

#### UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

January 29, 2010

Administrative Judge Lawrence G. McDade, Chair Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001 Administrative Judge Dr. Richard E. Wardwell Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001

Administrative Judge Dr. Kaye D. Lathrop 190 Cedar Lane East Ridgeway, CO 81432

> In the Matter of ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC. (Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station Units 2 and 3) Docket Nos. 50-247-LR and 50-286-LR

Dear Administrative Judges:

Pursuant to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board's December 18, 2008, "Memorandum and Order (Addressing Requests that the Proceeding be Conducted Pursuant to Subpart G)," slip op. at 13, and the Licensing Board's "Order (Granting Consent Motion Regarding Mandatory Disclosures)," dated January 30, 2009, at 1, the staff of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission ("Staff") herein notifies the Licensing Board and the parties that the hearing file has been supplemented for this proceeding. Materials in the hearing file may be accessed through the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System ("ADAMS"). An index containing the ADAMS accession number, date, and title or description of each item in Hearing File Index, Supplement 12 is appended hereto as Attachment 1.

On or about February 5, 2010, the newly identified documents in the hearing file will be made available via the Electronic Hearing Docket ("EHD"), which may be accessed at the following URL: <u>http://ehd.nrc.gov/EHD\_Proceeding/home.asp</u>. The hearing file will be contained in a sub-folder entitled, "Indian PT Hearing File, Supplement 12" in the "Indian\_PT\_2&3\_50-247&50-286-LR" folder of the EHD.

In addition, as required by 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5), the Staff is producing an updated privilege log, identifying documents withheld under the deliberative process privilege, which are appended hereto as Attachment 2. Also, attached is the Declaration of Brian E. Holian formally invoking the deliberative process privilege with respect to each of the documents in

Judge McDade Judge Lathrop Judge Wardwell

Attachment 2. The Staff will preserve and maintain the privileged documents identified in these logs during the pendency of this proceeding.

Further, pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(c), attached is the Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, certifying that all relevant materials required by this section have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete as to documents identified by January 22, 2010.

Finally, the NRC Staff notes that it has made a good faith effort to identify and characterize all documents meeting the criteria of 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b) and 10 C.F.R. § 2.1203 in this proceeding. In identifying these documents, the Staff does not concede their relevance to the license renewal issues to be decided in this proceeding.

Sincerely.

Brian G. Harris Counsel for NRC Staff

- Enclosures: Attachment 1 Hearing File Index, Supplement 12 Attachment 2 - Deliberative Process Privilege Log Declaration of Brian E. Holian Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg
- cc w/Encls.: Service List

|        | Accession   |               |  |
|--------|-------------|---------------|--|
| ID #   | Number      | Document Date | Title  |
| 12-001 | ML093620022 | 12/28/2009    | 2009/12/28 Indian Point LR Hearing - Telecon re Recent RAI Response                            |
| 12-002 | ML093620374 | 12/28/2009    | 2009/12/28 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Telecon re Recent RAI Response                        |
| 12-003 | ML093620438 | 12/28/2009    | 2009/12/28 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Telecon re Recent RAI Response                        |
| 12-004 | ML093641149 | 12/30/2009    | 2009/12/30 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Joint Application for CWA; Indian Point Units 2 and 3 |
| 12-005 | ML093650243 | 12/31/2009    | 2009/12/31 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: IPEC SAMA Letter                                      |
| 12-006 | ML100040199 | 1/4/2010      | 2010/01/04 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: IPEC SAMA Letter                                      |
| 12-007 | ML100050741 | 1/5/2010      | 2010/01/05 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW: Conference Details (JAN 07, 201009:00 AM ET)          |
| 12-008 | ML100081221 | 1/8/2010      | 2010/01/08 Indian Point LR Hearing - Week of Jan. 25th tentatively looks good                  |
| 12-009 | ML100130180 | 1/13/2010     | 2010/01/13 Indian Point LR Hearing - Site Visit  |
| 12-010 | ML100190222 | 1/14/2010     | 2010/01/14 Indian Point LR Hearing - Emailing: NL-10-013.pdf                                   |
| 12-011 | ML100190223 | 1/19/2010     | 2010/01/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Emailing: NL-10-013.pdf                               |
| 12-012 | ML100192092 | 1/19/2010     | 2010/01/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - site visit  |
| 12-013 | ML100200378 | 1/20/2010     | 2010/01/20 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Access Forms  |
| 12-014 | ML100211165 | 1/21/2010     | 2010/01/21 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Impingement Date                                      |

Attachment 2 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 12 - January 29, 2010

Certain documents otherwise subject to inclusion in the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for this proceeding have been determined by the NRC Staff to contain information subject to withholding from public disclosures as predecisional, deliberative information. Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5), the Staff is providing this log to identify the following documents, withheld under the "deliberative process" privilege.

|         | Accession   | Author Name/              | Document   | Document |   |                     | Page  |
|---------|-------------|---------------------------|------------|----------|---|---------------------|-------|
| ID #    | Number      | Affiliation               | Date       | Туре     | Title   | Comment             | Count |
| DPP-12- |             | R. Palla                  |            |          | 2009/12/22 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW:        | Internal discussion |       |
| 001     | ML093561145 | NRC/NRR                   | 12/22/2009 | E-Mail   | Output Files                                    | regarding SAMA      |       |
|         |             |                           |            |          | 2009/12/30 Indian Point LR Hearing - DRAFT -    | Internal            | -     |
| DPP-12- |             | S. Klementowicz           |            |          | License Renewal - Indian Point comment          | transmission of     |       |
| 002     | ML093640949 | NRC/NRR                   | 12/30/2009 | E-Mail   | resolution                                      | draft FSEIS         | 28    |
| DPP-12- |             | R. Palla                  |            |          | 2010/01/04 Indian Point LR Hearing - Followup   | Internal discussion |       |
| 003     | ML100040198 | NRC/NRR                   | 1/4/2010   | F-Mail   | Question re: SAMA ReAnalysis                    | regarding SAMA      |       |
|         |             |                           |            |          | 2010/01/14 Indian Point LR Hearing - Draft      | Internal            | ``    |
| DPP-12- |             | R. Palla                  |            |          | FSEIS Insert Discussing Impact of IP            | transmission of     |       |
| 004     | ML100141724 | NRC/NRR                   | 1/14/2010  | E-Mail   | Contentions on SAMA                             | draft FSEIS         |       |
|         |             |                           |            |          | 2010/01/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW: Draft  | Internal            |       |
| DPP-12- |             | R. Palla                  |            |          | FSEIS Insert Discussing Impact of IP            | transmission of     |       |
| 005     | ML100190008 | NRC/NRR                   | 1/19/2010  | E-Mail   | Contentions on SAMA                             | draft FSEIS         | 1(    |
| DPP-12- |             | R. Palla                  |            |          | 2010/01/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW: Letter | Internal discussion |       |
| 006     | ML100190227 | NRC/NRR                   | 1/19/2010  | E-Mail   | of Technical Direction Re IP Site Visit         | regarding SAMA      |       |
| DPP-12- |             | A Stuniophore             |            |          | 2010/01/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Letter | Internal discussion |       |
| 007     | ML100190226 | A. Stuyvenberg<br>NRC/NRR | 1/19/2010  | F-Mail   | of Technical Direction Re IP Site Visit         | regarding SAMA      |       |
|         |             |                           |            |          |   | Internal            |       |
| DPP-12- |             | A. Stuyvenberg            |            |          | 2010/01/20 Indian Point LR Hearing - App. G     | transmission of     |       |
| 008     | ML100201194 | NRC/NRR                   | 1/20/2010  | E-Mail   | changes   | draft FSEIS         | 33    |
|         |             |                           |            |          |   | Internal            |       |
| DPP-12- |             | A. Stuyvenberg            |            |          | 2010/01/20 Indian Point LR Hearing - changes to | transmission of     |       |
| 009     | ML100201192 | NRC/NRR                   | 1/20/2010  | E-Mail   | chapter 5                                       | draft FSEIS         | 10    |
|         |             |                           |            |          |   | Internal            |       |
| DPP-12- |             | A. Stuyvenberg            |            |          | 2010/01/20 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW:        | transmission of     |       |
| 010     | ML100201193 | NRC/NRR                   | 1/20/2010  | E-Mail   | Inserts to IP SEIS Chapter 5 and Appendix G     | draft FSEIS         | 14    |

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

## BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

)

)

In the Matter of ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.

Docket Nos. 50-247 & 50-286-LR

(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3)

# **DECLARATION OF BRIAN E. HOLIAN**

I, Brian E. Holian, do hereby state as follows:

I am employed as the Director of the Division of License Renewal ("DLR") in the
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's ("NRC") Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation ("NRR").
My supervisory responsibilities include oversight of the NRC Staff's review and evaluation of the
Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station Units 2 and 3 license renewal application.

2. As part of their responsibilities in updating the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for these proceedings, NRC staff members under my supervision identified certain documents as privileged because they contained information concerning the Staff's predecisional deliberative process. Those documents are listed in Attachment 2 to the submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 12.

3. I have personally reviewed the documents identified as privileged in Attachment 2, and have determined, in accordance with the guidance set forth in Management Directive 3.4, that they contain pre-decisional information concerning the Staff's review of the license renewal application. All documents contain either Staff's analyses, recommendations, opinions, or evaluations, and may not necessarily reflect the final agency position with respect to the matters discussed therein. Each of the documents comprises part of the deliberative process necessary for the Staff's review of the pending license renewal application.

4. Further, I have determined that disclosure of these documents could result in harm to the agency, in that it would (a) prematurely disclose the preliminary views of individual Staff members and/or the Staff prior to reaching a final agency decision, and could thus create confusion as to the actual policy or views of the NRC Staff; (b) hinder the efficiency of the Staff, in that forced disclosure of its internal discussions on an unresolved issue would tend to chill all future deliberations and would interfere with the Staff's ability to engage in a free exchange of opinions and analyses prior to publishing its final review documents; and (c) imply or suggest incorrectly that the opinions of the Staff members involved in these communications are actually the final decisions of the agency, while no such final decision has yet been made.

5. Accordingly, I formally invoke the deliberative process privilege with respect to each of the documents listed in Attachment 2 to the submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 12.

6. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

REI

Brian E. Holian

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 29<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2010

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

## BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

) )

)

In the Matter of ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.

Docket Nos. 50-247 & 50-286-LR

(Indian Point Nuclear Generation Station, Units 2 and 3)

#### AFFIDAVIT OF ANDREW L. STUYVENBERG CONCERNING MANDATORY DISCLOSURE REQUIREMENT OF 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)

I, Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, do hereby state as follows:

1. I am employed as a Project Manager in the Division of License Renewal in the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's ("NRC") Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation. I serve as a project manager for the Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station, Units 2 and 3 license renewal application ("LRA"). Among other things, I am managing the preparation of the hearing file and mandatory disclosures in connection with the LRA at issue in this proceeding.

2. I hereby certify that all relevant materials required to be disclosed pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336 (b) and (c) in the captioned proceeding have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete for documents identified as of January 22, 2010.

3. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Andrew L. Stuyvenberg

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 29<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2009

## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

# BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of

ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC. )

(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3) Docket Nos. 50-247/286-LR

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing Letter to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board regarding the Indian Point Hearing File, including: Attachment 1 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Supplement 12, Attachment 2 – Deliberative Process Privilege Log, Declaration of Brian E. Holian, dated January 29, 2010, and Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, dated January 29, 2010, have been served upon the following through deposit in the NRC's internal mail system, with copies by electronic mail, or, as indicated by an asterisk, by deposit in the U.S. Postal Service, with copies by electronic mail this 29<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2010:

Lawrence G. McDade, Chair Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop - T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555-0001 E-mail: Lawrence.McDade@nrc.gov

Dr. Richard E. Wardwell Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop - T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555-0001 E-mail: <u>Richard.Wardwell@nrc.gov</u>

Dr. Kaye D. Lathrop\* Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel 190 Cedar Lane E. Ridgway, CO 81432 E-mail: <u>Kaye.Lathrop@nrc.gov</u> Office of Commission Appellate Adjudication U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Mail Stop: O-16G4 Washington, DC 20555-0001 E-mail: <u>OCAAMAIL.resource@nrc.gov</u>

Office of the Secretary Attn: Rulemaking and Adjudications Staff Mail Stop: O-16G4 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001 E-mail: <u>Hearing.Docket@nrc.gov</u>

Zachary S. Kahn Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop – T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001 E-mail: <u>Zachary.Kahn@nrc.gov</u> Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Mail Stop: T-3 F23 Washington, DC 20555-0001 (Via Internal Mail Only)

Kathryn M. Sutton, Esq.\* Paul M. Bessette, Esq. Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP 1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, D.C. 20004 E-mail: <u>ksutton@morganlewis.com</u> E-mail: <u>pbessette@morganlewis.com</u>

Michael J. Delaney, Esq.\* Vice President – Energy Department New York City Economic Development Corporation (NYCDEC) 110 William Street New York, NY 10038 E-mail: <u>mdelaney@nycedc.com</u>

Justin D. Pruyne, Esq.\* Assistant County Attorney Office of the Westchester County Attorney 148 Martine Avenue, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor White Plains, NY 10601 E-mail: jdp3@westchestergov.com

Daniel E. O'Neill, Mayor\* James Seirmarco, M.S. Village of Buchanan Municipal Building Buchanan, NY 10511-1298 E-mail: <u>vob@bestweb.net</u> Josh Kirstein, Esq. Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop - T -3 F23 U. S, Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555-0001 E-Mail: Josh.Kirstein@nrc.gov

Manna Jo Greene\* Hudson River Sloop Clearwater, Inc. 112 Little Market Street Poughkeepsie, NY 12601 E-mail: <u>mannajo@clearwater.org</u>

William C. Dennis, Esq.\* Assistant General Counsel Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc. 440 Hamilton Avenue White Plains, NY 10601 E-mail: wdennis@entergy.com

Mylan L. Denerstein, Esq.\* Janice A. Dean, Esq. Executive Deputy Attorney General, Social Justice Office of the Attorney General of the State of New York 120 Broadway, 25<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10271 E-mail: <u>mylan.denerstein@oag.state.ny.us</u> janice.dean@oag.state.ny.us

Martin J. O'Neill, Esq.\* Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP 1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 4000 Houston, TX 77002 E-mail: <u>martin.o'neill@morganlewis.com</u> Robert Snook, Esq.\* Office of the Attorney General State of Connecticut 55 Elm Street P.O. Box 120 Hartford, CN 06141-0120 E-mail: robert.snook@po.state.ct.us

Phillip Musegaas, Esq.\* Deborah Brancato, Esq. Riverkeeper, Inc. 828 South Broadway Tarrytown, NY 10591 E-mail: <u>phillip@riverkeeper.org</u> <u>dbrancato@riverkeeper.org</u>

Elise N. Zoli, Esq.\* Goodwin Procter, LLP Exchange Place 53 State Street Boston, MA 02109 E-mail: <u>ezoli@goodwinprocter.com</u>

Ross H. Gould, Esq.\* 10 Park Ave, #5L New York, NY 10016 E-mail: <u>rgouldesg@gmail.com</u> John J. Sipos, Esq.\* Charlie Donaldson, Esq. Assistants Attorney General New York State Department of Law Environmental Protection Bureau The Capitol Albany, NY 12224 E-mail: john.sipos@oag.state.ny.us

Daniel Riesel, Esq.\* Thomas F. Wood, Esq. Ms. Jessica Steinberg, J.D. Sive, Paget & Riesel, P.C. 460 Park Avenue New York, NY 10022 E-mail: <u>driesel@sprlaw.com</u> <u>isteinberg@sprlaw.com</u>

Joan Leary Matthews, Esq.\* Senior Attorney for Special Projects New York State Department of Environmental Conservation Office of the General Counsel 625 Broadway, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor Albany, NY 12233-1500 E-mail: jlmatthe@gw.dec.state.ny.us

John Louis Parker, Esq.\* Office of General Counsel, Region 3 New York State Department of Environmental Conservation 21 South Putt Corners Road New Paltz, NY 12561-1620 E-mail: jlparker@gw.dec.state.ny.us

Brian G. Harris Counsel for NRC Staff