

October 31, 1997

MEMORANDUM TO: Samuel J. Collins, Director  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

FROM: Roy P. Zimmerman, Chair  
Ad-Hoc Review Panel

SUBJECT: DIFFERING PROFESSIONAL VIEW CONCERNING TECHNICAL  
SPECIFICATION TRIP SETPOINTS AND ALLOWABLE VALUES  
FOR INSTRUMENTATION

In a memorandum dated March 17, 1997, Dale Thatcher, Section Chief, Electrical Engineering Branch (EELB) forwarded to you the differing professional view of Mr. Fred Burrows concerning Technical Specification trip setpoints and allowable values for instrumentation. Mr. Burrows, an electrical engineer in EELB, provided two concerns. The first concern is that 10 CFR 50.36, "Technical Specifications," requires the trip setpoint by itself be considered the Limiting Safety System Setting, and a closely related second concern is that the NRC Improved Standard Technical Specifications should focus on the trip setpoint, not the allowable value, since it is only the trip setpoint that accounts for all the instrument errors. Additional concerns were developed during the Panel's review. All concerns are discussed in the enclosed report.

Your memorandum dated March 24, 1997, designated that an ad-hoc panel be formed to review this differing professional view. The members of the Ad-Hoc Review Panel were Roy Zimmerman as Chair, Bruce Boger as a management member, and Tom Dunning as a staff member as recommended by Mr. Burrows. Anthony Mendiola served as technical assistant to the Panel.

Enclosed is the Panel's report with its findings, conclusions, and recommendations.

DISTRIBUTION:

AJMendiola

OFFICE	ADPR:NRR
NAME	RPZimmerman <i>RZ</i>
DATE	10/31/97

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

9809250102 980915  
PDR TOPRP EMVWEST  
C PDR

9809250102

10