

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION**

BEFORE THE COMMISSION

In the Matter of)	Docket No. PAPO-00
)	
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY)	ASLBP No. 04-829-01-PAPO
)	
(High Level Waste Repository: Pre-Application Matters))	May 30, 2008

**STATE OF NEVADA'S OPPOSITION TO NYE COUNTY'S MOTION FOR LEAVE
TO FILE *AMICUS* BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF DOE'S APPEAL**

In accordance with 10 C.F.R. §2.323(c), the State of Nevada ("Nevada") files this Answer opposing Nye County's Motion for Leave to File *Amicus* Brief in Support of DOE Appeal from the PAPO Board's April 23, 2008 Order Denying DOE Motion to Strike Nevada LSN Certification. Nevada will show that Nye County's Motion should be denied; should it be granted, Nevada requests a reasonable time after the Commission's order in which to respond to Nye County's *Amicus* Brief on its merits.

I. INTRODUCTION

Nevada filed its initial LSN certification on January 17, 2008. Nye County also did so, on the same date. While Nye County brags that no party challenged its LSN certification, it ignores the fact that Nye County itself neither filed any motion regarding Nevada's LSN certification within the ten-day period permitted after January 17, nor did it join, in any way, the challenge to Nevada's certification filed by the U.S. Department of Energy ("DOE") on January 27, 2008. After observing in silence while DOE prosecuted its unsuccessful Motion to Strike Nevada's LSN Certification, and while DOE proceeded to appeal the PAPO's April 23, 2008 decision denying DOE's motion, Nye County now belatedly comes forward, long after all deadlines for either challenging Nevada's LSN or participating in DOE's appeal have gone by,

and seeks leave to advance arguments which misstate and misconstrue the PAPO Board decision, and which ignore the scope and rationale of DOE's appeal which Nye County "supports" and attempts to raise matters not germane to either the DOE appeal or the PAPO Board decision.

II. **ARGUMENT**

Nye County's Motion for Leave to File *Amicus* Brief in Support of DOE Appeal should be denied for the following reasons:

A. **Failure to Confer:**

Nye County recites that it intends "to participate fully in all aspects of the Yucca Mountain licensing proceedings" and that it has done so ever since the 1987 rulemaking which led to the current Licensing Support Network. Nye County is, accordingly, aware of, and bound by, NRC regulation 10 C.F.R. 2.323(b), which provides:

A motion must be **rejected** if it does not include a certification by the attorney or representative of the moving party that the movant has made a sincere effort to contact other parties in the proceeding and resolve the issue(s) raised in the motion, and that the movant's efforts to resolve the issue(s) have been unsuccessful.

(emphasis added).

Nye County wholly failed to so certify, or more importantly, to conduct the prerequisite effort to confer and resolve. Accordingly, Nye County's Motion "must be rejected."

B. **Nye County is a Potential Party, not an *Amicus*:**

Nye County insists its intention is "to intervene, and participate fully, in all aspects of the Yucca Mountain licensing proceedings." Nye County states that it is an affected unit of local government under Sections 116 and 117 of the Nuclear Waste Policy Act, 42 U.S.C. 10136 and 10137. The Commission's definitions in 10 C.F.R. 2.1001 provide that "a **party** for the purpose of this subpart means the DOE, the NRC Staff, the host state, and any affected unit of local

government as defined in Section 2 of the Nuclear Waste Policy Act of 1982, as amended" (emphasis added). As recently as March 26, 2008, Nye County exercised its party status, filing a Motion in the licensing proceeding to implement and institutionalize webcasting of Yucca proceedings. In addition, Nye County certified its LSN collection on January 17, 2008, and has supplemented it on a monthly basis, up to and including April 30, 2008. Accordingly, it is odd, and inconsistent, for Nye County to elect neither to challenge Nevada's LSN certification nor to participate in DOE's challenge below, but then to belatedly attempt to enter the side door of the appeal by feigning the position of an "*Amicus*."

Tellingly, the regulatory provision under which Nye County seeks to file is 10 C.F.R. 2.315, which specifically applies to a **person not a party**. Section 2.315(d) provides: "a person who is not a party may, in the discretion of the Commission, be permitted to file a brief '*amicus curiae*'." It is doubtful that Nye County truly intends to relinquish its status as a party just to file this *Amicus* brief, yet Section 2.315(a) provides that an *Amicus* "may not otherwise participate in the proceeding." Nye County is not an "*Amicus Curiae*," but an interested party or potential party in this proceeding, and its *Amicus* brief is not authorized by the Commission's rules..

C. Nye County's Motion is Untimely:

By any applicable standard, Nye County's Motion for Leave to File *Amicus* Brief in Support of DOE Appeal is past any conceivable deadline, and this is dispositive. According to NRC regulation 10 C.F.R. 2.1015(b), a notice of appeal and supporting brief challenging a PAPO Board order must be filed with the Commission no later than ten days after service of the order. In this appeal, that deadline was May 5, 2008, and was met by DOE. According to the very provision regarding "*Amicus*" status on which Nye County attempts to rely, any *Amicus* brief "must be filed within the time allowed to the party's whose position the brief will support."

10 C.F.R. 2.315(d). Accordingly, even if Nye County were considered an "*Amicus Curiae*," which it is not, its "*Amicus* Brief in support of DOE appeal" was due to have been filed on or before May 5, 2008. It was not filed until May 20, 2008, nor did Nye County seek or receive any extension of time to so file. Even hypothesizing that Nye County sought to file a Brief **in opposition** to DOE's (which it did not), Nye County likewise missed the deadline for that filing, as well. 10 C.F.R. 2.1015(b) provides that: "Any other party, interested governmental participant, or potential party may file a brief in opposition to the appeal no later than ten (10) days after service of the appeal." This date would have been May 15, 2008. Again, Nye County neither met this date nor sought an extension thereof (nor was its brief in opposition to, but was rather in support of, DOE's). Nye County's Motion is accordingly, by any measure, untimely and must be denied.

D. Nye County's *Amicus* is Irrelevant to DOE's Appeal and the PAPO Board Decision:

Finally, while a detailed discussion of the merits of Nye County's *Amicus* is deferred unless and until its Motion for Leave is granted, Nevada is constrained to point out that its focus is on extraneous topics not germane to the PAPO decision or DOE's appeal thereof. For example, Nye County spends more than half of its Argument section on the issue of the third category of Documentary Material (DM-3), criticizing the PAPO Board's **lack** of focus on this category of documents. Nye Brief at 4-5. Nye County asks "quizzically, we wonder why a discussion of DM-3 is not more prevalent?" *Id.* at 5. The answer is simple, as reflected by the very DOE Appeal Brief which Nye County says it states it is filed "in support of." DOE's focus on appeal was on the other categories of Documentary Material (DM-1 and DM-2). DOE stated that Nevada "has unilaterally deferred complete production of two of the three categories of its documentary material required to be on the LSN" (DOE Brief at 1-2); and after defining the

three categories went on to state "Nevada has failed to make a substantial, good-faith production of information within the **first and second** of those categories." *Id.* at 2. Nye County can rail at the PAPO Board or at DOE for their failure to discuss **other** arguments on **other** issues, if it wants; but the scope of the appeal is defined by the PAPO Board order appealed from and DOE's appeal of that order.

Similarly, Nye County's purported *Amicus* Brief erroneously suggests that the PAPO Board order authorizes **existing** Documentary Material to be withheld by Nevada or other parties until they file contentions or even until the time contentions are admitted. The PAPO Board nowhere suggested such a result. While the Board's decision focused on the probable timing of parties' **creation** of Documentary Material, it did nothing to disturb its earlier ruling that a party must place all its existing Documentary Material on its LSN at the time of its initial certification. Nye County would do well to heed the observation of the PAPO Board: "It is not this Board's role in passing upon a motion to raise issues on its own that are not presented to it by the moving party." PAPO Board April 23, 2008 Order at 10. Such inapposite arguments are the focus of Nye County's *Amicus* Brief. Nye County's Motion for Leave to File should be denied.

III. **CONCLUSION:**

For the foregoing reasons, Nye County's Motion for Leave to File *Amicus* Brief in Support of DOE Appeal from the PAPO Board's April 23, 2008 Order Denying DOE Motion to Strike Nevada LSN Certification should be denied. Should the motion not be denied, Nevada requests a reasonable time after the Commission's order in which to file a response brief, if necessary, addressing the merits of Nye County's proposed *Amicus* Brief, should the Commission permit it to be filed.

Respectfully submitted,
(signed electronically)

William H. Briggs, Jr., wbriggs@rdblaw.com
Merril Hirsh, mhirsh@rdblaw.com
ROSS, DIXON & BELL, LLP
2001 K St., N.W., Suite 400
D.C., D.C. 20006-1040
Telephone: 202.662.2000
Facsimile: 202.662.2190

Charles J. Fitzpatrick, cfitzpatrick@nuclearlawyer.com
Martin G. Malsch, mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com
EGAN, FITZPATRICK & MALSCH, PLLC
12500 San Pedro Avenue, Suite 555
San Antonio, TX 78216
Telephone: 210.496.5001
Facsimile: 210.496.5011

Attorneys for the State of Nevada

May 30, 2008

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

In the Matter of)
)
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY) Docket No. PAPO-00
)
(High-Level Waste Repository:)
Pre-Application Matters) May 30, 2008

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that the foregoing State of Nevada's Opposition to Nye County's Motion for Leave to File *Amicus* Brief in Support of DOE's Appeal has been served upon the following persons either by Electronic Information Exchange or electronic mail (denoted by an asterisk (*)).

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop - T-3 F23
Washington, DC 20555-0001

Thomas S. Moore, Chair
Administrative Judge
Email: PAPO@nrc.gov

Alex S. Karlin
Administrative Judge
Email: PAPO@nrc.gov

Alan S. Rosenthal
Administrative Judge
Email: PAPO@nrc.gov &
rsnthl@comcast.net

G. Paul Bollwerk, III
Administrative Judge
Email: PAPO@nrc.gov

Anthony C. Eitreim, Esq.
Chief Counsel
Email: PAPO@nrc.gov

James M. Cutchin
Email: PAPO@nrc.gov
Jered Lindsay

Email: PAPO@nrc.gov
Marcia Carpentier*

Email: PAPO@nrc.gov
Margaret Parish
Email: PAPO@nrc.gov

Debra Wolf
Email: PAPO@nrc.gov
Bradley S. Baxter*
Email: bxp@nrc.gov

Daniel J. Graser
LSN Administrator
Email: djg2@nrc.gov
ASLBP HLW Adjudication
Email: ASLBP_HLW_Adjudication@nrc.gov

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the Secretary of the Commission
Mail Stop - O-16 C1
Washington, DC 20555-0001
Hearing Docket
Email: hearingdocket@nrc.gov

Andrew L. Bates
Email: alb@nrc.gov
Adria T. Byrdsong

Email: atb1@nrc.gov
Emile L. Julian, Esq.
Email: elj@nrc.gov

Evangeline S. Ngbea
Email: esn@nrc.gov
Rebecca L. Giitter
Email: rll@nrc.gov

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of Congressional Affairs
Mail Stop O-17A3

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of Public Affairs
Mail Stop O-2A13
David McIntyre
Email: dtm@nrc.gov

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
 Office of the General Counsel
 Mail Stop - O-15 D21
 Washington, DC 20555-0001
 Karen D. Cyr, Esq.*
 General Counsel
 Email: kdc@nrc.gov
 Gwendolyn D. Hawkins
 Email: gxh2@nrc.gov
 Janice E. Moore, Esq.
 Email: jem@nrc.gov
 Trip Rothschild, Esq.*
 Email: tbr@nrc.gov
 Mitzi A. Young, Esq.
 Email: may@nrc.gov
 Marian L. Zobler, Esq.
 Email: mlz@nrc.gov
 Andrea L. Silvia, Esq.
 Email: alc1@nrc.gov
 Daniel Lenahan, Esq.
 Email: dwl2@nrc.gov
 Margaret J. Bupp
 Email: mjb5@nrc.gov
 OGCMailCenter
 Email: OGCMailCenter@nrc.gov

Hunton & Williams LLP
 Counsel for the U.S. Department of Energy
 Riverfront Plaza, East Tower
 951 East Byrd Street
 Richmond, VA 23219
 W. Jeffery Edwards, Esq.
 Email: jedwards@hunton.com
 Kelly L. Faglioni, Esq.
 Email: kfaglioni@hunton.com
 Melissa Grier
 Email: mgrier@hunton.com
 Donald P. Irwin, Esq.
 Email: dirwin@hunton.com
 Stephanie Meharg
 Email: smeharg@hunton.com
 Edward P. Noonan, Esq.
 Email: enoonan@hunton.com
 Audrey B. Rusteau
 Email: arusteau@hunton.com
 Michael R. Shebelskie, Esq.
 Email: mshebelskie@hunton.com

Pat Slayton
 Email: pslayton@hunton.com
 Belinda A. Wright
 Email: bwright@hunton.com

U.S. Department Of Energy
 Office of General Counsel
 1551 Hillshire Drive
 Las Vegas, NV 89134-6321
 George W. Hellstrom
 Email: george.hellstrom@ymp.gov

U.S. Department of Energy
 Office of General Counsel
 1000 Independence Avenue, S.W.
 Washington, DC 20585
 Martha S. Crosland, Esq.
 Email: martha.crosland@hq.doe.gov
 Angela M. Korczyk, Esq.
 Email: angela.korczyk@hq.doe.gov
 Mary B. Neumayr, Esq.*
 Email: mary.neumayr@hq.doe.gov

Carter Ledyard & Milburn, LLP
 Counsel for Lincoln County
 1401 Eye Street, N.W., Suite 300
 Washington, DC 20005
 Barry S. Neuman, Esq.
 Email: neuman@clm.com

U.S. Department of Energy
 1000 Independence Avenue, S.W.
 Washington, DC 20585
 Eric Knox, Associate Director, Systems
 Operations and External Relations, OCRWM*
 Email: eric.knox@hq.doe.gov
 Dong Kim, LSN Project Manager, OCRWM*
 Email: dong.kim@rw.doe.gov

Churchill, Esmeralda, Eureka, Mineral
 and Lander Counties
 1705 Wildcat Lane
 Ogden, UT 84403
 Loreen Pitchford, LSN Coordinator
 for Lander County
 Email: lpitchford@comcast.net

U.S. Department of Energy
 Office of Civilian Radioactive Waste Mgmt
 Office of Repository Development
 1551 Hillshire Drive
 Las Vegas, NV 89134-6321
 Timothy C. Gunter
 Email: timothy_gunter@ymp.gov

City of Las Vegas
 400 Stewart Ave.
 Las Vegas, NV 89101
 Margaret Plaster, Management Analyst
 Email: mplaster@LasVegasNevada.gov

Clark County (NV) Nuclear Waste Division
 500 S. Grand Central Parkway
 Las Vegas, NV 89155
 Irene Navis*
 Email: iln@co.clark.nv.us
 Engelbrecht von Tiesenhausen
 Email: evt@co.clark.nv.us

Nuclear Waste Project Office
 1761 East College Parkway, Suite 118
 Carson City, NV 89706
 Robert Loux
 Email: bloux@nuc.state.nv.us
 Steve Frishman, Tech. Policy Coordinator
 Email: steve.frishman@gmail.com

Eureka County and Lander County, Nevada
 Harmon, Curran, Speilberg & Eisenberg,
 LLP
 1726 M. Street N.W., Suite 600
 Washington, DC 20036
 Diane Curran, Esq.
 Email: dcurran@harmoncurran.com

Nevada Nuclear Waste Task Force
 P.O. Box 26177
 Las Vegas, NV 89126
 Judy Treichel, Executive Director
 Email: judynwtf@aol.com

Talisman International, LLC
 1000 Potomac St., N.W., Suite 300
 Washington, D.C. 20007
 Patricia Larimore
 Email: plarimore@talisman-intl.com

Nuclear Energy Institute
 1776 I Street, NW, Suite 400
 Washington, DC 20006-3708
 Michael A. Bauser, Esq.
 Associate General Counsel
 Email: mab@nei.org
 Anne W. Cottingham, Esq.
 Email: awc@nei.org
 Ellen C. Ginsberg, Esq.
 Email: ecg@nei.org
 Rod McCullum*
 Email: rxm@nei.org
 Steven P. Kraft*
 Email: spk@nei.org

White Pine County
 City of Caliente
 Lincoln County
 P.O. Box 126
 Caliente, NV 89008
 Jason Pitts
 Email: jayson@idtservices.com

Nuclear Information and Resource Service
 6930 Carroll Avenue, Suite 340
 Takoma Park, MD 20912
 Michael Mariotte, Executive Director*
 Email: nirsnet@nirs.org

Radioactive Waste Watchdog
 Beyond Nuclear
 6930 Carroll Avenue, Suite 400
 Takoma Park, MD 20912
 Kevin Kamps*
 Email: kevin@beyondnuclear.org

Yucca Mountain Project, Licensing Group,
DOE/BSC
Regulatory Programs
1180 North Town Center Drive
Las Vegas, NV 89144
Jeffrey Kriner
Email: jeffrey_kriner@ymp.gov

Abigail Johnson*
612 West Telegraph Street
Carson City, NV 89703
Email: abbyj@gbis.com

National Congress of American Indians
1301 Connecticut Ave. NW - Second floor
Washington, DC 20036
Robert I. Holden, Director*
Nuclear Waste Program
Email: robert_holden@ncai.org

Ross, Dixon & Bell
2001 K Street N.W.
Washington D.C. 20006-1040
William H. Briggs*
Email: wbriggs@rdblaw.com
Merril Hirsh, Esq.
Email: mhirsh@rdblaw.com

Churchill County (NV)
155 North Taylor Street, Suite 182
Fallon, NV 89406
Alan Kalt*
Email: comptroller@churchillcounty.org

Inyo County Water Department
Yucca Mtn Nuclear Waste
Repository Assessment Office
163 May St.
Bishop, CA 93514
Matt Gaffney, Project Associate*
Email: mgaffney@inyoyucca.org

Environmental Protection Agency
Ray Clark*
Email: clark.ray@epa.gov

Nuclear Waste Technical Review Board
Joyce Dory*
Email: dory@nwtrb.gov

Intertech Services Corporation
(for Lincoln County)
P.O. Box 2008
Carson City, NV 89702-2008
Dr. Mike Baughman*
Email: bigboff@aol.com

Nye County (NV) Department of Natural
Resources & Federal Facilities
1210 E. Basin Road, Suite 6
Pahrump, NV 89048
David Swanson*
Email: dswanson@nyecounty.net

Lincoln County (NV) Nuclear Oversight Prgm
100 Depot Ave., Suite 15; P.O. Box 1068
Caliente, NV 89008-1068
Lea Rasura-Alfano, Coordinator*
Email: jcciac@co.lincoln.nv.us

Nye County (NV) Regulatory/Licensing Adv.
18160 Cottonwood Rd. #265
Sunriver, OR 97707
Malachy Murphy*
Email: mrmurphy@chamberscable.com

Mineral County (NV) Board of County
Commissioners
P.O. Box 1600
Hawthorne, NV 89415
Linda Mathias, Administrator*
Office of Nuclear Projects
Email: yuccainfo@mineralcountynv.org

State of Nevada (NV)
100 N. Carson Street
Carson City, NV 89710
Marta Adams*
Email: maadams@ag.state.nv.us

White Pine County (NV) Nuclear
Waste Project Office
959 Campton Street
Ely, NV 89301
Mike Simon, Director*
(Heidi Williams, Adm. Assist. *)
Email: wpnucwst1@mwpower.net

Fredericks & Peebles, L.L.P.
1001 Second Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
916-441-2700
FAX 916-441-2067
Darcie L. Houck
Email: dhouck@ndnlaw.com
John M. Peebles*
Email: jpeebles@ndnlaw.com
Joe Kennedy, Chairman*
Email: chairman@timbisha.org
Barbara Durham*
Tribal Historic Preservation Officer
Email: dvdurbarbara@netscape.com

Counsel for the U.S. Department of Energy
Morgan, Lewis, Bockius LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20004
Lewis Csedrik, Esq.
E-mail: lsedrik@morganlewis.com
Jay Gutierrez, Esq.
E-mail: jguterrez@morganlewis.com
Thomas Poindexter, Esq.
E-mail: tpoindexter@morganlewis.com
Alex S. Polonsky, Esq.
E-mail: apolonsky@morganlewis.com
Thomas A. Schmutz, Esq.
E-mail: tschmutz@morganlewis.com
Donald Silverman, Esq.
E-mail: dsilverman@morganlewis.com
Paul J. Zaffuts, Esq.
E-mail: pzaffuts@morganlewis.com

(signed electronically)
Susan Montesi