

ACRSR-1351  
PDR



UNITED STATES  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION  
ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON REACTOR SAFEGUARDS  
WASHINGTON, D. C. 20555

April 11, 1989

Mr. Victor Stello, Jr.  
Executive Director for Operations  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Washington, D.C. 20555

Dear Mr. Stello:

SUBJECT: PROPOSED RESOLUTION OF GENERIC ISSUE 115, "ENHANCEMENT OF  
RELIABILITY OF WESTINGHOUSE SOLID STATE PROTECTION SYSTEMS"

During the 348th meeting of the Advisory Committee on Reactor Safeguards, April 6-8, 1989, we reviewed the NRC staff's proposed resolution of Generic Issue 115, "Enhancement of Reliability of Westinghouse Solid State Protection Systems." Our Subcommittee on Instrumentation and Control Systems met with the NRC staff on April 5, 1989, to discuss this matter. We also had the benefit of the document referenced.

We concur in the staff's conclusion that no backfit is justified under existing regulations.

The staff also reported that, although a backfit is not justified, some insights were developed during the analysis that suggest changes in the logic component of reactor trip systems to make them less vulnerable to common cause failures. We agree that these are worthy of licensee consideration. We also agree that consideration should be given to these alternatives in the design of future reactors. We believe however, that major improvements in the reliability of scram systems will not be easy to achieve and that, for future reactors, a more productive approach would involve design changes to make the consequences of an ATWS of much less concern than is the case for existing reactors.

In our consideration of this issue, we found the analysis reported in NUREG/CR-5197, EGG-2456 to be well organized, thorough, and understandable.

Sincerely,

Forrest J. Remick  
Chairman

R501  
1/1

8904210144 890411  
PDR ACRS  
R-1351  
PNU

Mr. Victor Stello, Jr.

-2-

April 11, 1989

Reference

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research, NUREG/CR-5197, EGG-2456: "Evaluation of Generic Issue 115, 'Enhancement of the Reliability of Westinghouse Solid State Protection System,'" January 1989

cc: S. J. Chilk, SECY  
J. L. Blaha, EDO  
E. S. Beckjord, RES  
W. Minners, RES  
D. L. Basdekas, RES  
C. B. Bartlett, RES  
D. Persinko, NRR