

From: Esh, David
Sent: Tuesday, March 10, 2015 2:29 PM
To: Snyder, Amy
Subject: FW: WVDP GoldSim

Here was my reply.

From: Esh, David
Sent: Tuesday, March 10, 2015 2:10 PM
To: 'Steve Marschke'
Subject: RE: WVDP GoldSim

Hi Steve,

This work was done a bit more than a few years ago now and was part of our normal independent evaluation process that we perform. At the time there were a lot of uncertainties and some data limitations and so we wanted to get a handle on what was going on and develop some risk insights. Normally we base our decisions on the licensee's work (we comment and seek revision until we believe the licensee's analysis supports the decision), and not our own independent analysis. For that reason, we also do not release our internal analyses unless we are using them in a licensing decision.

While it may be useful to consider the work that NRC has done, it also would potentially be a conflict of interest to have modeling performed that we review that is based (in part) on our own modeling. For this main reason we would not advocate the approach you outlined.

You may have seen some presentations we gave on the topic, or perhaps this paper <http://www.wmsym.org/archives/2006/pdfs/6188.pdf>. I would be happy to discuss what we did, but it has been a number of years so I may have to shake off the cobwebs.

Good luck with your proposal,

Dave

From: Steve Marschke [<mailto:smarschke@scainc.com>]
Sent: Tuesday, March 03, 2015 11:11 AM
To: Esh, David
Subject: WVDP GoldSim

Good morning Dr Esh,

My name is Steve Marschke, and I work for S. Cohen & Associates.

The DOE and NYSERDA are in the process of issuing an RFP to support the development of a probabilistic PA model for the West Valley site using GoldSim or a similar computer program. SC&A is considering bidding on that work. I am aware that under your direction the NRC has developed a detailed

GoldSim model of the West Valley site, including the HLW Tanks, the NDA, the SDA, and the Sr-90 Plume—all source areas that DOE/NYSERDA is also interested in modeling.

It's my opinion that the DOE/NYSERDA would benefit greatly if they were to utilize the NRC's West Valley GoldSim model as a "starting point" for their own probabilistic studies. I also believe that the NRC would benefit from sharing their GoldSim West Valley model, in that NRC would know exactly what is contained within (and therefore have confidence in) the DOE/NYSERDA model and results (at least until its modified).

Of course this is only my opinion, it is ultimately up to DOE/NYSERDA whether they wish to take advantage of the NRC's work or pursue their own West Valley probabilistic model. I wanted to get your opinion as to the feasibility of the NRC making available your West Valley GoldSim model to either SC&A directly or via DOE/NYSERDA—if it's not feasible then there is no decision for DOE/NYSERDA to make.

If you wish to talk with me I can be reached at 585-226-6655, or you can simply reply to this email.

Thank you for your time, I look forward to your response,
Steve