

Official Transcript of Proceedings
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

Title: 10 CFR 2.206 Petition RE
 Palisades Nuclear Plant

Docket Number: (n/a)

Location: (phone conference)

Date: Thursday, March 31, 2011

Work Order No.: NRC-823

Pages 1-33

NEAL R. GROSS AND CO., INC.
Court Reporters and Transcribers
1323 Rhode Island Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20005
(202) 234-4433

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

+ + + + +

NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

+ + + + +

NUCLEAR REACTOR REGULATION

+ + + + +

PETITION REVIEW BOARD

DISCUSSION WITH PETITIONER

-----¶

In the Matter of: :

10 CFR 2.206 PETITION :

OF MICHAEL MULLIGAN :

WITH RESPECT TO :

PALISADES NUCLEAR PLANT :

-----¶

Thursday, March 31, 2011

The above-entitled conference convened via teleconference, pursuant to notice, at 9:00 a.m. Eastern Daylight Time.

BEFORE:

THEODORE QUAY, Petition Review Board Chairman

MAHESH CHAWLA, Petition Manager for 2.206 petition

TANYA MENSAH, Petition Coordinator

ANDREA RUSSELL, NRR/Division of Policy and Rulemaking

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NRC STAFF PRESENT:

STEVEN GARRY, NRR/Health Physics and Human
Performance Branch

VIJAY GOEL, NRR/EEEEB

MATTHEW HAMM, NRR/Technical Specifications
Branch

JAY WALLACE, NRR/DCI/Piping and NDE Branch

ALSO PRESENT:

TERRY DAVIS, Entergy Nuclear/Palisades

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

(9:00 a.m.)

MR. CHAWLA: I would like to thank everybody for attending this meeting. My name is Mac Chawla.

Did somebody join here?

MR. GOEL: Yes. This is Vijay Goel.

MR. CHAWLA: Oh, hi, Vijay.

MR. GOEL: Hi.

MR. CHAWLA: Oh, we just started. Okay.

MR. GOEL: Okay.

MR. CHAWLA: I would like to thank everybody for attending this meeting. My name is Mac Chawla. And I am the Palisades Nuclear Plant Project Manager.

We are here today to allow the petitioner, Mike Mulligan, to address the Petition Review Board regarding the 2.206 petition dated February 22, 2011. I am the Petition Manager for the petition. The Petition Review Board Chairman is Ted Quay.

As far as the Petition Review Board's, or PRB's, review of this petition, Mike Mulligan has requested this opportunity to address the PRB. This meeting is scheduled from 9:00 to 10:00 a.m. Eastern Daylight Time.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 The meeting is being recorded by the NRC
2 Operations Center and will be transcribed by a court
3 reporter. The transcript will become a supplement to
4 the petition. The transcript will also be made
5 publicly available.

6 I would like to open this meeting with
7 introductions. As you go around the room, please be
8 sure to clearly state your name, your position, and
9 the office that you work for within the NRC for the
10 record.

11 I will start off. Again, my name is Mac
12 Chawla. I am the Petition Manager. We go around the
13 room here.

14 MS. MENSAH: Tanya Mensah, 2.206
15 Coordinator, Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation.

16 MR. HAMM: Matthew Hamm, reactor systems
17 engineer, the Technical Specifications Branch in NRR.

18 MR. GARRY: Steve Garry, senior health
19 physicist, Office of NRR.

20 CHAIRMAN QUAY: Ted Quay, Petition Review
21 Board Chairman, Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation.

22 MS. RUSSELL: Andrea Russell, Division of
23 Policy and Rulemaking, Nuclear Reactor Regulation.

24 MR. WALLACE: Jay Wallace, materials
25 engineer, NRR, Piping and NDE Branch.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 MR. CHAWLA: This is all the folks at
2 headquarters. And we have Mr. Vijay Goel. He's on
3 the phone.

4 MR. GOEL: Right. That's Vijay Goel from
5 Electrical Branch, NRR.

6 MR. CHAWLA: Okay. At this time are there
7 -- there are no other participants on the phone from
8 headquarters, right?

9 (No response.)

10 MR. CHAWLA: Hearing none, are there any
11 participants from the regional office on the phone?

12 (No response.)

13 MR. CHAWLA: Okay. Not hearing anybody
14 here, it looks like there is no one from the region
15 here.

16 Are there any representatives for the
17 licensee
18 on the phone?

19 MR. DAVIS: Yes. My name is Terry Davis.
20 I work in Nuclear Safety Assurance Licensing. I'm a
21 senior tech specialist.

22 MR. CHAWLA: Okay. Hi, Terry.

23 MR. DAVIS: Hi, Mac.

24 MR. CHAWLA: Mr. Mulligan, would you
25 please introduce yourself for the record now?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MR. MULLIGAN: I'm Mike Mulligan. And I
2 am a whistle-blower. I worked in the industry. I was
3 on submarines. And I worked in the industry for a
4 number of years. And I whistle-blowed on a certain
5 amount of other issues.

6 Thank you.

7 MR. CHAWLA: Okay. Thank you.

8 It is not required for members of the
9 public to introduce themselves for this call.
10 However, if there are any members of the public on the
11 phone that wish to do so at this time, please state
12 your name for the record.

13 (No response.)

14 MR. CHAWLA: Hearing none, I would say
15 there is no members of the public.

16 I would like to emphasize that we each
17 need to speak clearly and loudly to make sure that the
18 Court Reporter can accurately transcribe this meeting.
19 If you do have something that you would like to say,
20 please first state your name for the record.

21 For those dialing into the meeting, please
22 remember to mute your phones to minimize any
23 background noise or distractions. If you do not have
24 a MUTE button, this can be done by pressing the keys
25 *6. To unmute, press the *6 keys again. Thank you.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 At this time I will turn it over to the
2 PRB Chairman, Ted Quay.

3 CHAIRMAN QUAY: Good morning. Welcome to
4 this meeting regarding the 2.206 petition submitted by
5 Mr. Mulligan. I would like to first share some
6 background on our process.

7 Section 2.206 of Title X of the Code of
8 Federal Regulations describes the petition process,
9 the primary mechanism for the public to request
10 enforcement action by the NRC in a public process.

11 This process permits anyone to petition
12 the NRC to take enforcement-type action related to NRC
13 licensees or licensed activities. Depending on the
14 results of its evaluation, NRC could modify, suspend,
15 or revoke an NRC-issued license or take any other
16 appropriate enforcement action to resolve a problem.
17 The NRC staff guidance on the disposition of 2.206
18 petition requests is in management directive, 8.11,
19 which is publicly available.

20 The purpose of today's meeting is to give
21 the petitioner an opportunity to provide any
22 additional explanation or support for the petition
23 before the Petition Review Board's initial
24 consideration and recommendation.

25 This meeting is not a hearing, nor is it

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 an opportunity for the petitioner to question or
2 examine the Petition Review Board on the merits or the
3 issues presented in the petition request. No decision
4 regarding the merits of the petition will be made at
5 this meeting.

6 Following this meeting, the Petition
7 Review Board will conduct its internal deliberations.
8 The outcome of this internal meeting will be discussed
9 with the petitioner.

10 The Petition Review Board typically
11 consists of a chairman, usually a manager at the
12 Senior Executive Service level at the NRC. It has a
13 petition manager and a Petition Review Board
14 coordinator. Other members of the Board are
15 determined by the NRC staff based on the content of
16 the information in the petition request.

17 At this time I would like to introduce the
18 Board. I am Ted Quay, the Petition Review Board
19 Chairman. Mac Chawla is the Petition Manager for the
20 petition under discussion today. Andrea Russell is
21 the 2.206 Coordinator. Our technical staff includes
22 Vijay Goel, electrical engineer from the Office of
23 Nuclear Reactor Regulation's Electrical Engineering
24 Branch; Jay Wallace, materials engineer from the
25 Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation's Piping and NDE

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Branch; Matt Hamm, reactor systems engineer from the
2 Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation's Technical
3 Specification Branch; and Steven Garry, senior health
4 physicist from the Office of Nuclear Reactor
5 Regulation's Health Physics and Human Performance
6 Branch.

7 As described in our process, the NRC staff
8 may ask clarifying questions in order to better
9 understand the petitioner's presentation and to reach
10 a reasoned decision whether to accept or reject the
11 petitioner's request for review under the 2.206
12 process.

13 I would like to summarize the scope of the
14 petition under consideration and the NRC activities to
15 date. On February 22nd, 2011, Mr. Michael Mulligan
16 submitted to the NRC a petition under the 2.206
17 process regarding Palisades Nuclear Plant located in
18 Van Buren County, Michigan.

19 In this petition request, Mr. Mulligan
20 identified the following areas of concern. Mr.
21 Mulligan stated that the reactor oversight program is
22 ineffective and Entergy has a documented history of a
23 culture of falsification and thumbing their noses at
24 reoccurring violations.

25 In his petition, Mr. Mulligan requested

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 the following actions: one, immediate shutdown of
2 Palisades and other Entergy nuclear power plants; two,
3 replacement of top Palisades management staff; three,
4 replacement of Entergy corporate nuclear staff; four,
5 assignment of two additional NRC inspectors at
6 Palisades; five, formation of a local public oversight
7 panel around every plant; six, formation of an
8 emergency NRC senior official oversight panel; seven,
9 formation of a national NRC oversight public panel;
10 eight, analysis of Entergy's reoccurring problems;
11 and, nine, evaluation of NRC Region III resources.

12 As the basis for this request, Mr.
13 Mulligan cited various plant events/issues, which can
14 be divided into the following categories: one,
15 equipment failures; two, documentation/design basis
16 concerns; three, radiation protection; four, records
17 falsification; and, five, reactor oversight process.

18 Allow me to discuss the NRC activities to
19 date. On February 4th, 2011, Mr. Mulligan requested
20 an opportunity to address the Petition Review Board by
21 phone.

22 On March 2nd, 2011, Mr. Mulligan made an
23 additional request to speak to an NRC official
24 regarding the general state of conditions at Palisades
25 prior to addressing the PRB.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 On March 3rd, 2011, the PRB met to discuss
2 the request for immediate action only. The PRB denied
3 the request for immediate action because there were no
4 immediate safety concerns to the plant or to the
5 public health and safety of the public.

6 On March 4th, 2011, the Petition Review
7 Board's decision was conveyed to Mr. Mulligan. Mr.
8 Mulligan was also informed that the request to speak
9 to an NRC official was outside the 2.206 process and
10 he would have the opportunity during the phone call
11 with the PRB to address his concerns and provide
12 additional information.

13 On March 7th, 2011, Mr. Mulligan addressed
14 the PRB. And that is documented in ADAMS session
15 number ML110760687.

16 On March 21st, 2011, the PRB met
17 internally and made an initial recommendation that the
18 petition did not meet the criteria for review because
19 the petitioner failed to provide sufficient facts to
20 warrant further inquiry beyond what was already
21 inspected and documented in NRC inspection reports.

22 On March 24th, 2011, the petitioner was
23 informed by the PRB of the PRB's initial
24 recommendation and requested an additional opportunity
25 to address the PRB to provide additional information

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 in support of his petition request.

2 As a reminder for the phone participants,
3 please identify yourself if you make any remarks as
4 this will help in the preparation of the meeting
5 transcript that will be made publicly available.

6 Thank you.

7 And at this point, Mr. Mulligan, I will
8 turn it over to you.

9 MR. MULLIGAN: Mr. Quay, when you retire,
10 you know, you could always join our side.

11 CHAIRMAN QUAY: I sure could.

12 MR. MULLIGAN: You know, a lot of what is
13 going on here is, you know, you know, through Congress
14 and all that sort of stuff, the agency, Entergy, and
15 the industry has gotten into this hyper promotional
16 stance where all you guys, you think you're a used car
17 salesman and you're basically throwing out, you know,
18 just positive information, the kind of information
19 that is promotional that just reflects under the parts
20 of the car and stuff like that.

21 And your real job considering our sacred
22 duties is to explain to us what is really going on
23 behind the scenes and explain this and that and you
24 give us an accurate picture and stuff like that. You
25 know, the public should be involved.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 But what you are really doing is you are
2 talking to yourselves. When you're talking to the
3 public, you're really talking to yourselves. You're
4 kind of adding on. You have another party you're
5 bringing this talk in. You have another party you're
6 bringing that's listening to what you're saying. And
7 you're more or less talking to yourselves. And I
8 think that is more important.

9 And you are being honest. You are talking
10 in the communication that's honest. This is a
11 positive. This is our negatives.

12 And, you know, like for the last weekend
13 and stuff, we've been seeing a lot of pretty pictures
14 with a lot of different plants, promotional types of
15 stuff. And they are pretty pictures.

16 And you would be well the whole industry
17 would be well, to -- I can give you some ugly
18 pictures. And that would be H. B. Robinson and Wolf
19 Creek Plant. The H. B. Robinson Plant was just an
20 assortment of different things. A cable failed. And
21 then they uncovered a whole bunch of other events --
22 I mean, other equipment people, procedures, a plant
23 simulation, computer simulation, and stuff like that.

24 You weren't smart enough to figure out
25 what needed to be corrected, and then you had another

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 event and stuff like that. Really, the failure isn't
2 really the H. B. Robinson Plant. It's NRC for not
3 being able to protect our nation and to protect
4 ourselves from these types of accidents.

5 These things are all around us, we feel.
6 There are a lot of good plants. There's a lot of
7 plants that are in trouble. And they're spinning in
8 a bad direction. And the NRC doesn't -- the real
9 reactor oversight process doesn't create that
10 incentive to change behavior. They go according to
11 the procedures.

12 But who is to say the procedures are right
13 or the policies are right? Something has got to be
14 higher than that. You know, there's got to be a sense
15 of doing good.

16 And so we -- you know, this promotional
17 business with the industry is a fanaticism. It's a
18 diction. And in these times, you have a paradigm
19 change. And promotionalism can really end up heading
20 south. People will end up seeing the game. And we'll
21 lose even more confidence on what is going on in the
22 industry.

23 We don't see -- most of my engineer
24 friends that are out there, you know, they got it
25 wrong. They talk about battery chargers and batteries

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 and seismic calculations and all that stuff. Well,
2 they're going at it backwards and stuff like that.

3 Well, we as a nation have seen as
4 organizations fail, they give signals of that for
5 years. When that accident happens, like the Gulf, you
6 find out afterwards that, you know, what wasn't
7 disclosed was sickening. You know, before the
8 accident, what they knew and what they knew they
9 didn't know. And stuff was sickening, absolutely
10 disgustingly sickening, what they knew about what was
11 going on, and stuff like that.

12 So components don't fail. Battery
13 chargers don't fail. Relays don't fail. It's people.
14 The organizations fail. And to a host of reasons,
15 through incentives, to talk one way, to think one way,
16 or disincentive, intimidation systems, subtle and
17 promotional and outright illegal distribution, those
18 are things that frame how people talk and stuff.

19 What facilitates and accommodates that is
20 barriers. You don't do things when the world can see
21 you. You only do those kinds of things when you are
22 hidden behind barriers. And people can't see it. And
23 the vet work is going on behind the scenes and stuff
24 like that.

25 They tell me with this power-safe

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 business, I ain't got proof. Well, you know, I could
2 say certainty, certainty, gaming. You know, I choose
3 to display this. I choose not to display that. I
4 choose to display this certainty, and I choose to hide
5 this uncertainty and the whole thing there.

6 You end up creating a picture that is
7 inaccurate when you do it for self-interest,
8 self-interested reasons and stuff. There has got to
9 be something bigger there, why we do things, bigger
10 than self-interest.

11 You know, we belong to a great nation.
12 And I think we don't think a lot of times that we --
13 we served a great nation. When we served a great
14 nation, we serve ourselves the best.

15 They had the business with this QA
16 business stuff. You've got managers that --
17 essentially managers in Palisades lied about
18 credentials, managers' credentials, and stuff like
19 that. The new stuff that's coming out they've just
20 been coming out as well.

21 You know, this really wasn't illegal.
22 Lying about credentials and stuff really wasn't
23 illegal because it was just in Entergy's procedures.
24 And the agency is powerless to make a stand on that,
25 these kind of falsifications and stuff. They're

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 powerless because, you know, we've got to follow
2 procedures and our rules.

3 And there's really nothing in there that
4 says this is illegal. And so, you know, what you're
5 doing I think is you're trying to get through this
6 tech spec business. You're going to add
7 qualifications, requirements to tech specs. And so
8 that will get you.

9 You know, I find it amazing that you can't
10 get a plant -- you can't have the power to prevent
11 falsification and stuff.

12 You know, the QA/QC business, you
13 basically said, you know, it's a high management type
14 of inspection. And you say you find a lot of stuff.
15 You didn't find a lot of -- you know, most of it was
16 construction-related. And it pays to what it's really
17 about. And then you tell us that we haven't inspected
18 plants at the plant level. There just hasn't been
19 inspections with this QA/QC business.

20 I might make a case. You got the safety
21 release at Vermont Yankee, that questions QC/QA.
22 You've got Holtech issues with Entergy not being
23 able to maintain their quality of standards and stuff
24 like that. So, you know, you have to kind of -- this
25 thing is -- it sounds to me like it's a lot bigger

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 than construction-related activities.

2 And, as I talked about, you know, the NRC
3 has a habit if they know something is going on, they
4 ding them on the little stuff and then at Palisades or
5 Entergy or a number of these plants, they go behind
6 the scenes. And they correct all the stuff the public
7 can't see, can't see what's going on. And we get a
8 falsification of really what's going on there.

9 And so Entergy will come back later on and
10 say, "Well, we -- you know, at the plant level, we did
11 our own -- we caught our own thing. And we finally
12 figured out what is wrong with QA/QC. And we take
13 credit for it." And that is wrong.

14 That whole thing is a falsification. You
15 are creating a false image. And if you've got two
16 QA/QC problems, you should hunt that thing to the end
17 immediately and fix it and stuff like that.

18 So like right now, you live in uncertainty
19 as far as what is the QA status of a lot of these
20 plants. And, really, if you don't -- you know, that's
21 what I'm talking about with certainty uncertainty.
22 You live in a -- there is uncertainty there. And if
23 you don't got the proof that the plant is safe, you
24 know, you should shut it down.

25 I don't have the proof because the NRC

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 doesn't do the inspections. And they don't give me
2 the access to the plant and stuff.

3 And we talked about that. What was that
4 battery charger? You know, remember, I said battery
5 capacity and stuff is really not the issue here. You
6 know, that DD206, the battery charger, the relays and
7 battery charger, like the plant should have. I mean,
8 they should have followed their procedures, gotten
9 into a -- I don't know what it was -- a shutdown or
10 something, notified the NRC. And they didn't, I mean.

11 And there is really no punishment to that
12 as far as I see. Everybody plays in papier-mache. I
13 talked about papier-mache safety systems. And
14 papier-mache, you don't just file the paperwork and
15 nobody gives a shit because all you're throwing at
16 them is paperwork. And you don't make consequences.

17 How you see a tragic event, the Gulf of
18 Mexico or Davis-Besse, what happened is -- this is a
19 model. I'm trying to build a model here. People
20 corrupt language. You can see this corruption of
21 language a million miles away. You can see it years
22 before the accident.

23 And you corrupt language. You corrupt
24 communications in little ways. And everybody gets
25 away with it. And the next thing, you create this

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 model thinking and stuff. And that's what leads to
2 all our problems in the nuclear industry.

3 I can remember I am trying to explain a
4 model here. And this is a good one. I'm up in
5 Vermont Yankee. And I'm up in training. And I've
6 been stripped from my shift. You know they're going
7 to get me. And they're getting ready to take my
8 license from me. I knew it was happening. I was
9 terrified. But I had to go through it.

10 And the year prior to that, I was having
11 -- I mean, it was unbelievable the stuff that was
12 going on. I had written a little -- I had to trust
13 the NRC. I wrote a letter to the governor. She kind
14 of balked. I got her in trouble. And the next thing
15 you know, we had them starting a huge investigation.

16 The investigation was over intermittent
17 short of the fuel pool pump and stuff. I just
18 couldn't take it anymore. And the procedure said,
19 "Precaution." The procedure said if that pump wasn't
20 operational in a month, you are required to shut down.

21 And you create those penalties there. If
22 it's not there, if they don't have that pump, if they
23 don't have a spare pump, you've got create a
24 punishment. You just can't keep facilitating this,
25 saying, "We've got a zillion backup systems. Nothing

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 ever matters." You create a punishment there.

2 You shut them down. And then everybody
3 says, "Oh, no. Vermont Yankee got shut down" or
4 somebody else "got shut down." And then everybody
5 starts behaving and you don't have all the
6 paper-mache systems and stuff like that.

7 So you know what Vermont Yankee was doing?
8 You know, you had to have two pumps or be shut down in
9 a month. They didn't have a repair motor. And they
10 had to make that repair motor. They had to build that
11 motor from scratch, safety-grade motor from scratch.

12 They initially tagged the breaker and the
13 switch because they didn't want anybody using that
14 motor and stuff. And we knew that. You know, I knew
15 that and stuff. And a month goes by. And nobody says
16 anything. A few months go by. And NRC has an issue
17 with it, with the tag on the breaker, on the switch.
18 And then they talk about it. And the NRC gets them to
19 put a precaution tag on there and stuff like that.

20 So, you know, then people start saying,
21 "Well, what do you base that on? What engineering do
22 you base that on?" Me? You've got to have proof. At
23 least that shows up. You've got to have proof. You
24 know, that's what we live and breathe by and stuff.
25 And so they didn't have it and stuff like that.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 And so months go by and stuff. And I'm
2 getting fed up with all this stuff. They didn't have
3 -- you know, they had to get repaired. They had to
4 build a new motor. It took a long time and stuff like
5 that. And they weren't dealing with that requirement
6 of being shut down in 30 days and stuff.

7 So we're at a month and stuff. And I'm
8 getting sick and tired of it. And I knew the NRC was
9 powerless. And I was trying to play the NRC against
10 the state. And so I wrote a letter to the governor.
11 And I got her in a -- she kind of sat on it. And I
12 got her into trouble. And the investigation ensued.

13 You know, on that investigation with
14 Vermont, we had the memorandum of understanding. In
15 other words, the state couldn't go where they pleased
16 in the plant to look at the documents that they needed
17 and stuff like that. Vermont Yankee would prevent
18 them from doing it. And through all of this
19 networking, we got a memorandum of understanding.

20 We had troubles with the emergency diesel
21 generators everybody here is aware at Calvert Cliffs
22 business recently with leaking roofs. Well, we had
23 leaking roofs above the diesel generators for years
24 and came in with big puddles.

25 My sense because I didn't engage it, we

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 lost power sense and stuff. And so I made a deal
2 that, you know, before I left there, I was going to
3 fix that because I know my time was coming to an end
4 and stuff.

5 So, you know, we had rainstorms and more
6 puddles and water leaking down on the outlet breaker
7 and the panels. You know it was ugly and stuff.

8 And it took me a number of, six, months.
9 The outcome and all that business was to -- was the
10 roofs were coming into age, into time, you know, and
11 stuff. And they had to replace all the roofs. I
12 mean, that's what it was all about, took us six months
13 to figure it out and stuff.

14 So, again, the people are dead. The
15 brains are dead more or less. They've been turned on
16 for some reason. People's minds are turned off for a
17 number of different incentives and stuff like that.

18 We talked. I told her. I told the
19 governor. I says, "You're going to have a lot of --
20 you're going to have a simple plant trip. It's going
21 to turn into being really ugly. And you're going to
22 have a lot of equipment. And we're going to get
23 confused." I mean, that's what we're facing and stuff
24 like that.

25 I'm here to tell you that you can see

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 these things a year, two years away. Everybody plays
2 games. The NRC plays certainty certainty games. I'm
3 here to tell you. I'm here to testify you can see
4 these years ahead of time. They usually revolve
5 around budget issues.

6 Budgets are so difficult to -- you know,
7 restrictions or reductions or new needs show up and
8 you don't get the money and stuff. Those are so
9 difficult to manage on these big organizations. You
10 know, they typically come back to, say, a five percent
11 reduction and stuff. And who gives -- you know, they
12 don't care what that does to the people's minds. And
13 not very many people get it right and stuff.

14 So I'm sitting up there in training. And
15 I know it's bleak. And, all of a sudden, I get a call
16 from the plant. And they tell me, "Mike, would you
17 work some overtime?"

18 And so I says, "Sure. What's going on?"
19 They didn't really want me at the plant at that point.
20 It was in such a bleak condition.

21 And they said, "We had an accident. And
22 we need you down here."

23 So I came down here. And what happened
24 was they had a loss of off-site power in 1992 and
25 stuff. What they were doing was they were changing

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 the batteries out in the switch gear -- the shift yard
2 and taking shortcuts, you know. They got away with
3 shortcuts for years and stuff like that.

4 And shortcuts are difficult stuff because
5 they give so much positive incentives when you take
6 them. And it's once every 50 times that you do it
7 that you really pay the price.

8 And so they were replacing batteries.
9 They replaced one battery. They had two independent
10 sides. They had one battery out. They had the two
11 sides connected on one charger and one battery. And
12 the charger that was -- the remaining charger, can you
13 believe that? Two safety sides connected together,
14 safety sides of all the electronics out in the
15 switchyard and stuff. And it had two batteries and
16 one charger, and the charger was defective. They had
17 diodes out. It was half broken, you know, and stuff.

18 I believe when they opened the breaker,
19 when they closed the breaker connecting two batteries
20 together and stuff, they had a big voltage surge and
21 knocked out a bunch of components at Vermont Yankee in
22 the switchyard. And that's how we got our loss of
23 off-site power.

24 It lasted for -- the Pettitbone, that
25 stupid crane, wasn't on site. We had to wait a long

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 time for the crane to come so that we could backfeed
2 the plant from the shift yard. It was 12 hours
3 without any electricity at, outside electricity at,
4 Vermont Yankee.

5 The employees told me. They said it was
6 like a movie. "We thought we was in a movie when this
7 was happening."

8 The diesel generators had flow problems.
9 We had flow problems with water. The design accident
10 for the diesel generators is one diesel generator
11 fails, the other diesel generator still works. And so
12 the assumption is there is only one diesel generator
13 working.

14 So the design assumption the engineers,
15 the cheapskate engineers, you know, they say, "Well,
16 why do we have to build two diesel generators? It's
17 supposed to be independent."

18 So the design engineers said, "We're going
19 to just -- we only need one discharge. We can route
20 the two service water discharges for the diesel
21 generators into one pipe. And that's good enough
22 because, you know, we're only going to have one diesel
23 generator when it ends" and stuff.

24 So then they had a valve at the end of
25 this one discharge line, service water discharge line.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 And we had radiation detector problems. It wasn't
2 getting enough service water. The NRC was getting on
3 our case all the time.

4 We were losing the service water. It
5 wasn't getting enough pressure. And the service water
6 rad monitor was going inop and stuff. And the NRC
7 drives the -- finally had enough.

8 So we had one operator say, "Well, I know
9 what I'll do. That one isolation, that one manual
10 valve that connects the two diesel generators, well,
11 we'll throttle it down. And we'll get the -- we'll
12 bring the pressure up" and stuff like that. So that's
13 what he did. He said, "The problem is with the
14 service water rad monitor."

15 Of course, when the diesel generators --
16 when the two diesel generators start and stuff like
17 that and you have that excess service water load, it
18 was throttled. And it drove during the loss of
19 off-site. It drove the plant, the discharge pressure,
20 high. And it pegged up the meters, the flow meters,
21 of the service water flow to the diesel generators.

22 So, you know, for a couple of minutes
23 there, it looked pretty God damn bleak in the control
24 room. I wasn't there, but I had buddies that told me
25 about it. You know, they were in half light. And

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 diesel generators had started up. They had trouble
2 with RCIC.

3 And, for a couple of minutes, they didn't
4 know what the hell was wrong with the diesel
5 generators other than they didn't have -- they thought
6 service water pressure was pegged high. And the flows
7 were -- I don't know. I think they were low or high.

8 And it took two or three minutes for
9 everybody to figure -- you know, looking at the RTDs,
10 RTEs, whatever they're called, you know, that they
11 weren't going high before we figured out that, oh,
12 they've got enough service water flow. We didn't
13 know, you know, how much service water flows, how much
14 or anything like that.

15 But those two minutes, everybody realized
16 that how close they were, you know, because what was
17 -- you know, if they ever -- they got a couple of high
18 alarms on the motor but not high enough to threaten
19 the operation of it and stuff like that, which you
20 couldn't see what the flow was. And, you know, as
21 operators, we could imagine how close we were to --
22 without having any diesel generators, we were damn
23 close.

24 You know, they, the NRC and the industry,
25 they played around because they knew I was talking to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 outsiders, the media, and all that sort of stuff.

2 Politicians hate me because I drive them
3 into being involved with a plant like Vermont Yankee.
4 They want to be stupid and outside and stuff.

5 During those, you know, two critical
6 minutes, two or three critical minutes, five minutes,
7 where nobody knew they had enough diesel generator
8 flow, they heard this -- they heard these humongous
9 booms in the control room and stuff.

10 Nobody could -- you know, that's at the
11 part where right at the beginning of an accident,
12 where you don't know what's going on and you hear this
13 repetitive boom, boom, boom. They finally figured out
14 it was coming from the main condenser area.

15 And they had guys go down there. And they
16 are looking around trying to figure out what was the
17 noise. I think it was leaking main feedwater check
18 valves that was causing this. And then that water was
19 building up. Probably the feedwater feeders were
20 filled with hot water. And I don't -- some check
21 valve somewhere was making all this noise.

22 And the operator said he never -- he
23 couldn't believe it. They bled the feedwater system.
24 And that stopped it. But he said he couldn't believe
25 it walking up those -- inside that main condenser

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 area. He says he has -- the noise was so loud, and it
2 was hurting his ears, never seen anything like it. He
3 said he -- the noise was hurting his chest it was so
4 loud and stuff.

5 And so, I mean, that's my story of how I
6 -- I mean, I had those feelings when I was -- when
7 this whole thing started. I says, "You know, if it
8 goes south, how can I live with myself? If the plant
9 has a big problem and stuff and I've always" -- and
10 that has never left me. You know, what happens if I
11 have special knowledge and something goes wrong at
12 Vermont Yankee or it goes -- I have special knowledge
13 or if I have -- something goes wrong with the NRC or
14 another plant. And can I live with myself if we have
15 a Fukushima or a single plant or something? Can I
16 live with myself if it happens? And I don't think I
17 could. I never could, you know.

18 I destroyed my career. It's left residual
19 issues, emotional issues, with me. I've damaged my
20 children as far as not -- you know, I don't have the
21 credentials anymore and all that sort of stuff.

22 You know, I did that knowing that, you
23 know, down deep I said to myself, if something bad
24 happens, can I live with myself? Well, I'm an idiot,
25 you know. If an event happens and stuff, will I blame

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 myself? And I think I will.

2 And, you know, it's a choice who you hurt.
3 You hurt your family or you hurt, you know, a lot of
4 other people. So that's my story. As far as how
5 organizations, go numb for some reason,
6 multi-organizations.

7 The employee, the utility, a plant, a
8 Palisades miscommunication, you know, this inaccurate,
9 distorted communication, everybody gets the wrong
10 impression. Nobody is talking honestly anymore and
11 painfully and stuff, the agency and stuff.

12 You know, we have all seen it across the
13 nation where it's not really the components that fail,
14 although they do. It's the people. It's the people
15 and the little things they do that cause these things
16 and stuff. Don't deal with our problems, the
17 incentives, disincentives, and stuff.

18 So that's my story as far as how a plant
19 can go really bad. And I thank you for this
20 opportunity to speak with you. Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN QUAY: Okay. At this time does
22 the staff here at headquarters have any questions for
23 Mr. Mulligan?

24 (No response.)

25 CHAIRMAN QUAY: Mr. Goel, you are on the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 line. Do you have any questions?

2 MR. GOEL: No. This is Vijay Goel. I
3 have no questions.

4 CHAIRMAN QUAY: Okay. Does the licensee
5 have any questions?

6 MR. DAVIS: No. This is Terry Davis. I
7 have no questions.

8 CHAIRMAN QUAY: Okay. Thank you.

9 Before I conclude the meeting, members of
10 the public may provide comments regarding the petition
11 and may ask questions about the 2.206 petition
12 process. However, as stated at the opening, the
13 purpose of this meeting is not to provide an
14 opportunity for the petitioner or the public to
15 question or examine the Petition Review Board
16 regarding the merits of the petition request.

17 Has any member of the public joined the
18 phone call that wants to make a comment?

19 (No response.)

20 CHAIRMAN QUAY: Hearing none, Mr.
21 Mulligan, thank you for taking time to provide the NRC
22 staff with clarifying information on the petition you
23 have submitted.

24 Before we close, does the Court Reporter
25 need any additional information for the meeting

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 transcript?

2 THE REPORTER: This is the Court Reporter.

3 I have no questions. Thank you.

4 CHAIRMAN QUAY: Okay. Thank you. Thank
5 you very much. With that, this meeting is concluded.

6 And we will be terminating the phone connection.

7 (Whereupon, the foregoing matter was

8 concluded at 9:43 p.m.)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com