



UNITED STATES  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

September 16, 2010

Mr. J. R. Morris  
Site Vice President  
Catawba Nuclear Station  
Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC  
4800 Concord Road  
York, SC 29745

SUBJECT: CATAWBA NUCLEAR STATION, UNIT 2, REQUEST FOR WITHHOLDING  
INFORMATION FROM PUBLIC DISCLOSURE (TAC NO. ME4108)

Dear Mr. Morris:

By letter dated April 28, 2010, (Agencywide Document Accession Management System (ADAMS) Accession No. ML101730388), you attached a letter dated May 21, 2009, which enclosed an affidavit dated May 21, 2009, executed by J. A. Gresham of Westinghouse Electric Company, LLC (Westinghouse). The letter of May 21, 2009, requested that the information contained in the following document be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR), Part 2, Section 2.390:

WCAP-17072-P, "H\*: Alternate Repair Criteria for the Tubesheet Expansion Region in Steam Generators with Hydraulically Expanded Tubes (Model D5)," dated May 2009 (Proprietary)

A nonproprietary copy of this document has been placed in the Nuclear Regulatory Commission's (NRC's) Public Document Room and added to the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System Public Electronic Reading Room.

The affidavit stated that the submitted information should be considered exempt from mandatory public disclosure for the following reasons:

- (i) The information sought to be withheld from public disclosure is owned and has been held in confidence by Westinghouse.
- (ii) The information is of a type customarily held in confidence by Westinghouse and not customarily disclosed to the public. Westinghouse has a rational basis for determining the types of information customarily held in confidence by it and, in that connection, utilizes a system to determine when and whether to hold certain types of information in confidence. The application of that system and the substance of that system constitute Westinghouse policy and provide the rational basis required.

Under that system, information is held in confidence if it falls in one or more of several types, the release of which might result in the loss of an existing or potential competitive advantage, as follows:

- (a) The information reveals the distinguishing aspects of a process (or component, structure, tool, method, etc.) where prevention of its use by any of Westinghouse's competitors without license from Westinghouse constitutes a competitive economic advantage over other companies.
- (b) It consists of supporting data, including test data, relative to a process (or component, structure, tool, method, etc.), the application of which data secures a competitive economic advantage, e.g., by optimization or improved marketability.
- (c) Its use by a competitor would reduce his expenditure of resources or improve his competitive position in the design, manufacture, shipment, installation, assurance of quality, or licensing a similar product.
- (d) It reveals cost or price information, production capacities, budget levels, or commercial strategies of Westinghouse, its customers or suppliers.
- (e) It reveals aspects of past, present, or future Westinghouse or customer funded development plans and programs of potential commercial value to Westinghouse.
- (f) It contains patentable ideas, for which patent protection may be desirable.

There are sound policy reasons behind the Westinghouse system which include the following:

- (a) The use of such information by Westinghouse gives Westinghouse a competitive advantage over its competitors. It is, therefore, withheld from disclosure to protect the Westinghouse competitive position.
  - (b) It is information that is marketable in many ways. The extent to which such information is available to competitors diminishes the Westinghouse ability to sell products and services involving the use of the information.
  - (c) Use by our competitor would put Westinghouse at a competitive disadvantage by reducing his expenditure of resources at our expense.
  - (d) Each component of proprietary information pertinent to a particular competitive advantage is potentially as valuable as the total competitive advantage. If competitors acquire components of proprietary information, any one component may be the key to the entire puzzle, thereby depriving Westinghouse of a competitive advantage.
-

- (e) Unrestricted disclosure would jeopardize the position of prominence of Westinghouse in the world market, and thereby give a market advantage to the competition of those countries.
- (f) The Westinghouse capacity to invest corporate assets in research and development depends upon the success in obtaining and maintaining a competitive advantage.
- (iii) The information is being transmitted to the Commission in confidence and, under the provisions of 10 CFR Section 2.390, it is to be received in confidence by the Commission.
- (iv) The information sought to be protected is not available in public sources or available information has not been previously employed in the same original manner or method to the best of our knowledge and belief.
- (v) The proprietary information sought to be withheld in this submittal is that which is appropriately marked in WCAP-17072-P, "H\*: Alternate Repair Criteria for the Tubesheet Expansion Region in Steam Generators with Hydraulically Expanded Tubes (Model D5)," dated May 2009 (Proprietary), for submittal to the Commission, being transmitted by Duke Energy Application for Withholding Proprietary Information from Public Disclosure to the Document Control Desk. The proprietary information as submitted for use by Westinghouse for Catawba Unit 2 is expected to be applicable to other licensee submittals in support of implementing an alternate repair criterion, called H\*, that does not require an eddy current inspection and plugging of the tubes below a distance of 13.8 inches from the top of the tubesheet.

This information is part of that which will enable Westinghouse to:

- (a) Provide documentation of the analyses, methods, and testing which support the implementation of an alternate repair criterion, designated as H\*, for a portion of the tubes within the tubesheet of the Catawba Unit 2 steam generators.
- (b) Assist the customer in obtaining NRC approval of the Technical Specification changes associated with the alternate repair criterion.

Further this information has substantial commercial value as follows:

- (a) Westinghouse plans to sell the use of similar information to its customers for the purposes of meeting NRC requirements for licensing documentation.
- (b) Westinghouse can sell support and defense of the technology to its customers in the licensing process.

Public disclosure of this proprietary information is likely to cause substantial harm to the competitive position of Westinghouse because it would enhance the ability

of competitors to provide similar calculation, evaluation and licensing defense services for commercial power reactors without commensurate expenses. Also, public disclosure of the information would enable others to use the information to meet NRC requirements for licensing documentation without purchasing the right to use the information.

The development of the technology described in part by the information is the result of applying the results of many years of experience in an intensive Westinghouse effort and the expenditure of a considerable sum of money.

In order for competitors of Westinghouse to duplicate this information, similar technical programs would have to be performed and a significant manpower effort, having the requisite talent and experience, would have to be expended.

We have reviewed your application and the material in accordance with the requirements of 10 CFR 2.390 and, on the basis of the statements in the affidavit, have determined that the submitted information sought to be withheld contains proprietary commercial information and should be withheld from public disclosure.

Therefore, the version of the submitted information marked as proprietary will be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.390(b)(5) and Section 103(b) of the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, as amended.

Withholding from public inspection shall not affect the right, if any, of persons properly and directly concerned to inspect the documents. If the need arises, we may send copies of this information to our consultants working in this area. We will, of course, ensure that the consultants have signed the appropriate agreements for handling proprietary information.

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You also should understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

J. Morris

- 5 -

If you have any questions, please call me at 301-415-1119.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Jon Thompson". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Jon Thompson, Project Manager  
Plant Licensing Branch II-1  
Division of Operating Reactor Licensing  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-414

cc: Distribution via Listserv

Mr. James A. Gresham, Manager  
Regulatory Compliance and Plant Licensing  
Westinghouse Electric Company  
P.O. Box 355  
Pittsburgh, PA 15230-0355

September 16, 2010

J. Morris

- 5 -

If you have any questions, please call me at 301-415-1119.

Sincerely,

*/RA/*

Jon Thompson, Project Manager  
Plant Licensing Branch II-1  
Division of Operating Reactor Licensing  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-414

cc: Distribution via Listserv

Mr. James A. Gresham, Manager  
Regulatory Compliance and Plant Licensing  
Westinghouse Electric Company  
P.O. Box 355  
Pittsburgh, PA 15230-0355

**DISTRIBUTION:**

PUBLIC  
LPL2-1 R/F  
RidsNrrDorlLpl2-1 Resource  
RidsNrrPMCatowba Resource  
RidsNrrLAMO'Brien Resource

RidsAcrcsAcnw\_MailCTR Resource  
RidsRgn2MailCenter Resource  
RidsNrrDeCsgb Resource  
RidsNrrDoriDprResource

ELenning, NRR  
KKarwoski, NRR  
EMurphy, NRR  
AJohnson, NRR

**ADAMS Accession No. ML102520073**

**\* via e-mail**

OFFICE	NRR/LPL2-1/PM	NRR/LPL2-1/LA	NRR/CSGB/BC	NRR/LPL2-1/BC	NRR/LPL2-1/PM
NAME	JThompson	MO'Brien*	RTaylor (MYoder for)	GKulesa	JThompson
DATE	09/09/10/	09/09/10	09/13/10	09/16/10	09/16/10

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY