

### UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

March 30, 2010

Administrative Judge Lawrence G. McDade, Chair Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001

Administrative Judge Dr. Kaye D. Lathrop 190 Cedar Lane East Ridgeway, CO 81432 Administrative Judge
Dr. Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001

In the Matter of ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC. (Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station Units 2 and 3)

<u>Docket Nos. 50-247-LR and 50-286-LR</u>

### Dear Administrative Judges:

Pursuant to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board's December 18, 2008, "Memorandum and Order (Addressing Requests that the Proceeding be Conducted Pursuant to Subpart G)," slip op. at 13, and the Licensing Board's "Order (Granting Consent Motion Regarding Mandatory Disclosures)," dated January 30, 2009, at 1, the staff of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission ("Staff") herein notifies the Licensing Board and the parties that the hearing file has been supplemented for this proceeding. Materials in the hearing file may be accessed through the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System ("ADAMS"). The Staff herein notifies the Licensing Board and the parties that the Staff has not identified any new documents or materials requiring disclosure other than the documents withheld under the deliberative process privilege since the Staff's last update to the hearing file on February 26, 2010, for this proceeding.

As required by 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5), the Staff is producing an updated privilege log, identifying documents withheld under the deliberative process privilege, which are appended hereto as Attachment 1. Also, attached is the Declaration of Brian E. Holian formally invoking the deliberative process privilege with respect to each of the documents in Attachment 1. The Staff will preserve and maintain the privileged documents identified in these logs during the pendency of this proceeding.

Further, pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(c), attached is the Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, certifying that all relevant materials required by this section have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete as to documents identified by March 23, 2010.

Finally, the NRC Staff notes that it has made a good faith effort to identify and characterize all documents meeting the criteria of 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b) and 10 C.F.R. § 2.1203 in this proceeding. In identifying these documents, the Staff does not concede their relevance to the license renewal issues to be decided in this proceeding.

Sincerely,

Brian G. Harris

Counsel for NRC Staff

Enclosures: Attachment 1 - Deliberative Process Privilege Log

Declaration of Brian E. Holian Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg

cc w/Encls.: Service List

# Attachment 1 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 14 - March 30, 2010

Certain documents otherwise subject to inclusion in the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for this proceeding have been determined by the NRC Staff to contain information subject to withholding from public disclosures as predecisional, deliberative information. Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5), the Staff is providing this log to identify the following documents, withheld under the "deliberative process" privilege.

	Accession	Author Name/	Document	Document			Page
ID#	Number	Affiliation	Date	Туре	Title	Comment	Count
					2010/02/23 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE:	Transmission of	
					Entergy Releases Reports on Feasibility of	Internal	
DPP-14-		A. Stuyvenberg			Cooling Towers and Alternative Technologies for	Discussion	
001	ML100541538	NRC/NRR	2/23/2010	E-Mail	Indian Point Energy Center	Regarding SEIS	;
						Transmission of	
					2010/03/01 Indian Point LR Hearing - EFH	Internal	
DPP-14-		D. Logan			Assessment for Indian Point with Entergy's	Discussion	
002	ML100600741	NRC/NRR	3/1/2010	E-Mail	revised impingement data	Regarding SEIS	2
						Transmission of	
						Internal	
DPP-14-		R. Palla			2010/03/18 Indian Point LR Hearing - Indian	Discussion	
003	ML100770511	NRC/NRR	3/18/2010	E-Mail	Point MACCS2 Calculation Matrix	Regarding SEIS	:

## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

#### BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.	) ) )	Docket Nos. 50-247 & 50-286-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3)	)	

### **DECLARATION OF BRIAN E. HOLIAN**

- I, Brian E. Holian, do hereby state as follows:
- 1. I am employed as the Director of the Division of License Renewal ("DLR") in the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's ("NRC") Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation ("NRR"). My supervisory responsibilities include oversight of the NRC Staff's review and evaluation of the Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station Units 2 and 3 license renewal application.
- 2. As part of their responsibilities in updating the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for these proceedings, NRC staff members under my supervision identified certain documents as privileged because they contained information concerning the Staff's predecisional deliberative process. Those documents are listed in Attachment 1 to the submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 14.
- 3. I have personally reviewed the documents identified as privileged in Attachment 1, and have determined, in accordance with the guidance set forth in Management Directive 3.4, that they contain pre-decisional information concerning the Staff's review of the license renewal application. All documents contain either Staff's analyses, recommendations, opinions, or evaluations, and may not necessarily reflect the final agency position with respect to the

matters discussed therein. Each of the documents comprises part of the deliberative process necessary for the Staff's review of the pending license renewal application.

- 4. Further, I have determined that disclosure of these documents could result in harm to the agency, in that it would (a) prematurely disclose the preliminary views of individual Staff members and/or the Staff prior to reaching a final agency decision, and could thus create confusion as to the actual policy or views of the NRC Staff; (b) hinder the efficiency of the Staff, in that forced disclosure of its internal discussions on an unresolved issue would tend to chill all future deliberations and would interfere with the Staff's ability to engage in a free exchange of opinions and analyses prior to publishing its final review documents; and (c) imply or suggest incorrectly that the opinions of the Staff members involved in these communications are actually the final decisions of the agency, while no such final decision has yet been made.
- 5. Accordingly, I formally invoke the deliberative process privilege with respect to each of the documents listed in Attachment 1 to the submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 14.
- 6. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Brian F Holian

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 30<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2010

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

### BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.	) Docket Nos. 50-247 & 50-286	-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generation Station, Units 2 and 3)	) ) )	

# AFFIDAVIT OF ANDREW L. STUYVENBERG CONCERNING MANDATORY DISCLOSURE REQUIREMENT OF 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)

- I, Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, do hereby state as follows:
- 1. I am employed as a Project Manager in the Division of License Renewal in the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's ("NRC") Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation. I serve as a project manager for the Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station, Units 2 and 3 license renewal application ("LRA"). Among other things, I am managing the preparation of the hearing file and mandatory disclosures in connection with the LRA at issue in this proceeding.
- 2. I hereby certify that all relevant materials required to be disclosed pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336 (b) and (c) in the captioned proceeding have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete for documents identified as of March 23, 2010.
- 3. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Andrew L. Stuyvenberg

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 30<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2010

## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

#### BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, IN	C. )	Docket Nos. 50-247/286-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3)	)	

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing Letter to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board regarding the Indian Point Hearing File, including: Attachment 1 – Deliberative Process Privilege Log, Declaration of Brian E. Holian, dated March 30, 2010, and Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, dated March 30, 2010, have been served upon the following through deposit in the NRC's internal mail system, with copies by electronic mail, or, as indicated by an asterisk, by deposit in the U.S. Postal Service, with copies by electronic mail this 30<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2010:

Lawrence G. McDade, Chair Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop - T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555-0001 E-mail: Lawrence.McDade@nrc.gov

Dr. Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop - T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-mail: Richard.Wardwell@nrc.gov

Dr. Kaye D. Lathrop\*
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
190 Cedar Lane E.
Ridgway, CO 81432
E-mail: Kaye.Lathrop@nrc.gov

Office of Commission Appellate
Adjudication
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Mail Stop: O-16G4
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: OCAAMAIL.resource@nrc.gov

Office of the Secretary
Attn: Rulemaking and Adjudications Staff
Mail Stop: O-16G4
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: Hearing.Docket@nrc.gov

Zachary S. Kahn
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop – T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: Zachary.Kahn@nrc.gov

Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Mail Stop: T-3 F23 Washington, DC 20555-0001 (Via Internal Mail Only)

Kathryn M. Sutton, Esq.\*
Paul M. Bessette, Esq.
Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, D.C. 20004
E-mail: ksutton@morganlewis.com
E-mail: pbessette@morganlewis.com

Michael J. Delaney, Esq.\*
Vice President – Energy Department
New York City Economic Development
Corporation (NYCDEC)
110 William Street
New York, NY 10038
E-mail: mdelaney@nycedc.com

Justin D. Pruyne, Esq.\*
Assistant County Attorney
Office of the Westchester County Attorney
148 Martine Avenue, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor
White Plains, NY 10601
E-mail: jdp3@westchestergov.com

Daniel E. O'Neill, Mayor\*
Jarnes Seirmarco, M.S.
Village of Buchanan
Municipal Building
Buchanan, NY 10511-1298
E-mail: vob@bestweb.net

Josh Kirstein, Esq.
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop - T -3 F23
U. S, Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-Mail: Josh.Kirstein@nrc.gov

Manna Jo Greene\*
Hudson River Sloop Clearwater, Inc.
112 Little Market Street
Poughkeepsie, NY 12601
E-mail: mannajo@clearwater.org

William C. Dennis, Esq.\*
Assistant General Counsel
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.
440 Hamilton Avenue
White Plains, NY 10601
E-mail: wdennis@entergy.com

Mylan L. Denerstein, Esq.\*
Janice A. Dean, Esq.
Executive Deputy Attorney General,
Social Justice
Office of the Attorney General
of the State of New York
120 Broadway, 25<sup>th</sup> Floor
New York, NY 10271
E-mail: mylan.denerstein@oag.state.ny.us
janice.dean@oag.state.ny.us

Martin J. O'Neill, Esq.\*
Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 4000
Houston, TX 77002
E-mail: martin.o'neill@morganlewis.com

Robert Snook, Esq.\*
Office of the Attorney General
State of Connecticut
55 Elm Street
P.O. Box 120
Hartford, CN 06141-0120
E-mail: robert.snook@po.state.ct.us

Phillip Musegaas, Esq.\*
Deborah Brancato, Esq.
Riverkeeper, Inc.
828 South Broadway
Tarrytown, NY 10591
E-mail: phillip@riverkeeper.org
dbrancato@riverkeeper.org

Elise N. Zoli, Esq.\*
Goodwin Procter, LLP
Exchange Place
53 State Street
Boston, MA 02109
E-mail: ezoli@goodwinprocter.com

Ross H. Gould, Esq.\*
10 Park Ave, #5L
New York, NY 10016
E-mail: rgouldesq@gmail.com

John J. Sipos, Esq.\*
Charlie Donaldson, Esq.
Assistants Attorney General
New York State Department of Law
Environmental Protection Bureau
The Capitol
Albany, NY 12224
E-mail: john.sipos@oag.state.ny.us

Daniel Riesel, Esq.\*
Thomas F. Wood, Esq.
Ms. Jessica Steinberg, J.D.
Sive, Paget & Riesel, P.C.
460 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10022
E-mail: driesel@sprlaw.com

Joan Leary Matthews, Esq.\*
Senior Attorney for Special Projects
New York State Department of
Environmental Conservation
Office of the General Counsel
625 Broadway, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor
Albany, NY 12233-1500
E-mail: jlmatthe@gw.dec.state.ny.us

isteinberg@sprlaw.com

John Louis Parker, Esq.\*
Office of General Counsel, Region 3
New York State Department of
Environmental Conservation
21 South Putt Corners Road
New Paltz, NY 12561-1620
E-mail: jlparker@gw.dec.state.ny.us

Brian G. Harris

Counsel for NRC Staff