

DOCKET NOS.: 50-275 and 50-323

LICENSEE: PACIFIC GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY (PG&E)

FACILITY: DIABLO CANYON NUCLEAR POWER PLANT, UNITS 1 AND 2

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF MAY 23, 1989 PUBLIC MEETING TO DISCUSS PROPOSED CHANGE IN ALLOWED OUTAGE TIME FOR A DIESEL GENERATOR FROM 72 HOURS TO 7 DAYS (LAR 89-05, TAC NOS. 73109 AND 73110)

On May 23, 1989 the NRC staff and its consultants met with PG&E in Rockville, Maryland to discuss proposed License Amendment Request (LAR) 89-05, which would increase the allowed outage time (AOT) for any diesel generator from 72 hours to 7 days. This LAR was submitted by letter dated May 12, 1989. A report documenting the licensee's studies evaluating the risk and reliability of the revised AOT were submitted by letter dated May 11, 1989. In these submittals, the licensee stated that it plans to upgrade the onsite AC power system by adding a sixth diesel generator. This change would be made at the fourth refueling outage for Unit 2, which is scheduled to begin in October of 1991. Attendees at the meeting are given in Enclosure 1. The viewgraphs presented by the licensee during the meeting are given in Enclosure 2. At the conclusion of the meeting, the NRC staff stated that its review of the LAR was underway, and that if it needed additional information as part of its review, a request for such information would be transmitted to the licensee as soon as the need is established.

original signed by

Harry Rood, Senior Project Manager Project Directorate V Division of Reactor Projects - III, IV, V and Special Projects

Enclosures:

- 1. Meeting Attendees
- 2. Viewgraphs Presented by Licensee

cc: w/enclosures - see next page

DISTRIBUTION			
Central File	OGC		NChokshi
NRC & LPDRs	EJordan		AE1-Bassioni
JSniezek	BGrimes		GKelly
PDV Files	RBarrett		JKnox
GKnighton	NChokshi		JKnight
HRood	MJohnson		FRosa
ACRS (10)	RRobinson		•
DRSP/PD5 HRood:pm1 05/24/89	DRXAMD: PD5 GKnighton 05/91/89		
B906050169 PDR ADOCK	870524 05000275 PNU)	

DF01 1 Memo 4

5

م ۹ م ۹ ۹ م ۹ ۹ م ۹ ۹ م ۹ ۹ م ۹ م ۹ م

r X Lan - 4 - 4 - 1



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION WASHINGTON, D. C. 20555

May 24, 1989

DOCKET NOS.: 50-275 and 50-323

LICENSEE: PACIFIC GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY (PG&E)

FACILITY: DIABLO CANYON NUCLEAR POWER PLANT, UNITS 1 AND 2

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF MAY 23, 1989 PUBLIC MEETING TO DISCUSS PROPOSED CHANGE IN ALLOWED OUTAGE TIME FOR A DIESEL GENERATOR FROM 72 HOURS TO 7 DAYS (LAR 89-05, TAC NOS. 73109 AND 73110)

On May 23, 1989 the NRC staff and its consultants met with PG&E in Rockville, Maryland to discuss proposed License Amendment Request (LAR) 89-05, which would increase the allowed outage time (AOT) for any diesel generator from 72 hours to 7 days. This LAR was submitted by letter dated May 12, 1989. A report documenting the licensee's studies evaluating the risk and reliability of the revised AOT were submitted by letter dated May 11, 1989. In these submittals, the licensee stated that it plans to upgrade the onsite AC power system by adding a sixth diesel generator. This change would be made at the fourth refueling outage for Unit 2, which is scheduled to begin in October of 1991. Attendees at the meeting are given in Enclosure 1. The viewgraphs presented by the licensee during the meeting are given in Enclosure 2. At the conclusion of the meeting, the NRC staff stated that its review of the LAR was underway, and that if it needed additional information as part of its review, a request for such information would be transmitted to the licensee as soon as the need is established.

Harry Rood

Harry Rood, Senior Project Manager Project Directorate V Division of Reactor Projects - III, IV, V and Special Projects

Enclosures:

1. Meeting Attendees

- 2. Viewgraphs Presented by Licensee
- cc: w/enclosures see next page

الله ¹ له ف^{الت}مية الأملية وروتية. مان الزمرة مرد ما

TREAST Y MAY NO DER TO ANT 200 A STORT CONTRACT OF MANY

S. General MERICE France - The de South Anna in March 1996 and 1997 and 1994

So at Stark Variation and Stark Partie Manager Winder Parties - Cheeling Levels a US Stark and a Stark Winder Cheeling - Cheeling Cheeling (Cheeling) - Cheeling (Cheeling)

(1) \$ c_1 = (1) a construction and a second of the actual of the book by between the termination of the book by the book b

P *

> > JE BAR JE WE WE WANT OF ME . J.

Mr. J. D. Shiffer Pacific Gas and Electric Company

cc: Richard F. Locke, Esq. Pacific Gas & Electric Company Post Office Box 7442 San Francisco, California 94120

Janice E. Kerr, Esq. California Public Utilities Commission 350 McAllister Street San Francisco, California 94102

Ms. Sandra A. Silver 660 Granite Creek, Road Santa Cruz, California 95065

Mr. W. C. Gangloff Westinghouse Electric Corporation P. O. Box 355 Pittsburg, Pennsylvania 15230

Managing Editor <u>San Luis Obispo County Telegram</u> <u>Tribune</u> 1321 Johnson Avenue P. O. Box 112 San Luis Obispo, California 93406

Mr. Leland M. Gustafson, Manager Federal Relations Pacific Gas and Electric Company 1726 M Street, N. W. Washington, DC 20036-4502

Dian M. Grueneich Marcia Preston Law Office of Dian M. Grueneich 380 Hayes Street, Suite 4 San Francisco, California 94102 NRC Resident Inspector Diablo Canyon Nuclear Power Plant c/o U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission P. O. Box 369 Avila Beach, California 93424

Mr. Dick Blakenburg Editor & Co-Publisher South County Publishing Company P. O. Box 460 Arroyo Grande, California 93420

Bruce Norton, Esq. c/o Richard F. Locke, Esq. Pacific Gas and Electric Company Post Office Box 7442 San Francisco, California 94120

Dr. R. B. Ferguson Sierra Club – Santa Lucia Chapter Rocky Canyon Star Route Creston, California 93432

Chairman San Luis Obispo County Board of Supervisors Room 270 County Government Center San Luis Obispo, California 93408

Director Energy Facilities Siting Division Energy Resources Conservation and Development Commission 1516 9th Street Sacramento, California 95814

Ms. Jacquelyn Wheeler 3033 Barranca Court San Luis Obispo, California 93401



م ۲ ۲ ۲ ۲ ۲

י א'י א א אי א

н н м та н ^м

" " " "

a **y** , ,

с, калария и мария и Mr. J. D. Shiffer Pacific Gas and Electric Company - 2 -

cc:

Ms. Laurie McDermott, Coordinator Consumers Organized for Defense of Environmental Safety ,731 Pacific Street, Suite 42 San Luis Obispo, California 93401

Mr. Paul Szalinski, Chief Radiological Health Branch State Department of Health Services 714 P Street, Office Building #8 Sacramento, California 95814

Regional Administrator, Region V U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission 1450 Maria Lane Suite 210 Walnut Creek, California 94596

Diablo Canyon

. . .

Ms. Nancy Culver 192 Luneta Street San Luis Obispo, California 93401

President California Public Utilities Commission California State Building 350 McAllister Street San Francisco, California 94102

+1

м,

Michael M. Strumwasser, Esq. Special Assistant Attorney General State of California Department of Justice 3580 Wilshire Boulevard, Room 800 Los Angeles, California 90010 ,

ала о^рис**я** и солоний С ламае общинальных и солоний и С ламае общинальных и солоний и

4, 9

∦ (≥ 1) = − − − − 4

.

ENCLOSURE 1

ATTENDEES

Public Meeting on License Amendment Requests LAR 89-05 Diesel Generator Allowed Outage Time Diablo Canyon Combined Technical Specifications Tuesday, May 23, 1989

--- NAME ----

ORGANIZATION

Nilesh Chokshi Kent Daschke Adel El-Bassioni Robert G. Fitzpatrick Cynthia L. Haag Roger Johnson Jim Knight John Knox Barkeley S. Lew John McInerney Dick Robinson Harry Rood Raymond Thierry Ken Vavrek George Wu NRC/RES/PRAB Westinghouse-NATD NRC/DREP/PRAB BNL (Consultant to NRC) Westinghouse-NATD PG&E NRC/DEST/SELB NRC/DEST/SELB PG&E Westinghouse-NATD NRC/RES NRC/DRSP/PDV PG&E Westinghouse PG&E

N. MERNA

\$

アメコレンボード 見たらな Mrorat . B . 6 **∞ 8** . . . N . Kast ≻ najat **K** 4 ا الأخلا أرب أر AN ALL ALL IN THE REPORT OF MANY رياني مراجع مريحي ما المريحين الم Constant . R. at & Kinn 8. P. R. W. Harry & word CARLES AND

A with the test of the second secon

ية ب

1

ы

.

, t ⁻ , t

DIABLO CANYON POWER PLANT

ť

DIESEL GENERATOR

ALLOWED OUTAGE TIME STUDY

May 1989

PACIFIC GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY

PICE

Pacific Gas and Electric Company

DIESEL GENERATOR LAR

MEETING

PROPOSED AGENDA

MAY 23, 1989

1.	OPENING STATEMENT	NRC
2.	OVERVIEW OF LAR AND REPORT	PG&E
3.	SYSTEM DESCRIPTION	PG&E
4.	PRA	PG&E
	 CALCULATIONS SEQUENCES RESULTS 	
5.	RELIABILITY ANALYSIS	WESTINGHOUSE
	- OVERVIEW - CASE MODELS - RESULTS	
6.	SUMMARY	PG&E

.

ć



٠

r#

el 1

ŝ

SCHEDULE OVERVIEW

NRC MEETING

REPORT SUBMITTAL

LAR SUBMITTAL

NRC APPROVAL

SIXTH DG INSTALLATION

MARCH 31, 1989

MAY 11, 1989

MAY 12, 1989

MID-SEPTEMBER 1989

FALL 1991



x ζ,

2

. ب 1

x

•

-, , be v

٠

DIABLO CANYON POWER PLANT DIESEL GENERATOR ALLOWED OUTAGE TIME STUDY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0 SUMMARY

2.0 INTRODUCTION

- 2.1 BACKGROUND
- 2.2 SCOPE OF ANALYSIS

3.0 ELECTRIC POWER SYSTEM

- 3.1 ELECTRIC POWER SYSTEM FUNCTION
- 3.2 ELECTRIC POWER SYSTEM DESCRIPTION
- 3.3 ELECTRIC POWER SYSTEM OPERATION
- 3.4 DIESEL GENERATORS
- 3.5 SUMMARY OF STATION BLACKOUT
- 4.0

5.0

PROBABILISTIC RISK ANALYSIS

- 4.1 PRA CALCULATIONS
- 4.2 DATA ANALYSIS
- 4.3 DCPRA ELECTRIC POWER SYSTEM MODEL 4.3.1 CALCULATION MODIFICATIONS
- 4.4 CORE DAMAGE SEQUENCE MODELS
 - 4.4.1 DOMINANT SEQUENCE PRA MODEL
 - 4.4.2 NON-SEISMIC SEQUENCES
 - 4.4.3 SEISMIC SEQUENCES
- 4.5 QUANTIFICATION OF CORE DAMAGE FREQUENCY
 - 4.5.1 ABSOLUTE RISK RESULTS
 - 4.5.2 RELATIVE RISK RESULTS
 - 4.5.3 SENSITIVITY TO SWING DIESEL IN MAINTENANCE
- 4.6 INTERPRETATION OF RESULTS

RELIABILITY ANALYSIS

- 5.1 DIESEL GENERATOR FAULT TREE
 - 5.1.1 SUCCESS CRITERIA
 - 5.1.2 ASSUMPTIONS AND BOUNDARY CONDITIONS
 - 5.1.3 FAULT TREE DEVELOPMENT
 - 5.1.4 QUANTIFICATION



i

, •

ć ·

· ·

. . .

TABLE OF CONTENTS (Cont.)

- 5.2 CALCULATION MODELS
 - 5.2.1 SUCCESS CRITERIA
 - 5.2.2 CALCULATION MODEL CRITERIA
 - 5.2.3 CALCULATIONS
- 5.3 ALLOWED OUTAGE TIME ANALYSIS
- 5.4 RELIABILITY ANALYSIS RESULTS
 - 5.4.1 RELATIVE RISK METHOD
 - 5.4.2 AVERAGE ANNUAL RISK METHOD
 - 5.4.3 RISK RESULTS
- 5.5 SENSITIVITY STUDY
- 6.0 SUMMARY OF RESULTS
- 7.0 CONCLUSIONS
- 8.0 REFERENCES
- APPENDIX A: DIESEL GENERATOR SYSTEM EQUATIONS
- APPENDIX B: REDUCED CORE DAMAGE SEQUENCE MODEL
- APPENDIX C: SEISMIC SEQUENCE ANALYSIS
- APPENDIX D: RELIABILITY ANALYSIS FAULT TREES

.

•

.

SUMMARY OF ANALYSES

- USED TWO PROBABILISTIC EVALUATION METHODS
 - PRA BASED UPON LTSP DCPRA (PG&E/PLG)
 - RELIABILITY ANALYSIS BASED UPON BRUNSWICK/BNL METHODS (PG&E/WESTINGHOUSE)
- ANALYZED THREE CASES
 - FIVE DGS, 72-HOUR AOT, AND SINGLE 10 DAY PLANNED MAINTENANCE EACH CYCLE (BASE CASE)
 - FIVE DGS, 7-DAY AOT, AND SINGLE 7 DAY PLANNED MAINTENANCE EACH CYCLE (CASE 2)
 - SIX DGS, 7-DAY AOT, AND NO PLANNED MAINTENANCE (CASE 3)
- DETERMINED CHANGES IN ABSOLUTE AND RELATIVE RISK VALUES (CORE MELT FREQUENCY PER YEAR).
- FOUND THAT RELATIVE RISK CRITERION CONFIRMS THE ACCEPTABILITY OF A 7-DAY AOT. THERE WAS A NEGLIGIBLE CHANGE IN RISK WITH A 7-DAY AOT. ADDING A SIXTH DG WILL HAVE A POSITIVE BENEFIT, LARGER THAN THE EFFECT OF CHANGING TO A 7-DAY AOT.

. ب * * *

SYSTEM DESCRIPTION

•

÷

- ELECTRIC POWER
- FIVE DIESEL CONFIGURATION
- SIX DIESEL CONFIGURATION
- TECHNICAL SPECIFICATIONS

ь



9 7

s e a

` •



FIGURE 3-1 DIABLO CANYON ELECTRIC POWER SYSTEM

Pacific Gas and Electric Company

PCSE

<

v ,

. . • ·

. ۲

а , . . , . . • , . . 8 .

, e,

P a

EXISTING DIESEL GENERATOR ARRANGEMENT





• • •

a .

• × • .

.

PROPOSED MODIFICATION ADDITION OF SIXTH DIESEL GENERATOR





Ś

2 2 4 5 5 त २ भ

.

N I PA

.

Т.S. 3.8.1.1.в:

WITH A DIESEL GENERATOR OF THE ABOVE REQUIRED A.C. ELECTRICAL POWER SOURCES INOPERABLE, DEMONSTRATE THE OPERABILITY OF THE A.C. OFFSITE SOURCES BY PERFORMING SPECIFICATION 4.8.1.1.1A WITHIN 1 HOUR AND AT LEAST ONCE PER 8 HOURS THEREAFTER; AND IF THE DIESEL GENERATOR BECAME INOPERABLE DUE TO ANY CAUSE OTHER THAN PREVENTIVE MAINTENANCE OR TESTING, DEMONSTRATE THE OPERABILITY OF THE REMAINING OPERABLE DIESEL GENERATORS BY PERFORMING SPECIFICATION 4.8.1.1.2A.2 WITHIN 24 HOURS*; RESTORE THE DIESEL GENERATOR TO OPERABLE STATUS WITHIN 72 HOURS OR BE IN AT LEAST HOT STANDBY WITHIN THE NEXT 6 HOURS AND IN COLD SHUTDOWN WITHIN THE FOLLOWING 30 HOURS.

r ..., 3) 19 19

۰, ¥. ****

54

.

, , →γ,

:

BASES 3/4.8.1, 3/4.8.2, 3/4.8.3:

... THE A.C. AND D.C. SOURCE ALLOWABLE OUT-OF-SERVICE TIMES ARE BASED ON REGULATORY GUIDE 1.93, "AVAILABILITY OF ELECTRICAL POWER SOURCES," DECEMBER 1974.{A} WHEN ONE DIESEL GENERATOR IS INOPERABLE, ...

INSERT A

EXCEPT FOR THE ALLOWED OUTAGE TIME ASSOCIATED WITH ACTION STATEMENT B. OF SPECIFICATION 3.8.1.1. THIS ALLOWED OUTAGE TIME WAS CHANGED TO BE CONSISTENT WITH THE RECOMMENDATION OF DIABLO CANYON POWER PLANT DIESEL GENERATOR ALLOWED OUTAGE TIME STUDY, MAY 1989

. • ¥

1. 1. 1.

**** 2 K 2 *

•

PRA

- CALCULATIONS
- SYSTEM ANALYSIS
- CORE DAMAGE SEQUENCES
- RESULTS

. .

•

20 ; ; /

۰. ۰ er e

.

••• • • • • • •

TABLE 4-1 DEFINITION OF CALCULATIONS

<u>Calculation</u>	<u>No. of DGs</u>	Allowed Outage Time	Period of Scheduled Overhaul on Swing DG (with Unit 1 at power)
1A	, 5	3 Days	0 Days
1B	5	7 Days	0 Days
2	5	3 Days	10 Days
3	5	7 Days	7 Days
4	6	7 Days	0 Days
5	5	No Maintenance	0 Days
6*	5	7 Days	1 year

* This calculation evaluates the risk if the swing DG were unavailable for the entire year under a 7-day AOT.



** ах. r

* * •

. -· $\mathbf{F}_{\mathbf{r}} = \mathbf{F}_{\mathbf{r}}$

• .

:

SYSTEM ANALYSIS

- FOUR DISTINCT QUANTIFICATIONS
 - **3-DAY AOT (DCPRA)** -
 - 7-DAY AOT
 - SCHEDULED MAINTENANCE
 - **ZERO MAINTENANCE**
- **NON-SEISMIC**'
- SEISMIC
- **RESULTS IN TABLE 4-3**
- EQUATIONS IN APPENDIX A



. रम

. R • •

• .

° ► ' ¶' • • •

· 1 . .

\$

TABLE 4-3

DIESEL GENERATOR SPLIT FRACTION VALUES

.

Split	Calc. 1A & 3	2 (DCPRA)	Calcs. 1E	3&3&4	Calcs. 2	,3&6 •	Calc.	5 [°]
Fraction	3 Day AOT fo	r all Diesels	7 Day AOT fo	r all Diesels	Scheduled Mainte	nance on Diesel 13	Zero Diesel Maintenance	
	<u>Nonseismic</u>	<u>Seismic</u>	<u>Nonseismic</u>	<u>Seismic</u>	<u>S.F. Nonseismic</u>	<u>S.F. Seismic</u>	<u>Nonseismic</u>	<u>Seismic</u>
GF1	4.523E-02	8.510E-02	4.946E-02	8.721E-02	(1)		3.711E-02	7.561E-02
GG1	4.477E-02	8.417E-02	4.909E-02	8.654E-02			3.687E-02	7.507E-02
GGZ	5.561E-02	9.502E-02	5.682E-02	9.428E-02	GG4 4.344E-02	GG5 8.114E-02	4.395E-02	8.226E-02
GG3	4.523E-02	8.510E-02	4.946E-02	8.721E-02			3.711E-02	7.561E-02
GH1	4.436E-02	8.334E-02	4.878E-02	8.595E-02			3.668E-02	7.462E-02
GHZ	5.408E-02	9.329E-02	5.545E-02	9.275E-02	GH7 4.324E-02	GHA 8.064E-02	4.202E-02	8.060E-02
GH3 •	8.265E-02	_ 1.115E-01	8.063E-02	1.090E-01	GH8 4.784E-02	GHB 8.685E-02	* 8.933E-02	1.008E-01
GH4	4.477E-02	8.417E-02	4.909E-02	8.654E-02			3.687E-02	7.507E-02
GH5	5.561E-02	9.502E-02	5.682E-02	9.428E-02	GH9 4.344E-02		4.395E-02	8.226E-02
GH6	4.523E-02	8.510E-02	4.946E-02	8.721E-02			3.711E-02	7.561E-02
2G1	4.396E-02	8.251E-02	4.847E-02	8.537E-02			3.651E-02	7.419E-02
2G2	5.364E-02	9.244E-02	5.507E-02	9.205E-02			4.145E-02	7.990E-02
2G3	6.250E-02	1.016E-01	6.254E-02	9.964E-02	2GC 4.631E-02	2GI 8.531E-02	5.629E-02 -	8.852E-02
2G4	2.898E-01	1.903E-01	2.726E-01	1.851E-01			3.834E-01	2.100E-01
2G5	4.436E-02	8.334E-02	4.878E-02	8.595E-02			3.668E-02	7.462E-02
2G6	5.408E-02	9.329E-02	5.545E-02	9.275E-02	2GE 4.324E-02	•	4.202E-02	8.060E-02
2G7	8.265E-02	1.115E-01	8.063E-02	1.090E-01			8.933E-02	1.008E-01
2G8	4.477E-02	8.417E-02	4.909E-02	8.654E-02	*		3.687E-02	7.507E-02
2G9	5.561E-02	9.502E-02	5.682E-02	9.428E-02			4.395E-02	8.226E-02
2GA	4.523E-02	8.510E-02	4.946E-02	8.721E-02			3.711E-02	7.561E-02
2H1	4.356E-02	8.169E-02	4.817E-02	8.481E-02			3.636E-02	7.379E-02
2H2	5.320E-02	9.162E-02	5.470E-02	9.138E-02			4.090E-02	7.925E-02
2H3	6.206E-02	1.005E-01	6.205E-02	9.863E-02	2HI 4.585E-02		5.589E-02	8.739E-02
2H4	6.922E-02	1.112E-01	6.996E-02	1.087E-01	2HJ 5.573E-02		6.415E-02	1.002E-01
2H5	7.729E-01	5.269E-01	7.521E-01	5.214E-01	*		8.494E-01	6.230E-01
2H6	4.396E-02	8.251E-02	4.847E-02	8.537E-D2			3.651E-02	7.419E-02
2H7	5.364E-02	9.244E-02	5.507E-02	9.205E-02			4.145E-02	7.990E-02
2H8	6.250E-02	1.016E-01	6.254E-02	9.964E-02		,	5.629E-02	8.852E-02
2H9	2.898E-01	1.903E-01	2.726E-01	1.851E-01			3.834E-01	2.100E-01
2HA	4.436E-02	8.334E-02	4.878E-02	8.595E-02		_	3.668E-02	7.462E-02
2HB	5.408E-02	9.329E-02	5.545E-02	9.275E-02		-	4.202E-02	8.060E-02
2HC	8.265E-02	1.115E-01	8.063E-02	1.090E-01			8.933E-02	1.008E-01
2HD	4.477E-02	8.417E-02	4.909E-02	8.654E-02			3.687E-02	7.507E-02
2HE	5.561E-02	9.502E-02	5.682E-02	9.428E-02			4.395E-02	8.226E-02
ZHG	4.523E-02	8.510E-02	4.946E-02	8.721E-02			3.711E-02	7.561E-02

Note: (1) This quantification was used to evaluate core damage sequences that involved failure of the swing DG. The DG split fractions not listed for this case were not needed to quantify these sequences.

<

*



. . .



.





.



v



CORE DAMAGE SEQUENCES

- NON-SEISMIC SEQUENCES

j,

- DOMINANT SEQUENCE MODEL
- SCHEDULED MAINTENANCE SEQUENCES
- APPENDIX B
- SEISMIC SEQUENCES
 - SEIS4 COMPUTER MODEL
 - COMBINATIONS OF SEISMIC/NON-SEISMIC FAILURES
 - SCHEDULED MAINTENANCE TERMS
 - APPENDIX C



- .
- 、

- .

- ۰. ۸ ، ۰

TABLE 4-4 ABSOLUTE FREQUENCY RESULTS

			Period of Scheduled	-
			Overhaul on Swing DG	Frequency
<u>Calculation</u>	<u>No. of DGs</u>	Allowed Outage Time	(with Unit 1 at power)	<u>(per year)</u>
1A	5	3 Day	0 Days*	2.078E-04
1B	5	7 Day	0 Days	2.120E-04
2	5	3 Day	10 Days	2.124E-04
3	5	7 Day	7 Days	2.152E-04
·4	6 [.]	7 Day	0 Days	2.017E-04
5	5	No Maintenance	0 Days	2.042E-04
6	5	7 Day	1 Yr.	4.650E-04

* DCPRA Assumption; see Ref. 4 and 14



 \checkmark

• 11 12

4

.

x ,

r •

*

a t · · · · * 、

•

;

TABLE 4-5

RELATIVE RISK RESULTS

Description	<u>Risk Ratio</u>	Comments
Impact of Allowed Outage Time		
3 Day AOT:		
-5 DG configuration	0.05*	Risk during AOT/risk during base period with no maintenance
7-day AOT:		
-5 DG configuration	0.08*	Risk during AOT/risk during base period with no maintenance
-6 DG configuration	0.08*	Risk during AOT/risk during base period with no maintenance
Impact of Scheduled Outages		
-5 DG configuration (3 Day AOT) + 10 Days	0.04	Risk for scheduled outage/ risk for 18 months(72-hour AOT)
-5 DG configuration (7 Day AOT) + 7 Days	0.03	 Risk for scheduled outage/ risk for 18 months(7-day AOT)
-6 DG configuration (7 Day AOT)	0.00	
+ / Days	0.00	No scheduled outage/ risk for 18 months(7 Day AOT)

* Based on mean maintenance duration.

- Pacific Gas and Electric Company

1. . . Var

č

.

/



΄**δ** κ κ











RELIABILITY ANALYSIS OVERVIEW

- MODELING TECHNIQUES AND DATA COMPATIBLE WITH DCPRA
- ASSESS COMPLIANCE WITH DESIGN BASIS CRITERIA (LOOP, LOOP/LOCA)
- MISSION TIME CONSISTENT WITH REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS (BLACKOUT)
- MODEL DESIGNED TO BE STAND-ALONE, INCLUDES SUPPORT SYSTEMS IN FAULT TREES
- O RESULTS IN TABLES 5.8 AND 5.9
- **o** FAULT TREES IN APPENDIX D

.

 $\dot{\pmb{\delta}}_{\mu}$ ٠ . . д) С 2.41 43 ÷. 1 Ξ.

•

•

.

, a v , in the second second

RELIABILITY STUDY OVERVIEW COMPARISON

	<u>Brunswick</u>	DIABLO <u>Canyon</u>
NUMBER OF DIESEL GENERATORS	4	5
EXTEND AOT FROM 3 DAYS TO 7 DAYS	YES	YES
LENGTHEN QUICK START INTERVAL FROM 12 TO 72 HOURS & STI FROM 2 TO 24 HOURS	YES	NA
CASES ANALYZED: - BASELINE - LOOP EVENT - LOOP WITH LOCA IN ONE UNIT	YES YES YES	YES YES YES
TOP-LEVEL (REDUCED) TREES	YES	YES
TIME DEPENDENT, PHASED MISSION APPROACH (FRANTIC)	YES	YES
DIESEL CROSS-TIE BETWEEN UNITS	YES	SWING DG Only
USE OF PLANT SPECIFIC DATA	YES	YES
COMMON CAUSE METHOD	BINOMIAL	BETA- Factor
TESTING PRACTICE IN AOT:	SIMULTANEOUS	SEQUENTIAL

.

.

.

جو ج م ب ب

,

CALCULATION MODELS

÷

CURRENT FIVE DIESEL CONFIGURATION (3 AND 7-DAY AOT) PLANNED SIX DIESEL CONFIGURATION (7-DAY AOT)

- **o** ALL DGS IN STANDBY
 - LOOP EVENT IN BOTH UNITS
 - LOCA IN UNIT 1 WITH LOOP EVENT
- **o** AOT CONDITION (ONE DG OUT OF SERVICE)
 - LOOP EVENT
 - LOCA IN UNIT 1 WITH LOOP EVENT

4. W. O

2 न्द्र १ 2 .

, , , - - X 5 . •

. r -. 4 , •

,

•

، •

٩.

TABLE 5-8 RELATIVE RISK ANALYSIS RESULTS[®]

	Average/ Maximum <u>Risk</u>	<u>Ratio</u>	Standby
72-Hour AOT - 5 DGs			•
LOOP	1.33E-05/ 1.48E-05	0.06	2.16E-04
LOOP/LOCA	7.74E-11/ 9.41E-11	0.08	1.03E-09
7-Day AOT - 5 DGs			
LOOP	1.68E-05/ 2.15E-05	0.08	2.19E-04
LOOP/LOCA	1.03E-10/ 1.42E-10	. 0.10	9.93E-10
7-Day AOT - 6 DGs			
LOOP	9.09E-06/ 1.14E-05	0.05	1.91E-04
LOOP/LOCA	8.78E-11/ 1.27E-10	0.13	6.55E-10

- Pacific Gas and Electric Company 2085

÷



- .
- X.
- ×

 - 2
 - .
- .
- q

- .

اللہ 19 میں 19 میں 19 میں 19 میں 19 میں

- - - •

TABLE 5-9 AVERAGE ANNUAL RISK RESULTS

72-Hour AOT - 5 DGs	<u>Annual Risk</u>
LOOP	2.29E-04
LOOP/LOCA	1.10E-09
7-Day AOT - 5 DGs	
LOOP	2.35E-04
LOOP/LOCA	1.10E-09
7-Day AOT - 6 DGs	
LOOP	2.00E-04
LOOP/LOCA	7.43E-10

Pacific Gas and Electric Company

٦,

ç, · · · · · ****

ń

• ş**٩**.,

۹. ۱. ۱ 2°.-* •

ł.,

,

•

94 2

•

4

,

÷

**** ·

٠

•

SUMMARY OF RESULTS

1. THE FREQUENCIES FOR ALL CASES ARE ACCEPTABLY LOW (IN THE E-4 RANGE).

ć

- 2. THE RELATIVE RISK RATIO CRITERION IS SATISFIED FOR ALL CASES BY BOTH METHODS OF ANALYSES.
- 3. THE EFFECT OF CHANGING FROM A 72-HOUR TO A 7-DAY AOT IS INSIGNIFICANT, ON THE ORDER OF 1 PERCENT TO 3 PERCENT.
- 4. THE EFFECT OF ADDING THE SIXTH DG IS GREATER THAN THE EFFECT OF CHANGING TO A 7-DAY AOT, WITH A DECREASE ON THE ORDER OF 5 PERCENT TO 15 PERCENT.
- 5. THE TWO ANALYSES PROVIDE RESULTS WHICH ARE CONSISTENT. THE TRENDS OF THE RESULTS FOR THE THREE CASES ARE COMPARABLE BETWEEN THE PRA AND RELIABILITY ANALYSES. FURTHER, THE MAGNITUDE OF THE FREQUENCY RESULTS ARE COMPARABLE BETWEEN THE TWO DIFFERENT QUANTITATIVE APPROACHES.

.

, • •

.

TABLE 6-1

. 27

ANALYTICAL RESULTS⁽¹⁾

FOR UNPLANNED AND PLANNED MAINTENANCE ACTIVITIES 1

	PRA Anal	<u>Reliability Analysi</u>	s (Unplanned)		
	Unplanned & Planned ⁽²⁾	Unplanned			- • •
	Frequency	Frequency	Relative <u>Ratio⁽³⁾</u>	Frequency	Relative <u>Ratio⁽³⁾</u>
BASE CASE					
3-Day AOT/5 DGs (10 day Outage) ⁽²⁾	2.12E-04	2.08E-04	0.05	LOOP 2.29E-04 LOCA/	0.06
				LOOP 1.10E-09	0.08
CASE 2		•			
7-Day AOT/5 DGs (7 day Outage) ⁽²⁾	2.15E-04	2.12E-04	0.08	LOOP 2.35E-04 LOCA/	0.08
₹°g +				LOOP 1.10E-09	0.10
CASE 3					
7-Day AOT/6 DGs (0 day) ⁽²⁾	2.02E-04	2.02E-04	0.08	LOOP 2.00E-04 LO <u>C</u> A/	` 0.05
				LOOP 7.43E-10	0.13

PRA reflects frequency for Unit 1 only, whereas reliability considers frequency for both units
 Duration of outage for planned maintenance.
 AOT Risk Level/Non-AOT Risk Level

Pacific Gas and Electric Company

5

6-4



· · ·

.

• •

. .

...