

# UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

October 28, 2010

Administrative Judge Lawrence G. McDade, Chair Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001

Administrative Judge Dr. Kaye D. Lathrop 190 Cedar Lane East Ridgeway, CO 81432 Administrative Judge
Dr. Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001

In the Matter of ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC. (Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station Units 2 and 3)

<u>Docket Nos. 50-247-LR and 50-286-LR</u>

#### Dear Administrative Judges:

Pursuant to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board's December 18, 2008, "Memorandum and Order (Addressing Requests that the Proceeding be Conducted Pursuant to Subpart G)," slip op. at 13, and the Licensing Board's "Order (Granting Consent Motion Regarding Mandatory Disclosures)," dated January 30, 2009, at 1, the staff of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission ("Staff") herein notifies the Licensing Board and the parties that the hearing file has been supplemented for this proceeding. Materials in the hearing file may be accessed through the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System ("ADAMS"). An index containing the ADAMS accession number, date, and title or description of each item in Hearing File Index, Supplement 21 is appended hereto as Attachment 1.

On or about November 4, 2010, the newly identified documents in the hearing file will be made available via the Electronic Hearing Docket ("EHD"), which may be accessed at the following URL: <a href="http://ehd.nrc.gov/EHD\_Proceeding/home.asp">http://ehd.nrc.gov/EHD\_Proceeding/home.asp</a>. The hearing file will be contained in a subfolder entitled, "Indian PT Hearing File, Supplement 21" in the "Indian\_PT\_2&3\_50-247&50-286-LR" folder of the EHD.

In addition, as required by 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5), the Staff is producing an updated privilege log, identifying a document withheld under the deliberative process privilege, which are appended hereto as Attachment 2. Also, attached is the Declaration of Brian E. Holian formally invoking the deliberative process privilege with respect to the documents in Attachment 2. The Staff will preserve and maintain the privileged documents identified in the log during the pendency of this proceeding.

Further, pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(c), attached is the Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, certifying that all relevant materials required by this section have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete as to documents identified by October 22, 2010.

Finally, the NRC Staff notes that it has made a good faith effort to identify and characterize all documents meeting the criteria of 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b) and 10 C.F.R. § 2.1203 in this proceeding. In identifying these documents, the Staff does not concede their relevance to the license renewal issues to be decided in this proceeding.

Sincerely,

Brian G. Harris

Counsel for NRC Staff

Enclosures: Attachment 1 - Hearing File Index, Supplement 21

Attachment 2 - Deliberative Process Privilege Log

Declaration of Brian E. Holian Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg

cc w/Encls.: Service List

#### Attachment 1 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Supplement 21 - October 28, 2010

	Accession		
ID#	Number	Document Date	Title
021-001	ML102730624	9/28/2010	2010/09/28 Indian Point LR Hearing - IPEC SPDES and WQC: Thermal Status - Email 2 of 2
021-002	ML102730630	9/28/2010	2010/09/28 Indian Point LR Hearing - IPEC SPDES and WQC: Thermal Status - Email 1 of 3
021-003	ML102730633	9/28/2010	2010/09/28 Indian Point LR Hearing - IPEC SPDES and WQC: Thermal Status - Email 3 of 3
021-004	ML102740588	10/1/2010	2010/10/01 Indian Point LR Hearing - Follow-up to today's call
021-005	ML102790324	10/1/2010	2010/10/01 Indian Point LR Hearing - Follow-up to today's call
021-006	ML102790325	10/6/2010	2010/10/06 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Requested Data?
021-007	ML102800605	10/7/2010	2010/10/07 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Requested Data?

## Attachment 2 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 21 - October 28, 2010

Certain documents otherwise subject to inclusion in the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for this proceeding have been determined by the NRC Staff to contain information subject to withholding from public disclosures as predecisional, deliberative information. Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5), the Staff is providing this log to identify the following documents, withheld under the "deliberative process" privilege.

<u> </u>	ioco(b)(o), the otal	1 is providing this	iog to identity t	TIE TOHOWING	documents, withheld under the deliberative	process privilege.	
  ID#	Accession Number	Author Name/ Affiliation	Document Date	Document Type	Title	Comment	Page Count
		A.	1	11960	Tito	- Commone	Journ
DPP-21-		Stuyvenberg,	ļ		2010/00/29 Indian Point I B Hooring	Internal discussion	
001	ML102710668	NRC/NRR	0/20/2040		2010/09/28 Indian Point LR Hearing -		
001	IVIL 1027 10000	INRC/NRR	9/28/2010	E-Mail	INFO: Call with NMFS re: EFH	regarding EFH	
	}	<u>_</u> .			2010/09/30 Indian Point LR Hearing -		
DPP-21-		D. Logan,	1		RE: ACTION: Call with NMFS	Internal discussion	
002	ML102730278	NRC/NRR	9/30/2010	E-Mail	tomorrow	regarding EFH	2
		Α.			2010/09/30 Indian Point LR Hearing -		
DPP-21-	}	Stuyvenberg,			RE: ACTION: Call with NMFS	Internal discussion	
003	ML102730328	NRC/NRR	9/30/2010	E-Mail	tomorrow	regarding EFH	3
		Α.			-	Internal discussion	
DPP-21-		Stuyvenberg,			2010/09/30 Indian Point LR Hearing -	regarding thermal	
004	ML102730634	NRC/NRR	9/30/2010	E-Mail	Forwarding: Thermal Background	plumes	2
				-		Internal discussion	
DPP-21-		A. Imboden			2010/10/01 Indian Point LR Hearing -	regarding thermal	
005	ML102740003	NRC/NRR	10/1/2010	  F-Mail	Re: Forwarding: Thermal Background	, , ,	3
	<u> </u>	Α.	10,2010		r. to or war amigrmormar buonground	Internal discussion	† <u>*</u>
DPP-21-		Stuyvenberg,			2010/10/01 Indian Point LR Hearing -	regarding draft	
006	ML102740143	NRC/NRR	10/1/2010	F-Mail	FW: Missing sections of FSEIS	FSEIS	2
	1027 10110	Δ	10/1/2010	L-IVIAN	2010/10/05 Indian Point LR Hearing -	1 0210	
DPP-21-		Stuyvenberg,			RE: enviornmental impact on fish	Internal discussion	
007	ML102780463	NRC/NRR	10/5/2010	  - Mail	· •	[	١,
001	WIL 102700403	<del></del>	10/5/2010	E-Maii	around IP	regarding EFH	3
		A.			2010/10/06 Indian Point LR Hearing -	l	
DPP-21-	N41 400700000	Stuyvenberg,		l	INFO and A REQUEST: Two parts	Internal discussion	_
008	ML102790328	NRC/NRR	10/6/2010	E-Mail	re: NMFS	regarding EFH	3
					2010/10/06 Indian Point LR Hearing -		
DPP-21-		D. Logan,			RE: INFO and A REQUEST: Two	Internal discussion	
009	ML102790550	NRC/NRR	10/6/2010	E-Mail	parts re: NMFS	regarding EFH	3

## Attachment 2 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 21 - October 28, 2010

	Accession	Author Name/	Document	Document			Page
ID#	Number	Affiliation	Date	Туре	Title	Comment	Count
		Α.		_	2010/10/06 Indian Point LR Hearing -		i
DPP-21-		Stuyvenberg,		1	RE: INFO and A REQUEST: Two	Internal discussion	1
<u>01</u> 0	ML102790551	NRC/NRR	10/6/2010	E-Mail	parts re: NMFS	regarding EFH	3
					2010/10/06 Indian Point LR Hearing -		
DPP-21-		D. Logan,			RE: INFO and A REQUEST: Two	Internal discussion	
011	ML102790644	NRC/NRR	10/6/2010	E-Mail	parts re: NMFS	regarding EFH	4
		A.			2010/10/07 Indian Point LR Hearing -		
DPP-21-		Stuyvenberg,			RE: INFO and A REQUEST: Two	Internal discussion	
012	ML102800134	NRC/NRR	10/7/2010	E-Mail	parts re: NMFS	regarding EFH	4
		Α.					]
DPP-21-		Stuyvenberg,			2010/10/08 Indian Point LR Hearing -	Internal discussion	
013	ML102810057	NRC/NRR	10/8/2010	E-Mail	FW: Requested Data?	regarding EFH	6
					2010/10/20 Indian Point LR Hearing -		
DPP-21-	1	D. Logan,	ì		NMFS EFH recommendations for	Internal discussion	
014	ML102930628	NRC/NRR	10/20/2010	E-Mail	Indian Point - Notes	regarding EFH	6

### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

#### BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.	) ) )	Docket Nos. 50-247 & 50-286-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3)	) )	

#### **DECLARATION OF BRIAN E. HOLIAN**

- I, Brian E. Holian, do hereby state as follows:
- 1. I am employed as the Director of the Division of License Renewal ("DLR") in the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's ("NRC") Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation ("NRR"). My supervisory responsibilities include oversight of the NRC Staff's review and evaluation of the Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station Units 2 and 3 license renewal application.
- 2. As part of their responsibilities in updating the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for these proceedings, NRC staff members under my supervision identified documents as privileged because they contained information concerning the Staff's predecisional deliberative process. The documents are listed in Attachment 2 to the submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 21.
- 3. I have personally reviewed the documents identified as privileged in Attachment 2, and have determined, in accordance with the guidance set forth in Management Directive 3.4, that it contains pre-decisional information concerning the Staff's review of the license renewal application. The documents contain either the Staff's analyses, recommendations, opinions, or evaluations, and may not necessarily reflect the final agency position with respect

to the matters discussed therein. The document comprises part of the deliberative process necessary for the Staff's review of the pending license renewal application.

- 4. Further, I have determined that disclosure of the documents could result in harm to the agency, in that it would (a) prematurely disclose the preliminary views of individual Staff members and/or the Staff prior to reaching a final agency decision, and could thus create confusion as to the actual policy or views of the NRC Staff; (b) hinder the efficiency of the Staff, in that forced disclosure of its internal discussions on an unresolved issue would tend to chill all future deliberations and would interfere with the Staff's ability to engage in a free exchange of opinions and analyses prior to publishing its final review documents; and (c) imply or suggest incorrectly that the opinions of the Staff members involved in these communications are actually the final decisions of the agency, while no such final decision has yet been made.
- 5. Accordingly, I formally invoke the deliberative process privilege with respect to the documents listed in Attachment 2 to the submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 21.
- 6. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Brian F Holian

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 28<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2010

### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

#### BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.	) ) )	Docket Nos. 50-247 & 50-286-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station, Units 2 and 3)	) )	

## AFFIDAVIT OF ANDREW L. STUYVENBERG CONCERNING MANDATORY DISCLOSURE REQUIREMENT OF 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)

I, Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, do hereby state as follows:

- 1. I am employed as a Project Manager in the Division of License Renewal in the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's ("NRC") Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation. I serve as a project manager for the Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station, Units 2 and 3 license renewal application ("LRA"). Among other things, I am managing the preparation of the hearing file and mandatory disclosures in connection with the LRA at issue in this proceeding.
- 2. I hereby certify that all relevant materials required to be disclosed pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336 (b) and (c) in the captioned proceeding have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete for documents identified as of October 22, 2010.
- 3. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Andrew L. Stuyvenberg

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 28<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2010

### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

#### BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS,	INC.	Docket Nos. 50-247/286-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3)	) ) )	

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing Letter to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board regarding the Indian Point Hearing File, including: Attachment 1 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Supplement 21, and Affidavit of Andrew L Stuyvenberg, dated October 28, 2010, Attachment 2 – Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Supplement 21 – Deliberative Due Process Privilege, and Declaration of Brian E. Holian, dated October 28, 2010, have been served upon the following through deposit in the NRC's internal mail system, with copies by electronic mail, or, as indicated by an asterisk, by deposit in the U.S. Postal Service, with copies by electronic mail this 28<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2010:

Lawrence G. McDade, Chair Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop - T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555-0001 E-mail: Lawrence.McDade@nrc.gov

Dr. Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop - T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-mail: Richard.Wardwell@nrc.gov

Dr. Kaye D. Lathrop
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
190 Cedar Lane E.
Ridgway, CO 81432
E-mail: Kaye.Lathrop@nrc.gov

Office of Commission Appellate
Adjudication
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Mail Stop: O-16G4
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: OCAAMAIL.resource@nrc.gov

Office of the Secretary
Attn: Rulemaking and Adjudications Staff
Mail Stop: O-16G4
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: Hearing.Docket@nrc.gov

Josh Kirstein, Esq.
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop - T-3 F23
U. S, Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-Mail: Josh.Kirstein@nrc.gov

Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Mail Stop: T-3 F23 Washington, DC 20555-0001 (Via Internal Mail Only)

Kathryn M. Sutton, Esq.\* Paul M. Bessette, Esq. Jonathan Rund, Esq. Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP 1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, D.C. 20004

E-mail: ksutton@morganlewis.com E-mail: pbessette@morganlewis.com E-mail: martin.o'neill@morganlewis.com

Martin J. O'Neill, Esq.\* Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP 1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 4000 Houston, TX 77002 E-mail: martin.o'neill@morganlewis.com

Elise N. Zoli, Esq.\* Goodwin Procter, LLP Exchange Place 53 State Street Boston, MA 02109

E-mail: ezoli@goodwinprocter.com

William C. Dennis, Esq.\* Assistant General Counsel Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc. 440 Hamilton Avenue White Plains, NY 10601 E-mail: wdennis@entergy.com

Melissa-Jean Rotini, Esq. Assistant County Attorney Office of Robert F. Meehan, Esa. Westchester County Attorney 148 Martine Avenue, 6th Floor White Plains, NY 10601 E-Mail: MJR1@westchestergov.com

John J. Sipos, Esq.\* Charlie Donaldson, Esq. Assistants Attorney General New York State Department of Law Environmental Protection Bureau The Capitol Albany, NY 12224 E-mail: John.Sipos@ag.ny.gov

Mylan L. Denerstein, Esq.\* Janice A. Dean, Esq. Executive Deputy Attorney General, Social Justice Office of the Attorney General of the State of New York 120 Broadway, 25th Floor New York, NY 10271

E-mail: Mylan.Denerstein@ag.ny.gov Janice.Dean@ag.ny.gov

Joan Leary Matthews, Esq.\* Senior Attorney for Special Projects New York State Department of **Environmental Conservation** Office of the General Counsel 625 Broadway, 14th Floor Albany, NY 12233-1500

E-mail: ilmatthe@gw.dec.state.ny.us

Daniel E. O'Neill, Mayor\* James Seirmarco, M.S. Village of Buchanan Municipal Building Buchanan, NY 10511-1298

E-mail: vob@bestweb.net

E-mail: smurray@villageofbuchanan.com

Robert Snook, Esq.\*
Office of the Attorney General State of Connecticut
55 Elm Street
P.O. Box 120
Hartford, CN 06141-0120
E-mail: robert.snook@ct.gov

Phillip Musegaas, Esq.\*

Deborah Brancato, Esq.

Riverkeeper, Inc.

20 Secor Road

Ossining, NY 10562

E-mail: phillip@riverkeeper.org

dbrancato@riverkeeper.org

Michael J. Delaney, Esq.\*
Vice President – Energy Department
New York City Economic Development
Corporation (NYCDEC)
110 William Street
New York, NY 10038
E-mail: mdelaney@nycedc.com

Manna Jo Greene\*
Stephen Filler
Hudson River Sloop Clearwater, Inc.
724 Wolcott Avenue
Beacon, NY 12508
E-mail: mannajo@clearwater.org

E-mail: <a href="mailto:mannajo@clearwater.org">mannajo@clearwater.org</a>
E-mail: <a href="mailto:stephenfiller@gmail.com">stephenfiller@gmail.com</a>

Daniel Riesel, Esq.\*
Thomas F. Wood, Esq.
Ms. Jessica Steinberg, J.D.
Sive, Paget & Riesel, P.C.
460 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10022
E-mail: driesel@sprlaw.com
jsteinberg@sprlaw.com

Ross H. Gould, Esq.\* 270 Route 308 Rhinebeck, NY 12572 T: 917-658-7144

E-mail: rgouldesq@gmail.com

John Louis Parker, Esq.\*
Office of General Counsel, Region 3
New York State Department of
Environmental conservation
21 South Putt Corners Road
New Paltz, NY 12561-1620

E-mail: jlparker@gw.dec.state.ny.us

Brian G. Harris

Counsel for NRC Staff