

United States Nuclear Regulatory Commission Official Hearing Exhibit	
In the Matter of:	Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc. (Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3)
	<b>ASLBP #:</b> 07-858-03-LR-BD01
	<b>Docket #:</b> 05000247   05000286
	<b>Exhibit #:</b> ENT000594-00-BD01
	<b>Admitted:</b> 11/28/2012
	<b>Rejected:</b>
	<b>Other:</b>
	<b>Identified:</b> 11/28/2012
	<b>Withdrawn:</b>
	<b>Stricken:</b>

ENT000594  
Submitted: November 21, 2012

**RCF, Examples of Errors Remaining in Dr. Sheppard's Assessor Data Set**

## Sale Between Family Members: Property ID #285

Property Card PDF OAGI0000558.pdf, p.210

CAMPUS ASSOCIATES	8/82		-	-	7780	289
De Vita, Michael L. & Mary C.	7/84	254	-	63650	7947	426
Tucker, Michael + Cynthia	3/4/88	224.	SALE BETWEEN RELATIVES	55800	9185	128
Buchanan, Harold + Christine	4/25/88	510.	SALE BETWEEN RELATIVES	127500	9185	122
Leib, Barrie	5/22/00			75000	40173	371

Clearly listed on the card are two sales between relatives, noted by the Assessor. Using the property ID number, we can identify sales associated with this property ID in Dr. Sheppard's data as follows:

```
list id newid nomreturn saleyrqtr saleprice preyrqtr prevprice if id==285
```

id	newid	nomreturn	saleyrqtr	saleprice	preyrqtr	prevprice
285	285.2	-.035824	1988.1	55800	1984.3	63650
285	285.4	-.043947	2000.2	75000	1988.2	127500

"id" in the code and table above corresponds to the Property ID. "newid" corresponds to the observation ID, since each property in the sample may be associated with more than one sample observation. "saleyrqtr" is the year and quarter that the property was sold. "saleprice" is the nominal price received for the sale. "preyrqtr" is the purchase year and quarter. "prevprice" is the nominal purchase price.

Observation #285.2 in Dr. Sheppard's dataset was marked as being ineligible for inclusion by RCF staff because the sale associated with this observation was marked by the assessor as "sale between relatives," and as a result does not represent an arms-length market transaction.

Observation #285.4 in Dr. Sheppard's dataset was marked as being ineligible for inclusion by RCF staff because the purchase associated with this observation was marked by the assessor as "sale between relatives," and as a result does not represent an arms-length market transaction.

There were no other sample observations associated with this property ID, so all observations for this property were marked as being ineligible for inclusion in the analysis performed by RCF staff.

## Foreclosures and Bank Sales: Property ID #429

Property Card PDF OAGI0000558.pdf, p.330

RECORD OF OWNER	DATE	REVENUE STAMPS	MTG.	EST. SALE PRICE	VOLUME	PAGE
BARGER, WARREN & WIFE	9/58				5899	416
Patrick, Robert J. and wife	8/69	17.60	15.100	verified 15,675	6877	11
White, Leslie E. Jr. & Bonita	10/28/80	36.85	pm/d 33.37	verified 33,500	L.7662	P.143
<i>The Kissell Co</i>	<i>8/83</i>	<i>-0-</i>	<i>foreclosure judgment</i>		<i>7870</i>	<i>186</i>
<i>Sec of HUD</i>	<i>1/84</i>	<i>-0-</i>	<i>foreclosure</i>	<i>10.00</i>	<i>81.41</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>Baldwin, John L. &amp; Nancy A.</i>	<i>8/85</i>	<i>218</i>		<i>54,100</i>	<i>8206</i>	<i>309</i>
<i>Baldwin, John L.</i>	<i>7/26/94</i>			<i>-0-</i>	<i>10933</i>	<i>203</i>
<i>Baldwin John L. correction deed</i>	<i>3/96</i>			<i>-0-</i>	<i>11403</i>	<i>71</i>
<i>Banker Trust Co / UCFC Loan Trust</i>	<i>7/30/01</i>			<i>94125</i>	<i>41091</i>	<i>407</i>
<i>Redman David S.</i>	<i>6/17/02</i>			<i>110,000</i>	<i>42233</i>	<i>142</i>
<i>Belly, Elean</i>	<i>9/5/03</i>			<i>197,200</i>	<i>44051</i>	<i>177</i>

Clearly listed on the card are "HSP" (Housing Subsidy Program?), "foreclosure judgment," and "foreclosure," noted by the Assessor. Using the property ID number, we can identify sales associated with this property ID in Dr. Sheppard's data as follows:

id	newid	nomreturn	saleyrqtr	saleprice	preyrqtr	prevprice
429	429.2	.067558	1980.4	33500	1969.3	15675
429	429.3	.100723	1985.3	54100	1980.4	33500
429	429.6	.474846	2003.3	197200	2002.2	110000
429	429.5	.176787	2002.2	110000	2001.3	94125
429	429.4	.034623	2001.3	94125	1985.3	54100

Observation #429.2 in Dr. Sheppard's dataset was marked as being ineligible for inclusion by RCF staff because the purchase associated with this transaction was labeled by the assessor as subsidized, and as a result does not represent an arms-length market transaction.

Observation #429.3 in Dr. Sheppard's dataset was marked as being ineligible for inclusion by RCF staff because the sale associated with this transaction was labeled by the assessor as a foreclosure auction by HUD, and as a result does not represent an arms-length market transaction.

Observation #429.4 in Dr. Sheppard's dataset was marked as being ineligible for inclusion by RCF staff because the purchase associated with this transaction was labeled by the assessor as a foreclosure auction by HUD and the sale of the property was a repossession by a loan company, and as a result does not represent an arms-length market transaction.

Observation #429.5 in Dr. Sheppard's dataset was marked as being ineligible for inclusion by RCF staff because the purchase associated with this transaction was a repossession by a loan company, and as a result does not represent an arms-length market transaction.

Observation #429.6 was recommended for inclusion in the sample by RCF staff. This observation did not contain any errors.

## Private Hospital and SRO (Unusual Case): Property ID #615

Property Card PDF OAGI0000558.pdf, p.512

RECORD OF OWNER	DATE	REVENUE STAMPS	MTG.	EST. SALE PRICE	VOLUME	PAGE
	1951			11,500.		
Mueller, Kurt E. and wife	12/69	29.15		Verified 26,500	6902	83
HEADY, GEORGE RICHARD & <sup>HILDA</sup> GERDA	10/70	2.20		Verified 28,000	7256	517
<del>Barrego, Venurado</del>	<del>4/22/02</del>			<del>35,000</del>	<del>42207</del>	<del>235</del>
Barrego Venurado + Glorva E.	6/2/03			0 = 44,000	60453	
Leonardo Jose A.	10/20/07			420,000	44314	1557
WALKER CLIVE	5/1/07			511,300	47136	286

32-16-7-2  
 Comm Care Sponsor  
 10 patients checked out 9/14/83  
 220  
 4/18  
 C-3 ✓ (210) 6/93 Booming House #2  
 ASSESSMENT RECORD

Checked 5/14/92 (phone) 10 patients @ 130 mo = 1300 x 15,600  
 15,600 x .06 x 45% = 400 - One Bldg old AV - 400  
 #4592 fire insurance 800 (incl. in above) JV  
 2/8/97 EQ = 6164 - 1/6 pool 42 24 13,000. 5/10/90 complete 4c  
 6/7/93 EQ + 2800 Booming House #2  
 7/1/96 Now 221 - 1000

While it may not be completely clear, the Assessor notes that this property begins in the records as a 10-bed for-profit hospital and “Comm. Care Sponsor”. The building was then converted to an SRO Rooming House, and is then converted to a 2-family dwelling. The land is zoned commercial. Using the property ID number, we can identify sales associated with this property ID in Dr. Sheppard’s data as follows:

id	newid	nomreturn	saleyrqtr	saleprice	preyrqtr	prevprice
615	615.2	.044131	1969.4	26500	1951.1	11500
615	615.4	.080486	2002.2	355000	1970.4	28000
615	615.3	.066152	1970.4	28000	1969.4	26500
615	615.5	.066823	2004.4	420000	2002.2	355000
615	615.6	.078261	2007.2	511300	2004.4	420000

RCF staff recommended that all observations associated with this property be excluded from the sample for analysis because of the commercial zoning and unusual property and transaction history.

**“Not Valid Sale”: Property ID #1018**

Property Card PDF OAGI0000558.pdf, p.867

RECORD OF OWNER	DATE	REVENUE STAMPS	MTG.	EST. SALE PRICE	VOLUME	PAGE
Martin, Mary H. (Mary was on 7/31/74 and change ownership)						
LOUBENGEIGER, JOHN E. & KYONG SUK	10/29/75	30.80		not valid sale 28,000	7295	245
Loubengeiger, John E.	10/78	none		nosale	7509	374
HARBALIC, RONALD	9/26/82			110,000	42312	476
BANK J. DONALD & PEABODY-BARRARONE	10/30/03			200,000	44070	728

Clearly listed on the card is the phrase “not valid sale,” noted by the Assessor. Using the property ID number, we can identify sales associated with this property ID in Dr. Sheppard’s data as follows:

id	newid	nomreturn	saleyrqtr	saleprice	preyrqtr	prevprice
1018	1018.3	.547256	2003.4	200000	2002.3	110000
1018	1018.2	.050845	2002.3	110000	1975.4	28000

Observation #1018.2 in Dr. Sheppard’s dataset was marked as being ineligible for inclusion by RCF staff because the purchase associated with this transaction was marked by the Assessor as “not valid sale,” and as a result does not represent an arms-length market transaction.

Observation #1018.3 was recommended for inclusion in the sample by RCF staff. This observation did not contain any errors.

## HUD Takeover and Non-Market Sale: Property ID #1073

Property Card PDF OAGI0000558.pdf, p.295

RECORD OF OWNER	DATE	REVENUE STAMPS	MTG.	EST. SALE PRICE	VOLUME	PAGE
Martelli, Frank and Emelia	2/70	33.00		Verified 30,000	6910	319
<del>Martelli, Emelia</del>	<del>1/22</del>	<del>None</del>	<del>-</del>	<del>71,000</del>	<del>7105</del>	<del>699</del>
Ducey, Patrick	3/83	55.00	49,750	50,000	L 7823	P 236
SANTIAGO, JULIO & ANA	8/6/92			130,000	10396	269
The Secretary of Housing & Urban Dev.	10/31/94			-0-	11075	243
Lopez, Edward F.	3/27/95			85,000	11141	249
Rodriguez Eusebio y Ilda	7/7/99			150,500	12348	200
Cocharula, Manuel + Martha	5/28/02			25,000	42213	665
CASTILLO, DANIE & RODRIGUEZ CAROLANM	7/19/05			30,000	45059	631

Clearly listed on the card is the purchaser, “[t]he Secretary of Housing and Urban Development,” noted by the Assessor. Using the property ID number, we can identify sales associated with this property ID in Dr. Sheppard’s data as follows:

id	newid	nomreturn	saleyrqtr	saleprice	preyrqtr	prevprice
1073	1073.3	.101275	1992.3	130000	1983.1	50000
1073	1073.6	.18353	2002.2	255000	1999.3	150000
1073	1073.7	.116948	2005.1	350000	2002.2	255000
1073	1073.2	.039065	1983.1	50000	1970.1	30000
1073	1073.4	-.161148	1995.1	85000	1992.3	130000
1073	1073.5	.132727	1999.3	150000	1995.1	85000

Observation #1073.4 in Dr. Sheppard’s dataset was marked as being ineligible for inclusion by RCF staff because the sale associated with this transaction was marked by the Assessor as a transfer from the Secretary of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), and as a result does not represent an arms-length market transaction.

Observation #1073.4 in Dr. Sheppard’s dataset was marked as being ineligible for inclusion by RCF staff because the purchase associated with this transaction was marked by the Assessor as a transfer from the Secretary of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), and as a result does not represent an arms-length market transaction.

The remaining observations associated with this property were recommended for inclusion in the sample by RCF staff, as they did not contain any errors.