



UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

January 8, 2009

Mr. J. V. Parrish
Chief Executive Officer
Energy Northwest
P.O. Box 968 (Mail Drop 1023)
Richland, WA 99352-0968

SUBJECT: COLUMBIA GENERATING STATION - REQUEST FOR WITHHOLDING
INFORMATION FROM PUBLIC DISCLOSURE (TAC NO. MD9247)

Dear Mr. Parrish:

By letter dated January 2, 2009, Energy Northwest submitted an affidavit dated October 30, 2008, executed by Anthony P. Reese, Global Nuclear Fuel - Americas, LLC (GNF-A), requesting that the information contained in the following document be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR) Section 2.390:

GNF S-0000-0092-8136P Revision 0, "GE14 Thermal Hydraulic Compatibility With Columbia Legacy Fuel," dated October 2008.

The document is included in Enclosure 2 to Energy Northwest's letter to the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) dated January 2, 2009. A nonproprietary copy of this document has been placed in the NRC's Public Document Room and added to the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System Public Electronic Reading Room.

The affidavit stated that the submitted information should be considered exempt from mandatory public disclosure for the following reasons:

- The information...is classified as proprietary because it contains details of GNF-A's fuel design and licensing methodology.

The development of the methods used in these analyses, along with the testing, development, and approval of the supporting methodology was achieved at a significant cost, on the order of several million dollars, to GNF-A or its licensor.
 - Public disclosure of the information sought to be withheld is likely to cause substantial harm to GNF-A's competitive position and foreclose or reduce the availability of profit-making opportunities. The information is part of GNF-A's comprehensive BWR [boiling-water reactor] safety and technology base, and its commercial value extends beyond the original development cost. The value of
-

the technology base goes beyond the extensive physical database and analytical methodology and includes development of the expertise to determine and apply the appropriate evaluation process. In addition, the technology base includes the value derived from providing analyses done with NRC-approved methods.

The research, development, engineering, analytical, and NRC review costs comprise a substantial investment of time and money by GNF-A or its licensor.

The precise value of the expertise to devise an evaluation process and apply the correct analytical methodology is difficult to quantify, but it clearly is substantial.

GNF-A's competitive advantage will be lost if its competitors are able to use the results of the GNF-A experience to normalize or verify their own process or if they are able to claim an equivalent understanding by demonstrating that they can arrive at the same or similar conclusions.

The value of this information to GNF-A would be lost if the information were disclosed to the public. Making such information available to competitors without their having been required to undertake a similar expenditure of resources would unfairly provide competitors with a windfall, and deprive GNF-A of the opportunity to exercise its competitive advantage to seek an adequate return on its large investment in developing and obtaining these very valuable analytical tools.

We have reviewed your application and the material in accordance with the requirements of 10 CFR 2.390 and, on the basis of the statements in the affidavit, have determined that the submitted information sought to be withheld contains proprietary commercial information and should be withheld from public disclosure.

Therefore, the version of the submitted information marked as proprietary will be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.390(b)(5) and Section 103(b) of the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, as amended.

Withholding from public inspection shall not affect the right, if any, of persons properly and directly concerned to inspect the documents. If the need arises, we may send copies of this information to our consultants working in this area. We will, of course, ensure that the consultants have signed the appropriate agreements for handling proprietary information.


If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You also should understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

J.V. Parish

- 3 -

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at 301-415-2296.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "C. F. Lyon". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly stylized font.

Carl F. Lyon, Project Manager
Plant Licensing Branch IV
Division of Operating Reactor Licensing
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-397

cc: See next page

Columbia Generating Station

cc:

Anthony P. Reese
Global Nuclear Fuel - Americas, LLC
PO Box 780
Wilmington, NC 28402-0780

Additional Distribution via Listserv

January 8, 2009

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at 301-415-2296.

Sincerely,

/RA/

Carl F. Lyon, Project Manager
Plant Licensing Branch IV
Division of Operating Reactor Licensing
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-397

cc: See next page

DISTRIBUTION:

PUBLIC

RidsNrrDorlLpl4

RidsOgcRp

LPLIV Reading

RidsNrrPMColumbia Resource

RidsRgnMailCenter

RidsAcrsAcnw&mMailCenter

RidsNrrLAGLappert

ADAMS Accession No. ML090060223

OFFICE	NRR/LPL4/PM	NRR/LPL4/LA	SRXB/BC	NRR/LPL4/BC	NRR/LPL4/PM
NAME	FLyon	GLappert	GCranston	MMarkley	FLyon
DATE	1/8/09	1/8/09	1/8/09	1/8/09	1/8/09

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY