HLWYM HEmails

From: Bret Leslie
Sent: Wednesday, October 03, 2007 4:42 PM
To: Chandrika Manepally; James Myers; Osvaldo Pensado; Ronald Green; Roberto Pabalan; Christopher Markley; David Brooks; Randall Fedors
Subject: Fwd: Programmatic Review of Paper, "Probabilistic Methodology to Estimate Environmental Conditions f
Attachments: ML072760086.APK; distribution.txt

Randy et al,
I wrote the below before I read your email about keeping Chris in the loop on DST. I tried to capture the chemical issue in my comments on this proposed journal article. Please forward to those I missed. I have always meant to do the science to address the issue, but have never had the time. NOTE: That my concerns are well captured in DOE's LSN collection (captured phone conversations)... so wemay need an answer. Please forward to anyone I missed on distribtion. Thanks,
Bret

>>> Bret Leslie 10/03/2007 4:34 PM >>>
Tae,
I quickly reviewed this document as part of my preparations for the upcoming TPA briefing to ACNW&M.
1. My standard complaint on the imprecision of characterizing seepage water chemistry pertains to this paper. In essence, the Center has used the fundamental assumption that the chemical constituents and their ratios in the pore water are indicative of water that flows under thermal condtions and contributes to seepage. This is, as of yet, an untested assumption. The only known waters that flowed under repository-relevant conditions (e.g. affected by thermal-related FEPS) are those collected and analyzed as part of the Drift Scale Heater test. Until someone demonstrates that starting compositions and their evolution of Drift-scale water that seeped/flowed down fractures and into open borehole is comparable to pore waters starting and evolved compositions, we are on less than solid ground for using pore waters as being representative of seepage water compositions. This criticism is especially relevant in this paper as there is major discussion of "feasible" water compositions, which will need to be substantially clarified if drift scale heater test fluids are not included in the analysis, as these are the most likely feasible starting water compositions.

2. Everytime the phrase "underground waters" is used, it should be replaced with pore water (e.g., abstract and conclusion sections).

3. On page 5 "Thirty-three **pore water** not water compositions were used as input to the evaporation simulations selected ..."
cheers,
Bret
>>> E-RIDS2 10/03/2007 10:51 AM >>>
ADAMS DISTRIBUTION NOTIFICATION.
NMSS06 - CNWRA Contract Deliverable HLW (WM-00011)

Title: Programmatic Review of Paper, "Probabilistic Methodology to Estimate Environmental Conditions for Localized Corrosion and Stress Corrosion Cracking of Alloy 22 in a High-Level Radioactive Waste Repository Setting," (AI No. 06002.01.322.710).
Docket Number: WM-00011
Document Date: 10/02/2007
Author Name: Mohanty S
Author Affiliation: Center for Nuclear Waste Regulatory Analyses (CNWRA)
Addressee Name: DeMarco D A
Addressee Affiliation: NRC/NMSS/DHLWRS
Document Type: Letter
Availability: Non-Publicly Available
Document Sensitivity: Non-Sensitive
Comment: EIE Submittal

Electronic Recipients can RIGHT CLICK and OPEN the first Attachment to View the Document in ADAMS. The Document may also be viewed by searching for Accession Number ML072760086.

Hearing Identifier: HLW_YuccaMountain_Hold_EX
Email Number: 480

Mail Envelope Properties (s703c66a.078)

Subject: Fwd: Programmatic Review of Paper, "Probabilistic Methodology to Estimate Environmental Conditions f
Sent Date: 10/3/2007 4:41:49 PM
Received Date: 10/3/2007 4:42:59 PM
From: Bret Leslie

Created By: Bret.Leslie@nrc.gov

Recipients:
"Chandrika Manepally" <cmanepally@cnwra.swri.edu>
Tracking Status: None
"James Myers" <jmyers@cnwra.swri.edu>
Tracking Status: None
"Osvaldo Pensado" <opensado@cnwra.swri.edu>
Tracking Status: None
"Ronald Green" <rgreen@cnwra.swri.edu>
Tracking Status: None
"Roberto Pabalan" <rpabalan@cnwra.swri.edu>
Tracking Status: None
"Christopher Markley" <Christopher.Markley@nrc.gov>
Tracking Status: None
"David Brooks" <David.Brooks@nrc.gov>
Tracking Status: None
"Randall Fedors" <Randall.Fedors@nrc.gov>
Tracking Status: None

Post Office: NRNWMS05.NRC.GOV

Files	**Size**	**Date & Time**
MESSAGE	3006	10/3/2007 4:42:59 PM
ML072760086.APK	171	
distribution.txt	4751	

Options
Priority: Standard
Return Notification: No
Reply Requested: No
Sensitivity: Normal
Expiration Date:
Recipients Received:

Navigation to the webpage was canceled

What you can try:

- Retype the address.

Distribution Sheet

Priority: Normal

From: E-RIDS2

Action Recipients:	Copies:	
Shirley Rohrer	0	OK
RidsNmssPMKChang	0	OK
RidsNmssPMASapountzis	0	OK
Jon Chen	0	OK
Alicia Mullins	0	OK

Internal Recipients:

zzzFILE CENTER 01	1	Paper Copy
William Ford	0	OK
Tina Ghosh	0	OK
Timothy McCartin	0	OK
Thomas Matula	0	OK
Tae Ahn	0	OK
Sheena Whaley	0	OK
Rosemary Reeves	0	OK
Robert Johnson	0	OK
RidsNmssLASKim	0	OK
RidsNmssDhlwrs	0	OK
RidsManager	0	OK
RidsAdmDcpmMailCenter	0	OK
Randall Fedors	0	OK
Philip Justus	0	OK
N King Stablein	0	OK
Mysore Nataraja	0	OK
Mitzi Young	0	OK
Marian Zobler	0	OK
Mahendra Shah	0	OK
Lawrence Kokajko	0	OK
Kien Chang	0	OK
Keith Compton	0	OK
John Trapp	0	OK
John Bradbury	0	OK
Jin-Ping Gwo	0	OK
Jeffrey Pohle	0	OK
Janice Moore	0	OK
Janet Kotra	0	OK
James Rubenstone	0	OK
Jack Guttmann	0	OK
Jack Davis	0	OK
Eugene Peters	0	OK
Dennis Galvin	0	OK
Deborah DeMarco	0	OK
David Brooks	0	OK
Christopher Ryder	0	OK
Christopher Grossman	0	OK
Christine Schulte	0	OK
Brittain Hill	0	OK
Brian Benney	0	OK
Bret Leslie	0	OK

Andy Campbell	0	OK
Allen Fetter	0	OK
Albert Wong	0	OK
Aby Mohseni	0	OK
Abou-Bakr Ibrahim	0	OK

External Recipients:

Maria Padilla	0	OK

Total Copies: 1

Item: ADAMS Package
Library: ml_adams^hqntad01
ID: 072760086

Subject:
Programmatic Review of Paper, "Probabilistic Methodology to Estimate Environmental Conditions for Localized Corrosion and Stress Corrosion Cracking of Alloy 22 in a High-Level Radioactive Waste Repository Setting," (AI No. 06002.01.322.710). Document Date: 10/02/2007

Body:
ADAMS DISTRIBUTION NOTIFICATION.
NMSS06 - CNWRA Contract Deliverable HLW (WM-00011)

Title: Programmatic Review of Paper, "Probabilistic Methodology to Estimate Environmental Conditions for Localized Corrosion and Stress Corrosion Cracking of Alloy 22 in a High-Level Radioactive Waste Repository Setting," (AI No. 06002.01.322.710).
Docket Number: WM-00011
Document Date: 10/02/2007
Author Name: Mohanty S
Author Affiliation: Center for Nuclear Waste Regulatory Analyses (CNWRA)
Addressee Name: DeMarco D A
Addressee Affiliation: NRC/NMSS/DHLWRS
Document Type: Letter
Availability: Non-Publicly Available
Document Sensitivity: Non-Sensitive
Comment: EIE Submittal

Electronic Recipients can RIGHT CLICK and OPEN the first Attachment to View the Document in ADAMS. The Document may also be viewed by searching for Accession Number ML072760086.