

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION**

BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of)	Docket No. 52-011-ESP
Southern Nuclear Operating Company)	ASLBP No. 07-850-01-ESP-BD01
(Early Site Permit for Vogtle ESP Site))	December 18, 2008

**JOINT MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING ACCESS
TO AND DISCLOSURE OF TRADE SECRETS AND/OR CONFIDENTIAL
COMMERCIAL OR FINANCIAL INFORMATION**

Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. §2.323, applicant Southern Nuclear Operating Company (“Southern”); the Center for a Sustainable Coast, Savannah Riverkeeper, Southern Alliance for Clean Energy, Atlanta Women’s Action for New Directions, and Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League (collectively, the “Intervenors”); and the Nuclear Regulatory Commission Staff (“NRC Staff”) hereby file this joint motion seeking that the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board (“Board”) issue a Protective Order governing access to and disclosure of certain information constituting trade secrets and/or confidential commercial or financial information of Southern and its vendors or contractors. The parties unanimously request that the Board adopt the enclosed draft Protective Order and the Non-Disclosure Declaration, both enclosed as Attachment 1 hereto. However, as provided in the Protective Order, the NRC Staff is not obligated to participate in this Protective Order and may obtain the subject proprietary information under a separate agreement.

The need for a Protective Order arises from the general discovery provisions in 10 C.F.R. §2.336. Under those provisions, and subject to the terms of the parties’ agreement as set forth in the Board’s Memorandum and Order of April 3, 2007 (Ruling Regarding Joint Motion on

Mandatory Disclosures and Scheduling Prehearing Conference), Southern is required to furnish the Intervenor and NRC Staff documents that are relevant to the admitted contentions in this proceeding. Included among the documents being provided are several that contain proprietary trade secrets and/or confidential commercial and financial information that should be held in confidence by the Intervenor and NRC Staff pursuant to the policy reflected in 10 C.F.R. §§2.390(a)(4) and 9.17(a)(4). Further, the continuing duty of disclosures established by 10 C.F.R. §2.336(d) may require the production of a number of additional documents containing similar proprietary and confidential information.

Counsel for Southern have been authorized by counsel for the Intervenor and NRC Staff to submit this motion on their behalf. The undersigned respectfully requests that the Board issue the attached Protective Order and Non-Disclosure Declaration as a suitable mechanism to be used in this proceeding to govern access to and disclosure of information constituting trade secrets and/or confidential commercial or financial information of Southern and its vendors and contractors.

Respectfully submitted,

[Original signed by M. Stanford Blanton]

M. Stanford Blanton, Esq.

C. Grady Moore, III, Esq.

BALCH & BINGHAM LLP

1710 Sixth Avenue North

Birmingham, AL 35203-2015

Telephone: (205) 251-8100

Facsimile: (205) 226-8798

COUNSEL FOR SOUTHERN NUCLEAR OPERATING
COMPANY

Kathryn M. Sutton, Esq.

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20004

Telephone: (202) 739-5738

Facsimile: (202) 739-3001

CO-COUNSEL FOR SOUTHERN NUCLEAR
OPERATING COMPANY

ATTACHMENT 1

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION**

ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD PANEL

Before the Licensing Board:

**G. Paul Bollwerk, III, Chairman
Nicholas G. Trikouros
Dr. James F. Jackson**

<p>In the Matter of SOUTHERN NUCLEAR OPERATING CO. (Early Site Permit for Vogtle ESP Site)</p>

Docket No. 52-011-ESP

ASLBP No. 07-850-01-ESP-BD01

MEMORANDUM AND ORDER

(Protective Order Governing Disclosure of Proprietary Materials)

This protective order governs the disclosure and use in this proceeding of certain documents that applicant Southern Nuclear Operating Company (“Southern”) claims contain proprietary trade secrets and/or commercial or financial information of Southern or its vendors and contractors.¹ Pursuant to this protective order, counsel, witnesses, employees, consultants, and others representing the Center for a Sustainable Coast, Savannah Riverkeeper, Southern Alliance for Clean Energy, Atlanta Women’s Action for New Directions, and Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League (collectively, the “Intervenors”) or representing the Nuclear Regulatory Commission Staff (“NRC Staff”) shall be permitted access to such documents upon the conditions set forth herein. Except as otherwise expressly set forth herein, this protective

¹ The provisions of this protective order do not restrict use by NRC counsel, witnesses, employees, consultants, and others representing NRC Staff of documents containing protected material that NRC is entitled to receive apart from its role as a litigant in this proceeding (e.g., documents containing information required to be submitted to NRC by statute, regulation, or license condition or information submitted to, or acquired by, NRC in support of a requested licensing action or in fulfillment of its regulatory responsibilities). Rather, NRC’s use of such documents is governed by 10 C.F.R. §§2.390, 2.709, 9.17, and 9.25. The provisions of this protective order apply to NRC counsel, witnesses, employees, consultants, and others representing the NRC Staff with respect to documents containing protected material that NRC receives solely pursuant to 10 C.F.R. §2.336 and this protective order.

order shall remain in effect until specifically modified or terminated by the Atomic Safety Licensing Board (the “Board”) or the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (“NRC” or the “Commission”).

Those persons who are qualified pursuant to this protective order and who have executed a non-disclosure declaration (a “Non-Disclosure Declaration”) in the form of that attached hereto and incorporated herein, shall be permitted access to proprietary information under the following conditions:

A. If counsel for Southern in good faith believes that a document or portion thereof contains information that qualifies under 10 C.F.R. §2.390(a)(4) and (b)(4)(i)-(v) as a trade secret and/or commercial or financial information that is privileged and confidential, then he or she may designate it as such, and it shall be protected in accordance with the terms and conditions of this protective order. Each such document shall hereinafter be referred to as a “Proprietary Document.” Southern shall (a) prominently mark each Proprietary Document on the first page with a conspicuous “Proprietary” label, and, (b) on or before the later of (i) the date seven (7) business days after the date of this protective order, or (ii) the date seven (7) business days after the date a party requests a copy of the Proprietary Document, produce a copy with the proprietary information unredacted to the duly authorized representatives of the party requesting the Proprietary Document (as defined in paragraph F), provided each such representative has signed a Non-Disclosure Declaration.

B. Proprietary Documents shall be deemed to contain proprietary trade secrets and/or commercial and financial information required to be held in confidence pursuant to the policy reflected in 10 C.F.R. § 2.390(a)(4). The Intervenors, and, if it chooses to access or accept Proprietary Documents, the NRC Staff, shall hold such documents in confidence and in compliance with the terms and conditions of this protective order.²

² This Protective Order, and the good faith representation and designation of documents as Proprietary Documents by counsel for Southern, serves in lieu of the requirement for marking and for an affidavit under 10 C.F.R. §

C. The Board shall resolve any disputes arising under this protective order. Prior to presenting any such dispute to the Board, the parties to the dispute shall consult and use their best efforts, including the use of redaction, to resolve such dispute.

D. Any party that objects to the designation of a document as proprietary shall file a motion with the Board stating the party's objection, and specifying the portions of the document that should be disclosed. Within seven (7) business days, Southern shall have the burden of showing that information in the Proprietary Document is a trade secret and/or commercial or financial information that is privileged and confidential so that the Board can determine, as applicable, whether, on balance, it warrants protection under 10 C.F.R. §2.390.

E. If a party files a motion under the preceding paragraph then, pending a ruling by the Board, the Proprietary Documents in question shall continue to be held in confidence. If the Board rules that a document does not qualify for the asserted privilege, or that, on balance, the document should be disclosed without the restrictions of this protective order, then the unrestricted use of such documents may begin ten (10) business days after the Board's decision. If, during such time, Southern files an interlocutory appeal or request that the issue be certified to the Commission, such period of time shall be extended for an additional five (5) business days, during which time the Board or Commission may consider a request for any further stay.

F. Only individual counsel (including, without limitation, student-attorneys of the Turner Environmental Law Clinic), consultants, witnesses (including witnesses from the U.S.

2.390(b) and allows the NRC Staff to receive Proprietary Documents and to protect their confidentiality under FOIA. However, the NRC Staff (as well as any representative of the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers participating at the request of the NRC Staff) is not obligated to participate in this Order or to obtain Proprietary Documents hereunder. The NRC Staff may instead access the documents under an alternate approach as follows, or in any other way that Southern and the NRC Staff agree is appropriate: Rather than producing the potentially proprietary documents to the NRC Staff in their entirety under this protective order, Southern would retain a set of the documents at a mutually acceptable location for inspection by the NRC Staff. The NRC Staff would then inspect the documents and identify a list for production to the NRC Staff. These documents would then be submitted to the agency pursuant to the procedures of § 2.390 and would be dispositioned thereunder.

Army Corps of Engineers participating at the request of the NRC Staff), employees, and others representing the Intervenors or NRC Staff who have executed the attached Non-Disclosure Declaration may have access to the Proprietary Documents. The Proprietary Documents shall only be used as necessary for the conduct of this proceeding. The Proprietary Documents shall not be disclosed in any manner to any person except (a) the Board and its staff, and (b) those engaged in the conduct of this proceeding who have executed a Non-Disclosure Declaration and who, in the reasonable opinion of the party who has received the Proprietary Documents, need to know the information contained in the Proprietary Documents in order to carry out their responsibilities in this proceeding. Individuals with access to Proprietary Documents may make copies of and take notes on the confidential information contained in the documents, but such copies and notes become Proprietary Documents subject to the terms of this protective order.

G. Counsel, consultants, witnesses, employees, and others representing a party who receive documents subject to the terms of this protective order shall maintain the confidentiality of the information contained therein as required in the Non-Disclosure Declaration.

H. Counsel shall take all reasonable precautions necessary to assure that Proprietary Documents and the information contained therein are not distributed to unauthorized persons. Counsel are responsible for ensuring that persons under their supervision or control comply with this protective order.

I. All pleadings, testimony, exhibits and correspondence in this proceeding that contain information derived from a Proprietary Document shall be treated as confidential and if served:

1. be served via the Commission's electronic submittal system, but shall be excluded from the public docket for this proceeding by selecting the non-public filing option on the electronic filing system website; and

2. be served only on counsel for Southern, the Assistant for Rulemakings and Adjudications in the Office of the Secretary, the NRC Staff³, a representative of the Intervenors who has signed a Non-Disclosure Declaration, and the individual members of the Licensing Board.

J. At any hearing or conference in this proceeding in which a statement is made by a representative of a party, or a witness is questioned, concerning a Proprietary Document or information contained therein, the statement or testimony shall be given *in camera* or under other suitable conditions as this Board may establish, and the record of that portion of the hearing and any transcript thereof, shall be withheld from distribution to the public. It shall be the duty of the presenting party to notify the Board and Southern that such testimony or statement will contain proprietary information, prior to the testimony or statement being made.

K. A party intending to file or submit any pleading, testimony, exhibit, or correspondence in this proceeding that contains a Proprietary Document or information derived from a Proprietary Document, shall notify counsel for Southern in writing, as soon as the party is aware of the likely use of the Proprietary Document and, to the fullest extent possible, no less than five (5) business days prior to the date of the intended filing; provided, however, that such notice shall be provided to Southern no less than ten (10) business days prior to a hearing. Such notice shall identify the Proprietary Document(s) that the party intends to use or include. Unless Southern submits an affidavit conforming to the requirements of 10 C.F.R. §§ 2.390(b)(1)(ii) and (iii) within ten (10) business days after the filing of such pleading, testimony, exhibit, or correspondence, the protections of this protective order shall automatically cease to apply to the Proprietary Document.

³ The NRC Staff should be served as provided in this paragraph if counsel for the NRC Staff has either executed a Non-Disclosure Declaration or Southern has provided the subject Proprietary Document to counsel for the NRC Staff pursuant to an alternative approach as stated in fn 2, supra.

L. Proprietary Documents shall remain available until the date that an order terminating this proceeding is no longer subject to judicial review. The parties shall, within fifteen (15) business days of the date described above, return the Proprietary Documents to counsel for Southern or shall destroy that material, except that copies of filings, transcripts, and exhibits in this proceeding that contain such information and notes taken by persons reviewing proprietary material, may be retained if they are maintained in a secure place such that no distribution of the information to unauthorized individuals will occur. Within such time period, each party receiving Proprietary Documents shall submit to counsel for Southern an affidavit stating that, to the best of his or her actual knowledge, all Proprietary Documents have been returned or destroyed, or, in the case of filings, transcripts, exhibits, or notes in this proceeding, that such documents will be maintained in a secure place such that no distribution of the information to unauthorized individuals will occur. To the extent that such filings, transcripts, exhibits, and notes are not returned or destroyed, they shall remain subject to the provisions of this protective order.

M. Counsel, consultants, employees, or any other individuals representing a party who have reason to believe that Proprietary Documents may have been lost or misplaced or may have otherwise become available to unauthorized persons during the pendency of this proceeding shall notify the Board and counsel for Southern promptly of their concerns and the reasons for them.

N. Any violation of the terms of this protective order or a Non-Disclosure Declaration executed in furtherance of this protective order may result in the imposition of such sanctions as the Board may deem appropriate, including, but not limited to, referral of the violation to appropriate bar associations and/or other disciplinary authorities.

O. Nothing in this protective order precludes the Intervenors, Southern, or the NRC staff from seeking changes in it from the Board or the Commission as future circumstances warrant.

P. Nothing in this protective order shall be deemed to preclude any party from independently seeking, through discovery in any other administrative or judicial proceeding, any Proprietary Document or information produced in this proceeding under this protective order. In addition, if information identified in this proceeding as proprietary comes into the possession of, or is known by any party independently of the Proprietary Document produced in this proceeding, and such knowledge was acquired without violation of law or other requirement applicable to such party to keep such information confidential, use of that document or information in this proceeding, without compliance with the terms of this protective order, shall not be a violation of the terms of this protective order. The party asserting independent knowledge of the contents of Proprietary Documents or independent access to such documents, shall have the burden of proving that such information was independently obtained in the event that Southern asserts that disclosure of such information or document was a violation of this protective order.

Q. Each executed Non-Disclosure Declaration shall be served on the parties before it is deemed in effect. This service shall be accomplished through the use of e-mail alone.

R. The Board may alter or amend this protective order as circumstances warrant at any time during the course of this proceeding.

It is so ORDERED.

**FOR THE ATOMIC SAFETY
AND LICENSING BOARD**

G. Paul Bollwerk, III
CHAIRMAN

Rockville, Maryland
[Insert Date]

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION**

ATOMIC SAFETY AND LICENSING BOARD PANEL

Before the Licensing Board:

**G. Paul Bollwerk, III, Chairman
Nicholas G. Trikouros
Dr. James Jackson**

<p>In the Matter of SOUTHERN NUCLEAR OPERATING CO. (Early Site Permit for Vogtle ESP Site)</p>

Docket No. 52-011-ESP

ASLBP No. 07-850-01-ESP-BD01

NON-DISCLOSURE DECLARATION

Under penalty of perjury, I hereby certify that (i) access to “Proprietary Documents”, as that term is defined in the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board’s Protective Order dated December __, 2008 (the “Protective Order”), has been provided to me pursuant to the terms and restrictions of the Protective Order; (ii) I have been given a copy and have read the Protective Order; and (iii) I agree to be bound by the terms of the Protective Order. I understand and agree that Proprietary Documents, their contents, or any notes or other memoranda summarizing or otherwise describing their contents, or any form of information that derives from the Proprietary Documents and copies or discloses the contents of the Proprietary Documents, shall be held in confidence and shall not be disclosed to anyone except in accordance with the Protective Order. I acknowledge that a violation of this declaration or the Protective Order, which incorporates the terms of this declaration, constitutes a violation of an order of the Nuclear Regulatory Commission and may result in the imposition of such sanctions as the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board or the Nuclear Regulatory Commission may deem to be appropriate.

WHEREFORE, I do solemnly swear to protect such Proprietary Documents, and their contents, as may be disclosed to me in this proceeding, in accordance with the terms of this declaration.

[Note: For NRC representatives executing this Non-Disclosure Declaration, an executed agreement will be modified to contain the following additional sentence: “My agreement and acknowledgement, however, are not binding on the Nuclear Regulatory Commission’s fulfillment of its obligations under the Freedom of Information Act.”]

Name (printed): _____

Title: _____

Employed by or Representing: _____

Signature: _____

Date: _____