

**From:** Eric Duncan *R3*  
**To:** ExponentReportGroup  
**Date:** 04/23/2007 9:56:17 AM  
**Subject:** Fwd: Toledo Blade on Davis-Besse hearing

To all,

FYI regarding an additional impact of the Exponent Report.

Eric.

>>> Viktoria Mitlyng 04/23/2007 9:17:45 AM >>>  
Attached is the Toledo Blade story on Friday's hearing:

Article published Saturday, April 21, 2007  
Insurance claim to delay trial for 3 ex-Davis-Besse workers

By TOM HENRY  
BLADE STAFF WRITER

FirstEnergy Corp.'s attempt to recoup \$200 million from an insurance policy has caused a four-month delay in the criminal prosecution of three workers formerly associated with the utility's Davis-Besse nuclear plant in Ottawa County.

U.S. District Court Judge David Katz said at a hearing yesterday that he had no choice but to postpone the trial of Andrew Siemaszko to Sept. 10 and that of his two co-defendants, David Geisen and Rodney N. Cook, to Oct. 9 because of assertions made in a 661-page report by two FirstEnergy consultants, Exponent Failure Analysis Association of Menlo Park, Calif., and Altran Solutions Corp. of Boston.

The three were indicted last year on charges of lying to the government about the plant's condition in the fall of 2001.

All three face up to five years in prison and \$250,000 in fines, if convicted.

Both of FirstEnergy's consultants claim to be global leaders in scientific failure analysis. In their joint report, they attributed most of the vessel head's erosion to a three-week accelerated leakage period before Davis-Besse was shut down on Feb. 16, 2002, contrary to what the Nuclear Regulatory Commission had said.

FirstEnergy is using the new document to bolster its claim for \$200 million of insurance coverage the utility had on Davis-Besse's reactor head.

The company is trying to show the near-catastrophic rupture was more fluke than neglect.

It is doing so even though it admitted compromising safety for profits and paid a record \$33.5 million in fines for its role in what has been described as one of the U.S. nuclear industry's biggest attempted cover-ups.

At yesterday's hearing, defense attorneys noted the new report contradicts the NRC's assertions of the cavity forming over five to six years as well as the worldwide understanding of how the plant's reactor head nearly burst open in 2002.

Such a rupture could have endangered millions of people in northern Ohio by allowing radioactive steam

*F-156*

to form in the containment building. That type of accident would have been the first since the 1979 half-core meltdown of the Three Mile Island Unit 2 reactor near Harrisburg, Pa.

The NRC has remained neutral on the new report.

Judge Katz told Justice Department attorneys he wants to know within two weeks if the NRC believes the new findings are "junk science." If so, he would prevent federal prosecutors from using the report in court.

If not, that could raise questions as to whether the trio can be prosecuted for violating inspection standards that might have been flawed.

The FirstEnergy consultants' report was completed Dec. 15. It was turned over to the NRC on March 20 and made available to defense attorneys on April 2. Jury selection for Mr. Siemaszko's trial was to start on April 30.

The other two were scheduled to have their cases heard simultaneously in June.

One of Mr. Geissen's attorneys, Richard Hibey, told the judge that "litigation might be outpacing scientific understanding."

"If you are correct that the litigation before us is outpacing the science, then it is the government's obligation to make that determination," the judge responded.

Viktoria Mitlyng, a NRC spokesman, declined comment on the judge's instructions to federal prosecutors.

She said the agency still has not taken a position on the new report.

"Once the request is made, I'm sure it's going to be reviewed by the commission and action is going to be taken," Ms. Mitlyng said.

The NRC has based many of its claims on 2004 research by the Department of Energy's Argonne National Laboratory, 25 miles southwest of Chicago.

The lab determined Davis-Besse's massive steel lid had at least two months but no more than 13 months before it would have burst.

"We didn't know there was going to be a challenge to the worldwide understanding of how these events occurred. But there is and now we have to deal with it," Chuck Boss, one of Mr. Siemaszko's attorneys, told the judge.

The other attorney, Billie Pirner Garde, called the new report "an extraordinary turn of events with extraordinary implications."

"That science was not challengeable. It was the position of the whole industry," she said. "If [FirstEnergy's consultants] are right, judge, it changes the whole science of stress corrosion cracking."

The Argonne National Laboratory, chartered in 1946, was the nation's first national laboratory and continues to be one of the country's largest research centers today. The laboratory has ties to the advent of the atomic age.

Judge Katz said he considers it highly credible.

Contact Tom Henry at:  
[thenry@theblade.com](mailto:thenry@theblade.com)  
or 419-724-6079.



**Mail Envelope Properties** (462CC911.E88 : 4 : 3672)**Subject:** Fwd: Toledo Blade on Davis-Besse hearing**Creation Date** 04/23/2007 9:56:17 AM**From:** Eric Duncan**Created By:** ERD@nrc.gov

Recipients	Action	Date & Time
comcast.net AM vmitlyng	Transferred	04/23/2007 9:57:05
mac.com AM rjan (Jan Strasma-home)	Transferred	04/23/2007 9:57:05
nrc.gov ch_po.CH_DO AM ATB (Anne Boland)	Delivered	04/23/2007 9:56:49
PM CDP1 (Cynthia Pederson)	Opened	04/23/2007 12:10:01
PM	Opened	04/23/2007 12:11:48
	Deleted	04/23/2007 12:22:34
PM DEH (David Hills)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:40:50
AM GEG (Geoffrey Grant)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:11:30
AM	Deleted	04/23/2007 10:19:40
AM	Emptied	05/01/2007 2:00:38
PM GLS (Gary Shear)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:03:05
AM	Deleted	04/23/2007 10:05:58
AM	Undeleted	04/23/2007 10:06:41
AM	Forwarded	04/23/2007 10:07:44
AM	Deleted	04/24/2007 12:28:42
PM		

JER7 (John Rutkowski)	Opened	04/23/2007 3:02:42
PM		
	Deleted	05/04/2007 5:59:36
AM		
	Emptied	05/04/2007 6:02:12
AM		
JLC1 (James Caldwell)	Opened	04/23/2007 9:57:37
AM		
	Forwarded	04/23/2007 10:00:18
AM		
	Deleted	04/23/2007 10:00:23
AM		
	Emptied	04/28/2007 1:09:52
AM		
KSW (Steven West)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:30:09
AM		
MAS (Mark Satorius)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:21:47
AM		
RJS2 (Jan Strasma)	Opened	04/24/2007 12:51:22
PM		
RML2 (Roland Lickus)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:02:05
AM		
	Shared	
SAM9 (Sheri Minnick)	Opened	04/25/2007 7:26:28
AM		
	SharedEmptied	04/25/2007 7:26:46
AM		
SLS CC (Sharon Sarna)	Opened	04/23/2007 11:07:47
AM		
VTM (Viktoria Mitlyng)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:14:51
AM		
nrc.gov		
OWGWPO01.HQGWDO01	Delivered	04/23/2007 9:56:36
AM		
SRB3 (Scott Burnell)	Opened	04/23/2007 9:57:13
AM		
	Deleted	04/23/2007 9:57:19
AM		
	Emptied	04/23/2007 12:12:51
PM		
TEB (Tamara Bloomer)	Opened	04/23/2007 11:39:05
AM		
	Forwarded	04/23/2007 11:41:03
AM		

WHB (Bill Bateman)	Opened	04/23/2007 12:12:48
PM		
	Deleted	04/23/2007 12:13:04
PM		
nrc.gov		
OWGWPO02.HQGWDO01	Delivered	04/23/2007 9:56:36
AM		
JAG (John Grobe)	Deleted	04/25/2007 8:37:15
AM		
MGE (Michele Evans)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:23:54
AM		
	Deleted	04/23/2007 5:02:25
PM		
RAG1 (Russell Gibbs)	Opened	04/26/2007 7:40:11
AM		
	Deleted	04/26/2007 7:41:53
AM		
	Emptied	05/04/2007 12:09:10
AM		
nrc.gov		
OWGWPO03.HQGWDO01	Delivered	04/23/2007 9:56:37
AM		
JXC (Jay Collins)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:35:40
AM		
WHC (William Cullen)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:03:20
AM		
	Forwarded	04/23/2007 10:05:51
AM		
nrc.gov		
OWGWPO04.HQGWDO01	Delivered	04/23/2007 9:56:38
AM		
JKH3 (Jared Heck)	Opened	04/24/2007 8:49:49
AM		
nrc.gov		
TWGWPO02.HQGWDO01	Delivered	04/23/2007 9:56:36
AM		
USS (Undine Shoop)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:05:11
AM		
nrc.gov		
TWGWPO03.HQGWDO01	Delivered	04/23/2007 9:56:36

AM		
AXP10 (Amy Powell)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:34:07
AM		
	Replied	04/26/2007 1:47:12
PM		
	Forwarded	05/02/2007 3:21:53
PM		
nrc.gov		
TWGWPO04.HQGWDO01	Delivered	04/23/2007 9:56:38
AM		
TJW2 (Thomas Wengert)	Opened	04/23/2007 10:30:01
AM		

**Post Office****Delivered****Route**

comcast.net  
mac.com

ch_po.CH_DO	04/23/2007 9:56:49 AM	nrc.gov
OWGWPO01.HQGWDO01	04/23/2007 9:56:36 AM	nrc.gov
OWGWPO02.HQGWDO01	04/23/2007 9:56:36 AM	nrc.gov
OWGWPO03.HQGWDO01	04/23/2007 9:56:37 AM	nrc.gov
OWGWPO04.HQGWDO01	04/23/2007 9:56:38 AM	nrc.gov
TWGWPO02.HQGWDO01	04/23/2007 9:56:36 AM	nrc.gov
TWGWPO03.HQGWDO01	04/23/2007 9:56:36 AM	nrc.gov
TWGWPO04.HQGWDO01	04/23/2007 9:56:38 AM	nrc.gov

**Files****Size****Date & Time**

MESSAGE	7276	04/23/2007 9:56:17 AM
---------	------	-----------------------

**Options**

<b>Auto Delete:</b>	No
<b>Expiration Date:</b>	None
<b>Notify Recipients:</b>	Yes
<b>Priority:</b>	Standard
<b>ReplyRequested:</b>	No
<b>Return Notification:</b>	None

<b>Concealed Subject:</b>	No
<b>Security:</b>	Standard

<b>To Be Delivered:</b>	Immediate
<b>Status Tracking:</b>	All Information