

**From:** Benson, Michael  
**To:** Kirk, Mark; Stevens, Gary  
**Subject:** RE: Draft J-R data scumming letter  
**Date:** Tuesday, April 17, 2012 10:25:00 AM

---

Question: if no one uses this stuff anyway, why are we working on it?

**From:** Kirk, Mark  
**Sent:** Tuesday, April 17, 2012 10:09 AM  
**To:** Benson, Michael; Stevens, Gary  
**Subject:** Draft J-R data scumming letter

Mike / Gary –

Below is my draft. Please edit so we can send around. Any edits / comments gleefully accepted ... and I do need help in specific with the highlighted bit

---

Dear Colleagues –

As you may be aware, the NRC is considering an update to Reg Guide 1.161, "EVALUATION OF REACTOR PRESSURE VESSELS WITH CHARPY UPPER-SHELF ENERGY LESS THAN 50 FT-LB." This document is attached for your reference ... it has not been updated since it was first issued in 1995.

You are probably also aware that much of RG1.161 is mirrored in the ASME Code, SC-XI, Appendix K. One aspect of the RG that is not reflected in the Code approach are the equations that are used to estimate J-R curves from Charpy V-notch energy data. Our review of the information on which these equations were based reveal that there is limited information at high fluence (MIKE – can you say something more specific here). As plants go for license extension we feel it therefore important to check that the existing equations predict trends accurately at high fluence and, if needed, update the equations so that they do.

The purpose of this e-mail is to request your assistance in identifying and/or providing any data (J/R curve data, paired with Charpy data, for RPV steels & welds both before and after irradiation exposure) that would be helpful to this effort. If you have any data you think is pertinent, and can provide, I would appreciate a return e-mail so that we can discuss what is needed in more detail.

B/53