

Mr. James F. Klapproth, Manager  
 Engineering and Technology  
 GE Nuclear Energy  
 175 Curtner Avenue, M/C 772  
 San Jose, CA 95125-1088

November 19, 1999

- References: 1. Letter from J. Post (GENE) to USNRC, "Proprietary Information Supporting Meeting with NRC on OLYN Computer Code for ATWS Analysis," May 6, 1999.
2. "Safety Evaluation by the Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation on NEDC-24154P, Supplement 1 (TAC No. MA3478)," November 17, 1998.

Dear Mr. Klapproth:

The staff met with General Electric (GE) Nuclear Energy on April 21, 1999, to discuss an error that GE discovered in their OLYN code which was recently approved for use in anticipated transient without scram (ATWS) analyses by the staff (Reference 2). The error involves the water level reference value used to set the water level used throughout ATWS analyses. This error is associated only with the OLYN portion of the methodology approved in Reference 2.

The methodology approved in Reference 2 involves, among other things, normalizing the input boron mixing efficiency so that the boron mixing is conservative with respect to TRACG calculations. Furthermore, the normalized values input into the mixing tables were conservative with respect to the GE 1/6 scale boron mixing experiments performed at the Vallecitos Nuclear Center. The error which was discovered in the water level reference point does not affect the final results significantly because the input mixing efficiency table has been readjusted to maintain the same level of conservatism with respect to TRACG analyses. The adjusted boron mixing table is still conservative with respect to the Vallecitos data.

The staff has considered the information provided by GE in Reference 1 and concluded that the method which was previously approved in the November 17, 1998, safety evaluation remains valid because it has been shown that the adjusted input mixing efficiency table still leads to conservative assessment of ATWS events. Furthermore, the adjusted input efficiencies are still conservative with respect to the available data.

Sincerely,  
 /s/  
 Stuart Richards, Director  
 Project Directorate IV and Decommissioning  
 Division of Licensing Project Management  
 Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

cc: See next page

**DISTRIBUTION:**  
 File Center JWermiel  
 PUBLIC RCaruso  
 PDIV-2 Reading AUlises  
 SRXB Reading SRichards

\*For previous concurrences  
 see attached ORC

To receive a copy of this document, indicate "C" in the box										
OFFICE	SRXB*		SRXB*		SRXB*		PDIII-2 *	C	PDIV-2/LA *	C
NAME	AUlises		RCaruso		JWermiel		RPulsifer		EPeyton	
DATE	10/15/99		10/15/99		10/19/99		11/16/99		11/19/99	

To receive a copy of this document, indicate "C" in the box				
OFFICE	PDIV-2/SC *	C	PDIV/PD	C
NAME	SDembek		SRichards	
DATE	11/16/99		11/18/99	

DOCUMENT NAME: G:\PDIII-2\pulsifer\geatws.wpd

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

DF03

99 - 202

FILE CENTER COPY

PDIV TOP/UP EMVSENE

Mr. James F. Klapproth, Manager  
 Engineering and Technology  
 GE Nuclear Energy  
 175 Curtner Avenue, M/C 772  
 San Jose, CA 95125-1088

November 19, 1999

- References: 1. Letter from J. Post (GENE) to USNRC, "Proprietary Information Supporting Meeting with NRC on ODYN Computer Code for ATWS Analysis," May 6, 1999.
2. "Safety Evaluation by the Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation on NEDC-24154P, Supplement 1 (TAC No. MA3478)," November 17, 1998.

Dear Mr. Klapproth:

The staff met with General Electric (GE) Nuclear Energy on April 21, 1999, to discuss an error that GE discovered in their ODYN code which was recently approved for use in anticipated transient without scram (ATWS) analyses by the staff (Reference 2). The error involves the water level reference value used to set the water level used throughout ATWS analyses. This error is associated only with the ODYN portion of the methodology approved in Reference 2.

The methodology approved in Reference 2 involves, among other things, normalizing the input boron mixing efficiency so that the boron mixing is conservative with respect to TRACG calculations. Furthermore, the normalized values input into the mixing tables were conservative with respect to the GE 1/6 scale boron mixing experiments performed at the Vallecitos Nuclear Center. The error which was discovered in the water level reference point does not affect the final results significantly because the input mixing efficiency table has been readjusted to maintain the same level of conservatism with respect to TRACG analyses. The adjusted boron mixing table is still conservative with respect to the Vallecitos data.

The staff has considered the information provided by GE in Reference 1 and concluded that the method which was previously approved in the November 17, 1998, safety evaluation remains valid because it has been shown that the adjusted input mixing efficiency table still leads to conservative assessment of ATWS events. Furthermore, the adjusted input efficiencies are still conservative with respect to the available data.

Sincerely,  
 /s/

Stuart Richards, Director  
 Project Directorate IV and Decommissioning  
 Division of Licensing Project Management  
 Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

cc: See next page

DISTRIBUTION:

File Center JWermiel  
 PUBLIC RCaruso  
 PDIV-2 Reading AUises  
 SRXB Reading SRichards

\*For previous concurrences  
 see attached ORC

To receive a copy of this document, indicate "C" in the box							
OFFICE	SRXB*		SRXB*		SRXB*	PDIII-2 * C	PDIV-2/LA * C
NAME	AUises		RCaruso		JWermiel	RPulsifer	EPeyton <i>ESP</i>
DATE	10/15/99		10/15/99		10/19/99	11/16/99	11/18/99

To receive a copy of this document, indicate "C" in the box			
OFFICE	PDIV-2/SC *	C	PDIV/PD C
NAME	SDembek		SRichards <i>SAR</i>
DATE	11/16/99		11/18/99

DOCUMENT NAME: G:\PDIII-2\pulsifer\geatws.wpd

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY



UNITED STATES  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

November 19, 1999

Mr. James F. Klapproth, Manager  
Engineering and Technology  
GE Nuclear Energy  
175 Curtner Avenue, M/C 772  
San Jose, CA 95125-1088

- References:
1. Letter from J. Post (GENE) to USNRC "Proprietary Information Supporting Meeting with NRC on ODYN Computer Code for ATWS Analysis," May 6, 1999.
  2. "Safety Evaluation by the Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation on NEDC-24154P, Supplement 1 (TAC No. MA3478)," November 17, 1998.

Dear Mr. Klapproth:

The staff met with General Electric (GE) Nuclear Energy on April 21, 1999, to discuss an error that GE discovered in their ODYN code which was recently approved for use in anticipated transient without scram (ATWS) analyses by the staff (Reference 2). The error involves the water level reference value used to set the water level used throughout ATWS analyses. This error is associated only with the ODYN portion of the methodology approved in Reference 2.

The methodology approved in Reference 2 involves, among other things, normalizing the input boron mixing efficiency so that the boron mixing is conservative with respect to TRACG calculations. Furthermore, the normalized values input into the mixing tables were conservative with respect to the GE 1/6 scale boron mixing experiments performed at the Vallecitos Nuclear Center. The error which was discovered in the water level reference point does not affect the final results significantly because the input mixing efficiency table has been readjusted to maintain the same level of conservatism with respect to TRACG analyses. The adjusted boron mixing table is still conservative with respect to the Vallecitos data.

The staff has considered the information provided by GE in Reference 1 and concluded that the method which was previously approved in the November 17, 1998, safety evaluation remains valid because it has been shown that the adjusted input mixing efficiency table still leads to conservative assessment of ATWS events. Furthermore, the adjusted input efficiencies are still conservative with respect to the available data.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Stuart Richards", written over a horizontal line.

Stuart Richards, Director  
Project Directorate IV and Decommissioning  
Division of Licensing Project Management  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

cc: See next page

Mr. James F. Klapproth

- 2 -

cc:

Mr. George B. Stramback  
Regulatory Services Project Manager  
GE Nuclear Energy  
175 Curtner Avenue  
San Jose, CA 95125

Mr. Charles M. Vaughan, Manager  
Facility Licensing  
GE Nuclear Energy  
P.O. Box 780  
Wilmington, NC 28402

Mr. Glen A. Watford, Manager  
Nuclear Fuel Engineering  
GE Nuclear Energy  
P.O. Box 780  
Wilmington, NC 28402