

## SCHEDULING THE EXAM AND EXAMINER INDEPENDENCE

As referenced in the emails between [REDACTED] and M. Meeks in the previous section, Vogtle initially considered scheduling a retake exam for the applicants that had failed in 2011, to be given before the next regularly scheduled exam in the spring of 2012. Ultimately, Vogtle decided not to attempt to give a specific retake exam, and the applicants who had failed the exam in 2011 were moved in with the class to be tested in the spring of 2012. This decision led to the 2012 Vogtle class size to be relatively large; ultimately the 2012 operating test was administered to 18 applicants, with 22 applicants taking the written exam.

As shown in the attached FY2012 weekly schedule (revision 1), the initial exam team consisted of M. Bates as the chief examiner, with B. Caballero and M. Meeks the other two examiners. Based on his qualification schedule, M. Meeks requested to serve as the chief examiner under instruction for this exam and was approved by the branch chief. During the corporate notification phone call ("120-day"), this exam team was communicated to the facility licensee. Due to other scheduling pressures, in approximately August of 2011 the exam team changed, and B. Caballero was forced by his additional obligations to be replaced on the Vogtle 2012 exam with P. Capehart.

When the final number and makeup of the applicant class was determined following the completion of the licensee "audit" exam, M. Bates and M. Meeks independently began development of the schedule for what was scheduled as two full weeks for the operating test. These draft schedules were in a generic format ("I1 I2 I3" to designate "Instant SRO 1, Instant SRO 2, Instant SRO 3," etc.) and did not include any applicant names. During the development of these generic schedules, M. Bates' schedule worked better than M. Meeks' schedule; however, M. Meeks asked M. Bates to modify his schedule so that any surrogate operators would be in the BOP position, instead of the SRO position. Once the generic schedule had been generated, M. Meeks assigned applicant names to the positions in an inverse alphabetical order. Carla Smith's name was assigned as "I2." A copy of this schedule is included at the end of this section. When Carla Smith was associated with "I2," the exam team purposely assigned M. Bates as the examiner of record for I2. This was specifically chosen to ensure that there would be no bias from the previous 2011 exam, and the branch chief was notified of this decision.

In the cover letter from Carla Smith requesting an appeal review of her grading, she states:

In addition, two of the three examiners were a part of the evaluation team from Hot License 16 examination. I was the only applicant that was re-evaluated from Hot License 16. I did not have the benefit of starting with a clean slate or without preconceived expectations, like the other applicants....

As shown in the preceeding discussion and the following, this statement is without merit.

NUREG 1021, section ES-201 D.1.a states that: "The regional office shall not assign an examiner who failed an applicant on an operating test to administer any part of that applicant's retake operating test." Keeping the intent of this requirement in mind, as shown above M. Bates was intentionally assigned as Carla Smith's examiner of record.

As mentioned earlier, M. Bates was not directly involved in the decision associated with the likely denial of a waiver for Carla Smith. This was purposely done to ensure that M. Bates would independently evaluate Carla Smith's performance without preconceived ideas based on her performance in 2011 on the previous exam. Specifically, M. Bates took special effort not to review any 303 documentation or any other record of Carla Smith's 2011 performance until after the 2012 exam report was issued.

## 2nd Quarter FY2012

2012	1/02	1/9	1/16	1/23	1/30	2/06	2/13	2/20	2/27	3/05	3/12	3/19	3/26
HOLIDAY		M16					M20						
Aiello			WB Rev	WB Rev	WB Rev			WB-IP 4/10/2			WB-E	WB-E	Doc
Baldwin				HR-IP 8/4/4			HR-E	HR-E				BF Rev	BF Rev
Bates	Doc	Doc			VG Rev	VG-Rev	VG Rev			VG-IP 12/8/1			VG-E
Caballero		TP Doc	TP Doc	HR-IP	TP Doc		HR-E	HR-E		VG-IP			VG-E
Capehart		TP Doc	TP Doc	TP Doc						SM Review	SM Review	SM Review	
Chambers													
Laska			SQ-E	SQ-E	Doc	Doc	Doc	WB-IP?			WB-E	WB-E	Doc
Lea	Doc	Doc	BF Review	BF Review	BF Review								Doc
Meeks				HR-IP			HR-E			VG-IP			VG-E
Riches	Doc	Doc						WB-IP			WB-E	WB-E	Doc
Schaaf			SQ-E	SQ-E									Doc
New Hire												Doc	Doc
New Hire													
Other			SQ-E?	SQ-E?									
Other													

2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter F

2012	1/02	1/9	1/16	1/23	1/30	2/06	2/13	2/20	2/27	3/05	3/12	3/19	3/26
HOLIDAY			M16					M20					
Aiello	AL			HR-IP	Doc	AL	HR-E						
Bacon					GE TTC	GE TTC	GE TTC	SR Prep Written	GE TTC	GE TTC	SR Prep Written	GE TTC	GE TTC
Baldwin	HR Rev	HR Rev		HR-IP 8/2/3			HR-E	HR-E	Doc	Doc	Doc	BF Rev	BF Rev
Bates			SQ-E	SQ-E	Doc	VG Review	VG Review		VG-IP 149/1 N2368				VG-E
Caballero	TP Doc								Doc	AL 9	A/L		AP-1000 Sim Obs
Capehart	AL	Surry Corp. Ltr	AL 1/17		AL 2/1-2/8	AL		2/22 CR3 Mtg. 2/23 RPS Tmg	VG-IP			3/21 VG Mtg	VG-E
Goldau			SQ-Cert	SQ-Cert	GE Series			SR Prep Written	GE Series			GE Series	
Lanyi				HR Certify			HR Certify	HR Certify	TTC G-107	TTC G-107	SR Prep Written		
Laska			SQ-E	SQ-E	Doc	Doc	Doc						
Lea				HR-IP			HR-E	HR-E	Doc	Doc	Doc		AP-1000 Sim Obs
Meeks	Prep		Doc		VG Rev Chief UI	VG Rev Chief UI	VG Rev Chief UI		VG-IP C-UI				VG-E C-UI
Riches			SQ-E	SQ-E	BF PI&R		BF PI&R	SR Prep Written				SR Prep Written	AP-1000 Sim Obs
Schaaf				HR-IP C-UI			HR-E C-UI	HR-E C-UI				SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written
Toth		P-105					G-105	AL	SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written
Mark Lintz (Qualification)							SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written	SR Prep Written

# Vogtle Initial Licensed Operator Exam 2012-301

## WEEK 1

	MONDAY (3/26)	TUESDAY (3/27)	WEDNESDAY (3/28)	THURSDAY (3/29)	FRIDAY (3/30)
0700-1000	Scenario #6 CRS: I2 / E2 OATC: I1 / E1 BOP: R1 / E3	Scenario 7 CRS: I1 / E1 OATC: I2 / E2 BOP: R1 / E3	Scenario #2 CRS: U1 / E1 OATC: R7 / E2 BOP: R8 / E3	Scenario #3 CRS: I4 / E2 OATC: R2 / E3 BOP: Surrogate E1: A3 & A1-1 (U1, I8, R4, R3, R5, R6, R7)	Scenario #1 CRS: U1 / E1 OATC: R8 / E3 BOP: R7 / E2
1000-1300	Scenario #6 CRS: I4 / E2 OATC: I3 / E1 BOP: R2 / E3	Scenario 7 CRS: I3 / E1 OATC: I4 / E2 BOP: R2 / E3	Scenario #2 CRS: I5 / E1 OATC: R5 / E2 BOP: R6 / E3	Scenario #3 CRS: I2 / E2 OATC: R1 / E3 BOP: Surrogate E1: A3 & A1-1 (I1, I3, I5, I6, I7, R8)	Scenario #1 CRS: I1 / E1 OATC: R6 / E3 BOP: R5 / E2
1300-1600	Scenario #6 CRS: I6 / E2 OATC: I5 / E1 BOP: R3 / E3	Scenario 7 CRS: I5 / E1 OATC: I6 / E2 BOP: R3 / E3	Scenario #2 CRS: I8 / E2 OATC: I7 / E1 BOP: R4 / E3	Scenario #3 CRS: I8 / E2 OATC: R4 / E3 BOP: Surrogate E1: A3 & A1-1 (I2, R1, I4, R2)	Scenario #1 CRS: I6 / E2 OATC: R3 / E3 BOP: Surrogate
1600-1800		Scenario 7 CRS: I7 / E1 OATC: I8 / E2 BOP: R4 / E3			

I1:  
I2:  
I3:  
I4:  
I5:  
I6:  
I7:  
I8:  
U1:

R1:  
R2:  
R3:  
R4:  
R5:  
R6:  
R7:  
R8:

E1: Michael Meeks (Chief – Under Instruction)  
E2: Mark Bates (Chief)  
E3: Phil Capehart

# Vogtle Initial Licensed Operator Exam 2012-301

## WEEK 2

MONDAY (4/9)	E1 (Meeks)	E2 (Bates)	E3 (Capehart)
0700-0800	Travel	Travel	Travel (Potential JPM B?)
0800-0900	Travel	Travel	Travel (Potential JPM B?)
0900-1000	Travel	Travel	Travel (Potential JPM B?)
1000-1100	Sim B (R4, I7, I8)	Travel	Travel
1100-1300	Scenario 4 CRS: I7 / E1 OATC: I8 / E2 BOP: R4 / E3	Scenario 4 CRS: I7 / E1 OATC: I8 / E2 BOP: R4 / E3	Scenario 4 CRS: I7 / E1 OATC: I8 / E2 BOP: R4 / E3
1300-1400	Sim B (I5, I6, R1, R2)	Admin A4 (U1, I1, I2, I3, I4)	Admin A4 (U1, I1, I2, I3, I4)
1400-1500	Sim B (R6, R7, R8, I1, U1)		
1500-1600	Sim B (I2, I3, I4, R3, R5)	Admin A4 (I5, I6, I7, I8)	Admin A4 (I5, I6, I7, I8)
1600-1700	Complete Sim B	Complete Admin A4	Complete Admin A4

TUESDAY (4/10)	E1 (Meeks)	E2 (Bates)	E3 (Capehart)
0700-0800	Sim A (I1, I2, I3)	Travel to Plant & Setup	Travel to Plant & Setup
0800-0900	Sim A (I4, I5, I6)	Plant I (U1, R1, R2, R3, R4)	Plant J (R5, R6, R7, R8)
0900-1000	Sim A (I7, I8)	Plant I (R5, R6, R7, R8)	Plant J (U1, R1, R2, R3, R4)
1000-1100	Sim A (R1, R2)	Plant I (I1, I2, I3, I4)	Plant J (I5, I6, I7, I8)
1100-1200	Sim A (R5, R6, R7)	Plant I (I5, I6, I7, I8)	Plant J (I1, I2, I3, I4)
1200-1300	Sim A (R8, R3, R4)	Complete Plant I	Complete Plant J
1300-1400	Sim F (R1, R2, R3, R4, R5, R6)	Return to Training Building	Return to Training Building
1400-1500	Sim F (R7, R8, I1, I2, I3)		
1500-1600	Sim F (I4, I5, I6, I7, I8)		

WEDNESDAY (4/11)	E1 (Meeks)	E2 (Bates)	E3 (Capehart)
0700-0800	Sim G (I1, I2)	Travel to Plant & Setup	Travel to Plant & Setup
0800-0900	Sim G (I3, I4)	Plant K (U1, R1, R2, R3)	CR H (R4, R5, R6, R7, R8)
0900-1000	Sim G (I5, I6)	Plant K (R4, R5, R6, R7)	CR H (R1, R2, R3)
1000-1100	Sim G (I7, I8)	Plant K (R8, I1, I2)	Complete CR H
1100-1200	Sim G (R1, R2)	Plant K (I3, I4, I5, I6)	Return to Training Building
1200-1300	Sim G (R3, R4)	Complete Plant K	Sim G (R3, R4)
1300-1400	Sim G (R5, R6)	Return to Training Building	Sim G (R5, R6)
1400-1500	Sim G (R7, R8)		Sim G (R7, R8)
1500-1600	Complete Sim G		Complete Sim G

THURSDAY (4/12)	E1 (Meeks)	E2 (Bates)	E3 (Capehart)
0700-0800	Admin A2 (U1, I1, I2, I3, I4, I5)	Sim C (R1, R2, R3)	Sim C (R1, R2, R3)
0800-0900		Sim C (R4, R5, R6)	Sim C (R4, R5, R6)
0900-1000	Admin A2 (I6, I7, I8, R1, R2, R3)	Sim C (R7, R8, U1)	Sim C (R7, R8, U1)
1000-1100		Sim C (I1, I2, I3, I4)	Sim C (I1, I2, I3, I4)
1100-1200	Admin A2 (R4, R5, R6, R7, R8)	Sim C (I5, I6, I7, I8)	Sim C (I5, I6, I7, I8)
1200-1300		Sim D (R1, R2, R3)	Sim D (R1, R2, R3)
1300-1400	Admin A1-2 (U1, I1, I2, I3, I4, I5)	Sim D (R4, R5, R6)	Sim D (R4, R5, R6)
1400-1500	Admin A1-2 (I6, I7, I8, R1, R2, R3)	Sim D (R7, R8, I1)	Sim D (R7, R8, I1)
1500-1600	Admin A1-2 (R4, R5, R6, R7, R8)	Sim D (I2, I3, I4)	Sim D (I2, I3, I4)
1600-1700	Complete Admin A1-2	Sim D (I5, I6, I7, I8)	Sim D (I5, I6, I7, I8)

FRIDAY (4/13)	E1 (Meeks)	E2 (Bates)	E3 (Capehart)
0700-0800	Sim E (R1, R2, R3, R4)	Sim E (R1, R2, R3, R4)	Sim E (R1, R2, R3, R4)
0800-0900	Sim E (R5, R6, R7, R8)	Sim E (R5, R6, R7, R8)	Sim E (R5, R6, R7, R8)
0900-1000	Sim E (I1, I2, I3, I4)	Sim E (I1, I2, I3, I4)	Sim E (I1, I2, I3, I4)
1000-1100	Sim E (I5, I6, I7, I8)	Sim E (I5, I6, I7, I8)	Sim E (I5, I6, I7, I8)
1100-1200	Lunch and Prep for Exit Meeting	Lunch and Prep for Exit Meeting	Lunch and Prep for Exit Meeting
1200-1300	Exit Meeting	Exit Meeting	Exit Meeting
1300-1400	Travel	Travel	Travel
1400-1500	Travel	Travel	Travel
1500-1600	Travel	Travel	Travel