

UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

WASHINGTON, D. C. 20555

June 1, 1988

Docket Nos. 50-445 and 50-446

Mr. William G. Counsil Executive Vice President Texas Utilities Electric Company 400 North Olive Street, Lock Box 81 Dallas, TX 75201

Dear Mr. Counsil:

SUBJECT: REMOVAL OF STEAM GENERATOR TUBE VIBRATION INSTRUMENTATION

By letter dated March 28, 1988, you provided justification for removing the tube vibration instrumentation installed in the Comanche Peak Unit 1 steam generators and requested the staff's concurrence on the elimination of the vibration monitoring program. The staff has reviewed the justification and agrees that the tube vibration instrumentation and vibration monitoring program are no longer necessary at Comanche Peak Unit 1 as discussed below.

The instrumentation was installed subsequent to a modification of the preheat section of the steam generators as part of an effort to address tube vibration and wear in the preheater section of Westinghouse steam generators. The modification included expansion of selected tubes at the elevation of baffle plates and diverting a portion of the feedwater flow through the auxiliary feedwater nozzle. As the expected lead domestic Model D-4 steam generators, one of the Comanche Peak Unit 1 steam generators was instrumented with accelerometers to provide a measurement of the vibration response of representative tubes for comparison with the objectives of the modification.

The staff reviewed and approved the modifications to the steam generators and the feedwater system and the addition of the vibration instrumentation in Supplement 4 to NUREG-0797, "SER Related to the Operation of Comanche Peak Steam Electric Station, Units 1 and 2," (SSER 4). The staff also approved, subject to the receipt of additional information, the vibration monitoring program in SSER 4. The acceptance of the procedures for conducting and reporting the data from the vibration monitoring program was considered a confirmatory item.

Since the issuance of SSER 4, a number of domestic and foreign Model D steam generators with modified preheat sections have gone into operation. The experience from those plants indicates that there has not been accelerated wear of the tubes in the preheat section.

- 2 -

Based on the operating experience to date, the staff finds that the tube vibration instrumentation is no longer necessary to determine if the objectives of the modification have been met. Therefore, the staff concurs in the removal of the tube vibration instrumentation at Comanche Peak Unit 1 and the elimination of the vibration monitoring program.

Sincerely,

Christopher I. Grimes, Director Comanche Peak Project Division Office of Special Projects

cc: See next page

Mr. William G. Counsil Texas Utilities Electric Company

Based on the operating experience to date, the staff finds that the tube vibration instrumentation is no longer necessary to determine if the objectives of the modification have been met. Therefore, the staff concurs in the removal of the tube vibration instrumentation at Comanche Peak Unit 1 and the elimination of the vibration monitoring program.

- 2 -

Sincerely,

(original signed by PFMcKee for)

Christopher I. Grimes, Director Comanche Peak Project Division Office of Special Projects

cc: See next page

Distribution:

Docket File

NRC PDR

Local PDR

CPPD Reading

OSP Reading

S. Ebneter/J. Axelrad

C. Grimes

P. McKee

J. H. Wilson

J. Lyons

R. Warnick

CPPD-LA

M. Malloy

J. Moore, OGC

F. Miraglia

E. Jordan

ACRS (10)

T. Marsh, EMEB/NRR

OFC :A/D:CPPD:OSP:A/D:CPPD:OSP :EMEB/NRR :D/BACRPD:OSP:D:CPPD:OSP :

NAME :JLyons cb :JWilson :TMarsh :PMckee :Clorimes :

DATE :5/18/88 :5/18/88 :5/27/88 :5/1/88 :5/1/88 :