

INDIANA UNIVERSITY

DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL SCIENCE Woodburn Hall Bloomington, Indiana 47405

April 16, 1980

John Carr Freedom of Information Act Officer U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20000 FOIR-80-226
Rec'd 4-22-80

Dear Sir:

I would like to request that the attached list of documents dealing with NRC's decision on the mixed oxide fuel rule-making hearing, GESMO, published in the Federal Register, November 12, 1975, be released under the Freedom of Information Act.

I recognize that the Commission has, in the past, refused to release those documents and has been sustained in that refusal by the courts. However, I submit that many of the conditions and circumstances which were the basis of the past refusal have changed. In particular:

- Many of the key actors giving pre-decisional advice to the Commission and amongst themselves are no longer at NRC. Thus, whatever the chilling effect release might have had in 1975 or 1976, it is no longer as profound.
- 2. The GESMO rulemaking is no longer a formal part of the Commission's regulatory agenda. Release of the documents at this time, then, cannot affect the outcome of a sensitive and controversial process.
- 3. The Commission has ruled in the last two years that staff position papers on issues considered by the Commission should be available to the public. While that policy was not made retroactive, it should be noted that many of the documents herein requested would have been available had the policy been in effect in 1975.

I recognize that, despite these arguments, the Commission does have the legal discretion to reject my FOIA request. I do believe, however, that such a rejection would not be in the public interest. I intend to use any information obtained as part of my research into the decision-making processes used in scientific regulatory agencies. I believe that such research, as well as being important from an academic viewpoint, can serve a significant public purpose. I should note, in this connection, that similar work I did for NRC as part of the Goals Task Force for Radioactive Waste Management, work published as NUREG-0300 and NUREG-0412, had a major impact in advancing a more realistic and publicly responsive conceptualization of the waste management problem. Indeed, many of the Task Force's ideas were incorporated, almost verbatim, in the Report to the President of the Interagency Review Group on Nuclear

Waste Management (a report which I helped author as a full time consultant to the Office of Science and Technology Policy, Executive Office of the President).

In summary, then, I believe that the Commission should release the documents requested on the attached list. Such a release would be consistent with present NRC policy, not result in the disadvantages cited five years ago at the time of the initial FOIA rejection, and would serve the public interest.

Sincerely,

Daniel Metlay

Assistant Professor

Daniel Mickay

Enclosure

DM:mh

DOCUMENTS REQUESTED UNDER FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT

NO.	DATE	TITLE			
1.	7/3/75	SECY-75-338 COMMENTS ON COMMISSION'S PROVISIONAL VIEW ON PU RECYCLE FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE MAY 8, 1975			
2.	7/9/75	FOR: Samuel J. Chilk, SECY FROM: Peter L. Strauss, General Counsel SUBJ: SECY-75-338, COMMENTS RECEIVED DURING PLUTONIUM RECYCLE PROCEEDINGS			
3.	8/11/75	FOR: Files FROM: Samuel J. Chilk, SECY SUBJ: GESMO COMMENTS			
4.	8/14/75	FOR: The Commissioners FROM: R. E. Cunningham SUBJ: PU RECYCLE PROPOSED WORK PLAN FOR REVIEW AND ASSESSM OF COMMENTS ON PROVISIONAL VIEWS AND GESMO COMPLETION			
5.	8/20/75	FOR: Files FROM: Samuel J. Chilk, SECY SUBJ: MTG WITH ERDA REPS ON THE TOPIC OF PLUTONIUM RECYCLE (9/2/75)			
6.	8/22/75	FOR: Commissioners FROM: James E. Hard SUBJ: SCHEDULE FOR COMMENT REVIEW ON PLUTONIUM RECYCLE PRO-			
7.	8/29/75	FOR: The Commissioners FROM: Lee V. Gossick SUBJ: SCOPING PAPER GESMO - DECISION ON PROVISIONAL VIEWS			
8.	7/10/75	FOR: The Commissioners FROM: K. R. Chapman SUBJ: PU RECYCLE PROVISIONAL VIEW ISSUES AND ALTERNATIVES			
9.	9/12/75	FOR: The Commissioners FROM: Ben Huberman SUBJ: PLUTONIUM RECYCLE - GUIDANCE TO THE STAFF			
10.	9/12/75	FOR: Tom Rehm SUBJ: PU RECYCLE PROVISIONAL VIEWS - DISCUSSION PAPER ON ISSUES AND ALTERNATIVES			
11.	9/17/75	FOR: The Commissioners FROM: Commissioner Mason SUBJ: HUBERMAN'S 9/12 PLUTONIUM RECYCLE MEMO			

12.	9/19/75	FOR:	The Commissioners
	2112112	THRU: SUBJ:	Lee V. Gossick STAFF PAPER ON PU RECYCLE - FINAL DECISION PROCEDURES AND INTERIM LICENSING - Memo
13.	9/23/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	Ken Chapman Commissioner Mason REVIEW OF WASH-1327
14.	10/7/75	MEMO FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	Chairman Anders, Commissioner Gilinsky, Commissioner Kennedy, Commissioner Mason, Commissioner Rowden Ben Huberman PU RECYCLE
15.	10/7/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	The Commissioners K. R. Chapman PROCEDURES FORREACHING A FINAL DECISION ON PLUTONIUM RECYCLE AND INTERIM LICENSING
16.	10/8/75	MEMO TO: FROM: SUBJ:	Chairman Anders, Commissioner Gilinsky, Commissioner Kennedy, Commissioner Rowden Edward A. Mason, Commissioner THOUGHTS ON AN AGENDA FOR COMMISSION DISCUSSIONS PLUTONIUM RECYCLE
17.	10/14/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	The Commissioners Peter L. Strauss, General Counsel PLUTONIUM RECYCLE
18.	10/15/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	The Commissioners Howard K. Shapar PROCEDURES FOR REACHING A FINAL DECISION PU RECYCLE AND INTERIM LICENSING
19.	10/15/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	The Commissioners Norm Haller PU RECYCLE
20.	10/20/75	FOR: FROM: THRU: SUBJ:	The Commissioners H. K. Shapar, Exec Legal Dir Exec Director for Operations DRAFT FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE - SCOPE AND PROCEDURES FOR GENERIC PLUTONIUM RECYCLE ENVIRONMENTAL STATEMENT AND INTERIM LICENSING ACTIONS - DRAFT FRN
21.	10/22/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	Ben Huberman, Director, OPE Leonard S. Spector, Special Counsel to Commissioner Gilinsky COMMENTS OF COMMISSIONER GILINSKY ON DRAFT GESMO FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE
22.	10/22/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	Ben Huberman Commissioner Mason COMMENTS ON OCTOBER 20 DRAFT FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE- SCOPE AND PROCEDURES

23.	10/22/75	FOR! FROM: SUBJ:	Ben Huberman Commissioner Kennedy PU RECYCLE FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE
24.	10/22/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	The Commissioners Peter L. Strauss & Ben Huberman PU RECYCLE
25.	10/24/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	Huberman/Strauss Commissioner Mason PU - RECYCLE
26.	10/24/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	Chairman Anders, Commissioners Kennedy, Mason & Rowsen Commissioner Gilinsky INTERIM LICENSING OF PLUTONIUM RECYCLE FACILITIES
27.	10/28/75	DRAFT	U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION MIXED OXIDE FUEL - (PU RECYCLE) In WR's
28.	10/29/75	FOR: FROM: THRU: SUBJ:	The Commissioner: H. K. Shapar, Exec Legal Director Exec Dir for Operations REVISED DRAFT FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE - SCOPE AND PROCEDURES FOR GENERIC PLUTONIUM RECYCLE ENVIRONMENTAL STATEMENT AND INTERIM LICENSING ACTIONS
29.	10/29/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	The Commissioners Howard K. Shapar REPLACEMENT PAGE 15 FOR OCTOBER 29 DRAFT FRN
30.	11/3/75	FOR: FROM: THRU: SUBJ:	The Commissioners H. K. Shapar, Exec Legal Dir Exec Dir for Operations REVISED DRAFT FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE- SCOPE AND PRO- CEDURES FOR GENERIC PLUTONIUM RECYCLE ENVIRONMENTAL STATEMENT AND INTERIM LICENCING ACTIONS
31.	11/7/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	The Commissioners K. R. Chapman, Director, NMSS PU RECYCLE PROCEDURES
32.	11/9/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	The Commissioners H. K. Shapar, Exec Legal Dir FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE - SCOPE AND PROCEDURES FOR GENERIC PLUTONIUM RECYCLE ENVIRONMENTAL STATEMENT AND INTERIM LICENSING ACTIONS
33.	11/10/75	TO: FROM: SUBJ:	The Commissioners Ken Chapman PROCEDURES FOR REACHING DECISION ON USE OF MIXED OXIDE FUEL
34.	Undated	FOR: FROM:	Chairman Anders, Commissioners Kennedy, Mason & Rowden Commissioner Gilinsky

34 (Cont'd)		SUBJ:	USE OF WORDS "CRITERIA," "SAFEGUARDS REGULATIONS," AND "SAFEGUARDS REQUIREMENTS" IN DRAFT PLUTONIUM RECYCLE FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE
35.	Undated	MEMO TO: FROM: SUBJ:	C. Mason Peter L. Strauss YOUR INQUIRY CONCERNING NEPA AND ECONOMIC ANALYSIS
36.	9/2/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	C. H. Builder R. B. Leachman POSSIBLE ADDITIONS TO GESMO PROVISIONAL VIEWS SCOPING PAPER
37.	9/11/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	L. V. Gossick H. Lowenberg DISCUSSION PAPER - PU RECYCLE PROV VIEWS
38.	9/15/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	H. Lowenberg Bill Dircks QUESTIONS CONCERNING THE 9/10/75 PU RECYCLE PROVISIONAL VIEW ISSUES AND ALTERNATIVES
39.	9/15/75	NOTE TO: FROM: SUBJ:	Chapman Builder _ PROPOSED ACTION SAFEGUARDS PORTION CF GESMO
40.	9/18/75	OUTLINE:	STAFF PAPER ON PROCEDURES TO BE FOLLOWED TO REACH A DECISION ON WIDE-SCALE PU RECYCLE
41.	9/18/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	Ken Chapman Builder PROVISION DECISION PAPER NO. 3
42.	9/23/75	FOR: THRU: SUBJ:	C. H. Builder & H. K. Shapar K. R. Chapman COMMISSION DECISION PAPER ON PU RECYCLE - FINAL VIEWS ON PROCEDURES
43.	10/3/75	FOR: FROM: SUBJ:	Ken Chapman H. Lowenberg INTERIM LICENSING ALTERNATIVES
44.	11/6/75	FROM: SUBJ:	C. H. Builder SCHEDULE FOR INTERIM LICENSING AND ISSUANCE OF NEW SAFEGUARDS REQUIREMENTS FOR PLUTONIUM OPERATIONS
45.	Undated	OUTLINE:	STAFF PAPER ON PU RECYCLE
46.	Undated	OUTLINE:	STAFF PAPER ON PU RECYCLE
47.	Undated	LICENSING	STATUS OF WESTINGHOUSE MOX FUEL FABRICATION PLANT