

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

)	
In the Matter of)	Docket Nos. 52-025-COL &
SOUTHERN NUCLEAR OPERATING CO.)	52-026-COL
Vogtle Electric Generating Plant)	
Units 3 and 4)	October 28, 2011
)	

MOTION TO REINSTATE AND SUPPLEMENT
THE BASIS FOR FUKUSHIMA TASK FORCE REPORT CONTENTION

INTRODUCTION

Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.323(e), Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League (BREDL) hereby moves to reinstate and supplement the basis of its contention seeking consideration of the environmental implications of the Fukushima Task Force Report in the Environmental Report for the proposed construction and operation license for the Plant Vogtle nuclear power station. *See* Motion to Reopen the Record and Admit Contention Regarding the Safety and Environmental Implications of the Nuclear Regulatory Commission Task Force Report on the Fukushima Dai-ichi Accident. The contention was rejected as premature by the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board (ASLB) in LBP-11-27, Memorandum and Order (Denying Motions to Reopen Closed Proceedings and Intervention Petition/Hearing Request as Premature), __ NRC __ (Oct. 18, 2011).

BREDL seeks to supplement the contention's basis to assert that the Commissioners of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC or Commission) have recognized the safety and environmental significance of the conclusions and recommendations of the Fukushima Task Force Report by issuing an order directing the

NRC Staff to strive to complete and implement the lessons learned from the Fukushima accident within five years or by 2016. SRM/SECY-11-0124, Memorandum from R.W. Borchardt, Executive Director for Operations to Annette L. Vietti-Cook, Secretary, re: Recommended Actions to be Taken Without Delay from the Near-Term Task Force Report (October 18, 2011).¹ BREDL also requests the ASLB to rule that in light of SRM/SECY-11-0124, the contention is no longer premature under the standard established by the ASLB in LBP-11-27 and should be admitted.²

DISCUSSION

In LBP-11-27, the ASLB interprets the Commission's decision in *Union Electric Co. d/b/a Ameren Missouri* (Callaway Plant, Unit 2), et al., CLI-11-05, __ NRC __ (Sept. 9, 2011) to preclude admission of the BREDL's contention because "it remains much too early in the process of assessing the Fukushima event in the context of the operation of reactors in the United States to allow any informed conclusion regarding the possible safety or environmental implications of that event regarding such operation." *Id.* at 13. LBP-11-27 indicates, however, that the ASLB would consider the contention to be admissible if and when the Commission adopts the Task Force recommendations:

It is difficult to fathom how the Commission could have stated more precisely and definitively that it remains much too early in the process of assessing the

¹ The SRM is posted on the NRC's website at <http://www.nrc.gov/reading-rm/doc-collections/commission/srm/2011/2011-0124srm.pdf>.

² BREDL also wishes to notify the ASLB that it believes that LBP-11-27 is based on an erroneous interpretation of the National Environmental Policy Act ("NEPA") and the Commission's decision in *Union Electric Co. d/b/a Ameren Missouri* (Callaway Plant, Unit 2), et al., CLI-11-05, __ NRC __ (Sept. 9, 2011), and therefore intends to petition the Commission for review of LBP-11-27. BREDL will request the Commission to hold its petition for review in abeyance pending the outcome of this motion. *See, e.g., Private Fuel Storage, L.L.C.* (Independent Spent Fuel Storage Installation), CLI-01-1, 53 NRC 1, 3 (2001) (citing *International Uranium Corp.* (White Mesa Uranium Mill), CLI-97-9, 46 NRC 23, 24-25 (1997)).

Fukushima event in the context of the operation of reactors in the United States to allow any informed conclusion regarding the possible safety or environmental implications of that event regarding such operation. *Of still greater importance given BREDL's entire reliance on the findings and recommendations of the Task Force, the Commission stressed with equal force and clarity that, while under active study, none of those findings and recommendations has been accepted.* Thus, they scarcely have been given the effect that, according to BREDL et al, gives rise to the environmental implications that undergird the contention that is sought to be admitted.

Id. (emphasis added).

BREDL respectfully submits that the ASLB's condition for admission of the contention is satisfied by a Staff Requirements Memorandum (SRM) that was issued by the Commission on October 18, 2011, the same day that LBP-11-27 was issued. SRM/SECY-11-0124.³ In SRM/SECY-11-0124 the Commission ordered the NRC Staff to strive to complete and implement the lessons learned from the Fukushima accident within five years or by 2016. While the SRM did not order the adoption of every single recommendation, it did endorse a significant number of them, including the sweeping Recommendation # 1 which would expand the scope of the adequate protection standard. Thus, the Commission has accepted the Task Force Report in significant respects. LBP-11-27, slip op. at 13.

Therefore BREDL requests the ASLB to take the following actions:

- 1) Order the reinstatement of the contention;
- 2) Permit the supplementation of the contention's basis to include (in addition to the language of the Task Force Report itself and the Declarations of Dr. Arjun Makhijani, Dr. Ross McCluney and Rev. Charles Utley) SRM/SECY-11-0124 as an indication of the significance of the Task Force Report's conclusions and recommendations; and

³ There is no indication in LBP-11-27 that the ASLB was aware of the issuance of SRM/SECY-11-0124 at the time it issued LBP-11-27.

- 3) Rule on the admissibility of the reinstated and revised contention in light of SRM/SECY-11-0124.

CONCLUSION

Motions for reconsideration must show compelling circumstances which could not have been reasonably expected that render a decision invalid. For the foregoing reasons, BREDL's motion should be granted.

Respectfully submitted,

_____/sig/_____
John D. Runkle
Attorney at Law
Post Office Box 3793
Chapel Hill, North Carolina 27515
919.942.0600
jrunkle@pricecreek.com

NOTIFICATION OF COUNSEL

I certify that on October 27, 2011, BREDL contacted counsel for Southern Nuclear Operating Company and NRC Staff and attempted to resolve the issues raised by this motion. Southern Company stated that would not support the motion; NRC Staff reserved judgment on the motion and said they will respond to it in due course.

_____/sig/_____
John D. Runkle

October 28, 2011

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD PANEL

<p>In the Matter of SOUTHERN NUCLEAR OPERATING CO. Vogtle Electric Generating Plant Units 3 and 4</p>

Docket Nos. 52-025-COL and 52-026-COL

October 28, 2011

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that copies of the forgoing
MOTION TO REINSTATE AND SUPPLEMENT
THE BASIS FOR FUKUSHIMA TASK FORCE REPORT CONTENTION
have been served upon the following persons by Electronic Information Exchange

Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop - T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001

Alan S. Rosenthal, Chair
Administrative Judge
E-mail: alan.rosenthal@nrc.gov

G. Paul Bollwerk, III, Chair
Administrative Judge
E-mail: paul.bollwerk@nrc.gov

Gary S. Arnold
Administrative Judge
E-mail: gary.arnold@nrc.gov

Nicholas G. Trikouros
Administrative Judge
E-mail: ngt@nrc.gov

William H. Reed
Administrative Judge
E-mail: william.reed@nrc.gov

James F. Jackson
Administrative Judge
E-mail: jxj2@nrc.gov
jackson538@comcast.net
james.jackson@nrc.gov

Hillary Cain, Law Clerk
E-mail: hillary.cain@nrc.gov

Wen Bu, Law Clerk, ASLBP
E-mail: wen.bu@nrc.gov

OGC Mail Center: Members of this
office have received a copy of this filing
by EIE service.
OGCMailCenter@nrc.gov

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of Commission Appellate
Adjudication
Mail Stop: O-16C1
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: ocaamail@nrc.gov

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the General Counsel
Mail Stop O-15D-21
Washington, DC 20555-0001
Vogtle COL
Marian Zabler, Esq.
Ann Hodgdon, Esq.
Sara Kirkwood, Esq.
Patrick Moulding, Esq.
Marcia Carpentier, Esq.

Joseph Gilman, Paralegal
 Karin Francis, Paralegal
 E-mail: marian.zobler@nrc.gov
 ann.hodgdon@nrc.gov
 sara.kirkwood@nrc.gov
 patrick.moulding@nrc.gov
 marcia.carpentier@nrc.gov
 joseph.gilman@nrc.gov
 karin.francis@nrc.gov

Moanica M. Caston, Esq.
 Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
 40 Inverness Center Parkway
 P.O. Box 1295, Bin B-022
 Birmingham, AL 35201-1295
 E-mail: mcaston@southernco.com

Kathryn M. Sutton, Esq.
 Steven P. Frantz, Esq.
 Paul M. Bessette, Esq.
 Mary Freeze, Legal Secretary
 Angela M. Perry, Legal Secretary
 Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP
 Co-Counsel for Southern Nuclear
 Operating Co., Inc.
 1111 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
 Washington, DC 20004
 E-mail: ksutton@morganlewis.com
 sfrantz@morganlewis.com
 pbessette@morganlewis.com
 mfreeze@morganlewis.com
 angela.perry@morganlewis.com

Turner Environmental Law Clinic
 Emory University School of Law
 1301 Clifton Road
 Atlanta, GA 30322
 Lawrence Sanders, Esq.
 E-mail: lsande3@emory.edu

Mindy Goldstein, Esq.
 E-mail: magolds@emory.edu

Kenneth C. Hairston, Esq.
 M. Stanford Blanton, Esq.
 Peter D. LeJeune, Esq.
 Chad Pilcher, Esq.
 Millicent Ronnlund
 Balch & Bingham LLP
 1710 Sixth Avenue North
 Birmingham, Alabama 35203-2014
 E-mail: kchairston@balch.com;
 sblanton@balch.com;
 plejeune@balch.com;
 cpilcher@balch.com;
 mronnlund@balch.com

C. Grady Moore, III, Esq.
 Leslie Garrett Allen, Esq.
 Balch & Bingham, LLP
 1901 6TH Avenue, Suite 2600
 Birmingham, AL 35203
 E-mail: gmoore@balch.com
 E-mail: lgallen@balch.com

Robert B. Haemer, Esq.
 Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP
 2300 N Street, NW
 Washington, DC 20037-1122
 E-mail:
 robert.haemer@pillsburylaw.com

Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League
 P.O. Box 88
 Glendale Springs, NC 28629
 Louis A. Zeller
 E-mail: bredl@skybest.com

/signed (electronically)/
 John D. Runkle
 Attorney at Law
 P.O. Box 3793
 Chapel Hill, NC 27515
 919.942.0600
 jrunkle@pricecreek.com

October 28, 2011

