United States Nuclear Regulatory Commission Official Hearing Exhibit					
In the Matter of		Charlissa C	. Smith		
in the matter of.	(Denial of Senior Reactor Operator License)				
EAR REGUL	ASLBP #:	13-925-01-SP-BD01			
NUCL. WIOR	Docket #:	05523694			
S D D	Exhibit #:	NRC-037-00-BD01	Identified: 7/17/2013		
ST S ST	Admitted:	7/17/2013	Withdrawn:		
HIN DOIS	Rejected:		Stricken:		
****	Other:				

3. Examiner comment on 303 form p. 20 of 32, related to Scenario 7, Event 6

A. FACTUAL SEQUENCE OF EVENTS

-During the simulator scenario, at approximately time 08:53:30, RWST LO LEVEL alarmed for event 6, a RWST leak.

-At time 08:55:00, Carla, as Reactor Operator (RO) informed (SRO) that RWST level was 93.8% and lowering.

-At time 08:56:24, mentioned a 1-hour Tech Spec action associated with RWST operability.

- At time 09:00:10, instructed (Balance-of-Plant

operator) to call Clearance and Tagging (C&T) to commence make-up to the RWST.

-At time 09:02:00, C&T called and informed him that the operator dispatched to the field could not determine the position of the valves due to the excessive water leakage in the valve gallery. (this was a cue developed by the NRC exam team on-the-spot)

-At time 09:04:18, asked asked could they isolate sludge valves from in here? did not respond to the SRO.

-At time 09:05:09, C&T called and informed him that it appeared that the RWST leak was coming from downstream of the sludge mixing valves. -At time 09:06:47, **1** quietly stated to Carla, "sludge mixing should have isolated on RWST level." Carla then had a discussion with concerning closing manual valves.

-At time 09:08:40, RWST level was 88.5% and lowering.

-At approximately this point in the event, **and the second directed** to reference the normal operating procedure for the SI system to determine if there was applicable guidance for the team.

-At time 09:12:25, C&T called and informed him that the leak was downstream of the sludge mixing valves, but that the operator could not get close enough to the valves to operate due to the leakage.

-At approximately this point in the event sequence, informed informed that there was no instruction in the SI OP for closing sludge mixing

that there was no instruction in the SI OP for closing sludge mixing valves.
-During the discussion with the second state of the sludge mixing referenced a plant piping ECCS diagram (P&ID) that included the RWST and associated piping and valves. It appeared that the sludge mixing determined that the sludge mixing valves could be operated from the QPCP panel from referencing this print.
pointed to the sludge mixing valves on the print when talking with the sludge mixing the sludge mixing valves.
because the print shows the location of the valve handswitches (panel QPCP).

-At time 09:13:??, closed the RWST sludge mixing valves using the handswitches on the QPCP. The RWST sludge mixing pump subsequently automatically tripped. (These two statements are based upon memory of M. Meeks and P. Capehart).

-At time 09:15:??, reported to that sludge mixing valves had been closed.

-At time 09:15:41, Carla stated to that RWST level was 86.3%. -At time 09:16:40, time instructed C&T to have a field operator check the RWST leak.

-Shorty after the preceeding communication, the field operator informed that the leak had stopped.

B. EXAMINER EVALUATION AND COMMENTS

The examiner downgraded Carla in rating factor 3.a. because she did not know the location of the handswitches to close the RWST sludge mixing valves.

The following applicants were documented as not demonstrating adequate knowledge of the location of the handswitches to close the RWST sludge mixing valves: **Carla Smith**, **Carla Smith**,

The signed statements from the applicants in Carla's appeal package, providing information concerning this event do not appear to be complete and accurate in all material respects.

-2-

Appendix D	Required Operator Actions	Form ES-D-2
Op-Test No.: 2012-301	Scenario No.: 7	

Event No.: 6

Event Description: The RWST will develop a leak resulting in lowering RWST level below the Tech Spec limit. After receipt of a QMCB annunciators, the UO will find the RWST Sludge Mixing Isolation Valves have failed to automatically close. The UO will close the valves on the QPCP and the leak will be terminated.

Time	Position	Applicant's Action or Behavior
**53	OATC	Diagnose RWST level is actually lowering on all channels.
		Symptoms / alarms:
		ALB06-E04 RWST LO LEVEL
		Indications:
045)	ANS	 RWST level lowering on LI-0990, 0991, 0992, and 0993 to less than 95%
	OATC	ALB06-E04 actions.
		PROBABLE CAUSE
		1. Filling of Accumulators.
		2. Adding water to the Spent Fuel Pool. (1) (1)
		3. Safety Injection (SI) actuation.
585	AKKISTL	4. System leakage. > Celler Od The invotigate Rang Tuche
	UO	AUTOMATIC ACTIONS 0303 CATTOL Cast determe lake
		RWST Studge Mixing Iselation Valves 1-HV-10957 (Train B, 1-LT-0991) an 1-HV-10958 (Train A, 1-LT-0990) close.
	2515	Note to examiner: These values are located on the QPCP and will NOT close for this event. The UO will have to manually close the values to isolate the leak.
u D	858 3.	5.4 D lbr T.S. to restore
0501	ダンルのつ	Cot Brot op for 26 Restoring RWST IUI
5764	s-jus w	e can isit studge making from in here (D.d. ast durat it)

Op-Test No.: 2012-301	Scenario No.: 7	
Appendix D	Required Operator Actions	Form ES-D-2
		Submitted: May 31, 201 (apehart

Event No.: 6

Event Description: The RWST will develop a leak resulting in lowering RWST level below the Tech Spec limit. After receipt of a QMCB annunciators, the UO will find the RWST Sludge Mixing Isolation Valves have failed to automatically close. The UO will close the valves on the QPCP and the leak will be terminated.

Time	Position	Applicant's Action or Behavior
	OATC UO	ALB06-E04 actions continued. INTIAL OPERATOR ACTIONS NONE
	UO	SUBSEQUENT OPERATOR ACTIONS
		1. IF in Modes 1, 2, 3, or 4, and SI is not in progress, stop any operation that could be removing water from the RWST.
		2. IF a system leak is indicated, dispatch personnel to locate and isolate the leak.
OPU		Note to examiner. The UO closing either HV-10957 or HV-10958 will isolate the leak for this event.
	\checkmark	3. Restore RWST level to normal per 13701-1, "Boric Acid System".
	SS	4. Refer to Technical Specification LCO 3.5.4 and TR 13.1.7.
		COMPENSATORY OPERATOR ACTIONS
		NONE

UNS No intrata for closing Nor, dos in St of. (Theremay) \$

27

-4-

Bates NRC-037 Submitted: May 31, 20193/2012

Rg. 2

:52 J-C: 43 Steps 42 C-J'DRZ P Fair 18 17 She doses V centil PORY Linetra 7 C-R' BV 466 did dose torive May need to look at plats times of PORU loscu PORV 10h 1. DAB TS was entrus J-C: 2220- 2250 P(mites Band 22 05 Par Prose to 2260 # prime to corrections to recluse P 210 25 mate (she actually started to could genter P after the band was periddel) C-T' VET accounds repositaning Value 129 30 Tend 34 Valugare 0. PZR Spray in Namal. Conn nray Manual Lec? She Jr1! 3 Steps 37 24 Fau ph at data promys to P= 2270# 40 -1,5 cold Dan Bilet 23 45 Tang Tare Bard siven Parlineas - 20Fwhile rods in Manual_ C-T-C: # 3 Sturs 48 00 C-J.C' 4 3 Steps 51 30 level RUST Dear 5314 .6 C-J' 93,8% & PUST hund 55 00 Mentions 1 have 7.5 56 2N Ti -5-

Submitted: May 31, 2013 Pg 3 Booth instructed to fell them they are barry difficulty of Sleedy mix yales 47-R' 10 J-R: Call 14 to liney Mu to Plest <17-R' Can't tell position of values, values in value gally mon. 02 00 J-R'i Up ravislate studye values fim in Lue ? Not sore if I have him 04 18 <17-R' Lodes down shear of slutge mix va 15 09 R-C' Sludge mixing should have solated on Res 57 Cenel OCe 47 (- R' Discosily dosing Manual values RUST L-881576 08 40 CIT- 5 ' Leak is DIS of Mix Volue, but count set cluse to values 12 25 R-J' Both Study Mix Value, closed C-J' 86.3% RWST 15 41 R-c/7: Hur AD chub leak AD-R' leal & stopped 10 40 alar > 807 R-J'No Feed on S/6 #3 827 R'i Opus BT Jalue 19 17 T' X 78016 19 45 C.T. RE TVID 20 16 C-J: Re Tripped 20 40 C-5: 3 Stock Bds 21 56 S' NO SI / Not needed 82 50 J-R: Thothe Afer to 150 pm to earligh 23 47 19001 Rx Trip Resperse X 24 36 09 2615 J-(; Do SESTS 25 06 J-R: 60- 70% 46 level Ba 24 35 R: doses \$16 BID ISO classof 4, 50 J-C' EmBorato iau 13009 9 05

TV-129 in DIVERT ature indications? ts? brief, leav YORV leave 7 because on replica AUTO- DIVERT nely 1 on -> point wan Lack -129 w neco concern have warm (going

Appendix D	Required Operator Actions	Form ES-D-2
		Submitted: May 31, 2013
		NRC-03th

Scenario No.: 7

Event No.: 6

Event Description: The RWST will develop a leak resulting in lowering RWST level below the Tech Spec limit. After receipt of a QMCB annunciators, the UO will find the RWST Sludge Mixing Isolation Valves have failed to automatically close. The UO will close the valves on the QPCP and the leak will be terminated.

Time	Position	Applicant's Action or Behavior	
	OATC	Diagnose RWST level is actually lowering on all channels.	
		Symptoms / alarms:	
		ALB06-E04 RWST LO LEVEL	
		Indications:	
		 RWST level lowering on LI-0990, 0991, 0992, and 0993 to less than 95% 	
	OATC	ALB06-E04 actions.	
		PROBABLE CAUSE	
		1. Filling of Accumulators.	
		2. Adding water to the Spent Fuel Pool.	
		3. Safety Injection (SI) actuation.	
	×	4. System leakage.	
	UO	AUTOMATIC ACTIONS	
		RWST Sludge Mixing Isolation Valves 1-HV-10957 (Train B, 1-LT-0991) an 1-HV-10958 (Train A, 1-LT-0990) close.	
		Note to examiner: These valves are located on the QPCP and will NOT close for this event. The UO will have to manually close the valves to isolate the leak.	

26

-8-



		NRC-037(N) 1/5
	1.	Submitted: May 31, 2013
Appendix D	Required Operator Actions	Form ES-D-2

Scenario No.: 7

Event No.: 6

Event Description: The RWST will develop a leak resulting in lowering RWST level below the Tech Spec limit. After receipt of a QMCB annunciators, the UO will find the RWST Sludge Mixing Isolation Valves have failed to automatically close. The UO will close the valves on the QPCP and the leak will be terminated.

Time	Position	Applicant's Action or Behavior
	OATC UO	ALB06-E04 actions continued. INTIAL OPERATOR ACTIONS NONE
	UO SS	 SUBSEQUENT OPERATOR ACTIONS 1. IF in Modes 1, 2, 3, or 4, and SI is not in progress, stop any operation that could be removing water from the RWST. 2. IF a system leak is indicated, dispatch personnel to locate and isolate the leak. Note to examiner. The UO closing either HV-10957 or HV-10958 will isolate the leak for this event. 3. Restore RWST level to normal per 13701-1, "Boric Acid System". 4. Refer to Technical Specification LCO 3.5.4 and TR 13.1.7. COMPENSATORY OPERATOR ACTIONS NONE

Appendix D	Required Operator Actions	Form ES-D-2

Scenario No.: 7

Event No.: 6

Event Description: The RWST will develop a leak resulting in lowering RWST level below the Tech Spec limit. After receipt of a QMCB annunciators, the UO will find the RWST Sludge Mixing Isolation Valves have failed to automatically close. The UO will close the valves on the QPCP and the leak will be terminated.

Time	Position	Applicant's Action or Behavior			
	SS	3.5.4 Refueling Water Storage Tank (RWST). LCO 3.5.4 The RWST shall be OPERABLE. APPLICABILITY: MODES 1, 2, 3, and 4.			
		ACTIONS			
		CONDITION	REQUIRED ACTION	COMPLETION TIME	
		B. One or more sludge mixing pump isolation valves inoperable.	B.1 Restore the valve(s) to OPERABLE status.	24 hours	
		D. RWST inoperable for reasons other than Condition A or B.	D.1 Restore RWST to OPERABLE status.	1 hour	
		E. Required Action and associated Completion Time of Condition A or D	E.1 Be in MODe 3. AND	6 hours	
			E.2 Be in MODE 5	36 hours.	
		Note to examiner : Closing the RWST sludge mixing isolations HV-10957 and HV-10958 satisfies Condition B.			



NRC-037 Submitted: May 31, 2013 Muk

Appendix D	Required Operator Actions	Form ES-D-2



Op-Test No.: 2012-301

Scenario No.: 7

Event No.: 6

Event Description: The RWST will develop a leak resulting in lowering RWST level below the Tech Spec limit. After receipt of a QMCB annunciators, the UO will find the RWST Sludge Mixing Isolation Valves have failed to automatically close. The UO will close the valves on the QPCP and the leak will be terminated.

Time	Position	Applicant's Action or Behavior		
	SS	 TR 13.1.7 Borated Water Sources – Operating. TR 13.1.7 The following borated water source(s) shall be OPERABLE as required by TR-13.1.3: a. Boric acid storage tank. b. The refueling water storage tank (RWST). APPLICABILITY: MODES 1, 2, 3, and 4. 		
× *		CONDITION	REQUIRED ACTION	COMPLETION TIME
×		D. RWST inoperable.	D.1 Enter applicable Conditions of RWST Technical Specification 3.5.4.	Immediately.
		END OF EVENT 6, pro	oceed to EVENT 7, the	main event.





Appendix D	Required Operator Actions	Form ES-D-2	

Scenario No.: 7

Event No.: 7

Event Description: Main Feed Regulating Valve for loop # 3 fails shut requiring a Reactor trip. When the Reactor trips, 3 rods will stick out requiring an Emergency Boration by the OATC.

Time	Position	Applicant's Action or Behavior
	UO	Diagnose MFRV Loop # 3 has failed shut.
		Symptoms / alarms:
		ALB13-C01 STM GEN 3 FLOW MISMATCH
		ALB13-C06 STM GEN 3 HI/LO LVL DEVIATION (short delay)
		ALB13-C03 STM GEN 3 LO LEVEL (a little longer delay)
21		ALB13-C05 STM GEN 3 LO-LO LVL ALERT (auto trip set point)
		Indications:
	SS	 Feed flow reading 0 gpm for SG # 3 (1FI-530A / 531A). Level lowering rapidly on SG # 3 (1LI-538, 539, 537, & 553). MFRV # 3 green light only lit on ZLB-004. MFRV # 3 demand at 100% and red up arrow lit on 1FIC-530.
		Enters 18016-C CONDENSATE AND FEEDWATER MALFUNCTION section D MAIN FEEDWATER VALVE MALFUNCTION.

Appendix D

Required Operator Actions

Form ES-D-2

Op-Test No.: 2012-301 Scena

Scenario No.: 7

Event No.: 6

Event Description: The RWST will develop a leak resulting in lowering RWST level below the Tech Spec limit. After receipt of a QMCB annunciators, the UO will find the RWST Sludge Mixing Isolation Valves have failed to automatically close. The UO will close the valves on the QPCP and the leak will be terminated.

Time	Position	Applicant's Action or Behavior
7853	OATC	Diagnose RWST level is actually lowering on all channels.
		Symptoms / alarms:
		ALB06-E04 RWST LO LEVEL
		Indications:
045)	Ans	 RWST level lowering on LI-0990, 0991, 0992, and 0993 to less than 95%
	OATC	ALB06-E04 actions.
		PROBABLE CAUSE
		1. Filling of Accumulators.
	L	2. Adding water to the Spent Fuel Pool. (1) (NT
		3. Safety Injection (SI) actuation.
085	AKUSTLU	4. System leakage> Celler Od Tto invatigate Bang Turlie
	UO	AUTOMATIC ACTIONS 0303 CATTOL Cast determe lak
		RWST Studge Mixing Isolation Valves 1-HV-10957 (Train B,
	2515	Note to examiner: These valves are located on the QPCP and will NOT close for this event. The UO will have to manually close the valves to isolate the leak.
	d (d)	(1) it To the second
, u O	838 5.). 4 U (Nor 1.). () region-
0901	5-340-3	Cot Bred op our 20 nestoring toust int
0764	sourd wa	e can ifin shall many or the (1.0 as the -14-

Appendix D	Required Operator Actions	Form ES-D-2
		Capehart
		Submitted: May 31, 201

Op-Test No.: 2012-301 Scenario No.: 7

Event No.: 6

Event Description: The RWST will develop a leak resulting in lowering RWST level below the Tech Spec limit. After receipt of a QMCB annunciators, the UO will find the RWST Sludge Mixing Isolation Valves have failed to automatically close. The UO will close the valves on the QPCP and the leak will be terminated.

Time	Position	Applicant's Action or Behavior
	OATC UO	ALB06-E04 actions continued. INTIAL OPERATOR ACTIONS NONE
<i>6</i> ¶1	UO	 SUBSEQUENT OPERATOR ACTIONS 1. IF in Modes 1, 2, 3, or 4, and SI is not in progress, stop any operation that could be removing water from the RWST. 2. IF a system leak is indicated, dispatch personnel to locate and isolate the leak. Note to examiner. The UO closing either HV-10957 or HV-10958 will isolate the leak for this event. 3. Restore RWST level to normal per 13701-1, "Boric Acid System". 4. Refer to Technical Specification LCO 3.5.4 and TR 13.1.7. COMPENSATORY OPERATOR ACTIONS NONE

UNS No intrution for clising Nice, Uni in St of. (Theremay) to

Submitted? May 31, 2013

J-C: 43 Steps 42 C-T'PRZ D 18 17 Fau She doses uncu Linetea C-R' BV 466 clos tosi look at olots NP May need to times of BRU closen PORL J-C': 2220- 2250 P(mites Band DAB TS 22 05 WOR Prose to 2260 # prior 210 05 M (she actually started to currently an was periddel the band ter P a tu Recommends Teno Al VET Vielen 129 C-T' 34 30 NUSIFa Valugare C' Adjustin PZR Nama Seray in nra Mana 11 uce3 She 3 Step. 24 37 Faut look at data Sprays to 2P P= 2270# 40 a -1,5 cold Dain Birt Tane 45 Tare Bard Siven Parlinuas = 20F. while rasin Marual 4 3 Sters C-T-C' 48 00 Steps 3 C-T.C' 30 51 level 100 11 RUST 53 14 ALAX RUST level C-T: 93,8% 1 55 00 J: Mentions 1 have 7.5 56 2N

NRC-037 Submitted: 34 31, 2013

Pr 3 Booth instructed to fell them they are having difficulty of Sleedy mix yales 4-R'. 10 J-R'. Call cty to line, Mu to Plast 10 CIT-R' Can't tell position of values. Valiar in value alley por 02 00 if I hand him ceructy? J-R'i Up ramislate studge values fim in hue ? Not sore 18 04 <17-R' Lodes down shear of sludge mix rales 15 09 R-C' Sludge mixing should have solated in Res 57 Cenel OCe 47 C- RI Discosily dosing Manual values RUST L=881576 08 40 Mix Volue by + round set duse C/7-5 ' to values 12 25 15 0/5 Leak R-J' Both Slug Mix Value, clused C-J' 86.3% RUST 15 41 R-c/7: Huy AD chub leak AD-R' leale storned 10 40 alar > 18 07 R-J'No Feed on S/6 #3 R'i Opus BIP Jalu 19 17 T'IX TROIL 19 45 C.T. Re Trip 20 C-J' Re Tripped 20 40 C-5: 3 Stock Bds 21 56 5' NO SI / Not needed C-82 50 Thattle AFer to 150 spin to ecule 3/6 J-R: 23 47 Rx Trip Resperse 24 36 1900 1 TX 09 2615 all Green (c-3) J-C: Do SESTS 25 06 J-R: 60-70% 46 level Band 24 35 R: closes \$16 BID ISO classof 310 50 J-Ci EmBoute iau 29 05