

Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc. Palisades Nuclear Plant 27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway Covert, MI 49043 Tel 269 764 2000

Thomas P Kirwin
Acting Site Vice President

January 07, 2011

U. S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission

ATTN: Document Control Desk Washington, DC 20555-0001

SUBJECT:

Licensee Event Report 2010-004, Cracks Discovered in Emergency

Diesel Generator Turbocharger Support Plates

Palisades Nuclear Plant

Docket 50-255

License No. DPR-20

REFERENCES:

10 CFR 50.73

Dear Sir or Madam:

Licensee Event Report (LER) 2010-004 is enclosed. The LER describes the discovery of three cracks in the turbocharger vertical support plates of the 1-1 emergency diesel generator and, due to ongoing evaluations, is being conservatively submitted in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B) as a condition prohibited by technical specifications.

This letter contains no new commitments and no revisions to existing commitments.

Sincerely,
Thomas P Kriwin

TPK/TAD

Enclosure (1)

CC

Administrator, Region III, USNRC Project Manager, Palisades, USNRC Resident Inspector, Palisades, USNRC

ENCLOSURE

LER 2010-004

CRACKS DISCOVERED IN EMERGENCY DIESEL GENERATOR TURBOCHARGER SUPPORT PLATES

NRC FORM 366 U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION (10-2010)						E	APPROVED BY OMB NO. 3150-0104 EXPIRES 10/31/2013 Estimated burden per response to comply with this mandatory information collection request: 80 hours. Reported lessons learned are incorporated into the licensing process and fed back to							
(See reverse for required number of digits/characters for each block)							industry. Send comments regarding burden estimate to the Records Management Branch (T-6 E6), U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Washington, DC 20555-0001, or by internet e-mail to bjs1@nrc.gov, and to the Desk Officer, Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs, NEOB-10202 (3150-0104), Office of Management and Budget, Washington, DC 20503. If a means used to impose information collection does not display a currently valid OMB control number, the NRC may not conduct or sponsor, and a person is not required to respond to, the information collection.							
1. FACILI	TY NA	the second of the comment of		(Construction of the Construction of the Const	The second section of the section of the second section of the section of the second section of the sectio	2	2. DOCKET NUMBER				3. PAGE			
PALIS	ADE	S NUCL	EAR P	LANT			05000255				1 of 3			
4. TITLE						7								
Cracks Discovered in Emergency Diesel Generator Turbocharger Support Plates										Tee .				
5. E	EVENT	DATE	6. LER NUMBER			7. R	EPORT D	ATE	8. OTHER FACILITIES INVOLVED					
монтн	DAY	YEAR	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO	MONTH	DAY	YEAR	FACILITY NAME D			DOCKET	DOCKET NUMBER	
11	09	2010	2010	- 004 -	00	01	07	2011	FACILITY NAME			DOCKET	NUMBER	
9. OPERA	9. OPERATING MODE 11. THIS REPORT IS SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF 10 CFR §: (Check all that apply)													
1			□ 20.2201(b) □ 20.22 □ 20.2201(d) □ 20.22 □ 20.2203(a)(1) □ 20.22				$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$					A) 3)		
10. POWER LEVEL			20. 20. 20. 20.	2203(a)(2)(ii) 2203(a)(2)(iii) 2203(a)(2)(iv) 2203(a)(2)(v) 2203(a)(2)(vi)		50.36(c 50.36(c 50.46(a 50.73(a 50.73(a)(1)(ii)(A)(2))(3)(ii))(2)(i)(A)(2)(i)(B		3 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(A) □ 50.73(a)(2) 3 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A) □ 73.71(a)(4) 3 50.73(a)(2)(v)(B) □ 73.71(a)(5) 4 50.73(a)(2)(v)(C) □ OTHÈR 5 50.73(a)(2)(v)(D) NRC Form			(2)(x) (4) (5) (5) (a) Abstra	(2)(x) (4) (5) n Abstract below or in	
				12	. LICE	NSEE CC	NTACT	FOR THIS				<i>‡</i>		
	Terry Davis Telephone NUMBER (Include Area Code) (269) 764-2117													
		13.	COMPLE	TE ONE LINE FO			PONEN	T FAILUR	E DESCRIBED	IN THIS		_		
CAUSE		SYSTEM	COMPONENT FACTURER TO		ORTABLE O EPIX	CAUSE		SYSTEM			IANU- CTURER	REPORTABLE TO EPIX		
В	B EK DG F010 Y													
14. SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT EXPECTED							_		15. EXPEC	SION	MONTH	DAY	YEAR	
	<u> </u>			CTED SUBMISS			NO	tan linaa	DATE		02	26	2011	
ABSTRACT (Limit to 1400 spaces, i.e., approximately 15 single-spaced typewritten lines														

On October 31, 2010, Palisades' plant personnel discovered two cracks in the turbocharger vertical support plates of the 1-1 emergency diesel generator (EDG). Probable causes for the cracks in the support plates are high-cycle vibration and thermal cycling during engine runs. With two cracks in the turbocharger vertical support plate, an operability evaluation determined the 1-1 EDG was operable-DNC. Operable-DNC is a condition where a Technical Specification (TS) system structure or component is operable, but a degraded or nonconforming condition exists that does not require compensatory measures.

On November 4, 2010, during repair of the two previously identified cracks, a third crack in a vertical support plate was discovered. Weld repairs were completed on all three cracks on November 4, 2010. Due to the discovery of the third crack, on November 9, 2010, Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc. (ENO) and Fairbanks Morse, supplier of the 1-1 EDG, concluded additional detailed evaluations were required to maintain reasonable assurance the 1-1 EDG would have been able to operate satisfactorily for the required 30-day mission time. Therefore, without reasonable assurance of past operability, this situation is reportable in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B) as a condition prohibited by TS.

Due to the ongoing evaluation of the condition, ENO may request a cancellation of this LER, or a supplement will be submitted to provide additional details.

NRC FORM 366A

(10-2010)

LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) CONTINUATION SHEET

U.S.	NUCLEAR	REGULATORY	COMMISSION
D)			

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6	3. PAGE				
	\$	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REVISION NUMBER			
PALISADES NUCLEAR PLANT	05000255	2010	- 004 -	00	2	OF	3

PLANT CONDITIONS

On November 9, 2010, when it was determined additional evaluations were required to maintain reasonable assurance the 1-1 emergency diesel generator (EDG) would have been able to operate satisfactorily for the required 30-day mission time, the plant was operating at approximately 100% power.

EVENT DESCRIPTION

The EDG system [EK] is comprised of two independent, physically separate, full capacity diesel generators [DG] which consist of a diesel engine [ENG], its auxiliary systems and a class 1E generator unit [GEN]. The diesel engines are 18 cylinder turbocharged ALCO model 251F engines.

The diesel engine turbocharger is bolted on top of a horizontal, approximately 3/4" thick, steel mounting plate. Welded to the underside of the mounting plate are two sets of three, approximately 3/8" thick by 3 1/2" high, steel vertical support plates [SPT], that are welded to the integral engine-mounted aftercooler on the free end of the diesel engine. The turbocharger is also attached by connections to the exhaust manifold, air intake piping and aftercooler piping.

On October 31, 2010, during a monthly inspection, Palisades' plant personnel discovered a crack in a turbocharger vertical support plate of the 1-2 EDG. A follow-up inspection of the redundant 1-1 EDG revealed two cracks in the turbocharger vertical support plates. On November 4, 2010, during repair of the two previously identified cracks on the 1-1 EDG, a third crack in a vertical support plate was discovered. On November 4, 2010, weld repairs were completed on 1-1 EDG turbocharger vertical support plates. On November 6, 2010, weld repair of the single crack in turbocharger vertical support plate of the 1-2 EDG was completed.

In 1994, 2000, 2003 and 2005, single cracks were discovered in a turbocharger vertical support plate of the 1-2 EDG. In 2000 and 2005, single cracks were discovered in a turbocharger vertical support plate of the 1-1 EDG. In 2003, two cracks were discovered in a turbocharger vertical support plate of the 1-1 EDG. Fairbanks Morse, supplier of the EDGs, acknowledged cracks in the turbocharger vertical support plates are common in this model of diesel engine and have recommended a modification to replace the turbocharger support to a more robust design. Previous evaluations concluded the probable causes of the cracks are high-cycle vibration and thermal cycling during engine runs.

The operability evaluations for each previously identified condition determined the cracks would not render the EDG inoperable and the EDG could satisfactorily operate for the required 30-day mission time. A failure of the turbocharger vertical support could cause the turbocharger to move and vibrate in-place. The relative movement and/or vibration could potentially affect the operation of the EDG over time, but the initial failure would not compromise the turbocharger's function and therefore, would not compromise the system's ability to perform its function.

U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION (10-2010) LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) CONTINUATION SHEET							
1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6	. LER NUMBER	3. PAGE			
	ž	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REVISION NUMBER			
PALISADES NUCLEAR PLANT	05000255	2010	- 004	- 00	3 of 3		

On November 4, 2010, prior to discovery of the third crack on the turbocharger vertical support plate of the 1-1 EDG, an operability evaluation concluded the 1-1 EDG was operable-DNC. Operable-DNC is a condition where a Technical Specification (TS) system structure or component is operable, but a degraded or nonconforming condition exists that does not require compensatory measures.

On November 9, 2010, Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc. (ENO) and Fairbanks Morse concluded that, due to the discovery of the third crack in one of the turbocharger vertical support plates, additional detailed evaluations were required to maintain reasonable assurance the 1-1 EDG would have been able to operate satisfactorily for the required 30-day mission time. Therefore, without reasonable assurance of past operability, this situation is reportable in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B) as a condition prohibited by TS.

CAUSE OF THE EVENT

The probable cause of the event is the inability of the turbocharger support to withstand the high-cycle engine vibration and thermal cycling during engine runs.

CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN

All cracks identified in the turbocharger vertical support plates on 1-1 EDG and 1-2 EDG were repaired by welding.

CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TO BE TAKEN

Final corrective actions have not been determined. Due to the ongoing evaluation of the condition, ENO may request a cancellation of this LER, or a supplement will be submitted to include additional corrective actions.

ASSESSMENT OF SAFETY CONSEQUENCES

An assessment of the safety significance is ongoing. ENO may request a cancellation of this LER, or a supplement will be submitted to include an assessment of the safety significance of the condition.