

File etc



UNITED STATES  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

September 22, 1998

Senator Paul S. Sarbanes  
United States Senate  
Washington, DC 20510-2002

Dear Senator Sarbanes:

I am responding to your letter of August 12, 1998, to Dennis K. Rathbun of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) concerning a letter to you from Dr. T. S. Margulies. In your August 12 letter, you requested that we review Dr. Margulies' concerns and provide you with an appropriate response.

The NRC has an extensive inspection and licensing program to ensure that Calvert Cliffs is operating safely. In addition, we have inspectors in residence at every operating nuclear power plant who routinely inspect to determine whether or not operations are being conducted in accordance with the provisions of the plant's license. We believe this process provides reasonable assurance that the plant will continue to operate in a manner that will pose no undue risk to public health and safety in accordance with the Commission's regulations. In addition, the Commission evaluates issues that affect all plants or a group of plants on a generic basis. If the Commission finds that certain generic issues are applicable to Calvert Cliffs, the NRC will take appropriate action.

It may be helpful for you to be aware that Dr. Margulies is a former employee of the NRC and that the issues he raises in his letter to you were of great interest several years ago when he was employed here. The issues, Event V and Station Black-out, are severe accident sequences that have been studied by the NRC. NRC action on Event V has been completed. The NRC has also taken action on Station Black-out; however, the need for additional action is still under consideration. This issue may affect multiple facilities. After a generic resolution for this issue is identified, it will be implemented for all affected plants. It is premature to determine whether or not resolution of this generic issue has any special relevance to the Calvert Cliffs Nuclear Power Plant. The cost/benefit analyses Dr. Margulies offers are somewhat similar to analyses performed by the NRC staff. To the extent that it adds to our knowledge, Dr. Margulies' analyses will be taken into account in the regulatory process. It should be noted that Dr. Margulies has written to the NRC regarding issues such as these on two different occasions. The NRC responded to Dr. Margulies by letters dated August 18 and 28, 1998.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to address this issue.

Sincerely,

NRC FILE CENTER COPY

L. Joseph Callan  
Executive Director  
for Operations

200053

98-192

11  
DF01

Enclosures: As stated

9809290164 980922  
PDR ADOCK 05000317  
H PDR

9809290164



UNITED STATES  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

August 28, 1998

Dr. Timothy S. Margulies  
1213 River Bay Road  
Annapolis, MD 21401

Dear Mr. Margulies,

Your letter to Mr. Collins, dated July 23, 1998, concerning radiological risks and cost-benefit considerations for nuclear power reactors, Yucca Mountain, and the Waste Isolation Pilot Plant was forwarded to me. As you may know, the NRC is continuing to upgrade its regulations to be more risk-informed and using the kinds of information presented in your paper. I have forwarded your information to other appropriate offices.

Thank you for your interest in these matters.

Sincerely,

*Richard L. Emch, Jr.*  
for Charles L. Miller, Chief  
Emergency Preparedness and  
Radiation Protection Branch  
Division of Reactor Program Management  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Enclosure 1

11020508 112



UNITED STATES  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

August 18, 1998

Dr. Timothy S. Margulies  
1213 River Bay Road  
Annapolis, Maryland 21401

Dear Dr. Margulies:

Your letter to the Chairman concerning radiological risks and cost-benefit considerations for nuclear power reactors, Yucca Mountain, and the Waste Isolation Pilot Plant was forwarded to me. As you may know, the NRC is continuing to upgrade its regulations to be more risk-informed and is using the kinds of information presented in your papers. I have forwarded your information to other appropriate offices.

Thank you for your interest in these matters.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Cheryl Trotter".

John W. Craig, Director  
Division of Regulatory Applications  
Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research

Enclosure 2

9809610359 1P



Senator Paul S. Sarbanes  
 United States Senate  
 Washington, DC 20510-2002

Dear Senator Sarbanes:

I am responding to your letter of August 12, 1998, to Dennis K. Rathbun of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) concerning a letter to you from Dr. T. S. Margulies. In your August 12 letter, you requested that we review Dr. Margulies' concerns and provide you with an appropriate response.

The NRC has an extensive inspection and licensing program to ensure that Calvert Cliffs is operating safely. In addition, we have inspectors in residence at every operating nuclear power plant who routinely inspect to determine whether or not operations are being conducted in accordance with the provisions of the plant's license. We believe this process provides reasonable assurance that the plant will continue to operate in a manner that will pose no undue risk to public health and safety in accordance with the Commission's regulations. In addition, the Commission evaluates issues that affect all plants or a group of plants on a generic basis. If the Commission finds that certain generic issues are applicable to Calvert Cliffs, the NRC will take appropriate action.

It may be helpful for you to be aware that Dr. Margulies is a former employee of the NRC and that the issues he raises in his letter to you were of great interest several years ago when he was employed here. The issues, Event V and Station Black-out, are severe accident sequences that have been studied by the NRC. NRC action on Event V has been completed. The NRC has also taken action on Station Black-out; however, the need for additional action is still under consideration. This issue may affect multiple facilities. After a generic resolution for this issue is identified, it will be implemented for all affected plants. It is premature to determine whether or not resolution of this generic issue has any special relevance to the Calvert Cliffs Nuclear Power Plant. The cost/benefit analyses Dr. Margulies offers are somewhat similar to analyses performed by the NRC staff. To the extent that it adds to our knowledge, Dr. Margulies' analyses will be taken into account in the regulatory process. It should be noted that Dr. Margulies has written to the NRC regarding issues such as these on two different occasions. The NRC responded to Dr. Margulies by letters dated August 18 and 28, 1998.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to address this issue.

Sincerely,

Original signed by LJCallan  
 L. Joseph Callan  
 Executive Director  
 for Operations

Enclosures: As stated

**DISTRIBUTION:**  
 See attached list

DOCUMENT NAME: G:\CC1-2\SARBANES.GT

\*See Previous Concurrence

To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without attachment/enclosure "E" = Copy with attachment/enclosure "N" = No copy

OFFICE	PM:PDI-1	E	LA:PDI-1	NRR:DRPM:PERB*	D:PDI-1	TECH ED*
NAME	ADromerick/rs1		SLittle	CMiller	SBajwa	BCelure
DATE	09/ /98		09/ /98	09/04/98	09/ /98	09/08/98

OFFICE	D:DRPE(A)*	ADPR:NRR(A)*	D:NRR*	EDO	DCM
NAME	JZwolinski	BBoger	SCollins		
DATE	09/08/98	09/09/98	09/14/98	09/21/98	09/22/98

DISTRIBUTION:

Docket File (50-317) w/original incoming

PUBLIC

EDO #G980511

L. Callan

H. Thompson

A. Thadani

P. Norry

J. Blaha

S. Collins/F. Miraglia

B. Boger

PDI-1 R/F w/incoming

J. Zwolinski (A)

EDO R/F

C. P. Perriello

S. Bajwa

W. Travers

C. Norworthy

OGC

OPA

OCM

NRR Mail Room (EDO#G980511  
w/incoming) 012G18

N. Olson

R. Laskin

A. Dromerick (w/incoming)

S. Little

C. Hehl, Region I

SECY # (CRC-98-0775)

J. Roe

T. Martin

B. Sheron

Senator Paul S. Sarbanes  
 United States Senate  
 Washington, DC 20510-2002

Dear Senator Sarbanes:

I am responding to your letter of August 12, 1998, to Dennis K. Rathbun of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) concerning a letter to you from Dr. T. S. Margulies. In your August 12 letter, you requested that we review Dr. Margulies' concerns and provide you with an appropriate response.

The NRC has an extensive inspection and licensing program to ensure that Calvert Cliffs is operating safely. In addition, we have inspectors in residence at every operating nuclear power plant who routinely inspect to determine whether or not operations are being conducted in accordance with the provisions of the plant's license. We believe this process provides reasonable assurance that the plant will continue to operate in a manner that will pose no undue risk to public health and safety in accordance with the Commission's regulations. In addition, the Commission evaluates issues that affect all plants or a group of plants on a generic basis. If the Commission finds that certain generic issues are applicable to Calvert Cliffs, the NRC will take appropriate action.

It may be helpful for you to be aware that Dr. Margulies is a former employee of the NRC and that the issues he raises in his letter to you were of great interest several years ago when he was employed here. The issues, Event V and Station Black-out, are severe accident sequences that have been studied by the NRC. NRC action on Event V has been completed. The NRC has also taken action on Station Black-out, however, the need for additional action is still under consideration. This issue may affect multiple facilities. After a generic resolution for this issue is identified, it will be implemented for all affected plants. It is premature to determine whether or not resolution of this generic issue has any special relevance to the Calvert Cliffs Nuclear Power Plant. The cost/benefit analyses Dr. Margulies offers are somewhat similar to analyses performed by the NRC staff. To the extent that it adds to our knowledge, Dr. Margulies' analyses will be taken into account in the regulatory process. It should be noted that Dr. Margulies has written to the NRC regarding issues such as these on two different occasions. The NRC responded to Dr. Margulies by letters dated August 18 and 28, 1998.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to address this issue.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan  
 Executive Director  
 for Operations

**DISTRIBUTION:**  
 See attached list

DOCUMENT NAME: G:\CC1-2\ARBANES.GT

\*See Previous Concurrence

To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without attachment/enclosure "E" = Copy with attachment/enclosure "N" = No copy

OFFICE	PH/PP1	E	LA:PD1-1	NRR:DRPM:PERB*	D:PD1-1	TECH ED*
NAME	Agremerck/rs1		SLittle	CMiller	SBajwa	BCalure
DATE	09/17/98		09/17/98	09/04/98	09/17/98	09/08/98

OFFICE	D:DRPE(A)*	ADPR:NRR(A)*	D:NRR*	EDO	OCM
NAME	JZwolinski	BBoger	SCollins		
DATE	09/08/98	09/09/98	09/14/98	09/ /98	09/ /98

Official Record Copy



Senator Paul S. Sarbanes  
 SH-309 Hart Senate Office Building  
 Washington, DC 20510-2002

Dear Senator Sarbanes:

I am responding to your letter of August 12, 1998, to Dennis K. Rathbun of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) concerning a letter to you from Dr. T. S. Margulies. In your August 12 letter, you requested that we review Dr. Margulies' concerns and provide you with an appropriate response.

It may be helpful for you to be aware that Dr. Margulies is a former employee of the NRC and that the issues he raises in his letter to you were of great interest several years ago when he was employed here. The issues, Event V and Station Black-out, are severe accident sequences that have been studied by the NRC. NRC action on Event V has been completed. The NRC has also taken action on Station Black-out, however, the need for additional action is still under consideration. The NRC is handling this issue generically for resolution. After the resolution is reached, its implementation will be determined by the agency for all the impacted plants in the United States. It is premature to determine whether or not resolution of this generic issue has any special relevance to the Calvert Cliffs Nuclear Power Plant. The cost/benefit analyses Dr. Margulies offers are somewhat similar to analyses performed by the NRC staff. To the extent that it adds to our knowledge, Dr. Margulies' analyses will be taken into account in the regulatory process. Furthermore, Dr. Margulies has written to the NRC regarding issues such as these on two different occasions: once to the Chairman and once to the Director of the Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation. For your information, Enclosures 1 and 2 are our earlier responses to Dr. Margulies.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to address this issue.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan  
 Executive Director  
 for Operations

Enclosures: As stated

**DISTRIBUTION:**

Docket File (50-317) w/original incoming  
 PUBLIC  
 EDO #G980511  
 L. Callan  
 H. Thompson  
 A. Thadani  
 P. Norry  
 J. Blaha  
 S. Collins/F. Miraglia  
 B. Boger  
 PDI-1 F/F w/incoming  
 J. Zwolinski (A)  
 EDO R/F  
 C. Paperiello

S. Bajwa  
 W. Travers  
 C. Norsworthy  
 OGC  
 OPA  
 OCM  
 NRR Mail Room (EDO#G980511  
 w/incoming) 012G18  
 N. Olson  
 R. Laskin  
 A. Dromerick (w/incoming)  
 S. Little  
 C. Hehl, Region I  
 SECY # (CRC-98-0775)  
 J. Roe  
 T. Martin  
 B. Sheron

DOCUMENT NAME: G:\CC1-2\SARBANES.GT

\*See Previous Concurrence

To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without attachment/enclosure "E" = Copy with attachment/enclosure "N" = No copy

OFFICE	PM: PDI-1	E	LA: PDI-1	NRR: DRPM: PERB*	D: PDI-1	TECH ED*
NAME	ADPR: Tck/rsl		SLittle	CMiller	SBajwa	BCature
DATE	09/14/98		09/14/98	09/04/98	09/14/98	09/08/98
OFFICE	D: DRPE(A)*		ADPR: NRR(A)*	D: NRR		OCM
NAME	JZwolinski		BBoger	SCollins		
DATE	09/08/98		09/08/98	09/14/98	09/ /98	09/ /98

81919

Senator Paul S. Sarbanes  
 SH-309 Hart Senate Office Building  
 Washington, DC 20510-2002

Dear Senator Sarbanes:

I am responding to your letter of August 12, 1998, to Dennis K. Rathbun of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) concerning a letter to you from Dr. T. S. Margulies. In your August 12 letter, you requested that we review Dr. Margulies' concerns and provide you with an appropriate response. Accordingly, we have reviewed the issues raised by Dr. Margulies and have drafted Enclosure 1 as a proposed response.

It may be helpful for you to be aware that Dr. Margulies is a former employee of the NRC and that the issues he raises in his letter to you were of great interest several years ago when he was employed here. These are generic issues and have no special relevance to the Calvert Cliffs Nuclear Power Plant. The cost/benefit analyses Dr. Margulies offers are somewhat similar to analyses performed by the NRC staff. To the extent that it adds to our knowledge, Dr. Margulies' analyses will be taken into account in the regulatory process. Furthermore, Dr. Margulies has written to the NRC regarding issues such as these on two different occasions: once to the Chairman and once to the Director of the Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation. For your information, Enclosures 2 and 3 are our earlier responses to Dr. Margulies.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to address this issue.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan  
 Executive Director  
 for Operations

Enclosures: As stated

**DISTRIBUTION:**

Docket File (50-317) w/original incoming  
 PUBLIC  
 EDO #G980511  
 L. Callan  
 H. Thompson  
 A. Thadani  
 P. Norry  
 J. Blaha  
 S. Collins/F. Miraglia  
 B. Boger  
 PDI-1 R/F w/incoming  
 J. Zwolinski (A)  
 EDO R/F  
 C. Paperiello  
 T. Martin  
 J. Roe

S. Bajwa  
 W. Travers  
 C. Norsworthy  
 OGC  
 OPA  
 OCM  
 NRR Mail Room (EDO#G980511  
 w/incoming) 012G18  
 N. Olson  
 R. Laskin  
 A. Dromerick (w/incoming)  
 S. Little  
 C. Hehl, Region I  
 SECY # (CRC-98-0775)  
 B. Sheron

DOCUMENT NAME: G:\CC1-2\SARBANES.GT

\*See Previous Concurrence

To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without attachment/enclosure "E" = Copy with attachment/enclosure "N" = No copy

OFFICE	PM:PDI-1	E	LA:PDI-1	NRR:DRPM:PERB*	D:PDI-1	TECH ED*
NAME	ADromerick/rsi		SLittle	CMiller	SBajwa	BCalure
DATE	09/8/98		09/8/98	09/04/98	09/ /98	09/08/98

OFFICE	D:DRPE(A)	ADPR:NRR(A)	D:NRR	EDO	OCM
NAME	JZwolinski	BBoger	SCollins		
DATE	09/8/98	09/9/98	09/ /98	09/ /98	09/ /98



Senator Paul S. Sarbanes  
 3H-309 Hart Senate Office Building  
 Washington, DC 20510-2002

Dear Senator Sarbanes:

This is in response to your August 12, 1998, letter to Mr. Rathbun concerning a letter from Dr. T. S. Margulies. In your letter, you requested that we review the matter and provide you with an appropriate response. Accordingly, we have reviewed the issues raised by Dr. Margulies and have drafted the enclosed proposed response.

It may be helpful for you to be aware that Dr. Margulies is a former employee of the NRC and that the issues he raises in his letter to you were of great interest several years ago when he was here. These are general issues, with no special relevance to the Calvert Cliffs Nuclear Plant. The cost/benefit analyses Dr. Margulies offers are somewhat similar to analyses performed by the NRC staff. To the extent that it adds to our knowledge, Mr. Margulies' analyses will be taken into account in the regulatory process. Furthermore, Dr. Margulies has written to the NRC on two different occasions; once to the Chairman and the other to the Director of the Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation regarding such issues. Our response to Dr. Margulies is enclosed for your information.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to address this issue.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan  
 Executive Director for Operations

**DISTRIBUTION:**

Docket File (50-317) w/original incoming  
 EDO #G980511  
 L. Callan  
 H. Thompson  
 A. Thadani  
 P. Norry  
 J. Blaha  
 S. Collins/F. Miraglia  
 B. Boger  
 PDI-1 R/F w/incoming  
 J. Zwolinski (A)  
 EDO R/F

S. Bajwa  
 C. Norsworthy  
 OGC  
 OPA  
 OCM  
 NRR Mail Room (EDO#G980511  
 w/incoming) 012G18  
 N. Olson  
 R. Laskin  
 A. Dromerick w/incoming  
 S. Little  
 C. Hehl, Region I

DOCUMENT NAME: G:\CC1-2\SARBANES.GT

To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without attachment/enclosure "E" = Copy with attachment/enclosure "N" = No copy

OFFICE	PM:PDI-1	E	LA:PDI-1	NRR:DRPM:PERB	D:PDI-1	TECH ED
NAME	ADromerick/rs1		SLittle	CMiller <i>Callan</i>	SBajwa	
DATE	09/ /98		09/ /98	09/ 4 /98	09/ /98	09/ /98

OFFICE	D:DRPE(A)	ADPR:NRR(A)	D:NRR	EDO	OCM
NAME	JZwolinski	BBoger	SCollins		
DATE	09/ /98	09/ /98	09/ /98	09/ /98	09/ /98

Official Record Copy

# ACTION

## EDO Principal Correspondence Control

FROM: DUE: 09/09/98

EDO CONTROL: G980511  
DOC DT: 08/12/98  
FINAL REPLY:

Senator Paul Sarbanes

TO:

Rathbun, OCA

FOR SIGNATURE OF : \*\* GRN \*\*

CRC NO: 98-0775

Callan, EDO

DESC:

ROUTING:

ADDRESSING SEVERE ACCIDENT CONSEQUENCES --  
CALVERT CLIFFS (Timothy S. Margulies)

Callan  
Travers  
Thompson  
NOL Y  
Blaha  
Burns  
Thadani, RES  
Paperiello, NMSS  
Martin, AEOD

DATE: 08/25/98

ASSIGNED TO: NRR CONTACT: Collins

SPECIAL INSTRUCTIONS OR REMARKS:

NRR ACTION: DRPE:Zwolinski  
NRR RECEIVED: August 26, 1998

NRR ROUTING: Collins/Miraglia  
Boger  
Sheron  
Roe  
Zimmerman  
NRR Mailroom

ACTION  
DUE TO NRR DIRECTOR'S OFFICE  
BY 9/3/98

OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY  
CORRESPONDENCE CONTROL TICKET

PAPER NUMBER: CRC-98-0775 LOGGING DATE: Aug 21 98  
ACTION OFFICE: EDO  
AUTHOR: SEN. PAUL SARBANES  
AFFILIATION: U.S. SENATE  
ADDRESSEE: RATHBUN, OCA  
LETTER DATE: Aug 12 98 FILE CODE: ID&R 5 CALVERT CLIFFS  
SUBJECT: CALVERT CLIFFS NUCLEAR PLANT  
ACTION: Signature of EDO  
DISTRIBUTION: CHAIRMAN, COMRS, SECY/RAS  
SPECIAL HANDLING: OCA TO ACK  
CONSTITUENT: TIMOTHY MARGULIES  
NOTES:  
DATE DUE: Sep 7 98  
SIGNATURE: . DATE SIGNED:  
AFFILIATION: