

UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

WASHINGTON, DC 20555 - 0001

December 2, 2013

Administrative Judge Lawrence G. McDade, Chair Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001

Administrative Judge
Michael F. Kennedy
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001

Administrative Judge
Dr. Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001

In the Matter of ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC. (Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3)

<u>Docket Nos. 50-247-LR and 50-286-LR</u>

Dear Administrative Judges:

Pursuant to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board's December 18, 2008, "Memorandum and Order (Addressing Requests that the Proceeding be Conducted Pursuant to Subpart G)," slip op. at 13, the Licensing Board's "Order (Granting Consent Motion Regarding Mandatory Disclosures)," dated January 30, 2009, at 1, the staff of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission ("Staff") herein notifies the Licensing Board and the parties that the hearing file has been supplemented for this proceeding. Materials in the hearing file may be accessed through the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System ("ADAMS"). An index containing the ADAMS accession number, date, and title or description of each item in Hearing File Index, Supplement 58 is appended hereto as Attachment 1.

On or about December 12, 2013, the documents identified in the hearing file will be made available via the Electronic Hearing Docket ("EHD"), which may be accessed at the following URL: http://ehd.nrc.gov/EHD Proceeding/home.asp. The hearing file will be contained in a subfolder entitled, "Indian PT Hearing File, Supplement 58" in the "Indian_PT_2&3_50-247&50-286-LR" folder of the EHD.

In addition, as required by 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5), the Staff is producing a privilege log, identifying documents withheld under the deliberative process privilege, which are appended hereto as Attachments 2. Also attached is the Declaration of John W. Lubinski formally invoking the deliberative process privilege with respect to the documents in Attachment 2. The Staff will

Judge Kennedy Judge Wardwell

preserve and maintain the privileged documents identified in these logs during the pendency of this proceeding.

Further, pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(c), attached is the Affidavit of Kimberly J. Green, certifying that all relevant materials required by this section have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete as to documents identified by November 25, 2013.

Finally, the NRC Staff notes that it has made a good faith effort to identify and characterize all documents meeting the criteria of 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b) and 10 C.F.R. § 2.1203 in this proceeding. In identifying these documents, the Staff does not concede their relevance to the license renewal issues to be decided in this proceeding.

Sincerely,

/Signed (electronically) by/ Anita Ghosh Counsel for NRC Staff

Enclosures: Attachment 1 - Hearing File Index, Supplement 58

Attachment 2 - Deliberative Process Privilege Log

Declaration of John W. Lubinski Affidavit of Kimberly J. Green

cc w/Encls.: Service List

Attachment 1 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Supplement 58 - December 2, 2013

#QI	Accession Number	Document Date	Title
58-0001	ML13309A640	11/04/2013	2013/11/04 Indian Point LR Hearing - IPEC License Renewal - April 2013 Audit of Westinghouse Proprietary Information - RVI Program
58-0002	ML13309A638	11/05/2013	2013/11/05 Indian Point LR Hearing - IPEC License Renewal - RAI 6a Response Time - RVI
58-0003	ML13309A637	11/05/2013	2013/11/05 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: IPEC License Renewal - RAI 6a Response Time - RVI
58-0004	ML13323B779	11/19/2013	2013/11/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - RAI on RVI Applicant/Licensee Action Item 1
58-0005	ML13318A450	11/19/2013	Request for Additional Information for the Review of the Indian Point Nuclear Generating, Units 2 and 3, License Renewal Application, Set 2013-06 (TAC NOS. MD5407 and MD5408).
58-0006	ML13311A330	10/24/2013	2013/10/24 Indian Point LR Hearing - Fwd: Entergy Monitoring Plan
58-0007	ML13322A834	11/22/2013	IP RAI for Cost Estimates Report and Documentation

Attachment 2 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 58 – December 2, 2013

Certain documents otherwise subject to inclusion in the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for this proceeding have been determined by the NRC Staff to contain information subject to withholding from public disclosures as predecisional, deliberative information. Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5), the Staff is providing this log to identify the following documents, withheld under the "deliberative process" privilege.

Estimated Page Count	20	2
Comment	Internal discussion regarding SER input. Attachments: [NL-13-132, publically available at ML13282A140; NL-13-098, publically available at ML13211A173; NL-12-174, publically available at ML12341A180]	Internal discussion regarding draft RAI
Addressee Name & Addressee Affiliation	J. Wise, NRC/NRR	J. Poehler, NRC/NRR
Document Type	E-Mail w/ Attachment	E-Mail
Document Date	11/05/2013	11/08/2013
Title	2013/11/05 Indian Point LR Hearing - Please peer review the IP SER input for BP using the attached files.	2013/11/08 Indian Point LR Hearing - DRAI 6a
Author Name & Author Affiliation	W. Holston, NRC/NRR	K. Green, NRC/NRR
Accession Number	ML13309B648	ML13312A833
# 0	DP- 58- 001	DP- 58- 002

Attachment 2 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 58 - December 2, 2013

Estimated Page Count	4	2	2	10
Comment	Internal discussion regarding buried piping leakage	Internal discussion regarding SER input	Internal discussion regarding draft RAI	Email forwarding draft CZMA consultation letter [Also withheld under Attorney-Client privilege]
Addressee Name & Addressee Affiliation	S. Turk, NRC/OGC K. Green, NRC/NRR D. Morey, NRC/NRR	W. Holston, NRC/NRR	J. Poehler, NRC/NRR	A. Ghosh, NRC/OGC R. Chazell, NRC/NRR
Document Type	E-Mail	E-Mail	E-Mail	E-Mail w/ Attachment
Document Date	11/12/2013	11/12/2013	11/13/2013	11/14/2013
Title	2013/11/12 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW: Update on Indian Point 3 Service Water System Relief Request	2013/11/12 Indian Point LR Hearing - IP SER as you requested.	2013/11/13 Indian Point LR Hearing - RAI 6-A	2013/11/14 Indian Point LR Hearing - NYSDOS Letter- Predecisional
Author Name & Author Affiliation	W. Holston, NRC/NRR	W. Gardner, NRC/NRR	K. Green, NRC/NRR	M. Moser, NRC/NRR
Accession Number	ML13316B992	ML13316B988	ML13317A888	ML13318B175
# 0	DP- 58- 003	DP- 58- 004	DP- 58- 005	DP- 58- 006

Attachment 2 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 58 - December 2, 2013

Estimated Page Count	7	10	10
Comment	Internal discussion regarding SER input	Internal discussion regarding SER supplement and RAIs Attachment [NRC Staff's 21st Status Report to the Board, publically available at ML13308B382]	Internal discussion regarding SER input Attachment: Draft SER input
Addressee Name & Addressee Affiliation	K. Green, NRC/NRR W. Gardner, NRC/NRR	M. Galloway, NRC/NRR J. Lubinski, NRC/NRR	D. Morey, NRC/NRR
Document Type	E-Mail	E-Mail w/ Attachment	E-Mail w/ Attachment
Document Date	11/19/2013	11/19/2013	11/20/2013
Title	2013/11/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - IP 9/26/12 SER Input File	2013/11/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - Monthly Status Report to ASLBP on IP	2013/11/20 Indian Point LR Hearing - Indian Point Buried Pipe SER Input for Applicant letters and RAI Responses Through October 2013
Author Name & Author Affiliation	W. Holston, NRC/NRR	K. Green, NRC/NRR	W. Holston, NRC/NRR
Accession	ML13323A360	ML13323A363	ML13324A039
# 0	DP- 58- 007	DP- 58- 008	DP- 58- 009

Attachment 2 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 58 - December 2, 2013

Estimated Page Count	0
Comment	Internal discussion regarding SRE input Attachment: [NL-13-131, publically available at ML13274A238]
Addressee Name & Addressee Affiliation	J. Wise, NRC/NRR
Document Type	E-Mail w/ Attachment
Document Date	11/22/2013
Title	2013/11/22 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: IP review
Author Name & Author Affiliation	W. Gardner, NRC/NRR
Accession Number	ML13326A116
# 0	DP- 58- 010

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.)))	Docket Nos. 50-247-LR, 50-286-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3))	

DECLARATION OF JOHN W. LUBINSKI

I, John W. Lubinski, do hereby state as follows:

- 1. I am employed as the Director of the Division of License Renewal (DLR) in the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's (NRC) Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation (NRR). My supervisory responsibilities include oversight of the NRC Staff's review and evaluation of the Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3 license renewal application.
- 2. As part of their responsibilities in updating the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for these proceedings, NRC staff members under my supervision identified documents as privileged because they contained information concerning the Staff's predecisional deliberative process. The documents are listed in Attachment 2 to the submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 58.
- 3. I have personally reviewed the documents identified as privileged in

 Attachment 2, and have determined, in accordance with the guidance set forth in Management

 Directive 3.4, that they contain pre-decisional information concerning the Staff's review of the

 license renewal application. The documents contain either the Staff's analyses,

 recommendations, opinions, or evaluations, and may not necessarily reflect the final agency

position with respect to the matters discussed therein. The documents comprise part of the deliberative process necessary for the Staff's review of the pending license renewal application.

- 4. Further, I have determined that disclosure of the documents could result in harm to the agency, in that it would (a) prematurely disclose the preliminary views of individual Staff members and/or the Staff prior to reaching a final agency decision, and could thus create confusion as to the actual policy or views of the NRC Staff; (b) hinder the efficiency of the Staff, in that forced disclosure of its internal discussions on an unresolved issue would tend to chill all future deliberations and would interfere with the Staff's ability to engage in a free exchange of opinions and analyses prior to publishing its final review documents; and (c) imply or suggest incorrectly that the opinions of the Staff members involved in these communications are actually the final decisions of the agency, while no such final decision has yet been made.
- Accordingly, I formally invoke the deliberative process privilege with respect to the documents listed in Attachment 2 to the submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 58.
- 6. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Executed in Accord with 10 CFR 2.304(d)

John W. Lubinski

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 2nd day of December, 2013

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.) Docket Nos. 50-247-LR, 50-286-L	R
)	
)	
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating)	
Units 2 and 3))	

AFFIDAVIT OF KIMBERLY J. GREEN CONCERNING MANDATORY DISCLOSURE REQUIREMENT OF 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)

I, Kimberly J. Green, do hereby state as follows:

- 1. I am employed as a Senior Mechanical Engineer in the Division of License Renewal in the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's (NRC) Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation. I serve as the hearing file project manager for the Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3 license renewal application (LRA). Among other things, I am assisting with the preparation of the hearing file and mandatory disclosures in connection with the LRA at issue in this proceeding.
- 2. I hereby certify that all relevant materials required to be disclosed pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336 (b) and (c) in the captioned proceeding have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete for documents identified as of November 25, 2013.
- 3. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Executed in Accord with 10 CFR 2.304(d)

Kimberly J. Green

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 2nd day of December 2013

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.)	Docket Nos. 50-247-LR, 50-286-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating) Units 2 and 3)	

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Pursuant to 10 C.F.R § 2.305 (revised), I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing Letter to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board regarding the Indian Point Hearing File, including: Attachment 1 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Supplement 58; Attachment 2 – Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Supplement 58 – Deliberative Process Privilege; Declaration of John W. Lubinski, dated December 2, 2013; and Affidavit of Kimberly J. Green, dated December 2, 2013, in the above-captioned proceeding have been served upon the Electronic Information Exchange, the NRC's E-Filing System, this 2nd day of December, 2013.

/Signed (electronically) by/

Anita Ghosh
Counsel for NRC Staff
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the General Counsel
Mail Stop – O-15D21
Washington, DC 20555
Telephone: (301) 415-4113
E-mail: anita.ghosh@nrc.gov

Date of signature: December 02, 2013