

Diablo Canyon 1

2Q/2010 Plant Inspection Findings

Initiating Events

Mitigating Systems

Significance: G Jun 26, 2010

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Inadequate Corrective Actions Following Identification of a Non-conservative Technical Specification

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of 10 CFR Part 50, Appendix B, Criteria XVI, "Corrective Action," after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to implement prompt corrective actions after identifying a nonconservative technical specification. In December 2008, the inspectors identified that the diesel generator loading calculations were inadequate to demonstrate that the design basis were met. On January 9, 2009, the licensee entered this condition into the corrective action program. On April 9, 2009, Pacific Gas and Electric concluded that Technical Specification Surveillance Requirement 3.8.1, "AC Sources – Operating," was not adequate to preserve plant safety and applied the provisions of Technical Specification Surveillance Requirement 3.0.3, and Administrative Letter 98 10, "Dispositioning of Technical Specifications that are Insufficient to Assure Plant Safety." The licensee did not complete the necessary actions to correct the deficient technical specification by submitting an adequate license amendment request. The inspectors concluded the most significant contributor to the finding was a less than adequate engineering evaluation to support the new emergency diesel generator loading profiles following the previous violation. The licensee entered the performance deficiency into the corrective action program as Notification 50232181.

The inspectors determined that the performance deficiency is more than minor because if left uncorrected, the failure to implement prompt corrective actions has the potential to lead to a more significant safety concern. The inspectors concluded the finding was of very low safety significance because the finding was a design deficiency confirmed not to result in the loss of operability or functionality. The finding is associated with the Mitigating Systems Cornerstone. This finding had a crosscutting aspect in the area of problem identification and resolution, associated with the corrective action program component because the licensee failed to perform an adequate evaluation of the nonconservative technical specification such that the resolutions address causes and extent of conditions, as necessary.

Inspection Report# : [2010003](#) (*pdf*)

Significance: SL-IV Jun 26, 2010

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Failure to Report a Condition that Could Have Prevented the Fulfillment of a Safety Function

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B) and 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(v)(B) and after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to submit a required licensee event report within 60 days following discovery of a condition prohibited by the plant technical specifications and a condition that could have prevented the fulfillment of a safety function. On March 9, 2010, Pacific Gas and Electric identified that the degraded voltage protection scheme, required by Technical Specification 3.3.5, "Loss of Power Diesel Generator Start Instrumentation," was inadequate to protect operating engineering safety feature pump motors. The licensee concluded that sustained degraded voltage could result in an overcurrent condition affecting equipment powered from the preferred offsite power supply. This condition was required to be reported to the NRC because the degraded voltage protection scheme rendered engineered safety feature pumps inoperable for a period in excess of the allowable technical specification out of service time and the condition resulted in the loss of the degraded voltage protection scheme safety function on all

three vital 4 kV power buses.

The inspectors evaluated this finding using the traditional enforcement process because the failure to submit a required event report affected the NRC's ability to perform its regulatory function. The inspectors concluded the violation was a Severity Level IV because the licensee failed to submit an adequate licensee event report. The inspectors determined that the violation was also a finding under the reactor oversight process because licensee personnel failed to adequately evaluate a condition adverse to quality for operability and reportability, as required by station procedures. The inspectors concluded that the finding is more than minor because the failure to properly evaluate degraded plant equipment for past operability and reportability could reasonably be seen to lead to a more significant condition. The inspectors concluded that the finding had very low safety significance because the failure to adequately evaluate the condition did not result in an actual loss of a system safety function or equipment required by technical specifications, or involve the loss or degradation of equipment specifically designed to mitigate a seismic, flooding, or severe weather initiating event, and did not involve the total loss of any safety function that contributes to an external event initiated core damage accident sequence. This finding has a crosscutting aspect in the area of problem identification and resolution, associated with the corrective action program component because the licensee failed to perform an adequate evaluation of the degraded voltage protection scheme such that the resolutions address causes and extent of conditions, as necessary.

Inspection Report# : [2010003](#) (*pdf*)

Significance:  Mar 27, 2010

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Failure to Effectively Implement the Seismically-induced Systems Interaction Program

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of 10 CFR Part 50, Appendix B, Criterion V, "Instructions, Procedures, and Drawings," after Pacific Gas and Electric personnel failed to effectively implement the Seismically Induced System Interaction Program. The Seismic Interaction Program is part of the design basis mitigation strategy for a potential 7.5 magnitude Hosgri earthquake and is required by Procedure AD4.ID3, "SISIP Housekeeping Activities." The inspectors identified three examples of transient equipment and materials improperly staged in seismically induced system interaction target areas. Pacific Gas and Electric had not analyzed the transient equipment to assess the risk to safety related components as required by plant procedures. Pacific Gas and Electric entered this finding into the corrective action program as Notification 50299740.

The finding is more than minor because the failure to follow the Seismically Induced System Interaction Program is associated with the Mitigating Systems Cornerstone external events protection attribute and adversely affected the cornerstone objective to ensure the availability, reliability, and capability of systems that respond to initiating events to prevent undesirable consequences. The inspectors concluded that the finding had very low safety significance because none of the examples of improperly staged equipment resulted in an actual loss of a system safety function or equipment required by technical specifications, or involve the loss or degradation of equipment specifically designed to mitigate a seismic, flooding, or severe weather initiating event, and did not involve the total loss of any safety function that contributes to an external event initiated core damage accident sequence. The inspectors concluded this finding has a crosscutting aspect in the area of problem identification and resolution associated with the corrective action program component because the licensee's past actions to address Seismically Induced System Interaction Program deficiencies were not effective [P.1(d)].

Inspection Report# : [2010002](#) (*pdf*)

Significance: SL-IV Mar 27, 2010

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Failure to Update the Final Safety Analysis Report with the Current Plant Design Bases

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of 10 CFR 50.71 after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to update the Final Safety Analysis Report Update with the current design basis. The inspectors identified that the current Final Safety Analysis Report Update, Revision 18, Sections 3.1, 6.4, 6.5, and 9.4 did not capture the current design basis for the control room, component cooling water, and auxiliary feedwater systems. The failure of the licensee to provide current design basis information in the Final Safety Analysis Report Update had an adverse impact on the plant modification process, the licensee's ability to assess operability for degraded plant systems, and the NRC's ability to

ensure that regulatory requirements were met. The licensee entered this violation into the corrective action program as Notifications 50308588, 50306131, 5030799, and 50307476.

The inspectors evaluated this violation using the traditional enforcement process because the issue affected the NRC's ability to perform its regulatory function. The inspectors concluded that the violation is more than minor because the incorrect Final Safety Analysis Report Update information had a potential impact on safety and licensed activities. The inspectors concluded the violation is Severity Level IV because the erroneous information was not used to make an unacceptable change to the facility or procedures that would have resulted in greater than very low safety significance under the Significance Determination Process. Because the violation included a performance deficiency, the inspectors also concluded the issue was a finding under the Reactor Oversight Process. The finding had a crosscutting aspect in the area of problem identification and resolution associated with the corrective action program component because the licensee did not adequately evaluate the extent of condition of previous similar violation and take appropriate corrective actions [P.1(c)].

Inspection Report# : [2010002](#) (pdf)

Significance: SL-IV Mar 27, 2010

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Failure to Report a Condition that Could Have Prevented the Fulfillment of a Safety Function

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of 10 CFR 50.73(a)(1) after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to submit a required licensee event report within 60 days after discovering a condition that could have prevented the fulfillment of a safety function. On November 22, 2005, the licensee determined that plant operators may not have had the capability to align either residual heat removal train to the cold leg recirculation mode of emergency core cooling following certain small break loss of coolant accidents. Plant engineers determined that the residual heat removal containment sump suction valve operators were inadequately sized to open against the differential pressure generated by the pumps operating in recirculation for an extended period. Plant engineers identified this condition during a follow up of industry operating experience. The licensee initially concluded that the condition was not reportable because the operating experience was not applicable to Diablo Canyon. The licensee failed to re-screen the issue for reportability after determining that the plant was susceptible to the condition. The licensee entered this issue into the corrective action program as Notifications 50301839 and 50295784.

The inspectors evaluated this finding using the traditional enforcement process because the failure to submit a required event report affected the NRC's ability to perform its regulatory function. Consistent with the guidance in Section IV.A.3 and Supplement I, Paragraph D.4, of the NRC Enforcement Policy, the inspectors concluded the violation was a Severity Level IV because the licensee failed to submit a required licensee event report. The inspectors did not assign a crosscutting aspect because the performance deficiency represented a latent issue.

Inspection Report# : [2010002](#) (pdf)

Significance:  Mar 27, 2010

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Less Than Adequate Evaluation Following the Failure of Both Motor-Driven Auxiliary Feedwater Trains

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of 10 CFR, Part 50, Appendix B, Criteria XVI, "Corrective Actions," after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to implement adequate corrective actions following a protection system failure. On June 29, 2009, a protection system card failure resulted in the inoperability of both motor-driven auxiliary feedwater trains. The licensee concluded that the failure of the auxiliary feedwater trains were expected as part of the protection system design and limited corrective actions to replacing the failed card. The inspectors concluded that the protection system design did not meet the design basis, which required that no single active failure would prevent the auxiliary feedwater system from meeting the safety function. The licensee entered this issue into the corrective action program as Notifications 50251823, 50298491 and 50254412.

The inspectors concluded that the finding is greater than minor because the vulnerability of auxiliary feedwater to a single failure is associated with the design control attribute of the Mitigating Systems Cornerstone and adversely affected the cornerstone objective to ensure the availability, reliability, and capability of systems that respond to initiating events to prevent undesirable consequences. The inspectors determined the finding to have very low safety significance because the condition did not represent a loss of system safety function. While the single failure of the

protection system card resulted in the inoperability of both motor-driven auxiliary feedwater trains, the turbine-driven auxiliary feedwater train was available to perform the safety function. This finding has a crosscutting aspect in the area of problem identification and resolution, associated with the corrective action program component because the licensee failed to perform an adequate evaluation of the auxiliary feedwater failure such that the resolutions address causes and extent of conditions, as necessary [P.1(c)].

Inspection Report# : [2010002](#) (*pdf*)

Significance: SL-IV Mar 27, 2010

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Failure to Submit a Licensee Event Report following the Common-Cause Failure of Independent Trains or Channels

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of 10 CFR 50.73(a)(1) after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to submit a required licensee event report within 60 days after discovery of a common-cause failure of three control room radiation monitors. The inspectors concluded that monitors failed on October 13, 2009 as a result of water intrusion due to heavy rains. The inspectors concluded that common cause failure of the radiation monitors was reportable under 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(vii). Pacific Gas and Electric subsequently reported the event on February 17, 2010, as Licensee Event Report 2010-001-00, Control Room Ventilation Pressurization Due to Radiation Detector Failures. The licensee entered this issue into the corrective action program as Notification 50301839.

The inspectors evaluated this finding using the traditional enforcement process because the failure to submit a required event report affected the NRC's ability to perform its regulatory function. Consistent with the guidance in Section IV.A.3 and Supplement I, Paragraph D.4, of the NRC Enforcement Policy, the inspectors concluded that this was a Severity Level IV noncited violation because the licensee failed to submit a required licensee event report. Because the violation included a performance deficiency, the inspectors also concluded the issue was a finding under the Reactor Oversight Process. This finding has a crosscutting aspect in the area of problem identification and resolution associated with the corrective action program component because the licensee failed to thoroughly evaluate the failure of the radiation monitor failures to ensure NRC reportability requirements were met [P.1(c)].

Inspection Report# : [2010002](#) (*pdf*)

Significance: SL-IV Dec 31, 2009

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Inadequate 50.59 Evaluation for Steam Generator Tube Rupture Analysis

The inspectors identified a Severity Level IV noncited violation of 10 CFR 50.59 after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to perform an adequate evaluation of a change to the facility as described in the Final Safety Analysis Report Update. In 1992, the licensee identified that auxiliary feedwater and steam generator power-operated relief valve flow rates assumed in the steam generator tube rupture accident analysis were non-conservative. To address the non-conforming condition, Pacific Gas and Electric changed the accident analysis to include a new time critical operator action to terminate turbine-driven auxiliary feedwater flow 5.54 minutes after the reactor trip and credit motor driven auxiliary feedwater automatic level control to the ruptured steam generator. The licensee did not perform a 10 CFR 50.59 safety evaluation of these changes. The NRC basis of approval of the accident analysis include four time critical operator actions, each assumed to occur after the first 10 minutes following the accident. The inspectors concluded that NRC approval was required before the licensee added the new time critical manual action under the 10 CFR 50.59 Rule in effect at the time because the change reduced the margin to safety to the basis of Technical Specification 3.7.4, "10% Atmospheric Dump Valves." The inspectors also concluded that prior NRC approval was required under the current 50.59 Rule because the change result in a departure from a method of evaluation described in the Final Safety Analysis Report Update. The performance deficiency, a less than adequate 50.59 evaluation, was the result of a latent issue. However, the inspectors concluded that the licensee had reasonable recent opportunities to identify the problem. The inspectors also concluded that plant programs, processes or organizations have not changed such that the problem would not reasonably occur today and that the most significant contributor to the performance deficiency was reflective of current plant performance. The licensee entered this issue into their corrective action program as Notification 50270786.

The failure of Pacific Gas and Electric to perform a 10 CFR 50.59 evaluation of the changes to the steam generator tube rupture accident analysis was a performance deficiency. The inspectors evaluated this issue using traditional enforcement because the performance deficiency had the potential for impacting the NRC's ability to perform its

regulatory function. The issue was more than minor because of reasonable likelihood the change to the facility would require Commission review and approval prior to implementation. The inspectors also evaluated the significance of this issue under the Significance Determination Process using Inspection Manual Chapter 0609.04, "Phase 1 Initial Screening and Characterization of Findings." The finding affected the Mitigating Systems Cornerstone because the change described the operator actions required to mitigate steam generator tube rupture accident. The inspectors concluded the finding screened Green because the finding was a design deficiency that did not result in the loss of operability or functionality. The inspectors concluded that the violation was a Severity Level IV because the issue screened Green under the Significance Determination Process. The inspectors concluded that this finding had a crosscutting aspect in the area of problem identification and resolution associated with the corrective action program component because the licensee did not thoroughly evaluate the steam generator tube rupture analysis such that the resolutions addressed causes and extent of condition [P.1(c)].

Inspection Report# : [2009005](#) (pdf)

Significance:  Sep 25, 2009

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Failure to Identify and Correct a Degraded Fire Barrier

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of Diablo Canyon Facility Operating License Condition (5), "Fire Protection," after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to maintain Fire Door 155 in the rated condition. On September 1, 2009, the inspectors identified that Fire Door 155 was inoperable because the external latching mechanism device was not engaged. Fire Door 155 was required to provide a 1½ hour rated barrier between Fire Areas 4B and S-2. The licensee re-engaged the latching mechanism and entered the condition into the corrective action program as Notification 50265691. On September 16, 2009, the inspectors again identified that Fire Door 155 was inoperable because the external latching mechanism device was not engaged. The licensee subsequently determined that the latching mechanism had been defective. The inspectors concluded the most significant contributor to the violation was the less than adequate corrective action taken by the licensee following identification of the problem on September 1, 2009.

This finding is more than minor because the degraded fire barrier affected the mitigating systems cornerstone external factors attribute objective to prevent undesirable consequences due to fire. The inspectors determined that the inoperable door is a fire confinement category finding and that the fire barrier was moderately degraded because the door would not perform the rated barrier function. The inspectors concluded that this finding is of very low safety significance because a non-degraded automatic full area water-based fire suppression system was in place in the exposing fire area. The licensee entered this violation into the corrective action program as Notification 50268494. This finding has a crosscutting aspect in the area of problem identification and resolution associated with the corrective action program component because the licensee did not thoroughly evaluate the degraded fire door such that the resolution address causes and extent of condition [P.1(c)].

Inspection Report# : [2009004](#) (pdf)

Significance: SL-IV Sep 25, 2009

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Failure to Update the Final Safety Analysis Report Update with Current Accident Analysis

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of 10 CFR 50.71 after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to update the Final Safety Analysis Report Update with a critical operator action assumed in the plant steam generator tube rupture accident analysis. The steam generator tube rupture accident analysis assumed that the ruptured steam generator will not overflow with water during the accident. To ensure a margin to overflow, the accident analysis included a critical assumption that plant operators would manually trip the turbine-driven auxiliary feedwater pump within 5.54 minutes following the reactor trip. Final Safety Analysis Report Update Section 15.4.3.1, "Identification of Causes and Accident Description," and Final Safety Analysis Report Update Table 15.4-12, "Operator Action Times for Design Basis SGTR Analysis," provided a detailed description of the time dependant operator actions assumed in the accident analysis. The inspectors identified that neither section included the critical assumed operator action to trip the turbine-driven auxiliary feedwater pump. The inspectors concluded that the licensee had a reasonable opportunity to identify and correct the problem when the results of the revised steam generator tube rupture accident, supporting steam

generator replacement, was updated in the Final Safety Analysis Report Update in October 2008. The licensee entered this violation into the corrective action program as Notification 50269753.

The inspectors evaluated this finding with the traditional enforcement process because the issue affected the NRC's ability to perform its regulatory function. The inspectors concluded that the finding is greater than minor because the failure to update the required critical operator action assumed in the accident analysis could have a material impact on safety or licensed activities. The inspectors concluded that the violation is Severity Level IV because the erroneous information was not used to make an unacceptable change to the facility or procedures. The inspectors concluded that this finding had a crosscutting aspect in the area of problem identification and resolution associated with the corrective action program component because the licensee failed to implement a corrective action program with a low threshold for identifying issues and failed to identify the inaccuracies in the accident analysis as described in the Final Safety Analysis Report Update [P.1(a)].

Inspection Report# : [2009004](#) (pdf)

Significance:  Jul 24, 2009

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Safe Shutdown Procedure Not Consistent with Safe Shutdown Analysis

An NRC identified noncited violation of License Condition 2.C.(4), "Fire Protection," was identified in that post-fire safe shutdown Procedure CP M-10, "Fire Protection of Safe Shutdown Equipment," Revision 20, was not consistent with the calculation M-928, "10 CFR 50 Appendix R Safe Shutdown Analysis," for Fire Area 3-CC, containment penetration rooms. Specifically, certain time-critical operator manual actions identified in the safe shutdown analysis were not incorporated into Procedure CP M-10 such that there was assurance that the actions would be completed within the times assumed in the safe shutdown analysis. A fire in Fire Area 3-CC may cause a spurious actuation of Atmospheric Dump Valves PCV-19 and PCV-20. The safe shutdown analysis recommends failing closed Atmospheric Dump Valves PCV-19 and PCV-20 by manually isolating their air supply (instrument air, backup air, and nitrogen) and then venting the supply line to avoid excessive plant cooldown. Procedure CP M-10, "Fire Protection of Safe Shutdown Equipment," Revision 20, did not include the steps to perform these actions.

The inspectors determined that failing to incorporate post-fire safe shutdown actions to prevent an excessive cooldown due to fire induced spurious opening of atmospheric dump valves in the post-fire safe shutdown operating procedure was a performance deficiency. This finding is more than minor because it is associated with the reactor safety mitigating systems cornerstone attributes of protection against external events, (i.e., fire), and procedure quality. This finding was found to be of very low safety significance (Green) consistent with the guidance in Inspection Manual Chapter 0609, Appendix F, "Fire Protection Significance Determination Process," and its attachments. This finding has a crosscutting aspect in the Resources component of the Human Performance area because the procedure was not complete and up to date in accordance with the safe shutdown analysis [H.2(c)].

Inspection Report# : [2009008](#) (pdf)

Barrier Integrity

Significance:  Jun 26, 2010

Identified By: NRC

Item Type: NCV NonCited Violation

Failure to Perform Unit 1 Containment Concrete Inspections

The inspectors identified a noncited violation of Technical Specification 5.5.16.a.1, "Containment Leakage Rate Testing Program," after Pacific Gas and Electric failed to perform containment concrete inspections in accordance with the requirements of and frequency specified by ASME Section XI code, Subsection IWL. The licensee entered this into their corrective action program as Notification 50310054.

The inspectors concluded that the failure of Pacific Gas and Electric to perform the technical specification required inspections is a performance deficiency. The finding is more than minor because the performance deficiency is

associated with the Barrier Integrity Cornerstone human performance attribute and adversely affected the cornerstone objective to provide reasonable assurance that containment physical design barrier protects the public from radionuclide releases caused by accidents or events. The inspectors concluded that the finding is of very low safety significance because the performance deficiency did not represent a degradation of the radiological barrier function provided for the control room, auxiliary building, or spent fuel pool, did not represent a degradation of the barrier function of the control room against smoke or toxic atmosphere, did not represent an actual open pathway in the physical integrity of reactor containment, and did not involve an actual reduction in function of hydrogen igniters in the reactor containment. The inspectors did not assign a crosscutting aspect to this finding because the performance deficiency did not occur within the past three years and is not reflective of present performance.

Inspection Report# : [2010003](#) (*pdf*)

Emergency Preparedness

Occupational Radiation Safety

Public Radiation Safety

Physical Protection

Although the NRC is actively overseeing the Security cornerstone, the Commission has decided that certain findings pertaining to security cornerstone will not be publicly available to ensure that potentially useful information is not provided to a possible adversary. Therefore, the [cover letters](#) to security inspection reports may be viewed.

Miscellaneous

Last modified : September 02, 2010