



UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

January 31, 1994

Docket No. 50-155

Mr. Patrick M. Donnelly, Plant Manager
Big Rock Point Plant
Consumers Power Company
10269 U.S. 31 North
Charlevoix, Michigan 49201

Dear Mr. Donnelly:

SUBJECT: BIG ROCK POINT PLANT - GENERIC LETTER 89-10, SUPPLEMENT 5,
"INACCURACY OF MOTOR-OPERATED VALVE DIAGNOSTIC EQUIPMENT"
(TAC M87918)

On June 28, 1993, the NRC staff issued Supplement 5, "Inaccuracy of Motor-Operated Valve Diagnostic Equipment," to Generic Letter (GL) 89-10, "Safety-Related Motor-Operated Valve Testing and Surveillance," requesting nuclear power plant licensees and construction permit holders (1) to re-examine their MOV programs and to identify measures taken to account for uncertainties in properly setting valve operating thrust to ensure operability, and (2) to evaluate the schedule necessary to consider the new information on MOV diagnostic equipment inaccuracy and to take appropriate action in response to that information. Within 90 days of receipt of Supplement 5 to GL 89-10, licensees were required (1) to notify the NRC staff of the diagnostic equipment used to confirm the proper size, or to establish settings, for safety-related MOVs, and (2) to report whether they had taken actions or planned to take actions (including schedule) to address the new information on the accuracy of MOV diagnostic equipment.

The staff has reviewed the responses, and has found that, for the most part, licensees and permit holders have been actively addressing the uncertainties regarding the accuracy of MOV diagnostic equipment. The increased inaccuracy of MOV diagnostic equipment can raise questions regarding (1) the adequacy of torque switch settings to provide sufficient thrust while not exceeding thrust or torque structural limits and (2) the capability of actuator motors at current settings. In their responses, licensees and permit holders indicated that many MOVs had the potential for underthrusting or overthrusting as a result of the higher than expected inaccuracy of MOV diagnostic equipment. Consequently, some licensees reported that MOVs have been retested, adjusted, or modified to resolve the concerns regarding the accuracy of MOV diagnostic equipment.

In your response dated September 27, 1993, you stated that Consumers Power (CPCo) uses Liberty Technologies' VOTES equipment for MOV diagnostic testing. You also stated that 12 MOVs were affected by the Liberty Technologies' Part 21 notice, dated October 2, 1992, and that CPCo had determined four MOVs to exceed their thrust rating, but no immediate action was required. You stated that, of those four MOVs, one had its actuator replaced and torque switch reset, and another had its torque switch reset. You stated that the

9402100134 940131
PDR ADDOCK 05000155
P PDR

U10050

DF01
40
NRC FILE CENTER COPY

Mr. Patrick M. Donnelly

- 2 -

January 31, 1994

remaining two MOVs were only 2% and 3% overthrust. During a future inspection, the NRC staff will discuss CPCo's resolution of the MOV diagnostic equipment accuracy issue. Particularly, the staff will discuss (1) CPCo's basis for determining that no immediate action was required for the four actuators, and (2) whether CPCo addressed the thrust/torque structural and motor capability limits.

This completes all efforts on TAC M87918. If you have any questions regarding this issue, please call me at (301) 504-3018.

Sincerely,

Original signed by

Leonard N. Olshan, Project Manager
Project Directorate III-1
Division of Reactor Projects - III/IV/V
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

cc: See next page

DISTRIBUTION

Docket File

NRC & LPDRs

JZwolinski

LMarsh

ARBlough

LOlshan

CJamerson

OGC

ACRS(10)

BJorgensen, RIII

AHensen

TScarbrough 7/E/23

| | | | |
|--------|-----------|-------------|-----------|
| OFFICE | LA:PD31 | PM:PD31 | (A)D:PD31 |
| NAME | CJamerson | LOlshan:jkd | ARBlough |
| DATE | 1/27/94 | 1/28/94 | 1/28/94 |

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

FILENAME: G:\WPDOCS\BIGROCK\BR87918.GL

Mr. Patrick M. Donnelly, Plant Manager
cc:

Big Rock Point Nuclear Plant

Mr. Thomas A. McNish, Secretary
Consumers Power Company
212 West Michigan Avenue
Jackson, Michigan 49201

Judd L. Bacon, Esquire
Consumers Power Company
212 West Michigan Avenue
Jackson, Michigan 49201

Jane E. Brannon, County Clerk
County Building Annex
203 Antrim Street
Charlevoix, Michigan 49720

Office of the Governor
Room 1 - Capitol Building
Lansing, Michigan 48913

Regional Administrator, Region III
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
801 Warrenville Road
Lisle, Illinois 60532-4351

Nuclear Facilities and Environmental
Monitoring Section Office
Division of Radiological Health
Department of Public Health
3423 N. Logan Street
P. O. Box 30195
Lansing, Michigan 48909

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Resident Inspector Office
Big Rock Point Plant
10253 U.S. 31 North
Charlevoix, Michigan 49720

Mr. David P. Hoffman, Vice President
Nuclear Operations
Big Rock Point Plant
Consumers Power Company
212 West Michigan Avenue
Jackson, Michigan 49201