

# VOLUME ONE

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
PRELIMINARY STATEMENT .....	I-1
OPINION.....	1
I. QUALITY ASSURANCE/QUALITY CONTROL.....	1
A. Overview.....	1
B. The LILCO Quality Assurance Program.....	6
1. General Description.....	6
2. Elements of the Quality Assurance Program.....	8
a. Engineering and Design.....	9
b. Procurement.....	12
c. Construction.....	12
3. Compliance with Appendix B.....	14
4. Elements of the LILCO Quality Assurance Program That Ensure Its Proper Implementation.....	16
a. Attention to Quality in Construction.....	16
b. Inspections.....	18
c. Audits.....	20
d. Surveillances.....	22
e. Corrective and Preventive Action.....	23
f. Stone & Webster's Problem Reporting System.....	25
5. Other Factors Showing Proper Implementation of Shoreham's Quality Assurance Program.....	26

a. NRC I&E Program.....	26
b. Torrey Pines Technology Independent Verification.....	28
c. Independent Review of the Quality Assurance Program for the Reactor Pressure Vessel.....	29
d. Additional Programs.....	30
(1) Final Stress Analysis Review Program.....	30
(2) E&DCR Verification Program.....	31
(3) Raceway Qualification Program....	31
(4) As-Built Piping Program.....	32
(5) Fuel Load Drawing Update Program.....	33
(6) Final "A" Release Program.....	33
C. LILCO Audits.....	34
1. Many Overlapping Efforts.....	35
2. Insignificance of Observations.....	39
3. Corrective and Preventive Action.....	42
4. Compliance with Appendix B.....	43
5. Specific Subjects.....	46
a. Calculations.....	47
b. Drawings.....	49
c. Document Control.....	51
d. E&DCRs.....	52
e. Storage.....	54
D. Housekeeping.....	57

E.	The I&E Program: Application and Results at Shoreham.....	62
1.	I&E Program.....	62
2.	Construction Assessment Team Inspection.....	78
3.	Readiness Assessment Team Inspection.....	85
a.	Violation A.....	87
b.	Violation B.....	90
c.	Violation C.....	91
d.	Violation D.....	93
e.	FQC Inspection Program.....	94
4.	Systematic Assessment of Licensee Performance.....	98
F.	Final Safety Analysis Report Conformance.....	101
1.	The Purpose of the FSAR.....	102
2.	The Shoreham FSAR.....	104
3.	The Shoreham Plant Configuration Review.....	107
G.	The Torrey Pines Technology Independent Verification of Shoreham.....	110
1.	Selection of Torrey Pines.....	110
2.	Adequacy of the Scope of Torrey Pines' Review.....	112
3.	The Independent Verification.....	114
a.	Methodology.....	114
b.	Selection of Features to be Inspected.....	118

	<u>Page</u>
4. Inspection Results and Torrey Pines' Conclusion.....	121
H. Operational Quality Assurance.....	122
1. OQA Reporting Structure.....	123
a. LILCO's Structure.....	124
b. Requirements of Appendix B.....	125
c. LILCO's Structure Meets the Requirements of Appendix B.....	127
d. LILCO's Structure is Consistent with NRC Staff Guidance and Provides Positive Benefits.....	130
2. Equipment Failures.....	133
3. Replacement of Materials and Parts Important to Safety.....	136
I. Applicability of Statistical Methodology in Quality Assurance Program.....	139
J. Other Organizations that Assist in Assuring Quality.....	143
K. Conclusion.....	148
II. ENVIRONMENTAL QUALIFICATION.....	152
A. Scope of the Program.....	155
1. Safety-Related Electrical Equipment.....	153
2. Nonsafety-Related Electrical Equipment.....	157
3. Regulatory Guide 1.97 Equipment.....	161
B. Qualification Methodology.....	162
C. Justifications for Interim Operation.....	163

	<u>Page</u>
1. Administrative Controls.....	164
2. Wiring Modifications.....	165
3. Failure Modes.....	165
D. Ripeness for Ruling.....	166
E. Conclusion.....	169

## FINDINGS OF FACT

I. QUALITY ASSURANCE/QUALITY CONTROL.....	181
A. The LILCO Program.....	187
1. General Description.....	187
a. LILCO's Early Commitment to Quality.....	187
b. The Scope of LILCO's Quality Assurance Program.....	190
2. LILCO's Quality Assurance Program Meets the Criteria of 10 CFR Part 50, Appendix B.....	192
3. The Quality Assurance Organization for Shoreham.....	195
a. LILCO's Quality Assurance Organization.....	195
b. LILCO's Quality Assurance Program Incorporates the Stone & Webster and General Electric Programs.....	198
4. Elements of the LILCO Quality Assurance Program.....	200
a. The Engineering/Design Quality Assurance Program.....	200
(1) Organization for Design and Design Verification.....	200

	<u>Page</u>
(2) Design Verification.....	202
(a) Stone & Webster's Design Verification.....	202
(b) General Electric's Design Verification.....	203
(c) LILCO's Design Verification.....	204
(3) Design Change Control.....	205
(a) General Electric's and Stone Webster's Control of Design Changes.....	205
(b) LILCO's Control of Design Changes.....	206
(4) Audits for Quality Assurance in Engineering.....	207
(a) Stone & Webster's Engineering Audit Program.....	207
(b) General Electric's Engineering Audit Program.....	208
(c) LILCO's Engineering Audit Program.....	209
b. The Procurement Quality Assurance Program.....	210
(1) The LILCO/Stone & Webster Procurement Quality Assurance Program.....	210
(2) The General Electric Procurement Quality Assurance Program.....	212
c. The Construction Quality Assurance Program.....	213
(1) Stone & Webster's Construction Quality Assurance Program.....	215

	<u>Page</u>
(2) LILCO's Construction Quality Assurance Program.....	217
(3) Stop Work Orders Assure Quality in Construction.....	218
d. The Operations Quality Assurance Program.....	219
B. Additional Programs That Assure Quality At Shoreham.....	220
1. Final Stress Analysis Review Program.....	220
2. Fuel Load Drawing Update Program.....	224
3. E&DCR Implementation Verification Program.....	224
4. As-Built Piping Program.....	227
5. Electrical Raceway Qualification.....	228
a. Conduit Qualification and Inspection Program (CONQUIP).....	230
b. Conduit Support "As-Built" Program (CONSAP).....	231
c. Cable Tray Support Analysis Program (CAB TRAP).....	233
6. Final "A" Release Program.....	234
7. Third Party Audit of Reactor Pressure Vessel Quality History and Preservice Inspection.....	236
C. LILCO Audits.....	237
1. LILCO's Audit and Surveillance Program.....	239
a. General.....	239
b. LILCO Quality Assurance Department...	248
c. Quality Assurance Cost and Auditing Division of Stone & Webster.....	251

	<u>Page</u>
d. Engineering Assurance Division of Stone & Webster.....	254
e. Stone & Webster's Field Quality Control (FQC) Division.....	261
f. LILCO and Stone & Webster Supplier Audits.....	261
g. General Electric.....	263
2. Significance of Observations.....	265
3. Corrective and Preventive Action.....	267
4. Compliance With Appendix B.....	271
5. Specific Subjects.....	280
a. Calculations.....	280
(1) Ready Traceability.....	280
(2) Inadequate Documentation of Review.....	285
(3) Miscellaneous Important Concerns.....	288
(4) SAR Related.....	295
(5) Indexing and Filing.....	297
(6) Other.....	299
b. Drawings.....	304
(1) Early Pilot Audits.....	305
(2) Important Concerns.....	307
(3) Checking Concerns (Not Design Review).....	309
(4) Miscellaneous Unrelated.....	310
c. Document Control.....	312
(1) Procedure Related.....	313



	<u>Page</u>
(2) Legibility.....	316
(3) Miscellaneous Observations Relating to Indices, Logs, Files, Manuals, Procedures and Instructions.....	318
(4) Drawing Revisions in Files.....	324
d. Engineering and Design Coordination Reports (E&DCRs).....	327

## VOLUME TWO

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

(This Volume contains the balance of the Quality Assurance/Quality Control Findings of Fact, as well as the Environmental Qualification Findings of Fact.)

#### Page

#### FINDINGS OF FACT (continued)

##### I. QUALITY ASSURANCE/QUALITY CONTROL (continued)

d. Engineering and Design Coordination Reports (E&DCRs).....	Vol. I, p. 327
(1) Logging and Posting.....	336
(a) Significance Generally.....	337
(b) Reasons Why Logging and Posting Difficulties Were Not Significant.....	339
(c) Specific Logging and Posting Difficulties.....	342
(d) Corrective and Preventive Action.....	344
(e) Effectiveness of Program.....	350
(2) Additional Uses and Clarifications.....	350
(3) Missing from Files.....	356

	<u>Page</u>
(4) Timeliness.....	359
(5) Miscellaneous Construction and Engineering Items.....	362
e. Storage.....	365
(1) Storage History Cards.....	370
(2) Protection Against Weather.....	375
(3) Covers and Caps.....	378
(4) Environmental Protection.....	383
D. Housekeeping.....	388
1. General.....	388
2. The Construction Assessment Team (CAT) Inspection and Other I&E Reports.....	392
3. The Readiness Assessment Team (RAT) Inspection.....	397
E. I&E Program Description.....	402
F. The Construction Assessment Team (CAT) Inspection.....	445
G. The Readiness Assessment Team (RAT) Inspection.....	471
1. Violations.....	472
a. Violation A.....	472
(1) Welds on CRD Supports.....	472
(2) RHR System Hangers.....	474
(3) Cable Tray Supports.....	478
b. Violation B.....	482
c. Violation C.....	484
(1) Notification of Work on a Completed Structure.....	484

	<u>Page</u>
(2) E&DCR Posting.....	486
(3) E&DCR Incorporation.....	487
d. Violation D.....	489
2. EQC Final Inspection.....	494
3. Conclusions.....	502
H. Systematic Assessment of Licensee Performance (SALP).....	503
I. Final Safety Analysis Report (FSAR) Conformance.....	513
J. The Torrey Pines Independent Verification of Quality Assurance and Construction at Shoreham.....	528
1. Overview and Purpose of Torrey Pines Independent Verification.....	528
2. Selection of Torrey Pines.....	530
a. Technical Qualifications.....	530
b. Institutional and Individual Independence from LILCO, its Contractors and Shoreham.....	533
3. The Scope of Torrey Pines Independent Verification.....	534
4. Torrey Pines' Methodology.....	539
a. Task A.....	540
b. Task B.....	545
c. Task C.....	547
d. Task D.....	549
e. Task E.....	551
f. Task F.....	552
g. Torrey Pines' Judgment-Based Sampling Methodology.....	556

	<u>Page</u>
5. Preservation of Torrey Pines' Independence and Lack of Influence by LILCO or Contractors.....	559
6. Results of the Verification and Torrey Pines' Conclusions.....	563
K. Operational Quality Assurance -- Independence.....	567
1. LILCO Organization.....	569
2. LILCO's Compliance with Appendix B, Criterion I.....	572
3. NRC Staff Guidance.....	576
L. Operational Quality Assurance -- Replacement of Materials and Parts Important to Safety.....	579
1. Procurement.....	580
2. Installation.....	582
3. Inspection, Testing and Documentation.....	584
4. Staff Conclusions.....	587
M. Other Organizations That Assist in Assuring Quality.....	588
1. Independent Safety Engineering Group.....	588
2. Review of Operations Committee.....	604
3. Nuclear Review Board.....	608
4. Advisors to LILCO Management.....	612
5. LILCO's Treatment of Equipment Failures.....	617
N. Statistical Methodology.....	621
1. Regulations and Industry Practice.....	623

	<u>Page</u>
2. Statistical Methodology Inappropriate for Quality Assurance Auditing Program.....	626
II. Environmental Qualification.....	632
A. Background.....	632
B. Regulatory Framework.....	635
C. Scope of Shoreham's Environmental Qualification Program.....	639
1. Safety Related Electrical Equipment.....	639
2. Non-safety Related Electrical Equipment.....	645
3. Regulatory Guide 1.97 Equipment.....	650
D. Qualification Methodology and Its Review.....	652
E. Justifications for Interim Operation.....	658
1. Administrative Controls.....	660
2. Wiring Modifications.....	661
3. Failure Modes.....	661
4. Open Items.....	662