

**RESPONSE SHEET**

**TO:** Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary  
**FROM:** Chairman Gregory B. Jaczko  
**SUBJECT:** COMGEA-11-0001 – UTILIZATION OF EXPERT JUDGMENT IN REGULATORY DECISION MAKING

Approved  X  Disapproved \_\_\_\_\_ Abstain \_\_\_\_\_  
Not Participating \_\_\_\_\_

**COMMENTS:** Below  X  Attached \_\_\_ None \_\_\_

I appreciate Commissioner Apostolakis making the Commission aware of the increasing importance of expert elicitation and phenomena identification and ranking table activities, and I agree that the development of guidance to ensure the consistent utilization of expert judgment by the staff is worthwhile. In order to avoid any possible displacement of high priority safety or security activities, the staff should be given the flexibility to suggest a reasonable timeframe to submit a plan for the development of guidance on the use of expert judgment.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**SIGNATURE**  
  
3/2/11  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**DATE**

Entered on "STARS" Yes  x  No \_\_\_

**RESPONSE SHEET**

**TO:** Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary  
**FROM:** COMMISSIONER SVINICKI  
**SUBJECT:** COMGEA-11-0001 – UTILIZATION OF EXPERT JUDGMENT IN REGULATORY DECISION MAKING

Approved XX Disapproved \_\_\_\_\_ Abstain \_\_\_\_\_

Not Participating \_\_\_\_\_

**COMMENTS:** Below XX Attached \_\_\_ None \_\_\_

I approve Commissioner Apostolakis' proposal that the Commission direct the staff to provide a plan for the development of guidance for the application of expert judgment. In my experience, the selection of expert judgment techniques must be adapted specifically to the analysis at hand and the state of knowledge of the particular field. Therefore, I would emphasize to the staff that any guidance must allow flexibility in application and the use of highly stylized approaches by individual researchers, as long as scrutability is maintained. I also agree with Commissioner Ostendorff's caution about the prematurity of developing a national standard at this time.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
SIGNATURE

0228/11  
\_\_\_\_\_  
DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes  No

RESPONSE SHEET

TO: Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary  
FROM: COMMISSIONER MAGWOOD  
SUBJECT: COMGEA-11-0001 – UTILIZATION OF EXPERT  
JUDGMENT IN REGULATORY DECISION MAKING

Approved  Disapproved \_\_\_\_\_ Abstain \_\_\_\_\_

Not Participating \_\_\_\_\_

COMMENTS: Below  Attached \_\_\_ None \_\_\_

I agree with Commissioner Apostolakis that the NRC would benefit from formal guidance to assist the staff in choosing the method for obtaining and utilizing expert judgment and support his recommendation for the staff to provide a plan for the development of that guidance.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
SIGNATURE

22 February 2011  
\_\_\_\_\_  
DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes  No \_\_\_

**RESPONSE SHEET**

**TO:** Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary  
**FROM:** COMMISSIONER OSTENDORFF  
**SUBJECT:** COMGEA-11-0001 – UTILIZATION OF EXPERT JUDGMENT IN REGULATORY DECISION MAKING

Approved  X  Disapproved      Abstain    

Not Participating    

**COMMENTS:** Below  X  Attached      None    

I agree with Commissioner Apostolakis' objective to incorporate lessons learned from the use of expert judgment in past major studies. I believe that major lessons learned from across the nuclear sector, if conveyed in a useful and practical manner, could improve the confidence level and consistency of future regulatory decision-making that rely heavily on expert judgment. I support the recommendations described in COMGEA-11-0001 except the possibility of developing a national standard which I believe to be premature at this time.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**SIGNATURE**

2/11/11  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**DATE**

Entered on "STARS" Yes  X  No