



UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

March 17, 1994

Docket Nos. 50-361
and 50-362

Mr. Harold B. Ray
Senior Vice President
Southern California Edison Co.
Irvine Operations Center
23 Parker Street
Irvine, California 92718

Mr. Edwin A. Guiles
Vice President
Engineering and Operations
San Diego Gas & Electric Co.
101 Ash Street
San Diego, California 92112

Gentlemen:

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR WITHHOLDING INFORMATION FROM PUBLIC DISCLOSURE - SAN ONOFRE NUCLEAR GENERATING STATION - UNITS 2 AND 3 - "ROOT CAUSE EVALUATION FOR CPC AXIAL ANOMALY"

By letter dated July 19, 1993, from Southern California Edison Company (SCE) and by affidavit dated June 11, 1993, signed by S. A. Toelle, Nuclear Licensing requests that the following be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.790:

"Root Cause Evaluation for CPC Axial Shape Anomaly for SONGS Units 2 and 3" June 1993

Also enclosed is the nonproprietary version of the above document.

The Combustion Engineering affidavit forwarded with the proprietary document stated that the proprietary document cited should be considered exempt from mandatory public disclosure for the following reasons:

1. The information sought to be withheld from public disclosure, which is owned and has been held in confidence by Combustion Engineering, is details and results of COLSS and CPC uncertainty analysis methodology.
2. The information consists of test data or other similar data concerning a process, method or component, the application of which results in substantial competitive advantage to Combustion Engineering.
3. The information is being transmitted to the Commission in confidence under the provisions of 10 CFR Section 2.790 with the understanding that it is to be received in confidence by the Commission.
4. Public disclosure of the information is likely to cause substantial harm to the competitive position of Combustion Engineering because:

210037

NRC FILE CENTER COPY

9403230217 940317
PDR ADOCK 05000361
P PDR

DF01 1/0

- a. A similar product is manufactured and sold by major pressurized water reactor competitors of Combustion Engineering.
- b. Development of this information by C-E required tens of thousands of manhours and hundreds of thousands of dollars. A competitor would have to undergo similar expense in generating equivalent information.
- c. In order to acquire such information, a competitor would also require considerable time and inconvenience to develop similar details and results of COLSS and CPC uncertainty analysis methodology.
- d. The information consists of details and results of COLSS and CPC uncertainty analysis methodology, the application of which provides a competitive economic advantage. The availability of such information to competitors would enable them to modify their product to better compete with Combustion Engineering, take marketing or other actions to improve their product's position or impair the position of Combustion Engineering's product, and avoid developing similar data and analyses in support of their processes, methods or apparatus.
- e. Use of the information by competitors in the international marketplace would increase their ability to market nuclear steam supply systems by reducing the costs associated with their technology development.

We have reviewed your letter and the material based on the requirements and criteria of 10 CFR 2.790 and, on the basis of Combustion Engineering's statements, have determined that the submitted information sought to be withheld contains trade secrets or proprietary commercial information.

Therefore, "Root Cause Evaluation for CPC Axial Shape Anomaly for SONGS Units 2 and 3" marked as proprietary will be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.790(b)(5) and Section 103(b) of the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, as amended.

Withholding from public inspection shall not affect the right, if any, of persons properly and directly concerned to inspect the documents. If the need arises, we may send copies of this information to our consultants working in this area. We will, of course, ensure that the consultants have signed the appropriate agreements for handling proprietary information.

Messrs. Ray and Guiles

- 3 -

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You should also understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Mel Fields".

Mel Fields, Project Manager
Project Directorate V
Division of Reactor Projects III/IV/V
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

cc: See next page

Messrs. Ray and Guiles
Southern California Edison Company

cc:
T. E. Oubre, Esq.
Southern California Edison Company
Irvine Operations Center
23 Parker Street
Irvine, California 92718

Chairman, Board of Supervisors
County of San Diego
1600 Pacific Highway, Room 335
San Diego, California 92101

Alan R. Watts, Esq.
Rourke & Woodruff
701 S. Parker St. No. 7000
Orange, California 92668-4702

Mr. Sherwin Harris
Resource Project Manager
Public Utilities Department
City of Riverside
3900 Main Street
Riverside, California 92522

Mr. Charles B. Brinkman, Manager
Washington Nuclear Operations
ABB Combustion Engineering Nuclear Power
12300 Twinbrook Parkway, Suite 330
Rockville, Maryland 20852

Mr. R. W. Krieger, Vice President
Southern California Edison Company
San Onofre Nuclear Generating Station
P. O. Box 128
San Clemente, California 92674-0128

Mr. Don J. Womeldorf
Chief, Environmental Management Branch
California Department of Health Services
714 P Street, Room 616
Sacramento, California 95814

San Onofre Nuclear Generating
Station, Unit Nos. 2 and 3

Mr. Thomas E. Bostrom, Project Manager
Bechtel Power Corporation
12440 E. Imperial Highway
Norwalk, California 90650

Mr. Robert G. Lacy
Manager, Nuclear Department
San Diego Gas & Electric Company
P. O. Box 1831
San Diego, California 92111

Mr. Steve Hsu
Radiologic Health Branch
State Department of Health Services
Post Office Box 942732
Sacramento, California 94234

Resident Inspector/San Onofre NPS
c/o U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Post Office Box 4329
San Clemente, California 92674

Mayor
City of San Clemente
100 Avenida Presidio
San Clemente, California 92672

Regional Administrator, Region V
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
1450 Maria Lane, Suite 210
Walnut Creek, California 94596

Messrs. Ray and Guiles

-3-

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You should also understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

Sincerely,

Original signed by:

Mel Fields, Project Manager
Project Directorate V
Division of Reactor Projects III/IV/V
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

cc: See next page

DISTRIBUTION:

- Docket File
- NRC & Local PDRs
- PDV Reading File
- JRoe
- EAdensam
- TQuay
- DFoster-Curseen
- MFields
- MPSiemien, OGC
- KPerkins, RV

*See previous concurrence

OFFICE	PDV/LA <i>JRC</i>	PDV/PM	OGC	PDV/D
NAME	DFoster-Curseen	MFields <i>MF</i>	MSiemien*	TQuay <i>TQ</i>
DATE	3/17/94	3/17/94	3/15/94	3/17/94

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY DOCUMENT NAME: SOWHOLD.

Messrs. Ray and Guiles

-3-

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You should also understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

Sincerely,

Original signed by:

Mel Fields, Project Manager
 Project Directorate V
 Division of Reactor Projects III/IV/V
 Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

cc: See next page

DISTRIBUTION:

- Docket File
- NRC & Local PDRs
- PDV Reading File
- JRoe
- EAdensam
- TQuay
- DFoster-Curseen
- MFields
- MPSiemien, OGC
- KPerkins, RV

*See previous concurrence

OFFICE	PDV/LA <i>AC</i>	PDV/PM	OGC	PDV/D
NAME	DFoster-Curseen	MFields <i>MF</i>	MSiemien*	TQuay <i>T²</i>
DATE	3/17/94	3/17/94	3/15/94	3/17/94

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

DOCUMENT NAME: SOWHOLD.