

February 1, 1984

DISTRIBUTION:  
Document Control  
NRC PDR  
L PDR  
NSIC  
PRC  
LB#2 File  
EHylton  
RMartin  
Region I  
ELJordan, DEQA:IE  
JMTaylor, DRP:IE  
Vogler, OELD  
ACRS (16)

Docket Nos.: 50-352  
and 50-353

Mr. Edward G. Bauer, Jr.  
Vice President & General Counsel  
Philadelphia Electric Company  
2301 Market Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19101

Dear Mr. Bauer:

Subject: Request for Additional Information - Limerick

The Limerick Safety Evaluation Report (SER) identified control system failures as an outstanding issue. At the time of issuance of the SER, the Philadelphia Electric Company was performing a study to confirm that the consequences of certain control system failures were bounded by the FSAR accident and transient analyses.

By letter dated December 14, 1983, the Philadelphia Electric Company provided the results of a control system failure study in two reports entitled "Control Systems Failure Evaluation Report" and "Common Sensor Failure Evaluation Reports." We have found that additional information, as indicated in the enclosure, will be required in order to close this issue.

Please provide the date(s) on which you plan to respond to the above. Any questions concerning this information request should be directed to Mr. Robert E. Martin (301) 492-4937, the Licensing Project Manager.

Sincerely,

Original signed by:

A. Schwencer, Chief  
Licensing Branch No. 2  
Division of Licensing

Enclosure:  
As stated

cc: See next page

8402130609 840201  
PDR ADOCK 05000352  
E PDR

OFFICE	DL:LB#2/PM	DL:LB#2/BC					
SURNAME	RMartin	ASchwencer					
DATE	1/3/84	2/1/84					

Limerick

Mr. Edward G. Bauer, Jr.  
Vice President & General Counsel  
Philadelphia Electric Company  
2301 Market Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19101

cc: Troy B. Conner, Jr., Esquire  
Conner and Wetterhahn  
1747 Pennsylvania Avenue, N. W.  
Washington, D. C. 20006

Zori G. Ferkin  
Assistant Counsel  
Governor's Energy Council  
P. O. Box 8010  
1625 N. Front Street  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17105

Honorable Lawrence Coughlin  
House of Representatives  
Congress of the United States  
Washington, D. C. 20515

Roger B. Reynolds, Jr., Esquire  
324 Swede Street  
Norristown, Pennsylvania 19401

Frederic M. Wentz  
County Solicitor  
County of Montgomery  
Courthouse  
Norristown, Pennsylvania 19404

Eugene J. Bradley  
Philadelphia Electric Company  
Associate General Counsel  
2301 Market Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19101

Mr. Vincent Boyer  
Senior Vice President  
Nuclear Operations  
Philadelphia Electric Company  
2301 Market Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19101

Mr. Marvin I. Lewis  
6504 Bradford Terrace  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19149

Frank R. Romano, Chairman  
Air & Water Pollution Patrol  
61 Forest Avenue  
Ambler, Pennsylvania 19002

Charles W. Elliott, Esquire  
Brose & Poswistilo, 1101 Bldg.  
11th & Northampton Streets  
Easton, Pennsylvania 18042

Phyllis Zitzer, President  
Limerick Ecology Action  
P. O. Box 761  
Pottstown, Pennsylvania 19464

Mr. Karl Abraham  
Public Affairs Officer  
Region I  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
631 Park Avenue  
King of Prussia, PA 19806

Mr. Suresh Chaudhary  
Resident Inspector  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
P. O. Box 47  
Sanatoga, PA 19464

Joseph H. White III  
8 North Warner Avenue  
Bryn Mawr, PA 19010

James Wiggins, Sr. R. I.  
U. S. NRC  
P. O. Box 47  
Sanatoga, Pennsylvania 19464

Thomas Gerusky, Director  
Bureau of Radiation Protection  
Dept. of Environmental Resources  
5th Floor, Fulton Bank Bldg.  
Third & Locust Streets  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17120

Director, Pennsylvania Emergency  
Management Agency  
Basement, Transportation &  
Safety Building  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17120

Robert L. Anthony  
Friends of the Earth of the  
Delaware Valley  
103 Vernon Lane, Box 186  
Moylan, Pennsylvania 19065

Martha W. Bush, Esq.  
Deputy City Solicitor  
Municipal Services Bldg.  
15th and JFK Blvd.  
Philadelphia, PA 19107

David Wersan, Esq.  
Assistant Consumer Advocate  
Office of Consumer Advocate  
1425 Strawberry Square  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17120

Steven P. Hershey, Esq.  
Community Legal Services, Inc.  
Law Center North Central - Bevry Bldg.  
3701 North Broad Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19140

Jacqueline I. Ruttenberg, Esq.  
The Keystone Alliance  
3700 Chestnut Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104

Sugarman & Denworth  
Suite 510  
North American Building  
121 South Broad Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19107

Angus Love, Esq.  
101 East Main Street  
Norristown, Pennsylvania 19401

Lawrence Brenner, Esq.  
Administrative Judge  
Atomic Safety & Licensing Board  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Washington, DC 20555

Dr. Peter A. Morris  
Administrative Judge  
Atomic Safety & Licensing Board  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Washington, DC 20555

Dr. Richard F. Cole  
Administrative Judge  
Atomic Safety & Licensing Board  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Washington, D. C. 20555

Mr. J. T. Robb, N2-1  
Philadelphia Electric Company  
2301 Market Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19101

Mr. Spence W. Perry, Esq.  
Associate General Counsel  
Federal Emergency Management Agency  
Room 840  
500 C St., S.W.  
Washington, D. C. 20472

LIMERICK UNITS 1 & 2  
CONTROL SYSTEMS FAILURES  
REQUEST FOR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

To complete the review of the responses to Questions 421.10 and 421.11, the NRC staff requests the following information:

1. Appendix B of the "Control Systems Failures Evaluation Report" provides the criteria for elimination of systems and components from the control systems failure analysis.

Regarding these criteria:

- (a) Criterion N6 eliminates systems not used during normal power operations. Start-up, shutdown and refueling systems are not evaluated. It is the staff's concern that control system failures during plant evolutions where water level, pressure or reactivity are changing in response to turbine load or an operator's command may be of greater consequence than failures at steady state conditions. Therefore, the evaluation should be revised, or additional justification provided to support this criterion.
- (b) Criterion N2 eliminates operator actions as a result of indications. It is the staff's concern that operator response to erroneous indication

could exacerbate the control system failure. Therefore, the evaluation should be revised or additional justification provided to support this criterion.

- (c) Criterion N5 eliminates systems or components which cannot affect reactor parameters within 30 minutes of the loss. It is the staff's concern that the 30 minute criterion may not allow sufficient time to detect a failure and either restore the failed components to operable status or place the reactor in a safe condition. Therefore, the evaluation should be revised or additional justification provided to support this criterion.

- (d) Criterion N8 eliminates safety systems except for their response to conditions brought about by control systems failures. The evaluation should be revised to include a confirmation that where a safety system response was required one additional random, non-mechanistic failure was considered within the responding safety system.

2. Although the criteria for elimination of systems and components from the "Common Sensor Evaluation Report " has not been provided, it appears from statements contained in Section 3.1 of the Report that the criteria from the "Control Systems Failure Evaluation Report" were used. Provide the criteria used for the "Common Sensor Evaluation Report" to eliminate systems and components from the evaluation. If this criteria is the same criteria used for the "Control Systems Failure Report" address those concerns identified in Question 1 above.
3. The NRC staff's question on instrument sensing line failures (421.11) requested confirmation that a single failure in a common instrument line or tap would not defeat required protection system redundancy. Section 4.0 of the "Common Sensor Failure Evaluation Report" which includes a summary of the results of the study does not address this concern. From a review of Table 4.1 it appears that certain failures can disable redundant engineered safety feature functions (e.g., instrument line #3 - manual initiation of MSIV leakage control inoperable). It is the staff's concern that a single failure such as a plugged instrument tap could result in failures of multiple instrument channels. Such failures in combination



with a design basis event may not be bounded by the current FSAR analyses. Therefore, the evaluation should be revised to address the above stated concerns.