



UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D. C. 20555

FEB 14 1983

MEMORANDUM FOR: Robert J. Bosnak, Chief
Mechanical Engineering Branch, DE

THRU: *FL* Frank C. Cherny, Section Leader
Mechanical Engineering Branch, DE

FROM: Mark Hartzman
Mechanical Engineering Branch, DE

SUBJECT: TRIP REPORT - MEETING WITH ROBERT L. CLOUD AND
ASSOCIATES ON 1/26/83 IN BERKELEY, CA

Purpose:

The purpose of this meeting was to obtain clarification and a number of items related to ITR #12 (DC1-IDVP-Piping) and ITR #17 (DC1-IDVP-Piping, Additional Samples). In addition, a number of topics were also discussed to provide clarification on the overall IDVP. The meeting was attended by myself and P. Bezler from BNL.

The following items were discussed:

1. BNL questioned the appropriateness of the Hosgri 20 Hz rigidity criterion for supports and equipment. Aside from the fact that it is in the DC design criteria, RLCA felt that it is a reasonable criterion since the amplification in the Hosgri spectra is essentially one (1) beyond 20 Hz in most spectra used for the piping analysis. (This is however not true for all problems).
2. The comparison of support loads calculated from RLCA and PGE show significant differences in the values. The values calculated by RLCA usually exceed those by PGE by significant amounts, for example, as shown for one problem sample in Table II. Furthermore they do not show any comparison with allowable loads or stresses. We requested clarification on this issue. They stated that the design loads are those which were given to the support designers to design to an allowable stress. Since some of the support loads calculated by RLCA exceed the PGE loads by a considerable amount, there is no assurance that they will not fail. Large bore supports are being addressed in a separate ITR.

The issue was also raised as to the presentation of the results. RLCA calculated the deviation from the formula (verification-design)/verification whereas we felt that they should have used the formula (verification-design)/design. We believe that this is a