RASE-254

# UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

May 19, 2009

DOCKETED USNRC

May 21 2009 (10:00am)

OFFICE OF SECRETARY RULEMAKINGS AND ADJUDICATIONS STAFF

**SERVED May 21, 2009** 

SECRETARY

SOCKE AR BEGULA)

Mr. Peter D. Wolf 25 Main Street – Suite B Hastings-on-Hudson, NY 10706

Dear Mr. Wolf:

I am responding to your letter of March 17, 2009, sent to the Commission. Additionally, by email dated March 27, 2009, you sent to the Commission a copy of an e-mail to President Obama and attached a copy of your March 17, 2009 letter. Your correspondence expressed concerns about factors that you recommended for consideration during review of the license renewal application for Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3.

Under Nuclear Regulatory Commission procedural rules for adjudications, the Commission has an appellate role in proceedings commenced before its Atomic Safety and Licensing Boards, such as the Indian Point license renewal proceeding. Because of that role, I trust that you will understand that the Commissioners must remain impartial while this case is pending. At this time, therefore, the Commission cannot discuss or comment on issues involved in the licensing renewal proceeding. However, I am referring your correspondence to the Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation, which is responsible for reviewing the Indian Point license renewal application.

Copies of your correspondence and this response will be served on the participants in the Indian Point proceeding.

Sincerely,

Annette L. Vietti-Cook

cc: Indian Point Service List

25 Main Street – Suite B Hastings-on-Hudson, NY 10706 March 17, 2009

#### VIA OVERNIGHT COURIER and E-MAIL

Nuclear Regulatory Commission 11545 Rockville Pike – Room T-6D559 Rockville, MD 20852

Attn: Chairman Dale E. Klein

re: Environmental Impact Statement: License Renewal Application: DPR-26 & DPR-64 Indian Point Nuclear Generating Units 2 and 3 – Buchanan, NY (owned by Entergy)

Dear Mr. Klein:

These comments are in response to the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) prepared as part of the re-licensing process regarding the application by Entergy for a 20 year extension to continue operating Indian Point Units 2 & 3.

It appears that the full import of some critical environmental factors is not properly considered in the EIS, and should be a vital part of the NRC's review process; the factors of particular concern include, but are not limited to:

- Close proximity to a densely populated area (24 miles north of New York City),
- Location on a fault line, which has shown recent earthquake activity,
- Potentially Attractive Target to Terrorists,
- Manner in which Nuclear Waste is stored above ground,
- Continued Operation continuing to kill aquatic species in the Hudson River,
- History of Leaks & Shutdowns about 5 times higher than the national average,
- Unknown risks attendant with additional 20 years operation for this Facility,
- No credible study of the effects of different types of 'accidents' at Indian Point on surrounding areas, especially considering the history of other nuclear accidents

If the NRC ignores does not properly consider the above environmental factors, then it would seem that it cannot fulfill its self-stated vision of "Excellence in regulating the safe and secure management of radioactive materials for the public good."

I strongly urge the NRC fully consider the environmental factors, which were and which should have been discussed in the EIS, in determining whether to re-license the two Indian Point units.

Sincerely Yours, My Kan D. Wolf Peter D. Wolf

# Sheila McKelvin

From: Sent:

Peter D. Wolf [seawolf@cloud9.net] Friday, March 27, 2009 12:45 AM

To:

NRCExecSec Resource e-mail to President Obama

Subject: Attachments:

pipobamalttOO.doc

Please find attached an e-mail sent to President Obama – please distribute copies of the e-mail to the following persons:

- Chairman Dale E. Klein
- Commissioner Kristine L. Svinicki
- Commissioner Gregory B. Jaczko
- Commissioner Peter B. Lyons
- Branch Chief David J. Wrona
- Env. Proj. Eng. Andrew Stuyvenberg
- Regional Commissioner for New York

Many Thanks, Peter D. Wolf

## Q:WHAT'S WORSE THAN THE CURRENT FINANCIAL MELTDOWN?

#### A: A NUCLEAR MELTDOWN!

SOLUTION: CHANGE THE LAWS, RULES AND REGULATIONS REGARDING LICENSING, AND ESPECIALLY RELICENSING, OF NUCLEAR POWER PLANTS

re: Application for Re-Licensing Indian Point Nuclear Generating Plant at Buchanan, NY

Just as one could not envision the results of the current financial meltdown, it is almost inconceivable to contemplate the consequences of a serious nuclear incident at Indian Point to the New York metropolitan area, the region, and indeed the country.

Entergy owns the two nuclear generating plants at Indian Point which are nearing the end of their 40 year license, and they have applied to operate these units for another 20 years. There is a long history of leaks and shutdowns at the Indian Point plants; the safety record of these two plants is abysmal. On December 3, 2007, the New York State Attorney General, with the current Governor as well as Senators, and Representatives by his side, publicly stated opposition to the re-licensing of Indian Point (the first time a state opposed re-licensing a nuclear facility), yet the application has not been withdrawn.

I have followed Indian Point since 9/11, as it was deemed to be a prime terrorist target; in the ensuing months after 9/11, 41 governmental bodies expressed serious concern or opposition to the continued operation of Indian Point, mainly because it is in a heavily populated area (24 miles north of NYC), with no viable escape plan for many people.

In addition to reading, I have attended public information sessions hosted by the NRC, as well as a recent symposium on the re-licensing of 40 year old power plants at Pace Law School. I have government experience regarding accidents and readiness response, and industry knowledge concerning hazardous materials. While I am not opposed to nuclear power in principle, I do have grave concerns about Indian Point, and seriously question whether the facility should be permitted to continue to operate. My concerns include:

- Close proximity to a high density population center,
- Location on a fault line which has shown recent earthquake activity,
- Potential Target for Terrorists,
- Manner in which Above-Ground Nuclear Waste is stored.
- Continued operation continuing to kill fish in the Hudson River
- No history of a similar facility to evaluate the prospects of 20 more years of operation on a decaying plant structure.

Earlier this month, in commenting about another leak, the NY Times reported that an Entergy spokesman said: "It's eight feet underground, so there's no way of knowing when you have to replace it" (not exactly a reassuring statement from an applicant requesting a 20 year license extension), while an NRC spokeswoman commented that this leak was not as serious as the one in 2005 which had been "ongoing for a long time".

Just as we learned with dire consequences that outmoded oversight rules and regulations regarding the current financial system could not regulate the industry, I submit that the NRC re-licensing procedure for a 40 year old nuclear generating plant precludes the possibility of arriving at a comprehensive and fair decision. For example, it is my understanding that the NRC is prohibited from analyzing contemporary scientific data concerning a moderate earthquake along the existing fault line where there has been recent activity; the NRC is not permitted to evaluate past incidents at Three Mile Island, Chernobyl, or even the ramifications of the leaks emanating from the nuclear plant in Japan, precipitated by a recent earthquake, and the NRC is not allowed to consider scientific models assessing the probable consequences of an earthquake at Indian Point on the surrounding population of 20,000,000 people.

While you cannot prevent the current financial meltdown from occurring, you can be instrumental in preventing a future nuclear catastrophe. The new Administration has stated repeatedly its commitment to a scientific approach to the problems facing America. One meaningful way to fulfill this commitment would be to spearhead an overhaul of the procedure for licensing nuclear power plants generally, and re-licensing 40 year old nuclear power plants specifically, in order to permit the introduction and consideration of relevant scientific data to the re-licensing process.

Providing safety and security is the most basic of government obligations, and I strongly urge you (and those copied below) to enact and/or amend existing laws, rules, and regulations regarding the operation of nuclear facilities to protect the public.

Thank you in advance for your consideration.

Peter D. Wolf
JD, LLM Environmental Law
LCDR US Coast Guard Reserve (Ret.)

cc: (w/cc of recent ltr to the NRC) by mail & mail/or e-mail to distribution list

Steven Chu, Secretary of Energy

Carol Browner, US Dept of Energy

Linda Adams, Secretary of the EPA

Dale E. Klein, Chairman of the NRC

Kristine L. Svinicki, Commissioner, NRC

Gregory B. Jaczko, Commissioner, NRC

Peter B. Lyons, Commissioner, NRC

David J. Wrona, Branch Chief, NRC

Andrew Stuyvenberg, Env. Project Manager, NRC

Regional Administrator, NRC

Charles Schumer, U.S. Senator

Kirsten Gillibrand, U.S. Senator

Nita Lowey, U.S. Representative

Eliot Engel, U.S. Representative

Jon Hall, U.S. Representative

Maurice Hinchey, U.S. Representative

David Paterson, Governor, NYS

Andrew Cuomo, Attorney General NYS

John Sipos, Asst. Atty. Gen., NYS

Charles Donaldson, Asst. Atty. Gen., NYS

Joan Leary Matthews, NYS DEC

Paul D. Tonko, NYSERDA

Richard Brodsky, NYS Senator

Andrea Stewart Cousins, NYS Assembly

Andrew Spano, Westchester County Executive

William J. Ryan, Westchester County Board of Legislators

Thomas J. Abinanti, Chair Comm. on Env. & Energy

Paul J. Feiner, Greenburgh Town Supervisor

Peter Swiderski, Hastings-on-Hudson Mayor

Sandeep Mehrotra, Hastings-on-Hudson Conservation Commission

Ron Cascone, Hastings-on-Hudson Conservation Commission

Jacques Padawer, Hastings-on-Hudson Conservation Commission

Alex Matthiesson, Riverkeeper

Tim LaMorte, Rivertowns Enterprise

Paul G. Richards, Columbia University Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory

Senior Manager, Nuclear Safety & Licensing, Entergy, Jackson, MI

Manager, Licensing, Entergy Buchanan, NY

Received: from mail1.nrc.gov (148.184.176.41) by OWMS01.nrc.gov

(148.184.100.43) with Microsoft SMTP Server id 8.1.291.1; Fri, 27 Mar 2009

00:45:07 -0400 X-Ironport-ID: mail1

X-SBRS: 4.5 X-MID: 795464

X-IronPort-Anti-Spam-Filtered: true

X-IronPort-Anti-Spam-Result:

AmMBAKr2y0moZAEEkWdsb2JhbACCU5MtAQEBAQkLCgcRBbw5g3cG

X-IronPort-AV: E=Sophos;i="4.38,431,1233550800";

d="doc'32?scan'32,208,217,32";a="795464"

Received: from russian-caravan.cloud9.net ([168.100.1.4]) by mail1.nrc.gov

with ESMTP; 27 Mar 2009 00:45:06 -0400

Received: from localhost (localhost [127.0.0.1]) by russian-caravan.cloud9.net

(Postfix) with ESMTP id 637E3FDA0F for <NRCExecSec@nrc.gov>; Fri, 27 Mar 2009

00:45:06 -0400 (EDT)

X-Virus-Scanned: amavisd-new at cloud9.net

Received: from russian-caravan.cloud9.net ([127.0.0.1]) by localhost

(russian-caravan.cloud9.net [127.0.0.1]) (amavisd-new, port 10024) with ESMTP id QVei9O9UsZtO for <NRCExecSec@nrc.gov>; Fri, 27 Mar 2009 00:45:06 -0400

(EDT)

Received: from PDWDELL (249-151.customer.cloud9.net [168.100.249.151]) by

russian-caravan.cloud9.net (Postfix) with ESMTP id 747B5FD840 for <NRCExecSec@nrc.gov>; Fri, 27 Mar 2009 00:45:04 -0400 (EDT)

Return-Receipt-To: "Peter D. Wolf" <seawolf@cloud9.net>

From: "Peter D. Wolf" <seawolf@cloud9.net>

To: <NRCExecSec@nrc.gov>

Subject: e-mail to President Obama Date: Fri, 27 Mar 2009 00:45:09 -0400

Message-ID:

<!&!AAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAABDLEa6gn1KI/xdvzulf1bCgAAAEAAAAJ+hgOzrSdZKg8L

UYosCSdoBAAAAAA==@cloud9.net>

MIME-Version: 1.0

Content-Type: multipart/mixed:

boundary="---= NextPart 000 01CE 01C9AE75.47C63AF0"

X-Mailer: Microsoft Office Outlook 12.0

Thread-Index: AcmulszsorH23lJbS224B6TSSRn6dQ==

Content-Language: en-us

Return-Path: seawolf@cloud9.net

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

In the Matter of	)	
ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.	) Docket Nos. 50-247-LR ) 50-286-LR	
(Indian Point Nuclear Generating Station, Units 2 and 3)	) )	

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing LETTER OF THE SECRETARY TO PETER D. WOLF IN RESPONSE TO HIS MARCH 17 LETTER TO THE CHAIRMAN AND MARCH 27 E-MAIL TO PRESIDENT OBAMA have been served upon the following persons by U.S. mail, first class, or through NRC internal distribution.

Office of Commission Appellate Adjudication U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission. Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel Mail Stop T-3F23 Washington, DC 20555-0001

Administrative Judge Lawrence G. McDade, Chair

Administrative Judge Richard E. Wardwell

Administrative Judge Kaye D. Lathrop 190 Cedar Lane E. Ridgway, CO 81432

Zachary S. Kahn, Law Clerk

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Office of the Secretary of the Commission Mail Stop O-16C1 Washington, DC 20555-0001

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the General Counsel
Mail Stop O-15D21
Washington, DC 20555-0001
Sherwin E. Turk, Esq.
Beth N. Mizuno, Esq.
David E. Roth, Esq.
Brian Harris, Esq.
Andrea Z. Jones, Esq.
Karl Farrar, Esq.
Brian Newell, Paralegal

Docket Nos. 50-247-LR and 50-286-LR LETTER OF THE SECRETARY TO PETER D. WOLF IN RESPONSE TO HIS MARCH 17 LETTER TO THE CHAIRMAN AND MARCH 27 E-MAIL TO PRESIDENT OBAMA

William C. Dennis, Esq. Assistant General Counsel Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc. 440 Hamilton Avenue White Plains, NY 10601 Andrew M. Cuomo, Attorney General
John J. Sipos, Assistant Attorney General
Mylan L. Denerstein
Deputy Assistant Attorney General
Division of Social Justice
Janice A. Dean
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
of the State of New York
The Capitol
State Street
Albany, New York 12224

Kathryn M. Sutton, Esq.
Paul M. Bessette, Esq.
Martin J. O'Neill, Esq.
Mauri T. Lemoncelli, Esq.
Counsel for Entergy Nuclear Operation, Inc.
Morgan, Lewis & Bockius, LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004

Joan Leary Matthews, Esq.
Senior Attorney for Special Projects
New York State Department
of Environmental Conservation
625 Broadway, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor
Albany, New York 12233-5500

Michael J. Delaney
Vice President, Energy Department
New York City Economic Development
Corporation (NYCEDC)
110 William Street
New York, NY 10038

Robert D. Snook, Esq.
Office of The Attorney General
State of Connecticut
55 Elm Street
P.O. Box 120
Hartford, CT 06141-0120

Arthur J. Kremer, Chairman New York Affordable Reliable Electricity Alliance (AREA) 347 Fifth Avenue, Suite 508 New York, NY 10016

Stephen C. Filler, Board Member Hudson River Sloop Clearwater, Inc. 303 South Broadway, Suite 222 Tarrytown, NY 10591 Docket Nos. 50-247-LR and 50-286-LR LETTER OF THE SECRETARY TO PETER D. WOLF IN RESPONSE TO HIS MARCH 17 LETTER TO THE CHAIRMAN AND MARCH 27 E-MAIL TO PRESIDENT OBAMA

Daniel E O'Neill, Mayor James Siermarco, M.S. Liaison to Indian Point Village of Buchanan Municipal Building 236 Tate Avenue Buchanan, NY 10511-1298 Manna Jo Greene, Environmental Director Hudson River Sloop Clearwater 112 Little Markey Street Poughkeepsie, NY 12601

Thomas F. Wood, Esq.
Town of Cortlandt
Daniel Riesel, Esq.
Jessica Steinberg, J.D.
Counsel for the Town of Cortlandt
Sive, Paget & Riesel, P.C.
460 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10022

Nancy Burton, Esq.
Connecticut Residents Opposed
to Relicensing of Indian Point (CRORIP)
147 Cross Highway
Redding Ridge, CT 06876

Elise N. Zoli, Esq. Goodwin Proctor, LLP Exchange Place 53 State Street Boston, MA 02109 Justin D. Pruyne
Assistant County Attorney, Litigation Bureau
Of Counsel to Charlene M. Indelicato, Esq.
Westchester County Attorney
148 Martine Avenue, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor
White Plains, NY 10601

FUSE USA
John LeKay
Heather Ellsworth Burns-DeMelo
Remy Chevalier
Bill Thomas
Belinda J. Jaques
351 Dyckman Street
Peekskill, New York 10566

Westchester Citizens' Awareness Network (WestCan), Citizens Awareness Network, (CAN), et al Susan H. Shapiro, Esq. 21 Pearlman Drive Spring Valley, NY 10977

Victor M. Tafur, Senior Attorney Philip Musegaas, Esq. Deborah Brancato, Esq. Riverkeeper, Inc. 828 South Broadway Tarrytown, NY 10591

Richard L. Brodsky Assemblyman 5 West Main Street Suite 205 Elmsford, NY 10523 Docket Nos. 50-247-LR and 50-286-LR LETTER OF THE SECRETARY TO PETER D. WOLF IN RESPONSE TO HIS MARCH 17 LETTER TO THE CHAIRMAN AND MARCH 27 E-MAIL TO PRESIDENT OBAMA

Diane Curran, Esq.
Counsel for Riverkeeper, Inc.
Harmon, Curran, Spielberg,
& Eisenberg, LLP
1726 M. Street NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20036

Sarah L. Wagner, Esq. Legislative Office Building, Room 422 Albany, NY 12248

Office of the Secretary of the Commission

Dated at Rockville, Maryland this 21st day of May 2009