

**RESPONSE SHEET**

**TO:** Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary  
**FROM:** CHAIRMAN MACFARLANE  
**SUBJECT:** COMSECY-12-0014 – REVISED SCHEDULE AND PLANS FOR JAPAN LESSONS-LEARNED

Approved  X  Disapproved  X  Abstain \_\_\_\_\_

Not Participating \_\_\_\_\_

**COMMENTS:** Below  X  Attached \_\_\_\_\_ None \_\_\_\_\_

I approve the staff's request for an extension until November 30, 2012, for the paper regarding BWR Mark I and Mark II containment vent filters.

However, I disapprove of the change to the Tier 2 emergency preparedness orders, as proposed by the staff. As originally approved by the Commission in SRM-SECY-11-0137, the project plan noted development and issuance of these orders in late 2012 or early 2013. The staff's proposed approach using an Advanced Notice for Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR), as outlined in SECY-12-0095, "Tier 3 Program Plans and 6-Month Status Update in Response to Lessons Learned From Japan's March 11, 2011, Great Tohoku Earthquake and Subsequent Tsunami," notes the issuance of an ANPR in 2014, which only marks the beginning of the rulemaking process. As Commissioner Apostolakis noted in his vote, as supported by Commissioner Ostendorff, the staff's proposal in this paper, and in SECY-12-0095, lacks sufficient basis for a change of this significance. If the staff's preferred approach remains rulemaking rather than orders, the staff should provide a more detailed justification and basis for this change.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
SIGNATURE

7/27/12  
\_\_\_\_\_  
DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes  X  No \_\_\_\_\_

**RESPONSE SHEET**

**TO:** Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary  
**FROM:** COMMISSIONER SVINICKI  
**SUBJECT:** COMSECY-12-0014 – REVISED SCHEDULE AND  
PLANS FOR JAPAN LESSONS-LEARNED

Approved XX In Part      Disapproved XX In Part Abstain \_\_\_\_\_

Not Participating \_\_\_\_\_

**COMMENTS:** Below XX Attached \_\_\_ None \_\_\_

I approve the staff's request for an extension for the notation vote paper on severe accident capable containment vents, with or without filters, until November 30, 2012. I disapprove, at this time, the staff's request to include the Tier 2 activities related to Recommendation 9.3 with the Tier 3 activities related to emergency preparedness in a single advance notice of proposed rulemaking. As noted by my colleagues, and subsequently acknowledged by the staff in a briefing to Commissioners Assistants, COMSECY-12-0014 does not contain a fully developed evaluation to support this recommendation, and the completion of such an analysis would take some time to prepare. Consequently, I agree with Chairman Macfarlane that if the staff further evaluates its path forward and continues to support its original recommendation to combine these items, the staff should submit a more detailed justification and basis for this change to the Commission for its review and approval.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
SIGNATURE

08/ / /12  
\_\_\_\_\_  
DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes  No \_\_\_\_\_

**RESPONSE SHEET**

**TO:** Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary  
**FROM:** Commissioner Apostolakis  
**SUBJECT:** COMSECY-12-0014 – REVISED SCHEDULE AND PLANS FOR JAPAN LESSONS-LEARNED

Approved  Disapproved  Abstain

Not Participating

**COMMENTS:** Below  Attached  None

I approve the staff's request for an extension for the notation vote paper on severe accident capable containment vents, with or without filters, until November 30, 2012.

I do not approve the staff's proposal to include the Tier 2 activities related to Recommendation 9.3 with the Tier 3 activities related to emergency preparedness in a single advance notice of proposed rulemaking. The staff has not provided a sufficiently detailed discussion of the advantages and disadvantages of proceeding with such a proposal nor a sufficient basis for deviating from previous Commission direction on this Tier 2 activity. Without additional information, I am unable to assess the effects on the schedule for implementation of the Fukushima Near-Term Task Force recommendations, or other potential impacts of this proposal. Therefore, I cannot support the staff's request.



\_\_\_\_\_  
SIGNATURE

7/19/12

\_\_\_\_\_  
DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes  No

**RESPONSE SHEET**

TO: Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary  
FROM: COMMISSIONER MAGWOOD  
SUBJECT: COMSECY-12-0014 – REVISED SCHEDULE AND  
PLANS FOR JAPAN LESSONS-LEARNED

Approved X Disapproved \_\_\_\_\_ Abstain \_\_\_\_\_

Not Participating \_\_\_\_\_

COMMENTS: Below \_\_\_ Attached \_\_\_ None X

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
SIGNATURE

11 July 2012  
\_\_\_\_\_  
DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes X No \_\_\_\_\_

**RESPONSE SHEET**

**TO:** Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary  
**FROM:** COMMISSIONER OSTENDORFF  
**SUBJECT:** COMSECY-12-0014 – REVISED SCHEDULE AND PLANS FOR JAPAN LESSONS-LEARNED

Approved  X  Disapproved  X  Abstain \_\_\_\_\_

Not Participating \_\_\_\_\_

**COMMENTS:** Below  X  Attached \_\_\_\_\_ None \_\_\_\_\_

I approve the staff's due date extension request for the Tier 1 notation vote paper on severe accident capable containment vents, with or without filters.

I disapprove the staff's request to subsume the future Tier 2 orders on emergency preparedness (EP) with the EP Tier 3 advanced notice of proposed rulemaking (ANPR). I share Commissioner Apostolakis's concern that the staff has not provided sufficient information to justify deviation from previous Commission direction on this Tier 2 activity.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
SIGNATURE

7/20/12  
\_\_\_\_\_  
DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes  X  No \_\_\_\_\_