

**Enclosure 3 contains PROPRIETARY information
To be withheld under 10 CFR 2.390**



10 CFR 50.55a

Cary D. Harbor
Vice President
Regulatory & Oversight

**Palo Verde
Nuclear Generating Station**
P.O. Box 52034
Phoenix, AZ 85072
Mail Station 7605
Tel: 623.393.7953

102-08704-CDH/MSC
November 17, 2023

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
ATTN: Document Control Desk
Washington, DC 20555-0001

Subject: **Palo Verde Nuclear Generating Station Unit 1
Docket No. STN 50-528
Renewed Operating License Number NPF-41
Supplemental Submittal – Relief Request 70 – Proposed
Alternatives for Pressurizer Lower Shell Temperature Nozzle**

By letter number 102-08690, dated October 23, 2023 [Agencywide Documents Access and Management System (ADAMS) Accession No. ML23296A254], and pursuant to Title 10 of the Code of Federal Regulations (10 CFR) 50.55a, *Codes and Standards*, paragraph (z)(1), Arizona Public Service Company (APS) requested Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) authorization of Relief Request 70, on the basis that the alternatives provided an acceptable level of quality and safety. APS proposed alternatives to American Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME) Pressure Vessel Code, Section XI, 2013 Edition, and ASME Code Case N-638-10, *Similar and Dissimilar Metal Welding Using Ambient Temperature Machine [Gas Tungsten Arc Welding] GTAW Temper Bead Technique, Section XI, Division 1*, dated May 6, 2019, for Palo Verde Nuclear Generating Station (PVNGS), Unit 1.

On October 25, 2023, the NRC staff provided a request for additional information (RAI) to support their review of the requested relief. By letter number 102-08695, dated October 26, 2023 (ADAMS Accession No. ML23299A305), APS provided the requested response to the NRC staff RAI. The NRC staff provided verbal authorization of Relief Request 70 on October 27, 2023 (ADAMS Accession No. ML23303A011).

In the original Relief Request 70 application, APS made the following commitment to the NRC:

The final one-cycle flaw analytical evaluation, evaluation of repair, and corrosion evaluation will be submitted within 14 days following the end of the current PVNGS, Unit 1 refueling outage.

A member of the STARS Alliance, LLC

Callaway • Diablo Canyon • Palo Verde • Wolf Creek

**Enclosure 3 transmitted herewith contains PROPRIETARY information.
When separated from Enclosure 3, this transmittal is decontrolled.**

102-08704-CDH/MSC
ATTN: Document Control Desk
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Supplemental Submittal – Relief Request 70 – Proposed Alternatives for Pressurizer
Lower Shell Temperature Nozzle
Page 2

This letter provides the supplemental information consistent with the commitment. Specifically, Enclosures 1 and 3 each contain five attachments that are the non-proprietary and proprietary versions of the supplemental information, respectively. Enclosure 2 contains five attachments that are affidavits signed by Framatome that set forth the basis on which the proprietary information in the Enclosure 3 Attachments may be withheld from public disclosure by the Commission and addresses with specificity the considerations listed in 10 CFR 2.390(a)(4).

Correspondence with respect to the proprietary aspects of the Enclosure 3 Attachments or the supporting Framatome affidavits should be addressed to Philip A. Opsal, Manager, Product Licensing for Framatome Inc.


The Unit 1 refueling outage was completed on November 11, 2023. No new commitments are being made by this letter.

As stated in the original application, a separate relief request will be submitted to justify continued use of the nozzle repair for the life of the plant. This permanent relief request, which will contain the appropriate analyses and justification for the remainder of the plant operating life, will be submitted prior to the end of the current operating cycle.

Should you need further information regarding this letter, please contact Matthew S. Cox, Licensing Department Leader, at (623) 393-5753.

Sincerely,

Harbor, Cary
(Z16762)

 Digitally signed by Harbor,
Cary (Z16762)
Date: 2023.11.17 13:03:34
-07'00'

CDH/MSC/cr

- Enclosure 1: Non-Proprietary Supplemental Information - Relief Request 70 - Proposed Alternatives in Accordance with 10 CFR 50.55a(z)(1) for Pressurizer Lower Shell Temperature Nozzle
- Enclosure 2: Affidavits from Framatome Submitted in Accordance with 10 CFR 2.390 to Consider Enclosure 3 Attachments as Proprietary Documents
- Enclosure 3: Proprietary Supplemental Information - Relief Request 70 - Proposed Alternatives in Accordance with 10 CFR 50.55a(z)(1) for Pressurizer Lower Shell Temperature Nozzle

cc: J. D. Monninger NRC Region IV Regional Administrator
S. P. Lingam NRC NRR Project Manager for PVNGS
L. N. Merker NRC Senior Resident Inspector for PVNGS