



UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

June 10, 2014

Mr. Randall K. Edington
Executive Vice President Nuclear/
Chief Nuclear Officer
Mail Station 7602
Arizona Public Service Company
P.O. Box 52034
Phoenix, AZ 85072-2034

SUBJECT: PALO VERDE NUCLEAR GENERATING STATION, UNIT 3 - REQUEST FOR
WITHHOLDING INFORMATION FROM PUBLIC DISCLOSURE (TAC NO.
MF4169)

Dear Mr. Edington:

By letter dated May 16, 2014 (Agencywide Documents Access and Management System (ADAMS) Accession No. ML14141A545), Arizona Public Service Company (APS, the licensee), submitted two affidavits to the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) dated April 18 and April 29, 2014 (ADAMS Accession No. ML14149A097), executed by Messrs. Philip A. Opsal and Nathan E. Hottle, AREVA Inc. The affidavit requested that the information contained in the following corresponding document be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR), Part 2, Section 2.390:

AREVA Document 32-9215090-001, "ASME Section XI End of Life Analysis of PVNGS3 RV BMI Nozzle Repair."

AREVA Document 32-9215089-001, "Weld Residual Stress Analysis for PVNGS3 RV BMI Nozzle Repair."

AREVA Document 32-9215084-001, "ASME Section III End of Life Analysis of PVNGS3 RV BMI Nozzle Repair."

AREVA Document 32-9217241-002, "Palo Verde Unit 3 – BMI Nozzle Crack Growth Analysis."

AREVA Document 32-9216967-001, "Natural Frequency and Structural Integrity Analysis for PVNGS3 RV BMI Nozzle Repair."

AREVA Document 51-9213061-001, "Corrosion Evaluation for Palo Verde Unit 3 Reactor Vessel Bottom Mounted Instrument Nozzle Modification"

A nonproprietary copy of these documents has been placed in the NRC's Public Document Room and added to the NRC Library in ADAMS at Package Accession No. ML14149A349.

The affidavits stated that the submitted information should be considered exempt from mandatory public disclosure for the following reasons:

- (c) The information includes test data or analytical techniques concerning a process, methodology, or component, the application of which results in a competitive advantage for AREVA.
- (d) The information reveals certain distinguishing aspects of a process, methodology, or component, the exclusive use of which provides a competitive advantage for AREVA in product optimization or marketability.

We have reviewed your application and the material in accordance with the requirements of 10 CFR 2.390 and, on the basis of the statements in the affidavit, have determined that the submitted information sought to be withheld contains proprietary commercial information and should be withheld from public disclosure.

Therefore, the submitted information marked as proprietary will be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.390(b)(5) and Section 103(b) of the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, as amended.

Withholding from public inspection shall not affect the right, if any, of persons properly and directly concerned to inspect the documents. If the need arises, we may send copies of this information to our consultants working in this area. We will, of course, ensure that the consultants have signed the appropriate agreements for handling proprietary information.

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You also should understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

R. Edington

- 3 -

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at (301) 415-1530 or by e-mail at Jennivine.Rankin@nrc.gov.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Jennie Rankin". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke at the end.

Jennie K. Rankin, Project Manager
Plant Licensing Branch IV-1
Division of Operating Reactor Licensing
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-530

cc: Mr. Philip A. Opsal
Manager, Product Licensing
AREVA NP Inc.
3315 Old Forest Road
Lynchburg, VA 24501

Mr. Nathan E. Hottle
Manager, Product Licensing
AREVA NP Inc.
3315 Old Forest Road
Lynchburg, VA 24501

Additional distribution via Listserv

R. Edington

- 3 -

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at (301) 415-1530 or by e-mail at Jennivine.Rankin@nrc.gov.

Sincerely,

/RA/

Jennie K. Rankin, Project Manager
Plant Licensing Branch IV-1
Division of Operating Reactor Licensing
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-530

cc: Mr. Philip A. Opsal
Manager, Product Licensing
AREVA NP Inc.
3315 Old Forest Road
Lynchburg, VA 24501

Mr. Nathan E. Hottle
Manager, Product Licensing
AREVA NP Inc.
3315 Old Forest Road
Lynchburg, VA 24501

Additional distribution via Listserv

DISTRIBUTION:

| | | |
|-------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| PUBLIC | RidsNrrDeEviB Resource | RidsNrrPMPaloVerde Resource |
| LPLIV-1 Reading | RidsNrrDorlLpl4-1 Resource | RidsRgn4MailCenter Resource |
| RidsAcrsAcnw_MailCTR Resource | RidsNrrLAJBurkhardt Resource | |

ADAMS Accession No.: ML14150A169

| | | | |
|--------|-------------------------|--------------------|---------------------------|
| OFFICE | NRR/DORL/LPL4-1/PM | NRR/DORL/LPL4-1/LA | NRR/DE/EVIB/BC |
| NAME | JRankin | JBurkhardt | SRosenberg (JPoehler for) |
| DATE | 6/2/14 | 5/30/14 | 6/9/14 |
| OFFICE | NRR/DORL/LPL4-1/BC | NRR/DORL/LPL4-1/PM | |
| NAME | MMarkley (PBamford for) | JRankin | |
| DATE | 6/9/14 | 6/10/14 | |

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY