UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

Before Administrative Judges:

William J. Froehlich, Chairman Dr. Richard F. Cole Dr. Mark O. Barnett

In the Matter of

Docket No. 40-9075-MLA

POWERTECH (USA), INC.

ASLBP No. 10-898-02-MLA-BD01

(Dewey-Burdock In Situ Uranium Recovery Facility)

August 5, 2010

ORDER

(Denying Motion to Permit Untimely Filing)

On July 20, 2010, Consolidated Petitioners filed a motion with the Board requesting that they be permitted to file a letter and accompanying draft comments prepared by the South Dakota Department of Environment and Natural Resources (SD DENR) concerning the proposed Powertech project.¹ The SD DENR letter is addressed to Powertech and is dated April 19, 2010. The accompanying draft comments are 21 pages in length.

In the motion, Consolidated Petitioners state that they "do not seek to add petitioners or add or amend contentions under 2.309(f)(2)."² Rather, they assert, they "simply seek leave to file for consideration on their behalf, the DENR's latest analysis of Applicant's proposed mining and milling project application, which had not been issued and was therefore unavailable at the time [Consolidated Petitioners filed their contentions]."³ Consolidated Petitioners filed their contentions on March 8, 2010,⁴ and the SD DENR letter is dated April 19, 2010.

³ <u>Id.</u>

¹ Motion to Permit Untimely Filing of or Alternatively, Taking Judicial Notice of the SD DENR Letter to Powertech Cited at 6/8-9/10 Hearing (July 20, 2010) (Motion).

² Id. at 3.

⁴ Consolidated Request for Hearing and Petition for Leave To Intervene (March 8, 2010).

On July 30, 2010, Powertech and the NRC Staff filed answers opposing the motion.⁵

The Board denies Consolidated Petitioners' motion. Section 2.309(c), which governs the filing of untimely requests, calls for the moving party to show "[g]ood cause . . . for the failure to file on time." The Commission has held "good cause" to be the most important of the eight non-timely filing factors set out at 10 C.F.R. § 2.309(c). Consolidated Petitioners have not shown good cause for filing the motion more than three months after the SD DENR letter and comments were prepared. Further, as Consolidated Petitioners acknowledge, the Oglala Sioux Tribe appended this very letter and accompanying comments to their May 14, 2010 reply filing. Consolidated Petitioners do not set forth any reasons or demonstrate good cause for why they did not submit the SD DENR letter and comments when their reply filing was due on June 4, 2010.

Because Consolidated Petitioners have failed to demonstrate good cause, they must make a "compelling" showing on the seven remaining late-filing factors. ⁹ Consolidated Petitioners fail to do so. Most importantly, as noted above, the letter and accompanying comments that Consolidated Petitioners wish to place in the record were already filed before this Board as attachments to the Oglala Sioux Tribe's reply. ¹⁰ Accepting a duplicate copy of the letter and comments will not assist in developing a sound record. ¹¹ The Oglala Sioux Tribe's filing sufficiently represents the interests expressed in Consolidated Petitioners' motion. ¹²

In the event we determine that the SD DENR letter and comments should not be admitted as an untimely filing, Consolidated Petitioners ask that the Board take judicial notice of

⁵ Response to Consolidated Petitioners' Motion for Untimely Filing (July 30, 2010); NRC Staff's Opposition to Consolidated Petitioners' Motion to Permit Untimely Filing (July 30, 2010).

⁶ <u>See Dominion Nuclear Conn., Inc.</u> (Millstone Nuclear Power Station, Units 2 and 3), CLI-05-24, 62 NRC 551, 564 (2005).

⁷ Motion at 1.

⁸ See Tr. at 381.

⁹ See Millstone, CLI-05-24, 62 NRC at 565.

¹⁰ Reply to the NRC Staff and Applicant Responses to the Petition to Intervene and Request for Hearing of the Oglala Sioux Tribe (May 14, 2010).

¹¹ <u>See</u> 10 C.F.R. § 2.309(c)(viii).

¹² See id. § 2.309(c)(vi).

these documents.¹³ The Board denies this request as well. There is no need for the Board to take judicial notice of documents that already appear in the record of this proceeding as an attachment to another party's reply.

For the foregoing reasons, Consolidated Petitioners' motion is <u>denied</u>. It is so ORDERED.

FOR THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD¹⁴

/RA/

William J. Froehlich, Chairman ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE

Rockville, MD August 5, 2010

¹³ Motion at 16.

¹⁴ Copies of this memorandum and order were sent this date by the agency's E-Filing system to the counsel/representatives for (1) Consolidated Petitioners; (2) the Oglala Sioux Tribe; (3) the NRC Staff; and (4) Powertech USA, Inc.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

In the Matter of)	
)	
POWERTECH (USA) INC.)	Docket No. 40-9075-MLA
(Dewey-Burdock In Situ Recovery Facility)	
Source Materials License Application))	

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing Board **ORDER** (**Denying Motion to Permit Untimely Filing**), dated August 5, 2010, have been served upon the following persons by Electronic Information Exchange.

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Atomic Safety and Licensing Board (ASLB) Mail Stop T-3F23 Washington, DC 20555-0001

William J. Froehlich, Chair Administrative Judge wif1@nrc.gov

Richard F. Cole Administrative Judge richard.cole@nrc.gov

Mark O. Barnett
Administrative Judge
mark.barnett@nrc.gov

Anthony C. Eitreim, Esq., Chief Counsel ace1@nrc.gov
Megan Wright, Law Clerk
megan.wright@nrc.gov

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of Commission Appellate Adjudication
Mail Stop O-16C1
Washington, DC 20555-0001
OCAA Mail Center
ocaamail@nrc.gov

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the Secretary of the Commission
Rulemakings & Adjudications Staff
Mail Stop O-16C1
Washington, DC 20555-0001
hearingdocket@nrc.gov

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the General Counsel
Mail Stop O-15 D21
Washington, DC 20555-0001
Catherine Scott, Esq.
clm@nrc.gov
Michael Clark, Esq.
mjc1@nrc.gov
Brett Klukan, Esq.
brett.klukan@nrc.gov
Patricia Jehle, Esq.
patricia.jehle@nrc.gov

OGC Mail Center: OGCMailCenter@nrc.gov

POWERTECH (USA) INC., DEWEY-BURDOCK IN SITU RECOVERY FACILITY DOCKET NO. 40-9075-MLA

ORDER (Denying Motion to Permit Untimely Filing)

Counsel for the Applicant
Thompson & Pugsley, PLLC
1225 19th Street, NW, Suite 300
Washington, DC 20036
Christopher Pugsley, Esq.
cpugsley@athompsonlaw.com
Anthony J. Thompson, Esq.
ajthompson@athompsonlaw.com

Counsel for the Oglala Sioux Tribe Gonzales Law Firm 522 7th Street, Suite 202 Rapid City, SD 57701 Grace Dugan, Esq. dugan@wayecom.net

Counsel for the Oglala Sioux Tribe Western Mining Action Project P. O. Box 349 Lyons, CO 80540 Jeffrey C. Parsons, Esq. wmap@igc.org

Counsel for the Oglala Sioux Tribe Energy Minerals Law Center 1911 Main Avenue, Suite 238 Durango, CO 81301 Travis E. Stills, Esq. stills@frontier.net Counsel for multiple petitioners -

Organizations:

Aligning for Responsible Mining Clean Water Alliance

Individuals:

Theodore P. Ebert Gary Heckenlaible Susan Henderson Dayton Hyde Lilias Jones Jarding

David Frankel, Esq., Legal Director Aligning for Responsible Mining P.O.B. 3014 Pine Ridge, SD 57770 arm.legal@gmail.com

Law Office of Bruce Ellison P.O. Box 2508 Rapid City, SD 57709 Bruce Ellison, Esq. belli4law@aol.com Roxanne Andre, Paralegal roxanneandre@yahoo.com

Thomas J. Ballanco, Esq. Attorney for Dayton Hyde 945 Traval Street, #186 San Francisco, CA 94116 harmonicengineering1@mac.com

[Original signed by Linda D. Lewis]
Office of the Secretary of the Commission

Dated at Rockville, Maryland this <u>5th</u> day of August 2010.