

EDO Principal Correspondence Control

FROM: DUE: 11/12/10

EDO CONTROL: G20100648
DOC DT: 10/18/10
FINAL REPLY:

Louis A. Zeller
Blue Ridge Environmental
Defense League

TO:

Chairman Jaczko

FOR SIGNATURE OF :

** GRN **

CRC NO: 10-0465

Johnson, NRO

DESC:

Request to Overturn Withholding of Information
from Public Disclosure and a Call for a Special
Investigation (EDATS: SECY-2010-0498)

ROUTING:

Borchardt
Weber
Virgilio
Ash
Mamish
OGC/GC
Reyes, RII
Burns, OGC
Abdel-Khalik,
ACRS
Hawkins, ASLBP
Sanfilippo, OEDO

DATE: 10/21/10

ASSIGNED TO:

NRO

CONTACT:

Johnson

SPECIAL INSTRUCTIONS OR REMARKS:

Coordinate with OGC.

Template: SECY-017

EXIDS: SECY-01

EDATS

Electronic Document and Action Tracking System

EDATS Number: SECY-2010-0498

Source: SECY

General Information

Assigned To: NRO

OEDO Due Date: 11/12/2010 11:00 PM

Other Assignees:

SECY Due Date: 11/12/2010 11:00 PM

Subject: Request to Overturn Withholding of Information from Public Disclosure and a Call for a Special Investigation
Description:

CC Routing: RegionII; OGC; ACRS; ASLBP

ADAMS Accession Numbers - Incoming: NONE

Response/Package: NONE

Other Information

Cross Reference Number: G20100648, LTR-10-0465

Staff Initiated: NO

Related Task:

Recurring Item: NO

File Routing: EDATS

Agency Lesson Learned: NO

OEDO Monthly Report Item: NO

Process Information

Action Type: Letter

Priority: Medium

Signature Level: NRO

Sensitivity: None

Urgency: NO

Approval Level: No Approval Required

OEDO Concurrence: NO

OCM Concurrence: NO

OCA Concurrence: NO

Special Instructions: Coordinate with OGC.

Document Information

Originator Name: Louis A. Zeller

Date of Incoming: 10/18/2010

Originating Organization: Blue Ridge Environmental
Defense League

Document Received by SECY Date: 10/21/2010

Addressee: Chairman Jaczko

Date Response Requested by Originator: NONE

Incoming Task Received: Letter

OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY
CORRESPONDENCE CONTROL TICKET

Date Printed: Oct 20, 2010 14:36

PAPER NUMBER:

LTR-10-0465

LOGGING DATE: 10/20/2010

ACTION OFFICE:

EDO / OGC

AUTHOR:

Louis Zeller

AFFILIATION:

NC

ADDRESSEE:

Gregory Jaczko

SUBJECT:

Request to overturn withholding of information from public disclosure and a call for a special investigation

ACTION:

Direct Reply

DISTRIBUTION:

RF

LETTER DATE:

10/18/2010

ACKNOWLEDGED

No

SPECIAL HANDLING:

EDO should coordinate response with OGC

NOTES:

SECY/RAS will contact Mr. Zeller to make sure that he is in agreement with serving it on the parties.

FILE LOCATION:

ADAMS

DATE DUE:

11/12/2010

DATE SIGNED:

EDO --G20100648

Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League

www.BREDL.org PO Box 88 Glendale Springs, North Carolina 28629 BREDL@skybest.com (336) 982-2691

October 18, 2010

Gregory B. Jaczko, Chairman
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Mail Stop O-16G4
Washington, DC 20555-0001

Re: A request to overturn withholding of information from public disclosure and a call for a special investigation

Chairman Jaczko:

On behalf of the Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League, I write to request a special investigation of recent activities of the Nuclear Regulatory Commission's Office of New Reactors regarding the Westinghouse Electric Company's AP1000 nuclear power reactor.

As you know, on September 29, 2010 the Division of New Reactors approved three related requests to withhold information from public disclosure.¹ These actions center on withholding information on the AP1000 nuclear reactor's containment shield building. We believe these requests are improper, contrary to the interests of public health and safety and, coming at this time, an attempt to circumvent scrutiny by the affected public.

As you may also know, on June 25, 2010 Arnold Gunderson² briefed the Advisory Committee on Reactor Safeguards about serious design flaws in the AP1000 shield building, the steel and concrete structures which are supposed to contain radiation in the event of an accident. The ACRS determined that the issue would need to be addressed in both generic and site-specific proceedings; that is, during both overall design certification and individual license applications. On August 12, 2010 we filed a new contention in our Plant Vogtle license intervention based on this information.

Southern Nuclear Operating Company's Plant Vogtle is the reference site for the AP1000 combined license application, Docket Nos. 52-025 and 52-026. Georgia Women's Action for New Directions, the Center for a Sustainable Coast and the Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League are co-intervenors in the license application proceeding. The Atomic Safety and Licensing Board has ordered that a preliminary hearing be held tomorrow, October 19th, to hear arguments from the parties regarding the flaws in the AP1000, the very flaws identified by the ACRS as having an impact on the combined license application.

¹ ADAMS Accession Nos. ML102660263, ML102670260 and ML102660378

² Arnold Gunderson is the Chief Engineer with Fairewinds Associates, Inc., specializing in nuclear safety, engineering, and reliability issues. Gunderson is a nuclear engineer with more than 38 years of experience in nuclear power plant operation, management and design.

The AP1000 is a novel design. To reduce expensive plumbing, pumps and other hardware, Westinghouse relies on so-called passive safety systems; however, the passive design feature is the source of a fundamental weakness which we have brought before the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board. Unlike other pressurized water reactors, Westinghouse proposes to use a freestanding steel containment.³ The problem is that the ventilation system allows the free flow of air, allowing radiation to escape in the event of a reactor core breach or loss-of-coolant-accident. Gundersen stated the danger bluntly:

The unique AP1000 containment design allows it to develop a preexisting condition that could lead to a reduction in its wall thickness that would result in a rapid release of radiation. This scenario is likely and is not anticipated in the current design basis AP1000 analysis nor in the SAMDA analysis.

Gundersen goes on to say that corrosion, cracking and leakage in nuclear reactor containment structures are more serious than anticipated by the NRC. The high-moisture environment in the AP1000 makes it more susceptible to corrosion in inaccessible locations than older plants. An accident releasing radioactive gases from the AP1000 reactor vessel would not be kept inside the containment structure because there is an annular gap between the steel containment and the concrete building. This gap is designed to siphon air up and release it through the top of the building.

In June, the Chairman of the ACRS, Harold B. Ray, said that specific issues relating to accessibility, inspections and maintenance of the containment should be addressed not in the pending generic review of the AP1000 design by the ACRS, but within individual combined operating license proceedings.

Mr. Chairman, how could the Nuclear Regulatory Commission grant the request to withhold information from the public which is directly related to the ongoing determination of safety measures at Plant Vogtle? Even if such withheld information were deemed proprietary, which we dispute, the withholding must not impair procedural rights.⁴

Further, under 10 CFR § 2.390, the Commission may deny a request for withholding of information from the public. The relevant regulation states:⁵

The procedures in this section must be followed by anyone submitting a document to the NRC who seeks to have the document, or a portion of it, withheld from public disclosure because it contains trade secrets, privileged, or confidential commercial or financial information.

³ A nuclear reactor containment building is the final barrier to radioactive release, and must be reliable in the event of failure of the reactor vessel and the coolant system.

⁴ 42 USC 2231, Atomic Energy Act, Chapter 16, Sec.181

⁵ 10 CFR § 2.390(b)(5) Public inspections, exemptions, requests for withholding

If the Commission determines, under paragraph (b)(4) of this section, that the record or document contains trade secrets or privileged or confidential commercial or financial information, the Commission will then determine whether the right of the public to be fully apprised as to the bases for and effects of the proposed action outweighs the demonstrated concern for protection of a competitive position, and whether the information should be withheld from public disclosure under this paragraph. If the record or document for which withholding is sought is deemed by the Commission to be irrelevant or unnecessary to the performance of its functions, it will be returned to the applicant. (emphasis added)

The purpose of the requests by Westinghouse is to withhold information on steel welding inspections and benchmarking, analysis, testing, design and audits of the reactor containment shield building. Shield building maintenance and inspection issues are central to our intervention. The withheld AP1000 information is relevant and necessary for the intervenors in the ongoing Plant Vogtle licensing proceeding now before the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board. Withholding relevant and material information in this matter is improper and outrageous. The Commission should rescind and deny these requests.

In a related matter, we are troubled by the recent report by a pro-nuclear blogger in which the writer says he communicated with NRC staff assigned to the AP1000 shield building evaluation.⁶ According to the report, the NRC staff disagrees with Mr. Gundersen's assessment of containment liner corrosion and has already concluded that there are no "show stopping issues." If the NRC staff is biased, that is, if they chose sides in July before fully analyzing Gundersen's AP1000 research paper, how can we be assured of getting a fair hearing?

Finally, if the NRC's response to technical problems is a cloak of secrecy, how can the residents of Shell Bluff, Georgia and indeed the United States have any confidence in the next generation of nuclear power? Thank you for your consideration of our request.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Louis A. Zeller". The signature is written in a cursive style and is followed by a horizontal line.

Louis A. Zeller

⁶ Comments to Scientific American article, Rod Adams, 7/30/10

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD PANEL

Before the Licensing Board:

G. Paul Bollwerk, III, Chairman
Nicholas G. Trikouros
Dr. James F. Jackson

In the Matter of
SOUTHERN NUCLEAR OPERATING CO.
Vogtle Electric Generating Plant
Units 3 and 4

Docket Nos. 52-025-COL and 52-026-COL
ASLBP No. 10-903-01-COL-BD02

October 18, 2010

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that copies of the forgoing **Request to overturn withholding of information from public disclosure and a call for a special investigation** have been served upon the following persons by Electronic Information Exchange

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board
Panel
Mail Stop - T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001

G. Paul Bollwerk, III, Chair
Administrative Judge
E-mail: paul.bollwerk@nrc.gov

Nicholas G. Trikouros
Administrative Judge
E-mail: ngt@nrc.gov

James F. Jackson
Administrative Judge
E-mail: jxj2@nrc.gov
jackson538@comcast.net
james.jackson@nrc.gov

Wen Bu, Law Clerk, ASLBP
E-mail: wen.bu@nrc.gov

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the General Counsel
Mail Stop - O-15 D21
Washington, DC 20555-0001
Marian Zobler, Esq.
Ann P. Hodgdon, Esq.
Sara Kirkwood, Esq.
Patrick A. Moulding, Esq.
Sarah Price, Esq.
Carol H. Lazar, Esq.
Jessica Bielecki, Esq.
Stephanie Liaw, Esq.
Joseph Gilman, Paralegal
E-mail:
marian.zobler@nrc.gov;aph@nrc.gov;
Sara.Kirkwood@nrc.gov;
patrick.moulding@nrc.gov;
sap1@nrc.gov
jsg1@nrc.gov;Carol.Lazar@nrc.gov;
jessica.bielecki@nrc.gov;
stephanie.liaw@nrc.gov

OGC Mail Center: Members of this office have received a copy of this filing by EIE service.

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of Commission Appellate
Adjudication
Mail Stop: O-16C1
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: ocaamail@nrc.gov

Moanica M. Caston, Esq.
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
40 Inverness Center Parkway
P.O. Box 1295, Bin B-022
Birmingham, AL 35201-1295
E-mail: mcaston@southernco.com

Kathryn M. Sutton, Esq.
Steven P. Frantz, Esq.
Paul M. Bessette, Esq.
Mary Freeze, Legal Secretary
Angela M. Perry, Legal Secretary
Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP
Co-Counsel for Southern Nuclear
Operating Co., Inc.
1111 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20004
E-mail: ksutton@morganlewis.com
sfrantz@morganlewis.com
pbessette@morganlewis.com
mfreeze@morganlewis.com
angela.perry@morganlewis.com

Turner Environmental Law Clinic
Emory University School of Law
1301 Clifton Road
Atlanta, GA 30322
Lawrence Sanders, Esq.
E-mail: lsande3@emory.edu
Mindy Goldstein
E-mail: magolds@emory.edu

Kenneth C. Hairston, Esq.
M. Stanford Blanton, Esq.
Peter D. LeJeune, Esq.
Chad Pilcher, Esq.
Millicent Ronnlund
Balch & Bingham LLP
1710 Sixth Avenue North
Birmingham, Alabama 35203-2014
E-mail: kchairston@balch.com;
sblanton@balch.com;
plejeune@balch.com;
cpilcher@balch.com;
mronnlund@balch.com

C. Grady Moore, III, Esq.
Balch & Bingham, LLP
1901 6TH Avenue, Suite 2600
Birmingham, AL 35203
Leslie Garrett Allen, Esq.
E-mail: gmoore@balch.com
E-mail: lgallen@balch.com

Robert B. Haemer, Esq.
Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP
2300 N Street, NW
Washington, DC 20037-1122
E-mail:
robert.haemer@pillsburylaw.com

James B. Dougherty, Esq.
709 3rd Street, SW
Washington, DC 20024
E-mail: jimdougherty@aol.com

David Kyler
Center For A Sustainable Coast
Mailing address: 221 Mallery St. Suite B,
St. Simons Island, GA 31522
Phone: 912-638-3612
Email: susdev@gate.net

Bobbie Paul
Georgia Women's Action for New
Directions, Inc.
Mailing address: 250 Georgia Ave. SE,
Ste. 202, Atlanta, GA 30312
Phone: 404-524-5999
Fax: 404-524-7593
Email: bobbie@wand.org

John D. Runkle, Esq.
P.O. Box 3793
Chapel Hill, NC 27515
919-942-0600
Email: jrunkle@pricecreek.com

Barton Z. Cowan, Esq.
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC
600 Grant Street, 44th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
E-mail: teribart61@aol.com

October 18, 2010

/signed/ (electronically) by Louis Zeller
Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League
PO Box 88 Glendale Springs, NC 28629
Phone (336) 982-2691
Fax (336)982-2954
BREDL@skybest.com