

July 8, 2009

Mr. Yoshiki Ogata, General Manager  
APWR Promoting Department  
Mitsubishi Heavy Industries, Ltd.  
16-5, Konan 2-Chome, Minato-Ku  
Tokyo, 108-8215 JAPAN

SUBJECT: MITSUBISHI HEAVY INDUSTRIES, LTD. – REQUEST FOR WITHHOLDING INFORMATION FROM PUBLIC DISCLOSURE FOR MITSUBISHI HEAVY INDUSTRIES' RESPONSE TO THE U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION'S REQUEST FOR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION RELATED WITH TOPICAL REPORT MUAP-07009-P REVISION 0 "THERMAL DESIGN METHODOLOGY", MHI REF: UAP-HF-09182

Dear Mr. Ogata:

By letter to the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) dated April 28, 2009 (UAP-HF-09182), you submitted an affidavit requesting that the information contained in the following document be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR), Part 2, Section 2.390:

Supplemental Information on UAP-HF-09093, MHI's Response to the NRC's Request for Additional Information related with Topical Report MUAP-07009-P Revision 0 "THERMAL DESIGN METHODOLOGY"

A nonproprietary copy of this document has been placed in the NRC's Public Document Room and added to the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System (ADAMS) Public Electronic Reading Room and can be found under Accession Number ML091210207.

The affidavit stated that the submitted information should be considered exempt from mandatory public disclosure for the following reasons:

- The basis for holding the referenced information confidential is that it describes the unique design of the Thermal Design, developed by MHI and not used in the exact form by any MHI's competitors. This information was developed at significant cost to MHI, since it required the performance of Research and Development and detailed design for its software and hardware extending over several years.
- Public disclosure of the referenced information would assist competitors of MHI in their design of new nuclear power plants without the costs or risks associated with the design of new fuel systems and components. Disclosure of the information identified as proprietary would therefore have the following negative impacts on the competitive position of MHI in the U.S. nuclear plant market.

- A. Loss of competitive advantage due to the costs associated with development of the Thermal Design. Providing public access to such information permits competitors to duplicate or mimic the methodology without incurring the associated costs.
- B. Loss of competitive advantage of the US-APWR created by benefits of enhanced plant safety, and reduced operation and maintenance costs associated with the Thermal Design.

We have reviewed your application and the material in accordance with the requirements of 10 CFR 2.390 and, on the basis of the statements in the affidavit, have determined that the submitted information sought to be withheld contains proprietary commercial information and should be withheld from public disclosure.

Therefore, the submitted information marked as proprietary will be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.390(b)(5) and Section 103(b) of the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, as amended.

Withholding from public inspection shall not affect the right, if any, of persons properly and directly concerned to inspect the documents. If the need arises, we may send copies of this information to our consultants working in this area. We will, of course, ensure that the consultants have signed the appropriate agreements for handling proprietary information.

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You also should understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at (301) 415-3249, or via e-mail at [Ruth.Reyes@nrc.gov](mailto:Ruth.Reyes@nrc.gov).

Sincerely,

*/RA/*

Ruth Reyes, Project Manager  
US-APWR Projects Branch  
Division of New Reactor Licensing  
Office of New Reactors

Docket No. 52-021

cc: See next page

Y. Ogata

- 2 -

- A. Loss of competitive advantage due to the costs associated with development of the Thermal Design. Providing public access to such information permits competitors to duplicate or mimic the methodology without incurring the associated costs.
- B. Loss of competitive advantage of the US-APWR created by benefits of enhanced plant safety, and reduced operation and maintenance costs associated with the Thermal Design.

We have reviewed your application and the material in accordance with the requirements of 10 CFR 2.390 and, on the basis of the statements in the affidavit, have determined that the submitted information sought to be withheld contains proprietary commercial information and should be withheld from public disclosure.

Therefore, the submitted information marked as proprietary will be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.390(b)(5) and Section 103(b) of the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, as amended.

Withholding from public inspection shall not affect the right, if any, of persons properly and directly concerned to inspect the documents. If the need arises, we may send copies of this information to our consultants working in this area. We will, of course, ensure that the consultants have signed the appropriate agreements for handling proprietary information.

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You also should understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at (301) 415-3249, or via e-mail at [Ruth.Reyes@nrc.gov](mailto:Ruth.Reyes@nrc.gov).

Sincerely,  
*/RA/*

Ruth Reyes, Project Manager  
US-APWR Projects Branch  
Division of New Reactor Licensing  
Office of New Reactors

Docket No. 52-021

cc: See next page

**DISTRIBUTION:**

PUBLIC	JCiocco, NRO	RidsNroDnrlNmip	*Concurred via email
NMIP R/F	RReyes, NRO	RidsNroLACSmith	
D081	RidsOgcMailCenter	RidsAcrsAcnwMailCenter	

**Accession No.: ML091680603**

**NRO-002**

<b>OFFICE</b>	DNRL/NMIP: PM	DNRL/NMIP: LA	DNRL/NMIP: PM
<b>NAME</b>	RReyes	CSmith*	JCiocco
<b>DATE</b>	07/07/2009	07/01/2009	07/08/2009

DC Mitsubishi - US APWR Mailing List  
cc:

(Revised 04/01/2009)

Mr. Glenn H. Archinoff  
AECL Technologies  
481 North Frederick Avenue  
Suite 405  
Gaithersburg, MD 20877

Mr. Ed Wallace  
General Manager - Projects  
PBMR Pty LTD  
P. O. Box 9396  
Centurion 0046  
Republic of South Africa

Ms. Michele Boyd  
Legislative Director  
Energy Program  
Public Citizens Critical Mass Energy  
Agency and Environmental Program  
215 Pennsylvania Avenue, SE  
Washington, DC 20003

Mr. Gary Wright, Director  
Division of Nuclear Facility Safety  
Illinois Emergency Management  
1035 Outer Park Drive  
Springfield, IL 62704

Atsushi Kumaki  
Mitsubishi Heavy Industries, Ltd.  
APWR Promoting Department  
Wadasaki-cho- 1-1-1, Hyogo-ku  
Kobe 652-8585 JAPAN

Dr. Masanori Onozuka  
Mitsubishi Nuclear Energy Systems, Inc.  
2300 Wilson Blvd.  
Suite 300  
Arlington, VA 22201-5426

Dr. C. Keith Paulson  
Mitsubishi Nuclear Energy Systems, Inc.  
300 Oxford Drive, Suite 301  
Monroeville, PA 15146

Mr. Tom Sliva  
7207 IBM Drive  
Charlotte, NC 28262

Mr. Robert E. Sweeney  
IBEX ESI  
4641 Montgomery Avenue  
Suite 350  
Bethesda, MD 20814

## DC Mitsubishi - US APWR Mailing List

### Email

APH@NEI.org (Adrian Heymer)  
atsushi\_kumaki@mhi.co.jp (Atsushi Kumaki)  
awc@nei.org (Anne W. Cottingham)  
BrinkmCB@westinghouse.com (Charles Brinkman)  
chris.maslak@ge.com (Chris Maslak)  
ck\_paulson@mnes-us.com (C Keith Paulson)  
ckpaulson@aol.com (C.K. Paulson)  
CumminWE@Westinghouse.com (Edward W. Cummins)  
cwaltman@roe.com (C. Waltman)  
david.hinds@ge.com (David Hinds)  
david.lewis@pillsburylaw.com (David Lewis)  
DeLaBarreR@state.gov (R. DeLaBarre)  
donald.woodlan@luminant.com (Donald Woodlan)  
erg-xl@cox.net (Eddie R. Grant)  
gcesare@enercon.com (Guy Cesare)  
greshaja@westinghouse.com (James Gresham)  
james.beard@gene.ge.com (James Beard)  
jerald.head@ge.com (Jerald G. Head)  
jgutierrez@morganlewis.com (Jay M. Gutierrez)  
jim.riccio@wdc.greenpeace.org (James Riccio)  
jin\_chung@mnes-us.com  
JJNesrsta@cpsenergy.com (James J. Nesrsta)  
John.O'Neill@pillsburylaw.com (John O'Neill)  
Joseph\_Hegner@dom.com (Joseph Hegner)  
kcrogers@aol.com (K. C. Rogers)  
KSutton@morganlewis.com (Kathryn M. Sutton)  
kwaugh@impact-net.org (Kenneth O. Waugh)  
lchandler@morganlewis.com (Lawrence J. Chandler)  
lon.burnam@house.state.tx.us (Lon Burnam)  
Marc.Brooks@dhs.gov (Marc Brooks)  
maria.webb@pillsburylaw.com (Maria Webb)  
mark.beaumont@wsms.com (Mark Beaumont)  
masahiko\_kaneda@mhi.co.jp (Masahiko Kaneda)  
masanori\_onozuka@mnes-us.com (Masanori Onozuka)  
masayuki\_kambara@mhi.co.jp (Masayuki Kambara)  
matias.travieso-diaz@pillsburylaw.com (Matias Travieso-Diaz)  
mayorsouthern@granbury.org (Mayor David Southern)  
media@nei.org (Scott Peterson)  
mike\_moran@fpl.com (Mike Moran)  
MSF@nei.org (Marvin Fertel)  
mutsumi\_ishida@mnes-us.com (Mutsumi Ishida)  
mwetterhahn@winston.com (M. Wetterhahn)  
nan\_sirirat@mnes-us.com (Sirirat Mongkolkam)  
nirsnet@nirs.org (Michael Mariotte)

## DC Mitsubishi - US APWR Mailing List

patriciaL.campbell@ge.com (Patricia L. Campbell)  
paul.gaukler@pillsburylaw.com (Paul Gaukler)  
Paul@beyondnuclear.org (Paul Gunter)  
plarimore@talisman-intl.com (Patty Larimore)  
pshastings@duke-energy.com (Peter Hastings)  
RJB@NEI.org (Russell Bell)  
RKTemple@cpsenergy.com (R.K. Temple)  
Russell.Wells@Areva.com (Russell Wells)  
sabinski@suddenlink.net (Steve A. Bennett)  
sandra.sloan@areva.com (Sandra Sloan)  
satoshi\_hanada@mnes-us.com (Satoshi Hanada)  
satoshi\_watanabe@mnes-us.com (Satoshi Watanabe)  
sfrantz@morganlewis.com (Stephen P. Frantz)  
shinji\_kawanago@mnes-us.com (Shinji Kawanago)  
stephan.moen@ge.com (Stephan Moen)  
steven.hucik@ge.com (Steven Hucik)  
Tansel.Selekler@nuclear.energy.gov (Tansel Selekler)  
tgilder1@luminant.com (Tim Gilder)  
tmatthews@morganlewis.com (T. Matthews)  
tom.miller@hq.doe.gov (Tom Miller)  
trsmith@winston.com (Tyson Smith)  
Vanessa.quinn@dhs.gov (Vanessa Quinn)  
VictorB@bv.com (Bill Victor)  
vijukrp@westinghouse.com (Ronald P. Vijuk)  
Wanda.K.Marshall@dom.com (Wanda K. Marshall)  
whorin@winston.com (W. Horin)  
yoshiki\_ogata@mhi.co.jp (Yoshiki Ogata)