

UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

June 24, 1994

Docket Nos. STN 50-454, STN 50-455 and STN 50-456, STN 50-457

Mr. D. L. Farrar Manager, Nuclear Regulatory Services Commonwealth Edison Company Executive Towers West III, Suite 500 1400 OPUS Place Downers Grove, Illinois 60515

Dear Mr. Farrar:

SUBJECT: GENERIC LETTER (GL) 92-01, REVISION 1, "REACTOR VESSEL STRUCTURAL INTEGRITY," BRAIDWOOD STATION, UNITS 1 AND 2, AND BYRON STATION, UNITS 1 AND 2 (TAC NO.(s) M83436, M83437, M83443, and M83444)

By letters dated July 2, 1992, and November 19, 1993, Commonwealth Edison Company (CECo) provided its response to GL 92-01, Revision 1. The NRC staff has completed its review of your responses. Based on its review, the staff has determined that CECo has provided the information requested in GL 92-01.

The GL is part of the staff's program to evaluate reactor vessel integrity for Pressurized Water Reactors (PWRs) and Boiling Water Reactors (BWRs). The information provided in response to GL 92-01, including previously docketed information, is being used to confirm that licensees satisfy the requirements and commitments necessary to ensure reactor vessel integrity for their facilities.

A substantial amount of information was provided in response to GL 92-01. Revision 1. These data have been entered into a computerized database designated the Reactor Vessel Integrity Database (RVID). The RVID contains the following tables: A pressurized thermal shock (PTS) table for PWRs, a pressure-temperature limits table for BWRs and an upper-shelf energy (USE) table for PWRs and BWRs. Enclosure 1 provides the PTS tables, Enclosure 2 provides the USE tables for your facilities, and Enclosure 3 provides a key for the nomenclature used in the tables. The tables include the data necessary to perform USE and RT evaluations. These data were taken from your responses to GL 92-01 and previously docketed information. References to the specific source of the data are provided in the tables.

We request that you verify that the information you have provided for your facilities has been accurately entered in the summary data files. No response is necessary unless an inconsistency is identified. If no comments are received within 30 days from the date of this letter, the staff will consider your actions related to GL 92-01, Revision 1, to be complete and the staff will use the information in the tables for future NRC assessments of your reactor pressure vessel.

The information requested by this letter is within the scope of the overall burden estimated in GL 92-01, Revision 1, "Reactor Vessel Structural



Prol

Integrity, 10 CFR 50.54(f)." The estimated average number of burden hours is 200 person hours for each addressee's response. This estimate pertains only to the identified response-related matters and does not include the time required to implement actions required by the regulations. This action is covered by the Office of Management and Budget Clearance Number 3150-0011, which expires June 30, 1994.

Sincerely,

Original Signed By:

Ramin R. Assa, Acting Project Manager Project Directorate III-2 Division of Reactor Projects -III/IV Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Enclosures:

- Pressurized Thermal Shock Tables
- 2. Upper-Shelf Energy Tables

3. Nomenclature Key

cc w/enclosures: See next page

DISTRIBUTION Docket Files JRoe

RAssa ACRS(10) NRC & Local PDRs

JZwolinski RCapra

BClayton, RIII

PDIII-2 r/f

CMoore OGC

OFC	LA:PDIII-2	PM:PDIII-2	D:PDIII-2			
NAME	CMOORE	RASSA RA	RCAPRA AL			
DATE	/ / /94	6/24/94	6/24/94	/ /94	/ /94	/ /94
COPY	YES/NO	(YES) NO	(VES) NO	YES/NO	YES/NO	YES/NO

Mr. D. L. Farrar Commonwealth Edison Company

CC:

Mr. William P. Poirier Westinghouse Electric Corporation Energy Systems Business Unit Post Office Box 355, Bay 236 West Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15230

Joseph Gallo Gallo & Ross 1250 Eye St., N.W., Suite 302 Washington, D.C. 20005

Regional Administrator U. S. NRC, Region III 801 Warrenville Road Lisle, Illinois 6013

Ms. Bridget Little Rorem Appleseed Coordinator 117 North Linden Street Essex, Illinois 60935

U. S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Braidwood Resident Inspectors Office Rural Route #1, Box 79 Braceville, Illinois 60407

Mr. Ron Stephens Illinois Emergency Services and Disaster Agency IIO East Adams Street Springfield, Illinois 62706

Ho. A. Learner
Environmental Law and Policy
Center of the Midwest
203 North LaSalle Street
Suite 1390
Chicago, Illinois 60601

EIS Review Coordinator U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 77 W. Jackson Blvd. Chicago, Illinois 60604-3590

Chairman
Will County Board of Supervisors
Will County Board Courthouse
Joliet, Illinois 60434

U. S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Byron/Resident Inspectors Office 4448 North German Church Road Byron, Illinois 61010-9750

Ms. Lorraine Creek Rt. 1, Box 182 Manteno, Illinois 60950

Mrs. Phillip B. Johnson 1907 Stratford Lane Rockford, Illinois 61107

Attorney General 500 South 2nd Street Springfield, Illinois 62701

Michael Miller, Esquire Sidley and Austin One First National Plaza Chicago, Illinois 60690

George L. Edgar Newman & Holtzinger, P.C. 1615 L Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

Commonwealth Edison Company Byron Station Manager 4450 North German Church Road Byron, Illinois 61010

Illinois Dept. of Nuclear Safety Office of Nuclear Facility Safety 1035 Outer Park Drive Springfield, Illinois 62704

Commonwealth Edison Company Braidwood Station Manager Rt. 1, Box 84 Braceville, Illinois 60407

Chairman, Ogle County Board Post Office Box 357 Oregon, Illinois 61061

Plant Name	Beltline Ident,	Heat No. Ident.	ID Neut. Flumnce at EOL/EFPY	IRT new	Method of Determin, IRT	Chemistry Factor	Method of Determin. CF	xcu	XM i
Braidwood	Lower Mozzie Reit Forging	5P-7016	6.82818	10°F	Plant Specific	26	Table	0.06	0.71
EOL: 10/17/ 2026	Upper Shell forging	49C344-1-1 /490383	3.03£19	-30°F	Plant Specific	31	Table	0.05	0.73
	Lower Shell Forging	490867-1/ 490813-1	3.03E19	-20*F	Plant Specific	20	Table	0.03	0.73
	WF645 Upper Circ. Weld	H4498	6.82E18	-30°F	Plant Specific	41	Teble	0.03	0.50
	WF562 Middle Circ. Weld	442011	3.03£19	40°F	Plant Specific	41	Yable	0.03	0.65
	WF653 Lower Circ. Weld	31401	1.00£17	-4C*F	Plant Specific	150.8	Table	0.19	0.56

References

Chemical compositions and initial RT $_{\infty}$, data for all materials are from the July 2, 1992 letter from M.A. Jackson to T.E. Murley, Subject: Braidwood Station, Units 1 and 2.

Fluence data are from WCAP-12685, "Analysis of Capsule U from the Commonwealth Edison Company Braidwood Unit 1 Reactor Vessel Surveillance Program," August, 1990.

Plant	Beitline Ident.	Heat No.	ID Meut. Fluence at EOL/EFPY	IRT not	Method of Determin. IRT	Chemistry Factor	Method of Determin. CF	*Cu	TOM 1
3rs+dwood	Lower Nozzle Belt Forging	5p-7056	6.82518	30°F	Plant Specific	26	Teble	0.04	0.90
EOL: 12/18/ 2027	Upper Shell Forging	490963-1-1 /495904-1- 1	3.03€19	-30*F	Plant Specific	20	Table	0.03	0.71
	Lower Shell Forging	500102-1-1 /50097-1-1	3.03£19	-30°F	Plant Specific	37	Table	0.06	0.75
	Upper Circ. Weld	H4498	6.82518	-30°F	Plant Specific	41	Yaole	0.03	0.50
	Middle Circ. Weld	442011	3.03E19	40°F	Plant Specific	61	Table	0.03	0.65
	Lower Circ. Weld WF-696	1084-18	1.00E17	-16°F	Plant Specific	54	Table	0.04	0.6

References

Chemical composition and initial RT_{opt} data for all materials are from the July 2, 1992 letter from M.A. Jackson to T.E. Murley, Subject: Braidwood Station, Unit 1 an 2...

Fluence data are from WCAP-12845, "Analysis of Capsule U from the Commonwealth Edison Company Braidwood Unit 2 Reactor Yessel Surveillance Programs," March, 1991.

Plant Name	Beitline Ident.	Heat No. Ident.	ID Neut. Fluence at EOL/EFPY	I R T nek	Method of Determin. IRTon	Chemistry Factor	Method of Determin. CF	%Cu	XXII
Byron 1	Lower Nozzie Beiz Forging	123,218	2.159£19	30*#	Plant Specific	31	Table	0.05	0.72
FOL: 10/31/ 2024	Int. Shell Forging	5P-5933	2.159€19	40°F	Plant Specific	31	Table	0.05	0.73
	Lower Shell Forging	5P-5951	2.159€19	10*#	Plant Specific	26	Table	0.04	0.66
	WF-501 Upper Circ. Weld	442011	2.159€19	10*F	Plant Specific	61	Table	0.03	0.63
	WF-336 Middle Circ, Weld	442002	2.159€19	-30°F	Plant Specific	41	Table	0.03	0.46
	WF-472 Lower Circ. Weld	31401	1.00£17	10*#	Plant Specific	164.65	Table	0.23	0.57

References

Chamical composition and initial RT $_{\infty}$ data are from the July 2, 1992 letter from M.A. Jackson to T.E. Murley, Subjects Braidwood Station, Unit 1 and 2...

Fluence data are from MCAP-13880, Analysis of Capsule X from the Commonweelth Edison Company Byron Unit 1 Reactor Vessel Surveillance Program, " January, 1994.

Plant Name	Beitline ident.	Heat No. Ident.	ID Neut. Fluence at EOL/EFPY	IRT non	Method of Determin, IRT	Chamistry Factor	Method of Determin. Cf	*Cu	XMI
Byran 2	Lower Nozzie Beit Forging	4P-6107	6.82E18	10*F	Plant Specific	31	Table	0.05	0.74
11/6/ 1026	Upper Shell Forging	490329-1-1 /490297-1-	3.03€19	-20*F	Plant Specific	20	Table	0.01	0.70
	Lower Shell Forging	490330-1-1 /49C298	3.03€19	-20°F	Plant Specific	31	Table	0.05	0.73
	WF-562 Upper Circ. Weld	442011	6.82E18	40*5	Plant Specific	41	Teble	0.03	0.65
	WF-647 Middle Circ. Weld	442002	3.03£19	10*#	Plant Specific	68	Table	0.05	0.62
	WF-614 Lower Circ. Weld	31401	1.00£17	40°F	Plant Specific	144.4	Table	0.18	0.54

References

All chamical composition and initial RT $_{mo}$ data are from the July 2, 1992 letter from M.A. Jackson to T.E. Murley, Subject: Braidwood Station, Units 1 and 2.

Fluence data are from UCAP-12431, "Analysis of Capsule U from the Commonwealth Edison Company Syron Unit 2 Reactor Vessel Surveillance Program," October 1989. EQL USE values for the RG 1.99, Rev. 2 and the lower limiting value of 1.17. Cu for plates and forgings.

Fivence data for weld WF-616 is from the January 17, 1986 letter from G.L Alexander to M.R. Denton, subject: Zion Station Units 1 and 2; Byron Station Units 1 and 2; Braidwood Station Units 1 and 2; Pressurized Thermal Shock.

Summary File for Upper Shelf Energy

Plant Nesse	Seitline Ident.	Hest No.	Material Type	1/47 USE at EOL	1/47 Neutron Fluence at EOL	Unit and.	Method of Determin. Unirred. USE
Braidwood	Lower Nozzie Beit Forging	5P-7016	A 508-3	145	4.09E18	162	Direct
EOL: 10/17/ 2026	Upper Shell forging	49C344-1-1 /490383	A 508-3	93	1.66£19	118	Direct
	Lower Shell Forging	490867-1/ 490813-1	A 508-3	117	1.66819	136	Direct
	WF-645 Upper Circ. Weld	H4498	Linde 80, SAW	75	4.09E18	87	Direct
	WF-562 Middle Circ. Weld	442011	Linde 80, SAW	55	1.66£19	70	Direct
	WF-653 Lower Circ. Weld	31401	Linde 80, SAW	63	6.00E16	79	Direct

References

UUSE data for plate 490C346-1-1/490383-1-1 are from the July 2, 1992 letter from M.A. Jackson to T.E. Murley, Subject: Braidwood Station, Unit 1 and 2 ...

Fluence data are from MCAP-12685, "Analysis of Capaule U from Commonweelth Edison Company Braidwood Unit 1 Reactor Vessel Surveillance Program," August 1990.

UUSE data for the remaining materials are from the November 19, 1993 letter from T.W. Simplein to T.E. Murley, "...Eraidwood Station Units 1 and 2, Response to Request for Additional Information Regarding MRC Generic Letter 92-01. EOL USE for weld WF-653 was calculated using RG 1.99, Rev. 2 methodology.

Summary File for Upper Shelf Energy

Plant Hame	Settline Ident	Heat No.	Material Type	1/4T USE at EOL	1/4T Reutron Fluence at EOL	Unirrad. USE	Method of Determin. Unirrad. USE
Braidwood 2	Lower Mozzie Belt Forging	59-7056	A 508-3	115	4.09E18	128	Direct
EOL: 12/18/ 2027	Upper Shell Forging	490963-1-1 /495904-1- 1	A 508-3	94	1.66£19	119	Direct
	Lower Shell Forging	500102-1-1 /50097-1-1	A 508-3	124	1.66£19	150	Direct
	Upper Circ. Weld WF645	H4498	Linde 80, SAW	75	4.09E18	87	Direct
	Middle Circ. Weld WF-562	642011	Linde 80, SAW	55	1.66£19	70	Direct
	Lower Circ. Weld WF-696	1084-18	Linde 80, SAW	63	6.00E16	78	Direct

References

UUSE data for plate 490963-1-1/495906-1-1 are from the July 2, 1992 letter from M.A. Jackson to T.E. Murley, Subject: 37610wood Station, Units 1 and 2...

Fluence data are from WCAP-12845, "Analysis of Capsule U from the Commonwealth Edison Company Braidwood Unit 2 Reactor Vessel Surveillance Program," Narch 1991.

UUSE data for the remaining materials are from the November 19, 1993 letter from T.W. Simpkin to T.E. Murley, "...Braidwood Station units 1 and 2, Response to Request for Additional Information Regarding MRC Generic Letter 92-01. EOL USE for weld WF-696 was calculated using RG 1.99, Rev. 2 methodology.

Summary File for Upper Shalf Energy

Plant Wame	Seltline Ident.	Heat No.	Meterial Type	at EOL	1/4T Heutron Fluence at EOL	Unirrad. USE	Method of Determin. Unirrad. USE
Byron 1	Lower Nozzie Belt Forging	123,218	A 508-2	111	1.179€19	138	Direct
EOL: 10/31/ 2024	int. Shell Forging	58-5933	A 508-2	111	1.179£19	138	Direct
	Lower Shell forging	58-5951	A 508-2	120	1.179€19	150	Direct
	WF-501 Upper Circ. Weld	442011	Linde 80, SAW	63	1.179€19	73	Direct
	WF-336 Middle Circ. Weld	442002	Linde 80, SAW	60	1.179€19	76	Direct
	WF-472 Lower Circ. Weld	31401	Linde 80, SAW	64	6.00€16	72	Direct

References

UUSE data for forging 5P-5933 are from the July 2, 1997 letter from N.A. Jackson to T.E. Murley, Subject: Braidwood Station, Units 1 and 2.

Fluence data are from WCAP-13880, Analysis of Capsule X from the Commonwealth Edison Company Byron Unit 1 Reactor Vessel Surveillance Program, " January 1996.

UUSE data for the welds and initial $kT_{\rm max}$ for weld WF-501 are from the November 19, 1993 letter from T.W. Simpkin to T.E. Murley, "...Braidwood Station Units 1 and 2, Response to Request for Additional Information Regarding MRC Generic Letter 92-01. EQL USE for weld WF-472 was calculated using RG 1.99, Rev. 2 methodology. EQL USE for weld WF-336 was calculated using RG 1.99, Rev. 2 assuming the lower limiting value of 0.5% Cu. for welds.

USE data for forgings 123J218 and 5P-5951 are from WCAP-11651, "Analysis of Capsule U from the Commonwealth Edison Co. Byron Unit 1 Reactor Vessel Radiation Surveillance Program," November, 1987.

EOL USE values for the forgings were calculated using RG 1.99, Rev. 2 and the lower limiting value of 0.1% Cu for places and forgings.

Summary File for Upper Shelf Energy

Plant Naged	Beitline Ident.	Heat Mo.	Material Type	at EOL	1/47 Neutron Fluence at EOL	Unirrad. USE	Method of Determin, Unirrad, USE
Byron 2	Lower Nozzle Belt Forging	4P-6107	A 508-2	131	4.09E18	155	Direct
EOL: 11/6/ 2026	Upper Shell Forging	490329-1-1 /490297-1- 1	A 508-2	117	1.66£19	149	Direct
	Lower Shell Forging	490330-1-1 /490296-1-	A 508-2	99	1.66£19	127	Direct
	WF-562 Upper Circ. Weld	442011	Linde 80, SAW	60	4.09E18	70	Direct
	WF-447 Middle Circ. Weld	442002	Linde 80, SAW	53	1.66£19	67	Direct
	WF-614 Lower Circ, Weld	31401	Linde 80, SAW	67	6.00E16	76	Direct

References

UUSE data for forgings 490330-1-1/490298-1-1 are from the July 2, 1992 letter from M.A. Jackson to T.E. Murley, Subject: Braidwood Station, Units 1 and 2.

Fluence date; and UUSE date for forgings 6P-6107 and 690329-1-1/692297-1-1 are from WCAP-12431, "Analysis of Capsule U from the Commonwealth Edison Company Syron Unit 2 Reactor Vessel Surveillance Program," October 1989. EOL USE values for the forgings were calculated using RG 1.99, Rev. 2 and the lower limiting value of C.1% Cu for plates and forgings.

USE date for the welds are from the Hovember 19, 1993 letter from T.W. Simpkin to T.E. Murley, "...Braidwood Station Units 1 and 2. Response to Request for Additional Information Regarding NRC Generic Letter 92-01. EOL USE for weld WF-614 was calculated using RG 1.99, Rev. 2 methodology.

Fluence data for weld WF-614 is from the January 17, 1986 Letter from G.L Alexander to M.R. Denton, subject: Zion Station Units 1 and 2; Byron Station Units 1 and 2; Pressurized Thermal Shock.

PRESSURIZED THERMAL SHOCK AND USE TABLES FOR ALL PWR PLANTS

NOMENCLATURE

Pressurized Thermal Shock Table

Column 1: Plant name and date of expiration of license. Column 2: Beltline material location identification.

Column 3: Beltline material heat number; for some welds that a singlewire or tandem-wire process has been reported, (S) indicates single wire was used in the SAW process, (T) indicates tandem wire was used in the SAW process.

Column 4: End-of-life (EOL) neutron fluence at vessel inner wall; cited directly from inner diameter (ID) value or calculated by using Regulatory Guide (RG) 1.99, Revision 2, neutron fluence attenuation methodology from the guarter thickness (T/4) value reported in the latest submittal (GL 92-O1, PTS, or P/T limits submittals).

Column 5: Unirradiated reference temperature.

Column 6: Method of determining unirradiated reference temperature (IRT).

<u>Plant-Specific</u>
This indicates that the IRT was determined from tests on material removed from the same heat of the beltline material.

MTEB 5-2
This indicates that the unirradiated reference temperature was determined from following MTEB 5-2 guidelines for cases where the IRT was not determined using American Society of Mechanical Engineers Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code, Section III, NB-2331, methodology.

Generic
This indicates that the unirradiated reference temperature was determined from the mean value of tests on material of similar types.

Column 7: Chemistry factor for irradiated reference temperature evaluation.

Column 8: Method of determining chemistry factor.

 $\frac{Table}{This}$ indicates that the chemistry factor was determined from the chemistry factor tables in RG 1.99, Revision 2.

Calculated
This indicates that the chemistry factor was determined from surveillance data via procedures described in RG 1.99, Revision 2.

Column 9: Copper content; cited directly from licensee value except when more than one value was reported. (Staff used the average value in the latter case.)

No Data
This indicates that no copper data has been reported and the default value in RG 1.99, Revision 2, will be used by the staff.

Column 10: Nickel content; cited directly from licensee value except when more than one value was reported. (Staff used the average value in the latter case.)

No Data

This indicates that no nickel data has been reported and the default value in RG 1.99, Revision 2, will be used by the staff.

Upper Shelf Energy Table

Column 1: Plant name and date of expiration of license. Column 2: Beltline material location identification.

Column 3: Beltline material heat number; for some welds that a singlewire or tandem-wire process has been reported, (S) indicates single wire was used in the SAW process. (T) indicates tandem wire was used in the SAW process.

Column 4: Material type; plate types include A 5338-1, A 302B, A 302B Mod., and forging A 508-2; weld types include SAW welds using Linde 80, 0091, 124, 1092, ARCOS-B5 flux, Rotterdam welds using Graw Lo, SMIT 89, LW 320, and SAF 89 flux, and SMAW welds using no flux.

Column 5: EOL upper-shelf energy (USE) at T/4; calculated by using the EOL fluence and either the cooper value or the surveillance data. (Both methods are described in RG 1.99, Revision 2.)

EMA
This indicates that the USE issue may be covered by the approved equivalent margins analysis in the B&W Owners Group Topical Reports: BAW-2178P and BAW-2192-P.

Column 6: EOL neutron fluence at T/4 from vessel inner wall; cited directly from T/4 value or calculated by using RG 1.99, Revision 2, neutron fluence attenuation methodology from the ID value reported in the latest submittal (GL 92-01, PTS, or P/T limits submittals).

Column 7: Unirradiated USE.

EMA

This indicates that the USE issue may be covered by the approved equivalent margins analysis in the B&W Owners Group Topical Reports: BAW-2178P and BAW-2192P.

Column 8: Method of determining unirradiated USE.

Direct

For plates, this indicates that the unirradiated USE was from a transverse specimen. For welds, this indicates that the unirradiated USE was from test date.

65%

This indicates that the unirradiated USE was 65% of the USE from a longitudinal specimen.

Generic

This indicates that the unirradiated USE was reported by the licensee from other plants with similar materials to the beltline material.

NRC generic

This indicates that the unirradiated USE was derived by the staff from other plants with similar materials to the beltline material.

10, 30, 40, or 50 °F
This indicates that the unirradiated USE was derived from Charpy test conducted at 10, 30, 40, or 50 °F.

Surv. Weld This indicates that the unirradiated USE was from the surveillance weld having the same weld wire heat number.

Equiv. to Surv. Weld
This indicates that the unirradiated USE was from the surveillance weld having different weld wire heat number.

Sister Plant

This indicates that the unirradiated USE was derived by using the reported value from other plants with the same weld wire heat number.

Blank

Indicates that there is insufficient data to determine the unirradiated USE.

Integrity, 10 CFR 50.54(f)." The estimated average number of burden hours is 200 person hours for each addressee's response. This estimate pertains only to the identified response-related matters and does not include the time required to implement actions required by the regulations. This action is covered by the Office of Management and Budget Clearance Number 3150-0011, which expires June 30, 1994.

Sincerely.

Original Signed By:

Ramin R. Assa, Acting Project Manager Project Directorate III-2 Division of Reactor Projects -III/IV Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Enclosures:

- 1. Pressurized Thermal Shock Tables
- 2. Upper-Shelf Energy Tables

3. Nomenclature Key

cc w/enclosures: See next page

DISTRIBUTION

Docket Files

JRoe RASSa

ACRS(10)

NRC & Local PDRs

JZwolinski RCapra

BClayton, RIII

PDIII-2 r/f

CMoore

OFC	LA:PDIII-2	PM:PDIII-2	D:PDIII-2			
NAME	CMOORE &	RASSA RA	RCAPRA AL			
DATE	62494	6/24/94	6/24/94	/ /94	/ /94	/ /94
COPY	YES/NO	(YES)NO	(YES) NO	YES/NO	YES/NO	YES/NO