


United States Nuclear Regulatory Commission Official Hearing Exhibit	
Charlissa C. Smith (Denial of Senior Reactor Operator License)	
	ASLBP #: 13-925-01-SP-BD01
	Docket #: 05523694
	Exhibit #: CCS-093-00-BD01
	Admitted: 7/17/2013
	Rejected: 7/17/2013
Other:	Identified: 7/17/2013
	Withdrawn:
	Stricken:

Exhibit CCS-093

Exam Team rough notes in comparison to opportunities to withdraw rods. Credibility of notes and Lack of documentation exist. C. Smith typed notes but info can be verified with CCS-047(BATES), CCS-058(MEEKS), NRC-022(CAPEHART) FOR EVENT #3 – 4


- C. Smith stated that she attempted to withdraw rod twice (second time is clearly documented).
- C. Smith stated that the first attempt/request was made after the event #3(TE-130) and was interrupted by event #4 (no notes exist)
- NRC contends that C. Smith had opportunities when she was not involved in the activities addressed by the other crew members (this is not possible because it requires permission from the SS and assistance from the UO to perform a peer check)
- C. Smith did not make attempts according to the examiners because it is not in their notes. Notes missing on all three examiners notes for 8:05 to 8:11 am (was the request omitted on purpose?) This is the timeframe in which event #3 was complete and right before the next failure. The time frame that C. Smith describes happens to have missing data.....
- The notes are not intended to show the comment or step signed off in its entirety, it is to represent the times that notes were taken.

BATES NOTES

0724(14): Crew Take Shift
0727: 2½ Steps (1st Event)
0732: Increase 8-12 MWE
0736: Increase 3 Steps
0743(47): Alarms (2nd Event)
0744: IOA Done
0752(36): Place MFRV 4 to Auto.
0754(52): L & D Divert Alarm (3rd Event)

NOTE: Look at the examiners comment here, why would he write a comment like this in his notes about C. Smith

0755: TE130 “Certainly appeared that Carla made correct diagnosis”

0800: Pull P & ID  Last comment for event #3
0811: NSCW Cooling Fan (4th Event)  Next Event
0817(42): 3 Steps
0818(17): PZR Pressure Failure

11 minute gap in notes –
what was the crew doing?

MEEKS NOTES

0724(28): Crew Takes Shift
0727(19): AVE/REF 563.63/563.27
0728(40): Rods Increase 2.5 Steps ('^' 157) Raise Turbine Load 8-12 MWE
0736(50): Rods Increase 3 Steps
0739(48): Raise Turbine Load 8-12 MWE (AVE/REF 564.765/563.43)→Look@Time
0743(57): Fault In IOAs SF inst→MFPT speed
0745(00): Update Entering 18001
0745(16): IOA-Step-G1. Check and feed flows-MATCHED ON ALL SGs. (NO) RNO (FAILURE #2)
0746(32): UO-Step-G2. Select an unaffected control channel.
0750(37): UO OATC-Step-G5. Initiate the Continuous Actions Page.
0752(12): UO-Step-G3. Return MFP(s) speed to AUTO.
0753(03): ←Last Thing In #2-UO-Step-G4. Return SG feed flow valves to AUTO-Ask SM. So a phone call was made here.
0754(54): Fault In (FAILURE #3)
0756(08): Goes Through ARP
0802(10): SS direct TIC 130 manual control ← Last comment for event #3
0811(20): Fault In ← Next Event
0818(02): Fault In "Carla, shut that value"(PORV) < 2185#
0818(57): Entering 18001-C
0819(26): OATC-AOP 18001-C, Section C Immediate Actions (IOA)
0820(42): OATC-Step-C2. Check controlling channel-OPERATING PROPERLY. (YES)
0821(07): OATC-Step-C3. Initiate the Continuous Actions Page.
0821(53): OATC-Step-C4. Control PRZR pressure using heaters and sprays-BETWEEN 2220 AND 2250 PSIG.
0823(00): OATC-Step-C5
0824(05): OATC-Step-C7. Select unaffected channels on PS-455F:
0830(50): OATC-Step-C10. Return PRZR pressure Master Controller to AUTO.
0831(25): OATC-Step-C11. Select same channel on PS-455G PRZR PRESS REC SEL as selected on PS-455F
0831: Check P-11 Status
0837: Rods Increase 3 Steps
0839: SS-Directed SPRAYS→Auto

9 minute gap in notes – what was the crew doing?

CAPEHART'S NOTES

0727: 2.5 Step

0732: Increase Turbine Load

0736: Rods 3 Step

0740: Increase 8-12 MWE

0744: Step-Diagnose SG Loop #4 Flow FI-542 has failed high.

(FAILURE #2)

0745: Step-Enters APO 18001-C

0746: Step-G2. Select an unaffected control channel.

0751: Step-G5. Initiate the Continuous Actions Page.

0752: Step-G3. Return MFP(s) speed controls to AUTO.

0752: Step-G7. Notify I & C to initiate repairs.

0753: Step-G4. Return SG feed flow valves to AUTO. (Last Step)

0753: Step-G6. Check SG level control maintains NR level-AT 65%.

(Last Step)

0755: Diagnose TE-0130 has failed low. ALB07-F04 LTDN HX HI TEMP

DEMIN DIVERT. (FAILURE #3)

0756: ARP-Initial Operator Actions (IOA)

0757: ARP-Subsequent Operator Action

0758: Diagnose TE-0130 has failed low. ALB07-B04 (VOLUME CONTROL TANK OUTLET TEMP HI (delayed, or may not come in)

0805: L/D Hi Temp Alarm Cleared.

← Last comment for event #3

0812: OATC-Pulls up a trend on TE 130

← Next Event

0812: UO←Diagnose trip of NSCW Train a Tower Fan #1. ALB36-B02

480V SWGR 1AB15 TROUBLE. Green and amber light on NSCW CT Fan

#1-LIT. (FAILURE #4)

0817: U→S O/S Temp 50°F

7 minute gap in notes – what was the crew doing?

All three examiners
are missing a gap of
time in their notes
– that fits the
timeframe that C.
Smith identifies
that the Control
Rod withdrawal
was attempted

Suspicion of Notes

- Mark Bates notes have no lines on the first page and all other pages have lines (same document)
- Mark Bates has 3/26/2012 on some pages and 3/27/2012 on other pages (see next pages)

03/26/2012 Pg. 1

midnight SR: [redacted] Phil BOP: [redacted]

09:24:14 C-S: [redacted] *Can this shift*

27:48 S-C: ↑ 2 Steps *They correctly discussed ΔΦ management*

28:33 C-J: we have temp ←, we can lower turbine (no misgate.)

32:10 J-R: ↑ 8-12 MW

36:22 J-C: ↑ 3 Steps

43:47 Adams

56 R-J: Failed Steam Flow Int *Takes manual control of MFRV & Pump*

44:24 R-J: SRO's done

52:11 S-R: MFR Speed Control returned to auto

52:36 R-J-R: Place MFRV #4 to Auto.

54:52 C-S: LD Dem. Dint ↑ High 40 Temp

55:46 C-T: TE-130 *Anticrit appeared & Mark Bates made control observations*

08:00:30 R: Pulls P=EDs *J-97 CR, we, etc.*

01:54 C-S: The only thing we can do is control 4T to get TO fixed. (X)

02:45 J-C: Take manual control of TIC and monitor Tur: *1/4* (X)

J-C: That raises ↑ leaves temp if does not open ↑ job valve. (The controller is never working & she did not have time to operate it.) *1/4* (X)

05:00 1/2 thin temp Dem. Dint closed.

11:37 R-J: MFR (only fan) T-jump

R-J: AD to this → R-J: but 4/8 Temp without this.

FROM Exhibit CCS-047 pages 75

03/29/2012 Pg. 1

Phil BOP: [redacted]

with

discussed ΔΦ management

03/20/2012 Pg. 2

Heat Valve

Carlier

03/27/2012 Pg. 2

08:17:42 J-C: ↑ 3 Steps

18:17 C-T: ORZ P Failure *J-C: Shut that Valve*

She closes PZR given valves but did not close tank until usually Carlier

C-R: BV 960 did not close *added by [redacted] and [redacted]* (X)

May need to look at plots to get times of PZR closure *to s. up nec. instructions to close PZR valves.*

22:05 J-C: 2200-2250 P-Closed Band *DAB TS was online*

26:05 PZR P rose to 2200 # *prior to making correction to reduce P (she actually started to correctly control P when the band was possible)*

34:30 C-S: VCT Temp Ok. *Recommends repositioning valve 129*

C: Adjusted PZR Spray in Manual. *1st 1 of Spray Valve scene in Manual.*

37:24 J-C: ↑ 3 Steps *She was outside Turbine Band lost at data* (X)

40:37 PZR P = 2200 # *1-1/2 out from*

45:23 Turb = 1.5 call (Dem. Band)

[Turb Band seen on lines! at while rods in Manual] (X)

48:00 C-T-C: ↑ 3 Steps

51:30 C-S-C: ↑ 3 Steps

53:14 C-S: RWST low level Adams

55:00 C-S: 93.8% RWST level

56:04 J: Mentions 1 new TS

FROM Exhibit CCS-047 pages 76

Consider the possibility that the examiners ensured that their notes were consistent by making a comparison and adjusting the notes as need to ensure that the notes were similar

Did a rewrite of some notes occur?

How credible are the notes?

Booth instructed to tell them they can barely differentiate if sludge mix valve position was changed

09 00 10 C-R: Call C-T to leaving Me to RWST
 02 00 C-T-R: Can't tell position of valves, valves in valve gallery room
 04 18 J-R: Use camera to check sludge valves Am in here? Not sure if I heard him correctly?
 05 09 C-T-R: Leads downstream of sludge mix valves
 06 47 R-C: Sludge mixing should have isolated on RWST and
 C-R: Discrep during manual valves
 08 40 RWST L=88.5%
 12 25 C-T-S: Leak is % of ^{sludge} mix valve, but cannot get close to valves.
 R-T: Both Sludge Mix Valves closed
 15 41 C-S: 86.3% RWST L
 16 40 R-C: Have AD check leak No-R: leak stopped
 18 07 Alan:
 18 27 R-T: No feed on S/G A3
 19 17 R: Open B/D Valves
 19 45 J: X 18016
 20 14 C-T: Re Trip
 20 40 C-S: R: Tripped
 21 58 C-S: 3 Shock Beds
 22 50 C-S: No SI / not needed
 23 47 J-R: Throttle AFW to 150 gpm to make %
 24 36 J: X 19001 Re Trip Response
 25 06 J-C: Do SFTs 09 06 15 all Manual (C-S)
 26 38 J-R: 60-70% % level Round
 26 40 R: Close % B/D Iso closed
 29 05 J-L: Fin Break Jan 13009

F/A Q: 1

F/A Q: 2 on Damper

03/26/2012
 Pg 3
 of sludge mix valve
 position verification.

FROM Exhibit CCS-047 pages 77

09 30 19 C: Stand by for Pg 2
 30 44 C: Attempt to open S104 did not open
 33 25 J-C: Monitor Pop L @ 25%
 C-S: I am losing Part L R-J: S/G #3 Trends Changed
 34 22 J-R: Iso F/W to % #3 and look at level trend
 35 45 C-S: P/A level = 16% R-S: % #3 L
 36 15 J: X 19009 R-S
 37 20 C-S-C: SI Manual Calibration
 37 34 J: X 19000
 38 29 J: P.H. SI
 40 20 C-S: M. Cut / Chat Box
 49 13 J: X 19030 SSTR
 51 00 C-S: Chat P
 51 13 R-T: MSLI C: ADV CTMT
 52 40 J: X 19020
 59 46 J: X 19030
 10 01 23 C: 19030 Seal Inj Flow was initially > 20 gpm/pump.
 should it have been controlled via process protection?
 10:08:07 J: X - 19131 ECA-3.1
 10:09:00 END OF SCENARIO

FROM Exhibit CCS-047 pages 78

03/26/2012
 Pg 4

POST SCENARIO

03/27/2012
Pg 5

Q: Walk me through Temp/Turb Control. (Phil - 2.4°F)
A: What was your level? = 2.0°F
Q: What was your max A? = 2.3°F

ES: TE-2130 Failure

Q: What procedure guidance was used to manually
central T-2130? Initially, pressed up, but
then cancelled for manipulation & pressed
down.

Q: Walk me thru the diagnosis of plant response.
Demand goes down causing flow through HX to increase
Reactor activity increases.

ES: PT-456 Failure:

Q: What were your Top 4 Actions.
She went the wrong direction on PFRV H.I.

Q: What actions did you take. (Mode P Control is Auto)
Spray was still in Manual - so no input.

Q: What the position was spray valve in when Mode reset?
Spray valve was in manual.

Q: Was the RV inoperable? → Not operable due to not
auto closing.

Q: What was your P Control Band?

FROM Exhibit CCS-047 pages 79

Q: Walk me thru A & B Control. What was your max AB?
What was your target? ± 3 APD Units (0.2) Started @ -0.2
Did target change - stayed at 0.2.

03/27/2012
Pg 5

Q: What was your max AB?
What was your target? ± 3 APD Units (0.2) Started @ -0.2
Did target change - stayed at 0.2.

Q: At the end of the scenario seal by air was dropping. What was
your procedure guidance for controlling S.I. air?
First time flow 7300 the seal air was still in manual.
Q: What occurred to enable seal air to high?
A: 8105 & 8106 alarms could have caused it.
RCS P Level & Churn
↳ SSTR

FROM Exhibit CCS-047 pages 80

03/27/2012
Pg 6