

February 17, 2012

MEMORANDUM TO: Amy E. Cabbage, Chief
Policy Branch
Division of Advanced Reactors and Rulemaking
Office of New Reactors

FROM: George M. Tartal, Sr. Project Manager */RA/*
Policy Branch
Division of Advanced Reactors and Rulemaking
Office of New Reactors

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF THE JANUARY 31, 2012, PUBLIC MEETING TO
DISCUSS ECONOMIC SIMPLIFIED BOILING WATER REACTOR
STEAM DRYER CONCERNS

On January 31, 2012, the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff held a public meeting at Two White Flint North Conference Room, T-6A01, Rockville, Maryland, with GE-Hitachi Nuclear Energy (GEH) representatives. The purpose of the meeting was to discuss the NRC's concerns with the Economic Simplified Boiling-Water Reactor (ESBWR) steam dryer. The associated meeting notice is available at NRC's Agencywide Documents Access and Management System (ADAMS) accession number ML120190367. The slides discussed during the meeting are available at ADAMS accession number ML120300300. A list of attendees for this meeting is enclosed. The following provides a brief summary of the meeting.

Summary

Mr. George M. Tartal, from the NRC's Office of New Reactors (NRO), conducted the meeting. Mr. Tartal provided the purpose of and logistics for the meeting. Mr. Michael Mayfield, NRO, then provided introductory remarks for the meeting. Mr. Mayfield stated that the NRC had identified errors in several licensing topical reports related to the ESBWR steam dryer structural model. He added that the NRC intends to gather information regarding the nature of these errors and how GEH intends to address the errors. Mr. Mayfield also stated that the NRC does not intend to discuss the ESBWR rulemaking schedule in this meeting, but rather will do so once it is satisfied with how GEH addresses these errors.

Mr. Mohammed Shuaibi (NRO) then introduced Ms. Terri Spicher (NRO), who gave a brief overview of the NRC's concerns with the ESBWR steam dryer. Ms. Spicher described the licensing topical reports where the errors were identified, how the NRC became aware of these errors, a general description of the key errors, and how the identification of these errors calls into question the conclusions the staff made in its safety evaluation for the ESBWR design.

Contact: George M. Tartal, DARR/APOB
301-415-0016
george.tartal@nrc.gov

Mr. Brian Johnson (GEH) provided opening remarks for GEH and introduced Mr. Jerry Deaver (GEH). Mr. Deaver presented a brief history of boiling-water reactor steam dryers and discussed the available regulatory guidance on steam dryers. He then discussed in greater detail how the ESBWR steam dryer was designed and its licensing basis. Mr. Deaver concluded with a brief discussion of the errors the NRC identified and their implications on the ESBWR rulemaking.

At that time the NRC closed the meeting to members of the public to discuss the errors that the NRC identified. This portion of the meeting was closed because the information to be discussed is proprietary. Therefore, the NRC does not provide a summary of this portion of the meeting.

Following the closed portion of the meeting, the NRC reopened the meeting. Mr. Brian Johnson recapped GEH's position that the errors that the NRC identified are not significant enough to affect the ESBWR dryer design and, as a result, the rulemaking should proceed. Mr. Mayfield then provided the NRC's position that, while the NRC appreciates the information that was presented by GEH at this meeting, the NRC needs to further review the documentation described in the meeting. He stated that it is the NRC's intention to plan an audit at GEH's facilities to perform such a review. After the audit has been completed, the NRC will determine whether or not its safety conclusions on the ESBWR steam dryer structural model remain valid and how it might proceed with the rulemaking. Mr. Mayfield further stated that, pending the results of the audit, the ESBWR rulemaking is on hold.

Mr. Tartal then asked members of the public if there were any questions they would like to ask. Ms. Yanmei Xie (Platts) asked when the audit would be scheduled and what the purpose of the audit is. Mr. Mayfield responded that the NRC will put together an audit plan through its licensing division, but the timeline for doing so is uncertain. He reiterated that the audit would be conducted to review the details of the information that was discussed so that the NRC can determine how to proceed with the ESBWR design certification. Mr. Michael Keegan (Don't Waste Michigan Intervenor Fermi 3) then commented that the errors being discussed in this meeting were unacceptable and the design certification should not move forward. Ms. Xie asked a further question about how the NRC's audit process works. Mr. Mayfield stated that a team of NRC staff would visit GEH facilities to review the subject information, and that the NRC would generate an audit report that would be made publicly available. Mr. Tartal then concluded the meeting.

Docket No. 52-010

Enclosure:
As stated

cc w/encl: See next page

Mr. Brian Johnson (GEH) provided opening remarks for GEH and introduced Mr. Jerry Deaver (GEH). Mr. Deaver presented a brief history of boiling-water reactor steam dryers and discussed the available regulatory guidance on steam dryers. He then discussed in greater detail how the ESBWR steam dryer was designed and its licensing basis. Mr. Deaver concluded with a brief discussion of the errors the NRC identified and their implications on the ESBWR rulemaking.

At that time the NRC closed the meeting to members of the public to discuss the errors that the NRC identified. This portion of the meeting was closed because the information to be discussed is proprietary. Therefore, the NRC does not provide a summary of this portion of the meeting.

Following the closed portion of the meeting, the NRC reopened the meeting. Mr. Brian Johnson recapped GEH's position that the errors that the NRC identified are not significant enough to affect the ESBWR dryer design and, as a result, the rulemaking should proceed. Mr. Mayfield then provided the NRC's position that, while the NRC appreciates the information that was presented by GEH at this meeting, the NRC needs to further review the documentation described in the meeting. He stated that it is the NRC's intention to plan an audit at GEH's facilities to perform such a review. After the audit has been completed, the NRC will determine whether or not its safety conclusions on the ESBWR steam dryer structural model remain valid and how it might proceed with the rulemaking. Mr. Mayfield further stated that, pending the results of the audit, the ESBWR rulemaking is on hold.

Mr. Tartal then asked members of the public if there were any questions they would like to ask. Ms. Yanmei Xie (Platts) asked when the audit would be scheduled and what the purpose of the audit is. Mr. Mayfield responded that the NRC will put together an audit plan through its licensing division, but the timeline for doing so is uncertain. He reiterated that the audit would be conducted to review the details of the information that was discussed so that the NRC can determine how to proceed with the ESBWR design certification. Mr. Michael Keegan (Don't Waste Michigan Intervenor Fermi 3) then commented that the errors being discussed in this meeting were unacceptable and the design certification should not move forward. Ms. Xie asked a further question about how the NRC's audit process works. Mr. Mayfield stated that a team of NRC staff would visit GEH facilities to review the subject information, and that the NRC would generate an audit report that would be made publicly available. Mr. Tartal then concluded the meeting.

Docket No. 52-010

Enclosure:
As stated

cc w/encl: See next page

ADAMS Accession No.: ML120450595-pkg

***via e-mail**

NRC-001

OFFICE	PM:DARR/APOB	LA:DARR/APOB*	BC:DARR/APOB
NAME	GTartal	BAbeywickrama	ACubbage
DATE	02/17/12	02/14/12	02/17/12

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

A. Cubbage

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF THE JANUARY 31, 2012, PUBLIC MEETING TO
DISCUSS ECONOMIC SIMPLIFIED BOILING- WATER REACTOR STEAM
DRYER CONCERNS

Distribution:

PUBLIC
DARR/APOB, R/F
PNMS
GTartal, NRO
BAbeywickrama, NRO
ACubbage, NRO
RidsOpaMailCenter
RidsOgcMailCenter
RidsAcrsAcnwMailCenter
RidsNroDarrApob
RidsNroDarr
RidsNroDnrl
RidsNroDnrlLb3
RidsNroDe
RidsNroDeEmb

LIST OF ATTENDEES
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Public Meeting to Discuss Economic Simplified Boiling-Water Reactor
Design Certification Steam Dryer Concerns
Tuesday, January 31, 2012
9:00 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.

NRC

<u>Name</u>	<u>Office</u>
Chakrapani Basavaraju	NRR
Tom Bergman	NRO
Sheryl Burrows	NRO
Russell Chazell	NRO
Joseph Colaccino	NRO
Amy Cabbage	NRO
Robert Davis	NRO
Lois James	NRR
Pat Jefferson	OI
Ronaldo Jenkins	NRO
Kamal Manoly	NRR
Michael Markley	NRR
Michael Mayfield	NRO
David Misenhimer	NRO
Geary Mizuno	OGC
Bruce Olson	NRO
Thomas Scarbrough	NRO
Mohammed Shuaibi	NRO
Terri Spicher	NRO
Tom Tai	NRO
George Tartal	NRO
Robert Weisman	OGC

STAKEHOLDERS

<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>
William Bentley	TVA
Jerry Burford	Entergy
Patricia Campbell	GEH
Dan Chalk	DOE
Jerry Deaver	GEH
Steve Hambric	Penn State University
David Harwood	DTE
Brian Johnson	GEH
Kenji Kanamori	HGNE
John McLamb	GEH
Peter Smith	DTE
Glen Watford	GEH

Mike Withrow
Yanmei Xie
Peter Yandow

Entergy
Platts
GEH

Via Teleconference

Name

Organization

Enrico Betti	GEH
Scott Bowman	GEH
Tim Enfinger	GEH
John Fields	Monticello Nuclear Power Plant
Michael Keegan	Don't Waste Michigan Intervenor Fermi 3
Daniel Poppone	GEH
Vik Shah	Argonne National Laboratory
Daniel Somerville	Structural Integrity Associates
Michael Teutan	GEH
Tao Wu	GEH
Samir Ziada	Argonne National Laboratory

DC GEH - ESBWR Mailing List

(Revised 02/17/2012)

cc:

Ms. Michele Boyd
Legislative Director
Energy Program
Public Citizens Critical Mass Energy
and Environmental Program
215 Pennsylvania Avenue, SE
Washington, DC 20003

Mr. Tony Robinson
AREVA NP, Inc.
3315 Old Forest Road
Lynchburg, VA 24501

DC GEH - ESBWR Mailing List

Email

aec@nrc.gov (Amy Cubbage)
APH@NEI.org (Adrian Heymer)
awc@nei.org (Anne W. Cottingham)
bevans@enercon.com (Bob Evans)
bgattoni@roe.com (William (Bill) Gattoni))
brandonm@dteenergy.com (Michael Brandon)
BrinkmCB@westinghouse.com (Charles Brinkman)
cberger@energetics.com (Carl Berger)
charles.bagnal@ge.com (Charles Bagnal)
charles@blackburncarter.com (Charles Irvine)
CumminWE@Westinghouse.com (Edward W. Cummins)
cwaltman@roe.com (C. Waltman)
Daniel.Chalk@nuclear.energy.gov (Daniel Chalk)
david.hinds@ge.com (David Hinds)
david.lewis@pillsburylaw.com (David Lewis)
David.piepmeyer@ge.com (David Piepmeyer)
donaldf.taylor@ge.com (Don Taylor)
erg-xl@cox.net (Eddie R. Grant)
gcesare@enercon.com (Guy Cesare)
GEH-NRC@hse.gsi.gov.uk (Geoff Grint)
GovePA@BV.com (Patrick Gove)
gzinke@entergy.com (George Alan Zinke)
hickste@earthlink.net (Thomas Hicks)
hugh.upton@ge.com (Hugh Upton)
james1.beard@ge.com (James Beard)
jerald.head@ge.com (Jerald G. Head)
Jerold.Marks@ge.com (Jerold Marks)
Jim.Kinsey@inl.gov (James Kinsey)
jim.riccio@wdc.greenpeace.org (James Riccio)
joel.Friday@ge.com (Joel Friday)
Joseph_Hegner@dom.com (Joseph Hegner)
kimberly.milchuck@ge.com (Kimberly Milchuck)
KSutton@morganlewis.com (Kathryn M. Sutton)
kwaugh@impact-net.org (Kenneth O. Waugh)
lchandler@morganlewis.com (Lawrence J. Chandler)
lee.dougherty@ge.com
maria.webb@pillsburylaw.com (Maria Webb)
mark.beaumont@wsms.com (Mark Beaumont)
matias.travieso-diaz@pillsburylaw.com (Matias Travieso-Diaz)
media@nei.org (Scott Peterson)
mike_moran@fpl.com (Mike Moran)
MSF@nei.org (Marvin Fertel)
nirsnet@nirs.org (Michael Mariotte)
Nuclaw@mindspring.com (Robert Temple)

DC GEH - ESBWR Mailing List

patriciaL.campbell@ge.com (Patricia L. Campbell)
Paul@beyondnuclear.org (Paul Gunter)
pbessette@morganlewis.com (Paul Bessette)
peter.yandow@ge.com (Peter Yandow)
RJB@NEI.org (Russell Bell)
sabinski@suddenlink.net (Steve A. Bennett)
sandra.sloan@areva.com (Sandra Sloan)
sara.andersen@ge.com (Sara Anderson)
sfrantz@morganlewis.com (Stephen P. Frantz)
stephan.moen@ge.com (Stephan Moen)
strambgb@westinghouse.com (George Stramback)
tdurkin@energetics.com (Tim Durkin)
timothy1.enfinger@ge.com (Tim Enfinger)
tom.miller@hq.doe.gov (Tom Miller)
trsmith@winston.com (Tyson Smith)
Vanessa.quinn@dhs.gov (Vanessa Quinn)
Wanda.K.Marshall@dom.com (Wanda K. Marshall)
wayne.marquino@ge.com (Wayne Marquino)
whorin@winston.com (W. Horin)