



**UNITED STATES  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION  
REGION I**  
2100 RENAISSANCE BOULEVARD, SUITE 100  
KING OF PRUSSIA, PENNSYLVANIA 19406-2713

June 7, 2013

Mr. Joseph E. Pacher, Site Vice President  
R. E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant, LLC  
Constellation Energy Nuclear Group, LLC  
1503 Lake Road  
Ontario, NY 14519

**SUBJECT: R. E. GINNA NUCLEAR POWER PLANT - NRC INITIAL OPERATOR  
LICENSING RETAKE EXAMINATION REPORT 05000244/2013301**

Dear Mr. Pacher:

On May 16, 2013, the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) completed retake examinations at R. E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant. The enclosed report documents the examination findings, which were discussed on May 28, 2013, with Mr. Tom Paglia and other members of your staff.

The retake examinations included the evaluation of two applicants for reactor operator licenses and two applicants for instant senior reactor operator licenses. Written and operating examinations were developed using NUREG-1021, "Operator Licensing Examination Standards for Power Reactors," Revision 9, Supplement 1. The license examiner determined that all four of the applicants passed their respective retake examinations. Appropriate licenses were issued on June 5, 2013.

No findings were identified during this examination.

In accordance with 10 CFR 2.390 of the NRC's "Rules of Practice," a copy of this letter and its enclosure will be available electronically for public inspection in the NRC Public Document Room or from the Publicly Available Records (PARS) component of NRC's document system Agencywide Documents Access and Management System (ADAMS). ADAMS is accessible from the NRC Web site at <http://www.nrc.gov/reading-rm/adams/web-based.html> (the Public Electronic Reading Room).

Sincerely,

**/RA/**

Donald E. Jackson, Chief  
Operations Branch  
Division of Reactor Safety

J. Pacher

2

Docket No. 50-244  
License No. DPR-18

Enclosure:  
NRC Initial Operator Licensing Examination  
Report 05000244/2013301  
w/Attachment: Supplemental Information

cc w/encl: Distribution via ListServ

J. Pacher

2

Docket No. 50-244  
License No. DPR-18

Enclosure:  
NRC Initial Operator Licensing Examination  
Report 05000244/2013301  
w/Attachment: Supplemental Information

cc w/encl: Distribution via ListServ

Distribution w/encl:      **(via E-mail)**  
W. Dean, RA                    **(R1ORAMAIL RESOURCE)**  
D. Lew, DRA                    **(R1ORAMAIL RESOURCE)**  
D. Roberts, DRP                **(R1DRPMAIL RESOURCE)**  
M. Layton, DRP                **(R1DRPMAIL RESOURCE)**  
C. Miller, DRS                 **(R1DRSMAIL RESOURCE)**  
J. Clifford, DRS                **(R1DRSMAIL RESOURCE)**  
D. Schroeder, DRP  
A. Rosebrook, DRP  
T. Ziev, DRP  
N. Perry, DRP, SRI  
D. Dodson, DRP, RI  
M. Rose, DRP, AA  
D. Huyck, RI OEDO  
RidsNrrPMREGinna Resource  
RidsNrrDorlLpl1-1 Resource  
ROPreports Resource

DOCUMENT NAME: G:\DRS\Operations Branch\SILK\Exam FY13-Ginna Rtk Apr 13 (U01901)\Ginna Retake Exam Report.docx  
ADAMS PKG: ML13060A101                    ADAMS ACCESSION NUMBER: ML13158A271

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> SUNSI Review		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Non-Sensitive <input type="checkbox"/> Sensitive		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Publicly Available <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Publicly Available	
OFFICE	RI/DRS/OB	RI/DRS/OB			
NAME	DSilk	DJackson			
DATE	6/5/13	6/7/13			

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

**EXAMINATION REPORT**

**U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION  
REGION I**

Dockets: 50-244

Licenses: DPR-18

Report : 05000244/2013301

Licensee: Constellation Energy Nuclear Group, LLC

Facility: R. E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant

Location: 1503 Lake Road  
Ontario, NY 14519

Dates: May 15 – 16, 2013 (Operating Test Administration)  
April 26, 2013 (Written Examination Administration)  
May 3 to May 20, 2013 (NRC Examination Grading)  
June 5, 2013 (Licenses Issued)

Examiner: D. Silk, Chief Examiner, Operations Branch

Approved By: Donald E. Jackson, Chief  
Operations Branch  
Division of Reactor Safety

## Summary of Findings

ER 05000244/2013301; April 26, 2013 through May 16, 2013; R. E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant; Initial Operator Licensing Examination Report.

One NRC examiner evaluated the competency of two retake applicants for reactor operator licenses and two retake applicants for instant senior reactor operator licenses at R. E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant. The facility licensee developed the examinations using NUREG-1021, "Operator Licensing Examination Standards for Power Reactors," Revision 9, Supplement 1. The written examination was administered by the facility on April 26, 2013. The NRC examiner administered the operating tests on May 15-16, 2013. The license examiner determined that all four of the applicants passed their respective examinations. The appropriate licenses were issued on June 5, 2013.

A. NRC-Identified and Self-Revealing Findings

No findings were identified.

B. Licensee-Identified Violations

None.

## REPORT DETAILS

### 4. OTHER ACTIVITIES (OA)

#### 4OA5 Other Activities (Initial Operator License Examination)

##### .1 License Applications

###### a. Examination Scope

The examiner reviewed the four license applications submitted by the licensee to ensure the applications reflected that each applicant satisfied relevant license eligibility requirements. The applications were submitted on NRC Form 398, "Personal Qualification Statement," and NRC Form 396, "Certification of Medical Examination by Facility Licensee." The reactor operator retake applicants requested waivers for the operating portion of the examination and the senior reactor operator retake applicants requested waivers for the written examination and the dynamic simulator portion of the operating test. These waivers were granted by Region I. In addition, because all of the applicants had exceeded 24 months since passing a generic fundamental examination (GFE), the licensee requested a waiver asking for a deferral of a GFE examination until after the completion of the NRC retake examinations. This waiver was granted by NRC headquarters.

###### b. Findings

No findings were identified.

##### .2 Operator Knowledge and Performance

###### a. Examination Scope

On April 26, 2013, the licensee proctored the administration of the written examinations to the two reactor operator retake applicants. The licensee staff graded the written examinations, analyzed the results, and presented their analysis to the NRC on May 3, 2013.

The NRC examiner administered the job performance measure portion of the operating examination to the two senior reactor operator retake applicants on May 15-16, 2013. These applicants participated in a control room and facilities walkthrough test consisting of 10 system tasks and an administrative test consisting of five tasks.

###### b. Findings

All four of the retake applicants passed their respective examinations. For the written examinations, the reactor operator applicants' average score was 83.3 percent and ranged from 81.3 to 85.3 percent.

Enclosure

The NRC examiner completed the final grading of the written examination on May 3, 2013, and conducted a review of each missed question to determine the accuracy and validity of the examination questions. Chapter ES-403 and Form ES-403-1 of NUREG 1021 require the licensee to analyze the validity of any written examination questions that were missed by half or more of the applicants. The licensee determined that the 22 questions that were missed by half or more of the applicants were valid. (Note: This was a high number due to the fact that only two individuals took the written examination.) The licensee conducted a performance analysis for all 75 questions. Based on their review and analysis, the licensee did not submit any post-examination comments.

The text of the examination questions may be accessed in the Agency-wide Documents Access and Management System (ADAMS) system under the accession numbers noted in Attachment 1. However, in accordance with current NRC policy, the release of this written examination in ADAMS to the public will be delayed for 2 years.

.3 Initial Licensing Examination Development

a. Examination Scope

The facility licensee developed the examinations in accordance with NUREG-1021, Revision 9, Supplement 1. All licensee facility training and operations staff involved in examination preparation and validation were listed on a security agreement. The facility licensee submitted both the written and operating examination outlines on January 29, 2013. The chief examiner reviewed the outlines against the requirements of NUREG-1021, and provided comments to the licensee. The facility licensee submitted the draft written examination package on March 22, 2013, and the draft operating examination on April 8, 2013. The chief examiner reviewed the draft examination package against the requirements of NUREG-1021, and provided comments to the licensee. The licensee satisfactorily completed comment resolution for the written and operating examination on April 24, 2013. The NRC conducted an onsite validation of the operating examinations and provided minor editorial comments on May 13-14, 2013.

b. Findings

The NRC approved the initial examination outline and advised the licensee to proceed with the operating examination development.

The examiner determined that the written and operating examinations initially submitted by the licensee were within the range of acceptability expected for a proposed operating examination.

.4 Simulation Facility Performance

a. Examination Scope

The examiner observed simulator performance with regard to plant fidelity during the examination validation and administration.

Enclosure

b. Findings

No findings were identified.

.5 Examination Security

a. Examination Scope

The examiner reviewed examination security for examination development and during the examination administration week for compliance with NUREG-1021 requirements. Plans for simulator security and applicant control were reviewed and discussed with licensee personnel.

b. Findings

During the administration of the written examination, one of the reactor operator applicants demonstrated signs of anxiety while taking the test. The proctor contacted the escort and informed him of the applicant's condition. On a subsequent restroom break, a discussion occurred outside of the exam room and out of the presence of the proctor between the applicant and the escort in which the applicant was encouraged to relax and take one question at a time. There was some small talk (i.e., weather, NFL draft) that occurred. When this event was relayed to the chief examiner, it was stated that no discussion pertaining to the examination occurred. The escort was not part of the exam development team and, although not on the security agreement, he was aware of exam security considerations. Regional management requested the licensee to reconstruct the specifics of this event and details of the conversation between the applicant and the escort and then state why they believed that exam integrity was maintained. This information, and a Regional recommendation, was forwarded to NRC headquarters for their assessment. NRC headquarters decided that no examination security breach occurred. However, NRC headquarters instructed the Region to do the following: 1) Prior to the next Ginna initial operator licensing examination, reinforce the examination security expectations with the licensee, 2) ensure the examination security issue is documented in the examination report as required by ES-501 E.3.a, and 3) prior to the next initial examination verify that licensee corrective actions have been taken to prevent recurrence as specified in ES-201, Attachment 1, Physical Security Guidelines Item 5.

4OA6 Meetings, including Exit

The chief examiner presented the examination results to Ms. A. Smith, Nuclear Training Manager and Mr. T. Paglia, Operations Manager of your staff on May 28, 2013. Your staff did not identify any information or materials used during the examination as proprietary.

Attachments:

1. Supplemental Information
2. Simulator Fidelity Report

Enclosure



**ATTACHMENT**

**SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION**

**KEY POINTS OF CONTACT**

Licensee Personnel

A. Smith, Nuclear Training Manager  
K. Garnish, General Supervisor, Operations Training  
J. List, Supervisor Operations Continuing Training  
D. Dean, Operations Exam Reviewer (SRO)  
P. Landers, Lead Exam Developer  
S. Reed, Nuclear Training Instructor

NRC Personnel

N. Perry, Senior Resident Inspector

**ITEMS OPENED, CLOSED, AND DISCUSSED**

Opened

NONE

Opened and Closed

NONE

Closed

NONE

Discussed

NONE

**ADAMS DOCUMENTS REFERENCED**

Accession No. ML –13149A412 FINAL-Written Exam (Note: In accordance with current NRC policy, the release of this written examination in ADAMS to the public will be delayed for 2 years.)  
Accession No. ML – 13149A419 FINAL-Operating Exam (JPMs only)