Dated:

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION before the

ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

March 7, 1986 MAR 12 1986 DOCKETING & SERVICE BRANCH SECT-NRG

In the Matter of

PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY OF NEW HAMPSHIRE, et al.

(Seabrook Station, Units 1 and 2

Docket Nos. 50-443-OL 50-444-OL Off-site Emergency Planning Issues

APPLICANTS' ANSWER TO MOTION OF THE TOWN OF HAMPTON FOR FILING CONTENTIONS ON EVACUATION TIME STUDY

## Introduction

Under date of February 19, 1986, the Town of Hampton (Hampton), has filed a "Motion to Extend Deadline for Filing Contentions on Evacuation Time Study" ("Hampton Motion"). The Hampton Motion recites that there is currently under preparation "an updated and amended Evacuation Time Study", <u>Hampton Motion</u> ¶3, in connection with the New Hampshire Radiological Emergency Response Plan (NHRERP). The motion recites that the updated study has not yet been provided to Hampton and requests that the Board now issue an order giving Hampton 30 days from the date upon which it receives

> 8603170172 860307 PDR ADOCK 05000443 PDR

the update study to propound contentions in connection therewith. For the reasons set forth below the motion should be denied.

## Background

In connection with the August, 1983, hearings the applicants submitted Evacuation Time Estimates (ETEs) which were fully litigated in those hearing sessions. A decision as to whether these ETE's are reasonable is <u>sub judice</u> the "on site" Licensing Board in this proceeding.

#### ARGUMENT

The motion should be denied for two separate and distinct reasons.

A. THERE IS NO RIGHT TO LITIGATE STATE SPONSORED ETE'S IN NRC OPERATING LICENSE PROCEEDINGS

NRC regulations require preparation of ETEs only by Applicants for operating licenses. "The nuclear power reactor operating license applicant shall also provide an analysis of the time required to evacuate and for taking other protective actions for various sectors and distance within the plume exposure pathway EPZ for transient and permanent populations." 10 C.F.R. Part 50, App. E, § IV (introductory paragraph). ETEs are not mentioned in 10 C.F.R. § 50.47. As noted above, such ETEs were prepared in connection with the Applicants' radiological emergency response plans and determined by this Board to be an on-site

- 2 -

emergency planning issue, and the Applicants' ETEs were litigated in the August, 1983, hearings. While New Hampshire may determine to employ its own ETEs, this Board is limited to litigation of matters required by the Commission's regulations; in any respect in which the state determines to go beyond the requirements of the Commission's regulations the plans present no litigable issue. See <u>Pacific Gas and Electric Co.</u> (Diablo Canyon Nuclear Power Plant, Units 1 and 2), ALAB-781, 20 NRC 819, 829-33 (1984).

The requirement that Applicants prepare and submit ETEs is mirrored in the Staff/FEMA guidance document, NUREG-0654, Rev. 1, Criterion J-8. While the apparent assumption was the state and local plans would employ the Applicant's ETEs (or such portion of them that was relevant) in the plans for state and local action, see id., Criterion J-10(1) (see also the letter of Paul J. Cahill, then Director of the Massachusetts Civil Defense Agency, incorporated into the Applicants' ETEs, introduced into evidence in these proceedings as Ex. 2, following Tr. 1016 (8/17/83): "MCDA will incorporate the results [of these ETEs] in the Massachusetts radiological emergency response plan, after Federal officials have had an opportunity to review them. The results will be made available to local emergency response officials."), there is nothing that constrains New Hampshire to use one set of ETEs over another. Any contention that ETEs must be litigated twice must of

- 3 -

necessity rely on NUREG-0654 as supplying such a requirement. NUREG-0654 does not on its face purport to state what is litigable and what is not. This is not surprising because it is well-established that NUREG-0654. which has never been promulgated as regulation, imposes no regulatory requirements. Metropolitan Edison Co. (Three Mile Island Nuclear Station, Unit No. 1), ALAB-698, 16 NRC 1290, 1298-99 (1982) rev'd in part other grounds, CLI-83-22. 18 NRC 299 (1983); Philadelphia Electric Co. (Limerick Generating Station, Units 1 and 2), ALAB-819, 22 NRC 681, 710, affirming LBP-85-14, 21 NRC 1219, 1228 (1985). Even more plainly, NUREG-0654 must yield to the duly promulgated regulation where the regulation expressly addresses a topic. Thus, prescinding entirely from whether the various ETEs differ, the only set that is fair game for litigation in these proceedings is the set that has already been litigated.

# B. EVEN ASSUMING A RIGHT TO LITIGATE THE UPDATED STATE STUDIES, THERE IS NO RIGHT TO A FIXED 30-DAY PERIOD TO FORMULATE CONTENTIONS

Under NRC practice the original deadline for filing contentions derives from the notice of hearing. Thereafter, any contentions which are filed must meet the so-called late filing criteria. 10 CFR §§ 2.714(a)(1), 2.714(d); <u>Duke</u> <u>Power Co.</u> (Catawba Nuclear Station, Units 1 and 2), CLI-83-19, 17 NRC 1041 (1983). In this proceeding this

- 4 -

Board, without objection from any party, adopted a practice whereby the obligation and right to file contentions would be triggered by the filing with FEMA and distribution of the State and local emergency plans. Adoption of this practice is not equivalent to the conferring of an unfettered right to file further contentions any time additions or corrections are made to the plans. Rather the rule should, and must, be that if a party deems that a subsequently filed document provides a basis for a late-filed contention with respect to New Hampshire emergency planning, that party must make a filing pursuant to the NRC late filing rules. A new clock should not be started every time a change or addition is made to evolving emergency plans.

### CONCLUSION

The motion should be denied.

Respectfully submitted,

G. Dignan, Jr. Thomas

R. K. Gad III Ropes & Gray 225 Franklin Street Boston, MA 02110 (617) 423-6100 Counsel for Applicants

- 5 -

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Thomas G. Dignan, Jr., one of the attorneys for the Applicants herein, hereby certify that on March 7, 1986, I made service of the within document by mailing copies thereof, postage prepaid, to:

Administrative Judge Helen Hoyt Stephen E. Merrill, Esquire Chairperson Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555

Dr. Emmeth A. Luebke Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555

Ms. Diana P. Randall 70 Collins Street Seabrook, NH 03874

Diane Curran, Esquire Harmon & Weiss Suite 430 2001 S Street, N.W. Washington, DC 20009

Atomic Safety and Licensing Appeal Board Panel U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555

Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555

Attorney General George Dana Bisbee, Esquire Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General 25 Capitol Street Concord, NH 03301-6397

Dr. Jerry Harbour Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555

Richard A. Hampe, Esquire Hampe and McNicholas 35 Pleasant Street Concord, NH 03301

Sherwin E. Turk, Esquire Office of the Executive Legal Director U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555

Robert A. Backus, Esquire Backus, Meyer & Solomon 116 Lowell Street P.O. Box 516 Manchester, NH 03105

Mr. Ed Thomas FEMA, Region I John W. McCormack Post Office and Court House Post Office Square Boston, MA 02109

- 6 -

Paul McEachern, Esquire Matthew T. Brock, Esquire Shaines & McEachern 25 Maplewood Avenue P.O. Box 360 Portsmouth, NH 03801

Gary W. Holmes, Esquire Holmes & Ells 47 Winnacunnet Road Hampton, NH 03841

Mrs. Sandra Gavutis The Town of Kensington RFD 1 East Kingston, NH 03827

Senator Gordon J. Humphrey U.S. Senate Washington, DC 20510 (Attn: Tom Burack)

Senator Gordon J. Humphrey 1 Fillsbury Street Concord, NH 03301 (Attn: Herb Boynton)

Mr. Donald E. Chick Town Manager Town of Exeter 10 Front Street Exeter, NH 03833

H. Joseph Flynn, Esquire Office of General Counsel Federal Emergency Management Brentwood, NH 03833 Agency 500 C Street, S.W. Washington, DC 20472

Philip Ahrens, Esquire Assistant Attorney General Department of the Attorney General Augusta, ME 04333

JoAnn Shotwell, Esquire Assistant Attorney General Department of the Attorney General One Ashburton Place, 19th Floor Boston, MA 02108

Mr. Peter J. Matthews Mayor City Hall Newburyport, MA 01950

Mr. Calvin A. Canney City Manager City Hall 126 Daniel Street Portsmouth, NH 03801

Mr. Angie Machiros Chairman of the Board of Selectmen Town of Newbury Newbury, MA 01950

Mr. J. P. Nadeau Selectmen's Office 10 Central Road Rye, NH 03870

> Mr. William S. Lord Board of Selectmen Town Hall Friend Street Amesbury, MA 01913

homas G. Dignan, Jr.

- 7 -