

PMTurkeyCOLNPEm Resource

From: Comar, Manny
Sent: Wednesday, September 02, 2015 3:59 PM
To: Steve Franzone
Cc: TurkeyCOL Resource
Subject: FW: Auto Missile Issue at TP

FYI

From: Chuang, Tze-Jer
Sent: Tuesday, September 01, 2015 3:59 PM
To: Vera, Marieliz
Cc: Thomas, Vaughn; Patel, Pravin; Comar, Manny
Subject: Auto Missile Issue at TP

ALL:

Our phone discussion with the TP applicant focused on finite element approach. The shear demands are more accurate.

So I add the finite element results from Table 6 for the edge case in the table below (see 4th column).

As can be seen, the shear demands are even more than obtained from hand calculations, which were computed in the previous SA report.

So the issue becomes the capacity as defined by ACI code. For example, for 1W, Table 6 claims 62.16 klf, whereas Table 3 shows 34.19 klf.

They need to provide justification on why for 1W , for example, the capacity is 62.16 klf, not 34.19 klf.

Note that the DCD has determined that 1W, 4W and 5W behave as on-way beam response (whereas 2W and 3W two-way response).

The calculated results are tabulated in the following Table 3 as amended.

Table 3 (Amended) – One-Way Beam Reactions in Shear

Wall ID	Dynamic Load Factor (DLF)	Beam Shear V_u (klf)	Finite Element V_u (klf)	Allowable Shear ϕV_c (klf) ⁽²⁾
1W	1.86 ⁽¹⁾	39.16	46.7	34.19 ⁽¹⁾
2W	1.35	36.52	44.47	27.66
3W	1.20	33.26	42.8	28.61
4W	1.56	40.64	51.42	28.63
5W	1.25	27.86	41.66	32.60

Note (1): The DLF for 1W cannot be 0.97—recalculated to 1.86, based on DCD results; the allowable stress can be increased 1.1 times from 31.08 klf to 34.19 klf

(2): One-Way Beam Response Allowable Shear Stress: $\phi V_c = 112.76 \times 12 \times d$ (in inch) ÷ 1000 (in klf)

Tze-jer (Jerry) Chuang, Ph.D., P.E., Fellow, ASME
Senior Structural Engineer
NRO/DE/SEB
Mail Stop: T-08E43
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
Phone: 301-415-8586
Email: <Tze-jer.Chuang@NRC.GOV>

Hearing Identifier: TurkeyPoint_COL_NonPublic
Email Number: 1399

Mail Envelope Properties (572886d65c504359a0437146df1bb842)

Subject: FW: Auto Missile Issue at TP
Sent Date: 9/2/2015 3:58:47 PM
Received Date: 9/2/2015 3:58:48 PM
From: Comar, Manny

Created By: Manny.Comar@nrc.gov

Recipients:
"TurkeyCOL Resource" <TurkeyCOL.Resource@nrc.gov>
Tracking Status: None
"Steve Franzone" <steve.Franzone@fpl.com>
Tracking Status: None

Post Office: HQPWMSMRS05.nrc.gov

Files	Size	Date & Time
MESSAGE	1939	9/2/2015 3:58:48 PM

Options
Priority: Standard
Return Notification: No
Reply Requested: No
Sensitivity: Normal
Expiration Date:
Recipients Received: