

### UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

May 29, 2009

Administrative Judge Lawrence G. McDade, Chair Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001

Administrative Judge Dr. Kaye D. Lathrop 190 Cedar Lane East Ridgeway, CO 81432 Administrative Judge
Dr. Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001

In the Matter of ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC. (Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station Units 2 and 3)

<u>Docket Nos. 50-247-LR and 50-286-LR</u>

#### **Dear Administrative Judges:**

Pursuant to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board's December 18, 2008, "Memorandum and Order (Addressing Requests that the Proceeding be Conducted Pursuant to Subpart G)," slip op. at 13, and the Licensing Board's "Order (Granting Consent Motion Regarding Mandatory Disclosures)," dated January 30, 2009, at 1, the staff of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission ("Staff") herein notifies the Licensing Board and the parties that the hearing file has been supplemented for this proceeding. Materials in the hearing file may be accessed through the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System ("ADAMS"). An index containing the ADAMS accession number, date, and title or description of each item in Hearing File Index, Supplement 4 is appended hereto as Attachment 1.

On or about June 4, 2009, the newly identified documents in the hearing file will be made available via the Electronic Hearing Docket ("EHD"), which may be accessed at the following URL: <a href="http://ehd.nrc.gov/EHD">http://ehd.nrc.gov/EHD</a> Proceeding/home.asp. The hearing file will be contained in a sub-folder entitled, "Indian PT Hearing File, Supplement 4" in the "Indian\_PT\_2&3\_50-247&50-286-LR" folder of the EHD.

In addition, as required by 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5), the Staff is producing an updated privilege log, identifying documents withheld under the deliberative process privilege and documents containing proprietary, sensitive, or privacy-related information, which are appended hereto as Attachments 2 and 3, respectively. Also, attached is the Declaration of Brian E. Holian formally invoking the deliberative process privilege with respect to each of the documents in

Attachment 2. The Staff will preserve and maintain the privileged documents identified in these logs during the pendency of this proceeding.

Further, pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(c), attached is the Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, certifying that all relevant materials required by this section have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete as to documents identified by May 22, 2009. Finally, the NRC Staff notes that it has made a good faith effort to identify and characterize all documents meeting the criteria of 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b) and 10 C.F.R. § 2.1203 in this proceeding. In identifying these documents, the Staff does not concede their relevance to the license renewal issues to be decided in this proceeding.

Andrea Jones

Counsel for MRC Staff

Enclosures: Attachment 1 - Hearing File Index, Supplement 4

Attachment 2 - Deliberative Process Privilege Log

Attachment 3 - Proprietary and Sensitive Information Log

Declaration of Brian E. Holian Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg

cc w/Encls.: Service List

### Attachment 1 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Supplement 4 - May 29, 2009

	Accession	Document	
ID#	Number	Date	Title
			2009/01/26 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW: Indian Point Conference Call- call-in
04-001	ML091350397	1/26/2009	procedures
04-002	ML091350455	1/29/2009	2009/01/29 Indian Point LR Hearing - 17 safety problems found at Indian Pt.
04-003	ML091120802	4/22/2009	2009/04/22 Indian Point LR Hearing - Telecon on 4/27 at 1:00 pm EST
04-004	ML091170216	4/27/2009	2009/04/27 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW: Revised comparative pictures
04-005	ML091270867	5/7/2009	2009/05/07 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW: RE: Conference call time request
04-006	ML091400219	5/11/2009	2009/05/11 Indian Point LR Hearing - FW: RAI Fig 2
			2009/05/13 Indian Point LR Hearing - Draft RAI 3.4.2-2 related to the IP2 AFW
04-007	ML091330555	5/13/2009	pump room fire event open item
04-008	ML091350456	5/13/2009	2009/05/13 Indian Point LR Hearing - Hudson River Estuary meetings clarification
			2009/05/14 Indian Point LR Hearing - Fwd: Hudson River Estuary meetings
04-009	ML091350457	5/14/2009	clarification
			2009/05/14 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Entergy Indian Point Units 2 & 3 -
04-010	ML091340299	5/14/2009	Section 401 WQC - NOIA and RFI
04-011	ML091350174	5/15/2009	2009/05/15 Indian Point LR Hearing - Draft RAIs
			2009/05/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE: Teleconference Call Summary April
04-012	ML091390874	5/19/2009	27, 2009
			2009/05/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - Teleconference Call Summary April 27,
04-013	ML091390877	5/19/2009	2009

# Attachment 2 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 4 - May 29, 2009

Certain documents otherwise subject to inclusion in the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for this proceeding have been determined by the NRC Staff to contain information subject to withholding from public disclosures as predecisional, deliberative information. Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)(5),

	Accession	Author Name/		Document	Document		Page
ID#	Number	Affliation	Title	Date	Туре	Comment	Count
DPP-04-	14GIIIDCI	D. Logan	2008/07/25 Indian Point LR Hearing -	Date	Type	Internal transmission of	Oodin
001	ML091350413	NRC/NRR	simple answer	7/25/2008	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	1 4
	1012031330413	1410/14141	2008/08/04 Indian Point LR Hearing -	172372000	L-Wall	Comments regarding Elo	+
DPP-04-		D. Logan	information on cost of mitigation	Ì	1	Internal transmission of	
002	ML091350412	NRC/NRR	alternatives	8/4/2008	F-Mail	comments regarding EIS	2
DPP-04-	1012031330412	D. Logan	2008/09/16 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE:	0/4/2000	L-IVIAII	Internal transmission of	
003	ML091350410		Convert ppt to mg/L	9/16/2008	  E_Mail	comments regarding EIS	,
DPP-04-	IVIEUS 13304 TO	D. Logan	2008/09/17 Indian Point LR Hearing -	3/10/2000	L-IVIAII	Internal transmission of	<del>- </del>
004	ML091350409	_	redbreast sunfish (Lepomis auritus)	9/17/2008	E Mail	comments regarding EIS	,
DPP-04-	IVILUS 1330409	D. Logan	2008/09/18 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE:	9/1//2006	E-iviali	Internal transmission of	
005	MI 001350407	NRC/NRR	IP - Same para as last e-mail	9/18/2008	L Mail	1	,
005	ML091350407	INRC/INRR	2008/09/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE:	9/10/2000	E-IVIAII	comments regarding EIS	<del></del>
DPP-04-		D 1	1	1		Internal transmission of	1
	NI 004350405	D. Logan	Impingement sampling at IP - from	0/40/2009	 		ر ا
006	ML091350405	NRC/NRR	chapter 4	9/19/2008	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	
DDD 04		ID 1	2008/09/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE:				
DPP-04-	141 004050400	D. Logan	Impingement sampling at IP - from	0/40/0000		Internal transmission of	
007	ML0913504 <u>06</u>	NRC/NRR	chapter 4	9/19/2008	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	<del></del>
DPP-04-		D. Logan	2008/09/19 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE:	0140/000		Internal transmission of	
800	ML091350404	NRC/NRR	IP - Same para as last e-mail	9/19/2008	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	$\frac{2}{1}$
DPP-04-		V. Cullinan	2008/11/12 Indian Point LR Hearing -			Internal transmission of	
009	ML091350429	PNNL	Entrainment and Impingement	11/12/2008	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	_   9
DPP-04-		V. Cullinan	2008/11/14 Indian Point LR Hearing -			Internal transmission of	
010	ML091350428	PNNL	references	11/14/2008	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	5
DPP-04-		H. Nash	2008/12/15 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE:			Internal transmission of	
011	ML091350423	NRC/NRO	The bluefish question	12/15/2008	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	3
DPP-04-		V. Cullinan	2009/01/05 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE:			Internal transmission of	
012	ML091350427	PNNL	This might helpDennis	1/5/2009	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	10
DPP-04-		D. Logan	2009/01/08 Indian Point LR Hearing - RE:			Internal transmission of	
013	ML091350398	NRC/NRR	Question	1/8/2009	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	2
			2009/01/27 Indian Point LR Hearing -				
DPP-04-		V. Cullinan	Responses to Question from Conference			Internal transmission of	
014	ML091350426		Call 1-27-09	1/27/2009	F-Mail	comments regarding EIS	3

# Attachment 2 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Deliberative Process Privilege, Supplement 4 - May 29, 2009

}	Accession	Author Name/		Document	Document		Page
ID#	Number	Affliation	Title	Date	Туре	Comment	Count
DPP-04-		D. Logan				Internal transmission of	
015	ML091350392	NRC/NRR	2009/02/20 Indian Point LR Hearing -	2/20/2009	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	7
DPP-04-		D. Logan	2009/03/17 Indian Point LR Hearing -			Internal transmission of	
016	ML091350390	NRC/NRR	Primrose path	3/17/2009	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	2
DPP-04-		D. Logan	2009/04/15 Indian Point LR Hearing -			Internal transmission of	
017	ML091350375	NRC/NRR	ENSR 2000	4/15/2009	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	2
			2009/04/29 Indian Point LR Hearing -				
DPP-04-		D. Logan	NMFS's comments on the Indian Point			Internal transmission of	
018	ML091350372	NRC/NRR	biological assessment	4/29/2009	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	5
DPP-04-		V. Cullinan	2009/04/30 Indian Point LR Hearing -			Internal transmission of	
019	ML091350425	PNNL	Selection of RIS	4/30/2009	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	2
DPP-04-			2009/05/07 Indian Point LR Hearing - Re:			Internal transmission of	
020	ML091350430	J. Ward PNNL	Conference call time request	5/7/2009	E-Mail	comments regarding EIS	3

# Attachment 3 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Proprietary and Sensitive Information, Supplement 4 - May 29, 2009

Certain documents otherwise subject to inclusion in the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for this proceeding have been determined by the NRC Staff to contain trade secrets, privileged or confidential commercial or financial information or to contain sensitive unclassified non-safeguards information (SUNSI), or personally identifiable information (PII). Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. §2.336(b)(5), the Staff is providing this log to identify the following documents, which are either designated proprietary or which have been withheld because they contain SUNSI or PII and are subject to protected status under Section 2.390.

ID#	Accession Number	Author Name/Affiliation	Title/Description	Document Date	Document Type	Comment	Page Count
			2009/05/07 Indian Point		_		
			LR Hearing - FW: RE:				
			Conference call time				\
04-001	ML091350370	D. Logan NRC/NRR	request	5/7/2009	E-Mail	Contains PII	3

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

### BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.	)	Docket Nos. 50-247 & 50-286-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3)	) )	ASLBP No. 07-858-03-LR-BD01

#### DECLARATION OF BRIAN E. HOLIAN

- I, Brian E. Holian, do hereby state as follows:
- 1. I am employed as the Director of the Division of Licensing Renewal ("DLR") in the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's ("NRC") Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation ("NRR"). My supervisory responsibilities include oversight of the NRC Staff's review and evaluation of the Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station Units 2 and 3 license renewal application.
- 2. As part of their responsibilities in updating the hearing file and mandatory disclosures for these proceedings, NRC staff members under my supervision identified certain documents as privileged because they contained information concerning the Staff's predecisional deliberative process. Those documents are listed in Attachment 2 to the May 29, 2009 submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 4.
- 3. I have personally reviewed the documents identified as privileged in Attachment 2, and have determined, in accordance with the guidance set forth in Management Directive 3.4, that they contain pre-decisional information concerning the Staff's review of the license renewal application. All documents contain either Staff's analyses, recommendations, opinions, or evaluations, and may not necessarily reflect the final agency position with respect to the

matters discussed therein. Each of the documents comprises part of the deliberative process necessary for the Staff's review of the pending license renewal application.

- 4. Further, I have determined that disclosure of these documents could result in harm to the agency, in that it would (a) prematurely disclose the preliminary views of individual Staff members and/or the Staff prior to reaching a final agency decision, and could thus create confusion as to the actual policy or views of the NRC Staff; (b) hinder the efficiency of the Staff, in that forced disclosure of its internal discussions on an unresolved issue would tend to chill all future deliberations and would interfere with the Staff's ability to engage in a free exchange of opinions and analyses prior to publishing its final review documents; and (c) imply or suggest incorrectly that the opinions of the Staff members involved in these communications are actually the final decisions of the agency, while no such final decision has yet been made.
- 5. Accordingly, I formally invoke the deliberative process privilege with respect to each of the documents listed in Attachment 2 to the May 29, 2009 submission of the Staff's Hearing File Index Supplement 4.
- 6. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Brian E. Holian

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 29th day of May, 2009

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

### BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	)
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC. OPERATIONS, INC. )	) Docket Nos. 50-247 & 50-286-LR
·	) ASLBP No. 07-858-03-LR-BD01
(Indian Point Nuclear Generation Station,	)
Units 2 and 3)	)

# AFFIDAVIT OF ANDREW L. STUYVENBERG CONCERNING MANDATORY DISCLOSURE REQUIREMENT OF 10 C.F.R. § 2.336(b)

- I, Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, do hereby state as follows:
- 1. I am employed as a Project Manager in the Division of License Renewal in the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's ("NRC") Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation. I serve as a project manager for the Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station, Units 2 and 3 license renewal application ("LRA"). Among other things, I am managing the preparation of the hearing file and mandatory disclosures in connection with the LRA at issue in this proceeding.
- 2. I hereby certify that all relevant materials required to be disclosed pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.336 (b) and (c) in the captioned proceeding have been disclosed, and that the disclosures are accurate and complete for documents identified as of May 20, 2009.
- 3. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Andrew L∥Stuyvenøerg

Executed in Rockville, Maryland this 29th day of May, 2009

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

### BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of	)
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC	5. ) Docket Nos. 50-247/286-LR
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3)	) )

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing Letter to the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board regarding the Indian Point Hearing File, including: Attachment 1 - Indian Point License Renewal Hearing File Index Supplement 4, Attachment 2 – Deliberative Process Privilege Log, Attachment 3 – Proprietary and Sensitive Information Log, Declaration of Brian E. Holian, dated May 29, 2009, and Affidavit of Andrew L. Stuyvenberg, dated May 29, 2009, have been served upon the following through deposit in the NRC's internal mail system, with copies by electronic mail, or, as indicated by an asterisk, by deposit in the U.S. Postal Service, with copies by electronic mail this 29<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2009:

Lawrence G. McDade, Chair
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop - T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-mail: Lawrence.McDade@nrc.gov

Dr. Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop - T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, D.C. 20555-0001
E-mail: Richard.Wardwell@nrc.gov

Dr. Kaye D. Lathrop
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
190 Cedar Lane E.
Ridgway, CO 81432
E-mail: Kaye.Lathrop@nrc.gov

Office of Commission Appellate
Adjudication
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Mail Stop: O-16G4
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: OCAAMAIL.resource@nrc.gov

Office of the Secretary
Attn: Rulemaking and Adjudications Staff
Mail Stop: O-16G4
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: Hearing.Docket@nrc.gov

Zachary S. Kahn
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop – T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: Zachary.Kahn@nrc.gov

Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Mail Stop: T-3 F23 Washington, DC 20555-0001 (Via Internal Mail Only)

Kathryn M. Sutton, Esq.\*
Paul M. Bessette, Esq.
Martin J. O'Neill, Esq.
Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, D.C. 20004

E-mail: <u>ksutton@morganlewis.com</u>
E-mail: <u>pbessette@morganlewis.com</u>
E-mail: <u>martin.o'neill@morganlewis.com</u>

Michael J. Delaney, Esq.\*
Vice President – Energy Department
New York City Economic Development
Corporation (NYCDEC)
110 William Street
New York, NY 10038
E-mail: mdelaney@nycedc.com

Justin D. Pruyne, Esq.\*
Assistant County Attorney
Office of the Westchester County Attorney
148 Martine Avenue, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor
White Plains, NY 10601
E-mail: jdp3@westchestergov.com

Daniel E. O'Neill, Mayor\*
James Seirmarco, M.S.
Village of Buchanan
Municipal Building
Buchanan, NY 10511-1298
E-mail: vob@bestweb.net

Manna Jo Greene\*
Hudson River Sloop Clearwater, Inc.
112 Little Market Street
Poughkeepsie, NY 12601
E-mail: mannajo@clearwater.org

William C. Dennis, Esq.\*
Assistant General Counsel
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.
440 Hamilton Avenue
White Plains, NY 10601
E-mail: wdennis@entergy.com

Mylan L. Denerstein, Esq.\*
Janice A. Dean, Esq.
Executive Deputy Attorney General,
Social Justice
Office of the Attorney General
of the State of New York
120 Broadway, 25<sup>th</sup> Floor
New York, NY 10271

E-mail: mylan.denerstein@oag.state.ny.us janice.dean@oag.state.ny.us

Diane Curran, Esq.\*
Harmon, Curran, Spielberg & Eisenberg, LLP
1726 M Street, NW, Suite 600
Washington, D.C. 20036
E-mail: dcurran@harmoncurran.com

John J. Sipos, Esq.\*
Charlie Donaldson, Esq.
Assistants Attorney General
New York State Department of Law
Environmental Protection Bureau
The Capitol
Albany, NY 12224
E-mail: john.sipos@oag.state.ny.us

Robert Snook, Esq.\*
Office of the Attorney General
State of Connecticut
55 Elm Street
P.O. Box 120
Hartford, CN 06141-0120
E-mail: robert.snook@po.state.ct.us

Elise N. Zoli, Esq.\*
Goodwin Procter, LLP
Exchange Place
53 State Street
Boston, MA 02109

E-mail: ezoli@goodwinprocter.com

Ross H. Gould, Esq.\* 10 Park Ave, #5L New York, NY 10016 T: 917-658-7144

E-mail: rgouldesq@gmail.com

Daniel Riesel, Esq.\*
Thomas F. Wood, Esq.
Ms. Jessica Steinberg, J.D.
Sive, Paget & Riesel, P.C.
460 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10022
E-mail: driesel@sprlaw.com
isteinberg@sprlaw.com

Joan Leary Matthews, Esq.\*
Senior Attorney for Special Projects
New York State Department of
Environmental Conservation
Office of the General Counsel
625 Broadway, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor
Albany, NY 12233-1500
E-mail: jlmatthe@gw.dec.state.ny.us

John Louis Parker, Esq.\*
Office of General Counsel, Region 3
New York State Department of
Environmental conservation
21 South Putt Corners Road
New Paltz, NY 12561-1620
E-mail: ilparker@gw.dec.state.ny.us

Sherwin E. Turk Counsel for NRC Staff