



**Timothy P. Cleary**Site Vice President
Sequoyah Nuclear Plant

April 10, 2009

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission ATTN: Document Control Desk Washington, D.C. 20555-0001

10 CFR 50.73

Gentlemen:

TENNESSEE VALLEY AUTHORITY - SEQUOYAH NUCLEAR PLANT (SQN) UNITS 1 AND 2 - DOCKET NOS. 50-327 AND 50-328 - FACILITY OPERATING LICENSE DPR-77 AND DPR-79 - LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) 50-327 AND 50-328/2009-002-00

The enclosed LER provides details concerning a condition prohibited by the SQN technical specifications (TSs) regarding select SQN reactor coolant system leakage detection equipment. The leakage detection capability of the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitors may not have satisfied the leakage rate detection requirements during required plant conditions. This report is being submitted in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73 (a) (2) (i) (B), as an event that was prohibited by the plant's TS requirements.

Sincerely.

Timothy P. Cleary

**Enclosure** 

cc: See page 2

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Page 2 April 10, 2009

Enclosure cc (Enclosure):

INPO Records Center Institute of Nuclear Power Operations 700 Galleria Parkway, SE, Suite 100 Atlanta, Georgia 30339-5957

Mr. Tracy J. Orf, Project Manager U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Mail Stop 08G-9a One White Flint North 11555 Rockville Pike Rockville, Maryland 20852-2739

NRC Resident Inspector Sequoyah Nuclear Plant 2600 Igou Ferry Road Soddy-Daisy, Tennessee 37379

NRC F	ORM 3	66	U.S	3. NUCLE	AR REGUL	ATORY (	сомміз	SION								
(9-2007)  LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)  (See reverse for required number of digits/characters for each block)						Estimated burden per response to comply with this mandatory collection request: 80 hours. Reported lessons learned are incorporated into the licensing process and fed back to industry. Send comments regarding burden estimate to the Records and FOIA/Privacy Service Branch (T-5 F52), U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Washington, DC 20555-0001, or by internet e-mail to infocollects@ncr.gov, and to the Desk Officer, Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs, NEOB-10202, (3150-0104), Office of Management and Budget, Washington, DC 20503. If a means used to impose an information collection does not display a currently valid OMB control number, the NRC may not conduct or sponsor, and a person is not required to respond to, the information collection.										
1. FAC	ILITY N								2. DOCKET NUMBER 3. PAGE							
Seq	uoyah	Nuclea	r Plant (	(SQN) U	nit 1					05000327				1 OF 6		
4. TITLE: Lower Containment Gaseous Radiation Monitor Channel Inoperable, a Resultant of Leakage Detection Capabilities																
5. E	VENT	DATE	6.	LER NUM	IBER	7. R	EPORT [	DATE	8. OTHER FACILITIES INVOLVED							
MONTH	TH DAY YEAR YEAR SEQUENTIAL REV MONTH DAY YEAR NUMBER NO.			FACILITY NAME SQN Unit 2					05000328							
02	11	2009	2009	- 002	- 00	04	10	200		FACILITY NAME DOCKI				OCKET N	JMBER	
9. OPE	RATIN	G MODE	11	. THIS RE	PORT IS S	UBMITT	ED PURS	UAN	т то	THE R	EQUIREMENT	S OF 10 C	FR §: (Ch	eck a	ll that ar	(vla
1 20.2201(b) 20.2201(d) 20.2203(a)(1) 20.2203(a)(2)(i) 20.2203(a)(2)(ii) 20.2203(a)(2)(iii) 20.2203(a)(2)(iv) 20.2203(a)(2)(v) 20.2203(a)(2)(v) 20.2203(a)(2)(v)			20.2203(a)(3)(i) 20.2203(a)(3)(ii) 20.2203(a)(4) 50.36(c)(1)(i)(A) 50.36(c)(1)(ii)(A) 50.36(c)(2) 50.46(a)(3)(ii) 50.73(a)(2)(i)(A)			)	50.73(a)(2)(i)(C) 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(A) 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(B) 50.73(a)(2)(iii) 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(A) 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A) 50.73(a)(2)(v)(B) 50.73(a)(2)(v)(C) 50.73(a)(2)(v)(D)				50.73(a)(2)(vii)  50.73(a)(2)(viii)(A)  50.73(a)(2)(viii)(B)  50.73(a)(2)(ix)(A)  50.73(a)(2)(x)  73.71(a)(4)  73.71(a)(5)  OTHER  Specify in Abstract below or in NRC Form 366A					
					12	LICEN:	SEE CON	ITACT	ΓFOF	R THIS	LER					
NAME Zachar	y T Kitts	5							TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include Area Code) 423-843-7018					Code)		
			13. CO	IPLETE C	NE LINE F	OR EAC	н сомр	ONEN	T FA	ILURE	DESCRIBED	IN THIS RI	EPORT			
CAU	SE	SYSTEM	CON	MPONENT	MANU- FACTURER		ORTABLE O EPIX		CAUS	SE	SYSTEM	COMPONE		IANU- CTUREF		PORTABLE TO EPIX
В		IJ		RI	G063		NO									
		14	. SUPPL	EMENTAL	REPORT E	EXPECT	ED				15. EXP		MON	тн	DAY	YEAR
YE	YES (If yes, complete 15. EXPECTED SUBMISSION DATE)  NO  SUBMISSION DATE															
ABSTRA	ACT (Lii	nit to 1400 s	spaces, i.e.	., approxima	ately 15 single	e-spaced t	ypewritten	lines)								
radio atmo spec subn	oactivosphe cificati nitted	ity moni re gase on (TS) a licens	tors we ous rad action se ame	ere cons dioactiv s of Limenden	sidered in ity monith niting Con t request	nopera or cha ndition t (LAR)	ible. S nnels in for Op to rem	QN s nope erat nove	suberaberaberion	seque le and 3.4.6. lowe	containme ently decla d complied 1. On No r containm	red the l I with the vember nent atm	lower co e assoc 12, 200 ospher	ontai iated 8, S e ga	inmen d tech QN seous	nical

radioactivity monitors were considered inoperable. SQN subsequently declared the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channels inoperable and complied with the associated technical specification (TS) actions of Limiting Condition for Operation 3.4.6.1. On November 12, 2008, SQN submitted a license amendment request (LAR) to remove the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channels from the SQN TSs. NRC approved the SQN LAR on December 4, 2008. On February 11, 2009, NRC documented a violation of Units 1 and 2 TS 3.4.6.1, "Leakage Detection Instrumentation," for the SQN failure to maintain the gaseous lower containment atmosphere radioactivity monitors of the reactor coolant system (RCS) leakage detection instrumentation operable. NRC concluded that the Unit 1 and 2 monitors had been inoperable since June 1987 as a result of not being able to perform their safety function of detecting a RCS pressure boundary leak of 1 gallon per minute in one hour because of improvements in reactor fuel quality. In addition, NRC exercised enforcement discretion and did not issue enforcement action for this violation in accordance with Enforcement Guidance Memorandum 09-001, "Dispositioning Violations of NRC Requirements for Operability of Gaseous Monitors for Reactor Coolant System Leakage Detection."

# NRC FORM 366A

(9-2007)

# LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
Sequoyah Nuclear Plant (SQN) Unit 1	05000327	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REVISION	2 OF 6
		2009 -	- 002	00	

<sup>17.</sup> NARRATIVE (If more space is required, use additional copies of NRC Form 366A)

### I. PLANT CONDITION(S)

Unit 1 was operating at approximately 100 percent power when the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channel was declared inoperable. Unit 2 was in Mode 5, cold shutdown, and this condition does not require the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channel to be operable.

### II. DESCRIPTION OF EVENT

#### A. Event:

On November 6, 2008, NRC verbally informed SQN that the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitors [EIIS Code RI] were considered inoperable. SQN subsequently declared the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channels inoperable and complied with the associated technical specification (TS) actions of Limiting Condition for Operation (LCO) 3.4.6.1, "Leakage Detector Instrumentation." On November 12, 2008, TVA submitted for a license amendment request (LAR) to remove the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channels from the SQN TSs. NRC approved the SQN LAR on December 4, 2008, and SQN implemented the change and exited the LCO requirement. NRC's inspection report dated February 11, 2009, documented the Unit 1 and 2 monitors had been inoperable since June 1987 as a result of not being able to perform their safety function of detecting a reactor coolant system (RCS) pressure boundary leak of 1 gallon per minute (gpm) in one hour because of improvements in reactor fuel quality.

B. Inoperable Structures, Components, or Systems that Contributed to the Event:

None.

C. Dates and Approximate Times of Major Occurrences:

November 3, 2008 NRC resident questioned the capability of the lower

containment atmospheric gaseous channels to meet TSs requirements. Regulatory Guidance-1.45 requires the leakage detection instrumentation in the TSs be capable of detecting a RCS pressure boundary leak of 1 gpm in one

hour.

November 3, 2008 Unit 2 experiences a reactor trip in which a response by the

leakage detection system is required.

November 4-5, 2008 TVA provided evidence to the NRC Resident Inspector

regarding the SQN licensing basis of the RCS leakage

detection system.

# NRC FORM 366A

(9-2007)

# LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)

1. FACILITY NAME 2. DOCKET 6. LER NUMBER			:R	3. PAGE	
Sequoyah Nuclear Plant (SQN) Unit 1	05000327	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REVISION	3 OF 6
		2009 -	- 002	00	

17. NARRATIVE (If more space is required, use additional copies of NRC Form 366A)

NRC verbally informed SQN that the lower containment November 6, 2008

atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitors were considered

inoperable.

With Unit 1 in Mode 1, SQN declared the Unit 1 lower November 6, 2008

> containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channel inoperable and complied with the appropriate LCO

actions.

November 7, 2008 Prior to Unit 2 entering Mode 4, SQN declared the Unit 2

> lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channel inoperable and complied with the

appropriate LCO actions.

SQN submitted an LAR to remove the lower containment November 8, 2008

atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channel from the

NRC approved the LAR and SQN implemented the TS December 4, 2008

change.

February 11, 2009 NRC exercised enforcement discretion in regards to an

> identified violation at SQN for failure to maintain the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor of the RCS leakage detection instrumentation operable in

accordance with Units 1 and 2 TS 3.4.6.1.

D. Other Systems or Secondary Functions Affected:

No other systems or secondary functions were affected by this event.

Method of Discovery:

NRC resident questioned the capability of the lower containment atmospheric gaseous channels to meet TS LCO 3.4.6.1 requirements.

# F. Operator Actions:

Subsequent to the dialogue with NRC on November 6, 2008, Operations declared the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channel inoperable for Unit 1 on November 6, 2008, at 1845 EST and Unit 2 on November 7, 2008, at 0426 EST during restart of the unit. Declaration of the Unit 2 lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channel being inoperable was not performed until the unit was in the mode of applicability for the channel.

#### NRC FORM 366A (9-2007)

# LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
Sequoyah Nuclear Plant (SQN) Unit 1	05000327	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REVISION	4 OF 6
		2009 -	- 002	00	

<sup>17.</sup> NARRATIVE (If more space is required, use additional copies of NRC Form 366A)

## G. Safety-System Responses:

No safety-system response was required to function at the time SQN declared the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channels inoperable. These channels do not provide an automatic safety-system start signal.

### III. CAUSE OF THE EVENT

#### A. Immediate Cause:

Regulatory requirement for the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitors to detect a 1 gpm in one hour of an RCS leak based on realistic source terms.

### B. Root Cause:

SQN interpreted its licensing basis to not require detection of 1 gpm in one hour of an RCS leak by the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitors in all plant conditions, based on NRC correspondence during original plant licensing. Upon further review and discussions with the NRC, TVA made a decision to declare its lower containment gaseous radioactivity monitors inoperable and enter TS 3.4.6.1 for both units.

### C. Contributing Factor:

TVA did not consider the SQN licensing basis for the RCS leakage detection system to require detection of 1 gpm in one hour RCS leak by the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitors during all plant conditions. This consideration is based on the NRC safety evaluation of the RCS leakage detection system in Section 5.2.4 of NUREG-0011, "Safety Evaluation Report by the Office Of Nuclear Reactor Regulation U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission In the Matter of Tennessee Valley Authority Sequoyah Nuclear Plant Units 1 And 2 Docket Nos. 50-327 and 50-328." Also, TVA informed Atomic Energy Commission (AEC) of its RCS leakage detection system capability to meet Regulatory Guide (RG) 1.45, "Reactor Coolant Pressure Boundary Leakage Detection System," May 1973. TVA's response stated full compliance with RG-1.45 could not be met because the system was designed, contracted for, and partially installed prior to the issuance of the RG.

# LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
Sequoyah Nuclear Plant (SQN) Unit 1	05000327	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REVISION	5 OF 6
		2009 -	- 002	00	

<sup>17.</sup> NARRATIVE (If more space is required, use additional copies of NRC Form 366A)

### IV. ANALYSIS OF THE EVENT

On November 3, 2008, NRC resident questioned the capability of the lower containment atmospheric gaseous channels to meet LCO 3.4.6.1. RG-1.45 requires the leakage detection instrumentation in the TSs be capable of detecting a RCS pressure boundary leak of 1 gpm in one hour. Later on November 3, 2008, SQN Unit 2 experienced a reactor trip in which the leakage detection system responded. However, the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor did not provide helpful information to the Operators.

The leakage detection system primarily consists of two lower containment atmospheric radioactivity monitors (gaseous and particulate) and the containment pocket sump level instrumentation [EIIS Code LI]. Although, the lower containment gaseous radioactivity monitor channel may not be capable of detecting a 1 gpm in one hour RCS leak under all plant conditions, the leakage detection system would meet the regulatory requirement for detection of leakage from the RCS pressure boundary and would have fulfilled the safety analysis requirements.

### V. ASSESSMENT OF SAFETY CONSEQUENCES

Based on the above "Analysis of The Event," this event did not adversely affect the health and safety of plant personnel or the general public.

### VI. CORRECTIVE ACTIONS

### A. Immediate Corrective Actions:

SQN declared each unit's lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channel inoperable and entered into the appropriate action of LCO 3.4.6.1.

### B. Corrective Actions to Prevent Recurrence:

On November 12, 2008, TVA requested an LAR for each SQN unit to remove the lower containment atmosphere gaseous radioactivity monitor channel from the TSs. On December 4, 2008, NRC approved SQN's request.

### VII. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

### A. Failed Components:

None.

(9-2007)

# LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
Sequoyah Nuclear Plant (SQN) Unit 1	05000327	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REVISION	6 OF 6
		2009 -	- 002	00	

<sup>17.</sup> NARRATIVE (If more space is required, use additional copies of NRC Form 366A)

### B. Previous LERs on Similar Events:

Review of license event reports for Units 1 and 2 since 2004 found no previous similar events related to non-compliance with TSs.

### C. Additional Information:

TVA selected February 11, 2009, as the starting date for reporting this event based on the issuance of NRC Inspection Report 0500327 and 0500328/2008-005, and the active NRC regulatory response to this issue.

## D. Safety System Functional Failure:

This event did not result in a safety-system functional failure in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(v).

## E. Unplanned Scram with Complications:

This condition did not result in an unplanned scram with complications.

### VIII. COMMITMENTS

None.