

July 28, 2010

MEMORANDUM TO: Michael L. Scott, Chief
Safety Issues Resolution Branch
Division of Safety Systems
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

FROM: Joseph A. Golla, Project Manager **/RA/**
Generic Communications and Power Uprate Branch
Division of Policy and Rulemaking
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF PUBLIC MEETING WITH THE NUCLEAR ENERGY
INSTITUTE AND PRESSURIZED WATER REACTOR OWNER'S
GROUP ON JUNE 22, 2010

On June 22, 2010, Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff met with representatives of the Nuclear Energy Institute (NEI) and the Pressurized Water Reactor Owner's Group (PWROG) to discuss Generic Safety Issue – 191 (GSI-191) resolution options. Enclosure 1 provides a list of those in attendance. Enclosure 2 is the meeting agenda. Briefing slides for the presentation entitled, "GSI-191 Resolution Options," June 22, 2010, presented by NEI and utility personnel, may be viewed at NRC Agencywide Documents Access and Management System Accession No. ML101970235.

The meeting was convened with opening remarks given by Dr. Sher Bahadur, Deputy Director of the Division of Safety Systems (DSS), Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation (NRR). Following this, Mr. Michael Scott, Chief of the Safety Issues Resolution Branch, NRR/DSS, made remarks and, in particular, commented that the staff would not be in a position to give definitive feedback at the meeting regarding the viability of any of the options being presented because these matters are currently under NRC staff review and subject to Commission decision.

Mr. Maurice Dingler, representing the PWROG, then gave an update on PWROG activities. Topics included zones of influence (ZOI) and long term core cooling (LTCC). The ZOI briefing included information on background of the issue, indicating five of seven major issues identified by the NRC staff are resolved and two remain open. The two open issues are application of ANSI/ANS 58.2-1988 jet expansion model to data, and scaling data from smaller test articles to plant components. The ZOI briefing also included information on the PWROG-approved ZOI reduction project. This project will include the use of computational fluid dynamics and the conduct of additional jet impingement testing. See the briefing slides for more detail.

The portion of the briefing on LTCC indicated that the program goal is to develop limits for debris entering the core that will not challenge LTCC. Recent and current activities were also presented. See the briefing slides for more detail.

Mr. Rick Grantom of STP Nuclear Operating Company (STPNOC) presented a briefing entitled "Insights on Risk Significance of GSI-191 Sequences." The South Texas plant was used as a reference plant for the discussion. The presentation included background, risk characterization sequences needing the recirculation function, relationship to other risk contributors, and risk-informed approach for addressing GSI-191. See the briefing slides for more detail.

Mr. John Butler of NEI presented a briefing on considerations on the use of GDC-4. Discussion ensued during this briefing between Mr. Butler and Mr. Scott and Mr. Taylor of the NRC regarding the application of GDC-4 to GSI-191 evaluations. Mr. Taylor asked Mr. Butler why the NRC should change its stance regarding this issue, since the NRC staff had rejected earlier attempts to apply GDC-4 for this purpose. Mr. Butler stated that it is appropriate to bring into play risk perspectives to show that remaining uncertainty is negligible. Mr. Scott stated that the staff does not agree that all that remains are minor issues but also stated that the staff is reconsidering its previous rejection of applying GDC-4. Mr. Butler stated that risk insights are in fact taken into account currently in licensing processes and that there is no reason to exclude its use in the case of GSI-191 sump strainer evaluations, i.e., that it, "fits well with established staff practice." Mr. Scott emphasized that implementation of GDC-4 would not necessarily address all sump performance issues, since smaller breaks likely outside the scope of GDC-4 are limiting for some plants (or could become limiting if larger breaks were removed from consideration).

Mr. Wayne Harrison of STPNOC presented a briefing on considerations on the use of 10 CFR 50.46a (i.e., loss of coolant accidents (LOCAs) at or below the transition break size (TBS) are design-basis accidents, LOCAs involving breaks larger than the TBS are beyond-design-basis accidents). Mr. Butler presented considerations on the use of the 50.46 "alternate evaluation" (i.e., redefinition of the design-basis LOCA break size with a more realistic evaluation of break sizes larger than the redefined break size). Mr. Tim Bowman of STPNOC presented a briefing entitled, "Plant Impacts of Closure Options." See the briefing slides for details on these presentations. There were no questions or comments from members of the public, and the meeting was adjourned.

Enclosure 1: List of Attendees

Enclosure 2: Meeting agenda

Mr. John Butler of NEI presented a briefing on considerations on the use of GDC-4. Discussion ensued during this briefing between Mr. Butler and Mr. Scott and Mr. Taylor of the NRC regarding the application of GDC-4 to GSI-191 evaluations. Mr. Taylor asked Mr. Butler why the NRC should change its stance regarding this issue, since the NRC staff had rejected earlier attempts to apply GDC-4 for this purpose. Mr. Butler stated that it is appropriate to bring into play risk perspectives to show that remaining uncertainty is negligible. Mr. Scott stated that the staff does not agree that all that remains are minor issues but also stated that the staff is reconsidering its previous rejection of applying GDC-4. Mr. Butler stated that risk insights are in fact taken into account currently in licensing processes and that there is no reason to exclude its use in the case of GSI-191 sump strainer evaluations, i.e., that it, "fits well with established staff practice." Mr. Scott emphasized that implementation of GDC-4 would not necessarily address all sump performance issues, since smaller breaks likely outside the scope of GDC-4 are limiting for some plants (or could become limiting if larger breaks were removed from consideration).

Mr. Wayne Harrison of STPNOC presented a briefing on considerations on the use of 10 CFR 50.46a (i.e., loss of coolant accidents (LOCAs) at or below the transition break size (TBS) are design-basis accidents, LOCAs involving breaks larger than the TBS are beyond-design-basis accidents). Mr. Butler presented considerations on the use of the 50.46 "alternate evaluation" (i.e., redefinition of the design-basis LOCA break size with a more realistic evaluation of break sizes larger than the redefined break size). Mr. Tim Bowman of STPNOC presented a briefing entitled, "Plant Impacts of Closure Options." See the briefing slides for details on these presentations. There were no questions or comments from members of the public, and the meeting was adjourned.

Enclosure 1: List of Attendees

Enclosure 2: Meeting agenda

DISTRIBUTION: See next page

ADAMS ACCESSION NUMBER: ML101970232

OFFICE	LA:DPR:PLPB	PM:DPR:PLPB	BC:DCI:CSGB	BC:DSS:SSIB
NAME	EHylton EGH	JGolla JAG	RTaylor RMT	MScott
DATE	7/21/2010	7/21/2010	7/22/2010	7/28/10

**List of Attendees for June 22, 2010,
Meeting With NEI and PWROG**

Mo Dinger	WCNOC/PWROG
Melvin Arey	Duke Energy/PWROG
John Butler	NEI
Tony Nowinowski	Westinghouse/PWROG
Alex Marion	NEI
Tim Croyle	Westinghouse
Biff Bradley	NEI
Glen Thomas	AREVA
Charles Bowman	STPNOC
Rick Grantom	STPNOC
Wayne Harrison	STPNOC
Brian Dunn	FPL
Ken Petersen	STARS
Rob Taylor	NRC
Bruce Lin	NRC
Erv Geiger	NRC
John Tsao	NRC
Paul Klein	NRC
Matt Yoder	NRC
Mike Scott	NRC
Joe Golla	NRC
Chris Hott	NRC
John Lehning	NRC
Steve Smith	NRC
Steve Dinsmore	NRC
Emma Wong	NRC
Nancy Chapman*	Bechtel
Bill Schulz*	STPNOC
Tony Zimmerman*	Progress Energy
Wes McGoun*	Progress Energy
Kip Walker*	Enercon
Lee Sera*	Indian Point
Roger Waters*	Indian Point
Kirk Troxler*	Beaver Valley
Megan Stachowiak*	Alion
Hiroshi Matsuoka*	Mitsubishi
Ed Kimoto*	So. Calif. Edison
Susan Baier*	Westinghouse
Matt Brandes*	Callaway

* Indicates participated via telecom

Enclosure 1

MEETING AGENDA
U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION (NRC)
MEETING WITH THE NUCLEAR ENERGY INSTITUTE (NEI) AND
PRESSURIZED WATER REACTOR OWNER'S GROUP (PWROG)

June 22, 2010

8:30-8:45	Introduction and meeting purpose	NRC/NEI
8:45-10:15	Considerations on the use of various options For resolution of GSI-191	NEI/PWROG
10:15-10:30	Break	
10:30-11:00	Update on PWROG activities	PWROG
11:00-11:45	Discussion	NEI/PWROG/ NRC
11:45-12:00	Opportunity for public comment	Public/NRC

Enclosure 2

Memorandum to Michael Scott from Joe Golla

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF PUBLIC MEETING ON JUNE 22, 2010, WITH NEI AND PWROG
TO DISCUSS RESOLUTION OPTIONS FOR GSI-191

DISTRIBUTION:

E-Mail:

RidsNrrOd
RidsNrrAdro
RidsNrrAdes
RidsNrrDss
RidsNrrDci
RidsNrrDpr
RidsNrrDprPgcb
RidsEdoMailCenter
RidsAcrcAcnwMailCenter
RidsOgcMailCenter

Michael Scott
John Lehning
Steve Smith
Paul Klein
Matthew Yoder
Stephen Dinsmore
Christopher Hott
John Jolicoeur
Joe Golla
Sher Bahadur
Robert Taylor