





Module II – Circuit Analysis Fire-Induced Circuit Failures Research

Joint EPRI/NRC-RES Fire PRA Workshop June 25-29, 2018

Gabe Taylor – U.S. NRC

Daniel Funk – JENSEN HUGHES

Dane Lovelace – JENSEN HUGHES

A Collaboration of the Electric Power Research Institute (EPRI) & U.S. NRC Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research (RES)

CIRCUIT FAILURE RESEARCH Objectives

- To provide a status update on the recent research efforts related to fire-induced cable damage and circuit/equipment failures
- Topics covered
 - Circuit Failure Testing
 - Electrical Expert PIRT Panel (NUREG/CR-7150, Vol. 1 / EPRI 1026424)
 - PRA SSHAC Level 2 Expert Elicitation (NUREG/CR-7150, Vol. 2 / EPRI 3002001989)
 - Data Analysis (NUREG-2128)
 - NUREG/CR-6850 Impacts
 - JACQUE-FIRE 3 Working Group (NUREG/CR-7150, Vol. 3 / EPRI 3002009214)
 - Current Transformer (CT) Open Circuit Testing (NUREG/CR-7228)
 - High Energy Arc Fault (HEAF) Testing (NEA/CSNI/R(2017)7)
 - Instrumentation Circuit Testing (NUREG/CR-7244, in publications)





WARNING!

Some of the material in this presentation has NOT been generically endorsed by the NRC.

The referenced documents in this presentation may be endorsed in future RG updates (in part or full).

NRC may endorse on a case-by-case basis.





CIRCUIT FAILURE RESEARCH Testing Programs

- Testing programs include:
 - NEI/EPRI 2002
 - NRC/SNL CAROLFIRE 2008
 - NRC/SNL DESIREE-FIRE 2010
 - NRC/SNL KATE-FIRE 2011
 - NRC and OECD HEAF testing (2017, 2018, Phase 2 In Progress)
 - Current transformer testing 2016
 - Instrumentation circuit testing 2018
 - Panel Wiring (Canceled)
 - Performance of Cable Coatings Completed 2017





CIRCUIT FAILURE RESEARCH Electrical PIRT Panel NUREG/CR-7150, Vol. 1 & EPRI 1026424

PIRT

- Phenomena Identification and Ranking Table
- Structured expert elicitation (use of expert judgment)

Purpose

- Identify phenomena that influences the failure mode of electrical cables during severe fire conditions
- If possible, arrive at consensus technical positions on longstanding fire-induced circuit failure issues
- Provide technical basis for follow-on PRA Expert Panel

Report - JACQUE-FIRE

- Results of PIRT *are not* regulatory guidance
- NRR will establish regulatory positions on the technical results presented in the PIRT Report







CIRCUIT FAILURE RESEARCH Data Analysis Effort: NUREG-2128

- NRC ELECTRA FIRE
 - ELECTRA-FIRE
 - Electrical Cable Test Results and Analysis During Fire Exposure
 - Objective
 - Consolidate three major fire-induced circuit and cable failure experiments between 2001 and 2011
 - Further refine available test data to obtain additional insights from existing data
 - Scope
 - Evaluate parameters that effect hot-short failure modes and hotshort durations
 - Intra-cable & Inter-cable faults
 - Concurrence
 - Ground equivalent hot shorts







CIRCUIT FAILURE RESEARCH PRA Expert Panel NUREG/CR-7150, Vol. 2 & EPRI 3002001989

- PRA SSHAC Level 2 Expert Elicitation
 - Following PIRT, SSHAC Level 2 process for use of expert judgment
 - Formal process for soliciting, judging, and weighing input
- Purpose
 - Use expanded data set to revise/develop conditional probabilities of hot short given cable damage
 - Results replace guidance and probability values in NUREG/CR-6850, Task 10
 - Develop hot short duration probabilities for AC and DC control circuits
- Status
 - Final Report Issued May 2014
 - Use of NUREG/CR-7150, Vol. 2 Probabilities and Durations endorsed by NRC Interim Guide Memo (IGM)







CIRCUIT FAILURE RESEARCH JACQUE-FIRE 3 Working Group NUREG/CR-7150, Vol. 3 & EPRI 3002009214

- Provide technical basis/positions on outstanding circuit analysis issues
 - Use of the PIRT results (Clarifications to Appendix J of NEI 00-01)
 - Limits on the number of hot-short circuit failures to assume for MSOs
 - Established a NEW class of equipment "High Impact Component"
 - Update to hot-short classifications for select cases (i.e., plausible, implausible, incredible)
 - Shorting switch criteria and design considerations (New Appendix I to NEI 00-01)
 - Limit on Spurious Operation Duration for certain circuits
 - Clarifications to Volume 1, based on insights obtained from Volume 2 results







Which is Proper Polarity?







PROPER POLARITY Conclusion

Conclusion

- AC and DC solenoids and relays used in double break control circuits should be assumed "polarity insensitive," unless specific manufacturer's technical data indicates the device is "polarity sensitive".
- "Polarity insensitive" means that the coil will operate regardless of the orientation of the applied positive and negative voltage to the coil.





DEVICE ACTUATIONS FROM DIFFERENT POWER SOURCE

Issue

-Can an ac power source energize a dc device (solenoid or relay)?

Conclusion

-Yes, unless engineering analysis or testing shows otherwise.





HIGH IMPACT COMPONENT

Definition

"The set of components whose fire-induced failure could result in immediate and unrecoverable consequences for an operating nuclear power plant, e.g., loss of reactor coolant system inventory, inventory loss with the potential to damage the fuel in less than or equal to one hour, the potential for a release of radiation by bypassing primary containment. As such, this set of components warrants the use of a more conservative circuit failure criteria in the postfire safe shutdown analysis."

Consider for "implausible" failure modes





HIGH IMPACT COMPONENT CONSIST OF

- High/low pressure interface
 - See Appendix C of NEI 00-01
- Target conductor(s) is(are) associated with cabling for a single component or single signal that due to fire-induced hot short spurious operation, could cause a transient that results in an unrecoverable condition leading to fuel damage.





HIGH IMPACT COMPONENTS BWR

- Spurious opening of both shutdown cooling suction valves (classified as "high/low pressure interfaces")
- Spurious opening of multiple Safety Relief Valves (SRVs) and failure (due to "fire damage" effects) of a sufficient number of low pressure make-up systems such that the inventory loss is not bounded by design basis accident analysis.





HIGH IMPACT COMPONENT PWR

- Spurious opening of the shutdown cooling suction valves (to SDC/LPSI/RHR – the "high/low pressure interfaces")
- Spurious opening of one or more Pressurizer Power Operated Relief Valves (PORV) and failure (due to "fire damage" effects) of its associated block valve to close or remain closed.





SINGLE BREAK CONTROL CIRCUITS Table of Plausibility

Table 3-1: Failure Modes for Single Break Control Circuits								
Power Supply	Grounded AC		Ungrounded AC (from CPT or Distributed) or DC					
	Conductor Hot Short Failure Mode							
Target Cable Configuration	Intra-Cable	Inter-Cable	Intra-Cable	Inter-Cable	Ground Fault Equivalent			
Thermoset Insulated Conductor Cable	Plausible	Plausible	Plausible	Plausible	Plausible			
Thermoplastic Insulated Conductor Cable	Plausible	Plausible	Plausible	Plausible	Plausible			
Metal Foil Shield Wrap Cable	Plausible	Incredible	Plausible	Incredible	Plausible			
Armored Cable	Plausible	Incredible	Plausible	Incredible	Plausible			





DOUBLE BREAK CONTROL CIRCUITS

Table of Plausibility

 \bigcirc

Table 3-2: Failure Modes for Double Break Control Circuits (includes single break control circuits with control power fuses removed) [Ungrounded AC w/CPTs, Ungrounded DC (Ungrounded AC w/o CPTs)]								
Target Cable Configuration	Intra-Cable & Intra-Cable	Intra-Cable & Inter-Cable	Inter-Cable & Inter-Cable	Intra-Cable & Ground Fault Equivalent	Inter-Cable & Ground Fault Equivalent			
Thermoset Insulated Conductor Cable	Plausible	Plausible	Incredible	Plausible	Implausible (latching) Incredible (non-latching)			
Thermoplastic Insulated Conductor Cable	Plausible	Plausible	Implausible (latching) Incredible (non-latching)	Plausible	Implausible (latching) Incredible (non-latching)			
Metal Foil Shield Wrap Cable	Plausible	Incredible	Incredible	Plausible	Incredible			
Armored Cable	Plausible	Incredible	Incredible	Plausible	Incredible			





APPENDIX I – SHORTING SWITCH GUIDANCE







SHORTING SWITCH DRAWBACK







CONSIDERATIONS WHEN USING A SHORTING SWITCH

- Licensing Conditions
 - 10 CFR 50, Appendix R
 - III.G.2
 - III.L.7
 - GL 86-10
- Component Classification
- Engineering Evaluation
 - Maintain integrity of switch and other associated components





SHORTING SWITCH DESIGN CONSIDERATIONS







ELECTRICAL DESIGN AND OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

- Minimum pick-up
- Credible source cables/conductors
 - Sometimes referred to as "aggressor"
- Maximum expected voltage / current
- Cabinet fires
- Fire-induced open circuits
- Additional mitigating measures





CURRENT GUIDANCE ON MULTIPLE CIRCUIT FAILURES

- RG 1.189, Rev. 2 took exception to
 - NEI 00-01 Section 3.5.1.1 "Circuit Failure Criteria"
 - Bullet 7 under "Circuits for 'Important to safe shutdown' components"
 - Multiple fire induced circuit failures affecting separate conductors in separate cables (where circuit failure is not sealed-in or latched)
- Where defense-in-depth features are present
 - Considered at least 2 separate cables
 - High-low pressure interface \rightarrow considered at least 3 separate cables
- Where NO defense-in-depth features are present
 - No limit on the number of separate cables





JACQUE-FIRE VOLUME 3 RECOMMENDATIONS Number of Fire-Induced Failures to Consider (1-1-2-2-4)

- Hot shorts for transient inrush considerations
 - Only consider single inrush, provided supply and load sequencer is not degraded from fire effects
- Inter-cable, non-latching hot shorts with 10 minutes coping time
 - One (Single Break)
- Inter-cable
 - Two
- Non-latching with 10 minute coping time
 - Two
- Selective Sequence
 - Four





DURATION *Recommendation for Deterministic Applications*

- ac control circuits
 - 20 Minutes
- dc control circuits
 40 Minutes
- Single worst case postulated hot short-induced spurious operation







ANTICIPATED REGULATORY FOOTPRINT

- JACQUE-FIRE Volume 3 issued November 2017
- NEI 00-01 has been revised to incorporate JACQUE-FIRE insights (Rev. 4 submitted to NRC)
- RG 1.189 to be revised to endorse NEI 00-01, Rev 4 (in full or in part)





NRC AND OECD HEAF TESTING

- 2017 Nuclear Energy Agency issued NEA/CSNI/R(2017)7, documenting a series of test performed to investigate high energy arcing fault (HEAF) phenomena
- 26 tests completed
- Several tests involving aluminum exhibited energy releases and byproducts different than non-aluminum tests
- NRC staff identified the involvement of aluminum during a HEAF as a potential Generic Issue
- Additional testing is planned / ongoing.







Examples of HEAFs that have occurred













HEAF Testing







INSTRUMENT CIRCUIT TESTING

- Recommendation from JACQUE-FIRE 1 & 2
- Limited testing done to investigate failure mode and complement testing from 2001
- Scoping tests performed by SNL

- 39 tests





Failure mode was observed in several TS cable and in one TP cable tested.

US.NRC

Final Report

Response of Nuclear Power Plant Instrumentation Cables

Exposed to Fire Conditions

Office of Nuclear Regulatory Res

NUREG/CR-7244

Regression analysis indicated that conductor count and specific insulation material had influence on leakage time.







INSTRUMENTATION CIRCUIT TESTING Circuits Tested



Figure 3-1: 4-20 mA Instrumentation circuit for fire test, grounded



Figure 3-3: 10–50 mA Instrumentation circuit for fire test



Figure 3-2: 4-20 mA Instrumentation circuit for fire test, ungrounded









CIRCUIT FAILURE RESEARCH DC Test Video and Pictures







CIRCUIT FAILURE RESEARCH





