

September 11, 2009

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARDS

In the Matter of)	
)	Docket No. 63-001-HLW
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY)	
)	ASLBP Nos. 09-876-HLW-CAB01
(High-Level Waste Repository))	09-877-HLW-CAB02
)	09-878-HLW-CAB03
)	09-892-HLW-CAB04

NRC STAFF ANSWER TO THE
STATE OF NEVADA'S MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE
NEW CONTENTION AND PROPOSED CONTENTION NEVADA SAFETY 206

INTRODUCTION

Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.309(h)(1) and the “[Construction Authorization Board] Case Management Order #1,” dated January 29, 2009 (CMO # 1) (unpublished) at 4, the staff of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (Staff) hereby files its answer to the “State of Nevada’s Motion for Leave to File New Contention Based on Newly Available Information” (Motion), and proposed contention NEV-SAFETY-206 (attached to the Motion as Exhibit A), filed August 24, 2009. For the reasons set forth below, the Staff does not oppose Nevada’s motion for leave to file proposed contention NEV-SAFETY-206, and does not object to the admission of the proposed contention.

BACKGROUND

On June 3, 2008, the Department of Energy (DOE) submitted the Yucca Mountain Repository License Application to the NRC, seeking authorization to construct a geologic repository at Yucca Mountain, Nevada, in accordance with the provisions of 10 C.F.R. Part 63. See Yucca Mountain; Notice of Receipt and Availability of Application, 73 Fed. Reg. 34,348 (June 17, 2008); Yucca Mountain; Notice of Receipt and Availability of Application; Correction,

73 Fed. Reg. 40,883 (July 16, 2008). After the Staff docketed the License Application,¹ the Commission issued a “Notice of Hearing and Opportunity to Petition for Leave to Intervene,” *U.S. Dept’ of Energy* (High-Level Waste Repository), CLI-08-25, 68 NRC 497 (2008). The Notice of Hearing was subsequently published in the *Federal Register* on October 22, 2008.² In response to the Notice of Hearing, Nevada filed a timely intervention petition, and is one of the parties admitted to this proceeding.³

Three Construction Authorization Boards (CABs or Boards) were established to preside over the petitions to intervene and requests to participate in this licensing proceeding. U.S. Department of Energy; Establishment of Atomic Safety Licensing Boards, 74 Fed. Reg. 4477 (Jan. 26, 2009). On June 19, 2009, the Chief Administrative Judge established Construction Authorization Board 04 to, among other things, preside over matters concerning new or amended contentions. See Establishment of Atomic Safety and Licensing Board; Department of Energy, 74 Fed. Reg. 30,644 (June 26, 2009).

On August 24, 2009, Nevada filed the instant motion and proposed contention. NEV-SAFETY-206 alleges that DOE’s Alloy-22 corrosion modeling is inadequate because it relies upon flawed experimental data. See NEV-SAFETY-206 at 1.

¹ Department of Energy; Notice of Acceptance for Docketing of a License Application for Authority to Construct a Geologic Repository at a Geologic Repository Operations Area at Yucca Mountain, 73 Fed. Reg. 53,284 (Sept. 15, 2008).

² In the Matter of U.S. Department of Energy (High-Level Waste Repository); Notice of Hearing and Opportunity To Petition for Leave to Intervene on an Application for Authority To Construct a Geologic Repository at a Geologic Repository Operations Area at Yucca Mountain, 73 Fed. Reg. 63,029 (Oct. 22, 2008).

³ See *U.S. Dep’t of Energy*, LBP-09-06, 69 NRC ___, slip op. (May 11, 2009); see also *U.S. Dep’t of Energy*, CLI-09-14, 69 NRC ___, slip op. (June 30, 2009).

DISCUSSION

A. Legal Standards Governing New or Amended Contentions

Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.309(f)(2) and CMO #1, new or amended contentions are considered timely if they are based upon new and materially different information than was previously available, and filed within 30 days of when that information became available. See 10 C.F.R. § 2.309(f)(2)(i)-(iii); see also CMO #1 at 3-4. The Staff has previously addressed contention admissibility requirements generally, and will not repeat them here. See “NRC Staff Answer to Intervention Petitions,” dated February 9, 2009, at 34-39.

B. Proposed Contention NEV-SAFETY-206

NEV-SAFETY-206 – INADEQUATE DOE WEIGHT-LOSS MEASUREMENT FOR GENERAL-CORROSION TESTING OF ALLOY-22

SAR Subsection 2.3.6.2.2, 2.3.6.3 and similar subsections, which deal with waste package degradation and general corrosion testing of Alloy-22, inadequately address generalized corrosion because they rely on flawed experimental data.

NEV-SAFETY-206 at 1. Nevada’s new contention references two recent DOE condition reports. The reports describe deposits found on Alloy-22 coupons that were corrosion-tested for 5 years (Licensing Support Network (LSN) Accession No. DEN001614731), and a waxy substance found on coupons that were corrosion-tested for 9.5 years (LSN Accession No. DEN001614752). Nevada asserts that these findings invalidate the experimental data DOE relies upon its License Application, NEV-SAFETY-206 at 5, and that therefore, the License Application does not comply with various requirements of 10 C.F.R. Part 63. *Id.* at 7. Attached to the proposed contention, as exhibits 1 and 2, are affidavits and curricula vitae of Maurice E. Morgenstein and Michael C. Thorne, both adopting paragraphs 5 and 6 of the proposed contention as their opinion.

C. Staff Response

The Staff does not oppose Nevada's motion for leave to file the proposed contention, as the contention appears to be based upon previously unavailable and materially different information, the referenced DOE condition reports. Nevada states that these documents were made available on the LSN on July 31, 2009, as confirmed by the LSN Administrator. Motion at 1. Thus, the Motion appears timely because it was filed within 30 days of the date the cited reports became available. The proposed contention appears to satisfy the contention admissibility requirements in 10 C.F.R. § 2.309(f)(1). Thus, the Staff does not object to the admission of proposed contention NEV-SAFETY-206.

CONCLUSION

For the reasons set forth above, the Staff does not oppose Nevada's motion for leave to file proposed contention NEV-SAFETY-206, and does not object to admission of the proposed contention.

Respectfully submitted,

/Signed (electronically) by/

Adam S. Gendelman
Counsel for NRC Staff
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Mail Stop O-15D21
Washington, DC 20555-0001
(301) 415-8445
Adam.Gendelman@nrc.gov

Dated at Rockville, Maryland
this 11th day of September, 2009.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARDS

In the Matter of)	
)	Docket No. 63-001-HLW
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY)	
)	ASLBP Nos. 09-876-HLW-CAB01
(High-Level Waste Repository))	09-877-HLW-CAB02
)	09-878-HLW-CAB03
)	09-892-HLW-CAB04

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that copies of the "NRC STAFF ANSWER TO THE STATE OF NEVADA'S MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE NEW CONTENTION AND PROPOSED CONTENTION NEVADA SAFETY 206" in the above-captioned proceeding have been served on the following persons this 11th day of September, 2009, by Electronic Information Exchange.

CAB 01

William J. Froehlich, Chairman
Thomas S. Moore
Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-mail: wjf1@nrc.gov
tsm2@nrc.gov
rew@nrc.gov

CAB 04

Thomas S. Moore, Chairman
Paul S. Ryerson
Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-mail: tsm2@nrc.gov
psr1@nrc.gov
rew@nrc.gov

CAB 02

Michael M. Gibson, Chairman
Alan S. Rosenthal
Nicholas G. Trikouros
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-mail: mmg3@nrc.gov
axr@nrc.gov
nqt@nrc.gov

Office of the Secretary
ATTN: Docketing and Service
Mail Stop: O-16C1
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555
E-mail: HEARINGDOCKET@nrc.gov

Office of Commission Appellate
Adjudication
ocaamail@nrc.gov

CAB 03

Paul S. Ryerson, Chairman
Michael C. Farrar
Mark O. Barnett
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-mail: psr1@nrc.gov
mcf@nrc.gov
mob1@nrc.gov
mark.barnett@nrc.gov

Charles J. Fitzpatrick, Esq.
John W. Lawrence, Esq.
Egan, Fitzpatrick, Malsch & Lawrence PLLC
12500 San Pedro Avenue, Suite 555
San Antonio, TX 78216
E-mail: cfitzpatrick@nuclearlawyer.com
jlawrence@nuclearlawyer.com

Martin G. Malsch, Esq.
Egan, Fitzpatrick & Malsch, PLLC
1750 K Street, N.W. Suite 350
Washington, D.C. 20006
E-mail: mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com

Brian W. Hembacher, Esq.
Deputy Attorney General
California Attorney General's Office
300 South Spring Street
Los Angeles, CA 90013
E-mail: brian.hembacher@doj.ca.gov

Timothy E. Sullivan, Esq.
Deputy Attorney General
California Department of Justice
1515 Clay Street., 20th Flr.
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
E-mail: timothy.sullivan@doj.ca.gov

Kevin W. Bell, Esq.
Senior Staff Counsel
California Energy Commission
1516 9th Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
E-mail: kwbell@energy.state.ca.us

Bryce C. Loveland
Jennings Strouss & Salmon, PLC
8330 W. Sahara Avenue, Suite 290
Las Vegas, NV 89117-8949
Email: bloveland@jsslw.com

Alan I. Robbins, Esq.
Debra D. Roby, Esq.
Jennings Strouss & Salmon, PLC
1700 Pennsylvania Ave, NW Suite 500
Washington, D.C. 20005
E-mail: arobbins@jsslw.com
droby@jsslw.com

Donald J. Silverman, Esq.
Thomas A. Schmutz, Esq.
Thomas C. Poindexter, Esq.
Paul J. Zaffuts, Esq.
Alex S. Polonsky, Esq.
Lewis Csedrik, Esq.
Morgan, Lewis & Bockius LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004
E-mail: dsilverman@morganlewis.com
tschmutz@morganlewis.com
tpoindexter@morganlewis.com
pzaffuts@morganlewis.com
apolonsky@morganlewis.com
lcshedrik@morganlewis.com

Malachy R. Murphy, Esq.
18160 Cottonwood Rd. #265
Sunriver, OR 97707
E-mail: mrmurphy@chamberscable.com

Robert M. Andersen
Akerman Senterfitt
801 Pennsylvania Avenue N.W., Suite 600
Washington, DC 20004 USA
E-mail: robert.andersen@akerman.com

Martha S. Crosland, Esq.
Angela M. Kordyak, Esq.
Nicholas P. DiNunzio
James Bennett McRae, Esq.
U.S. Department of Energy
Office of the General Counsel
1000 Independence Avenue, S.W.
Washington, DC 20585
E-mail: martha.crosland@hq.doe.gov
angela.kordyak@hq.doe.gov
nick.dinunzio@rw.doe.gov
ben.mcrae@hq.doe.gov

George W. Hellstrom
U.S. Department of Energy
Office of General Counsel
1551 Hillshire Drive
Las Vegas, NV 89134-6321
E-Mail: george.hellstrom@ymp.gov

Jeffrey D. VanNiel, Esq.
530 Farrington Court
Las Vegas, NV 89123
E-mail: nbridvn@gmail.com

Susan L. Durbin, Esq.
Deputy Attorney General
1300 I Street
P.O. Box 944255
Sacramento, CA 94244-2550
E-mail: susan.durbin@doj.ca.gov

Frank A. Putzu
Naval Sea Systems Command Nuclear
Propulsion Program
1333 Isaac Hull Avenue, S.E.
Washington Navy Yard, Building 197
Washington, DC 20376
E-mail: frank.putzu@navy.mil

John M. Peebles
Darcie L. Houck
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan LLP
1001 Second Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
E-mail: jpeebles@ndnlaw.com

Ellen C. Ginsberg
Michael A. Bauser
Anne W. Cottingham
Nuclear Energy Institute, Inc.
1776 I Street, N.W., Suite 400
Washington, D.C. 20006
E-mail: ecg@nei.org
mab@nei.org
awc@nei.org

David A. Repka
William A. Horin
Rachel Miras-Wilson
Winston & Strawn LLP
1700 K Street N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006
E-mail: drepka@winston.com
whorin@winston.com
rwilson@winston.com

Jay E. Silberg
Timothy J.V. Walsh
Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP
2300 N Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20037-1122
E-mail: jay.silberg@pillsburylaw.com
timothy.walsh@pillsburylaw.com

Gregory L. James
710 Autumn Leaves Circle
Bishop, California 93514
Email: gljames@earthlink.net

Arthur J. Harrington
Godfrey & Kahn, S.C.
780 N. Water Street
Milwaukee, WI 53202
E-mail: aharring@gklaw.com

Steven A. Heinzen
Douglas M. Poland
Hannah L. Renfro
Godfrey & Kahn, S.C.
One East Main Street, Suite 500
P.O. Box 2719
Madison, WI 53701-2719
E-mail: sheinzen@gklaw.com
dpoland@gklaw.com
hrenfro@gklaw.com

Robert F. List, Esq.
Jennifer A. Gores, Esq.
Armstrong Teasdale LLP
1975 Village Center Circle, Suite 140
Las Vegas, NV 89134-6237
E-mail: rlist@armstrongteasdale.com
jgores@armstrongteasdale.com

Diane Curran
Harmon, Curran, Spielberg, & Eisenberg,
L.L.P.
1726 M Street N.W., Suite 600
Washington, D.C. 20036
E-mail: dcurran@harmoncurran.com

Ian Zabarte, Board Member
Native Community Action Council
P.O. Box 140
Baker, NV 89311
E-mail: mrizabarte@gmail.com

Richard Sears
District Attorney No. 5489
White Pine County District Attorney's Office
801 Clark Street, Suite 3
Ely, NV 89301
E-mail: rwsears@wpcda.org

Donald P. Irwin
Michael R. Shebelskie
Kelly L. Faglioni
Hunton & Williams LLP
Riverfront Plaza, East Tower
951 East Byrd Street
Richmond, VA 23219-4074
E-mail: dirwin@hunton.com
mshebelskie@hunton.com
kfaglioni@hunton.com

Curtis G. Berkey
Scott W. Williams
Rovianne A. Leigh
Alexander, Berkey, Williams, & Weathers
LLP
2030 Addison Street, Suite 410
Berkley, CA 94704
E-mail: cberkey@abwwlaw.com
swilliams@abwwlaw.com
rleigh@abwwlaw.com

Bret O. Whipple
1100 South Tenth Street
Las Vegas, Nevada 89104
E-mail: bretwhipple@nomademail.com

Gregory Barlow
P.O. Box 60
Pioche, Nevada 89043
E-mail: lcd@lcturbonet.com

Connie Simkins
P.O. Box 1068
Caliente, Nevada 89008
E-mail: jcciac@co.lincoln.nv.us

Dr. Mike Baughman
Intertech Services Corporation
P.O. Box 2008
Carson City, Nevada 89702
E-mail: bigoff@aol.com

Michael Berger
Robert S. Hanna
Attorney for the County of Inyo
233 East Carrillo Street Suite B
Santa Barbara, California 93101
E-mail: mberger@bsglaw.net
rshanna@bsglaw.net

/Signed (electronically) by/

Adam S. Gendelman
Counsel for NRC Staff
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the General Counsel
Mail Stop O-15D21
Washington, DC 20555-0001
(301) 415-8445
Adam.Gendelman@nrc.gov